

WEBVTT

00:00:00.000 --> 00:00:00.000
Yeah, the, the black Pelican, the

00:00:00.000 --> 00:00:00.000
black flamingos and the, oh yeah, pink crew, they have to do with anything.

00:00:00.000 --> 00:00:03.000
Of the, the huge poster, you know, the three covers. I think I still have that.

00:00:03.000 --> 00:00:07.000
But that was from the eighth edition.

00:00:07.000 --> 00:00:19.000
Listen to know that was, that's the Ballantine. That's the first.

00:00:19.000 --> 00:00:23.000
And finally replaced after about.

00:00:23.000 --> 00:00:40.000
I had my Chaucer Professor as an undergraduate, had a van, and he had that neural painted on the side of his fam.

00:00:40.000 --> 00:00:45.000
Behind john is the Jimmy county poster

00:00:45.000 --> 00:00:53.000
i'm john, but we put up with that artwork for the sake of the mat back in those days. Yeah.

00:00:53.000 --> 00:01:01.000
We were just having a discussion in the tomorrow Pierce fandom because a lot of the early maps, but one of the main characters household on the wrong side of the border.

00:01:01.000 --> 00:01:04.000
And all of us were like, that's not the right country.

00:01:04.000 --> 00:01:15.000
What's going on, why isn't it in the right country and somebody asked her on like a Reddit AMA she's like yeah I didn't have a lot of time to proofread that map it's been fixed in the second edition, we're like, but we had all these ideas we had all these

00:01:15.000 --> 00:01:24.000
theories about why it was on the wrong country, but now that was just an error.

00:01:24.000 --> 00:01:27.000
Well doesn't take much for us to start generating theories and ideas does it.

00:01:27.000 --> 00:01:31.000

Now, that's the that's the fun of living fantasy.

00:01:31.000 --> 00:01:45.000

We don't require any stimulus at all. Just like our spot. I think the story was that Valentine was rushing to get the paperbacks out because of the eighth edition.

00:01:45.000 --> 00:02:15.000

You know Ballantine had been negotiating with Houghton Mifflin, and Ace just ran ahead and and so they had to get something out but look, dramatic.

00:02:20.000 --> 00:02:23.000

a lot of science fiction covers.

00:02:23.000 --> 00:02:27.000

Turned out that way.

00:02:27.000 --> 00:02:37.000

I used to pay attention to the covers on Ace doubles, and it was like those illustrations had nothing to do with the stories

00:02:37.000 --> 00:02:47.000

are very little. I hate to say anything positive about the hate to say anything positive about the publishing industry but they have gotten better at that.

00:02:47.000 --> 00:02:55.000

Yeah,

00:02:55.000 --> 00:03:03.000

suppose it's a little bit illogical to complain about them since they do provide us with all the stuff we want to talk about but

00:03:03.000 --> 00:03:14.000

my very first Worldcon, it was one of my favorite things walking through the gallery of all the folks who wanted to be adored for their excellent illustrations of covers and I was like, oh wow I've seen that one.

00:03:14.000 --> 00:03:25.000

I've seen that it was, it was a very exciting moment for me as a baby fan.

00:03:25.000 --> 00:03:30.000

I wouldn't even

00:03:30.000 --> 00:03:37.000

feel animosity toward them for rejecting my books if I didn't see the crap that they published instead.

00:03:37.000 --> 00:03:47.000

I thought it was more worth publishing and what they turned out.

00:03:47.000 --> 00:03:54.000
No accounting for taste.

00:03:54.000 --> 00:04:12.000
Let's see, I can hear someone's voice but it sounds kind of garbled so I'm going to meet some folks and see if that fixes it.

00:04:12.000 --> 00:04:15.000
Nice.

00:04:15.000 --> 00:04:27.000
Are you doing Sarah, nothing I've seen you San Diego. Oh, I'm doing okay. You know, wish, I wish I could be doing better but I'm doing okay.

00:04:27.000 --> 00:04:32.000
But a lot of things you mean by. Okay,

00:04:32.000 --> 00:04:40.000
well let's see I have a roof over my head I eat regularly my car runs, mostly.

00:04:40.000 --> 00:04:42.000
The not hurting.

00:04:42.000 --> 00:04:46.000
but you know, being more prosperous would be fun.

00:04:46.000 --> 00:04:55.000
But on the other hand, I'm enjoying the editing that I do for my clients.

00:04:55.000 --> 00:05:06.000
And I'm slowly working more towards getting my own writing done, so

00:05:06.000 --> 00:05:30.000
it would be exciting to finish some of my writing, but do you got any snide comments to make about the guest Jeopardy hosts a sniper, not so much. I mean, I watched lover Burton this way, this week and and actually thought he did a good job and his enthusiasm

00:05:30.000 --> 00:05:34.000
was a lot of fun. Ken Jennings I watched the beginning.

00:05:34.000 --> 00:05:41.000
But I thought Ken was a little too cool I didn't know, or seen before.

00:05:41.000 --> 00:05:45.000
Neither just me Street, or as Julian before.

00:05:45.000 --> 00:05:49.000
Did he come across quite the same way.

00:05:49.000 --> 00:05:50.000
Yeah.

00:05:50.000 --> 00:06:08.000

But I haven't caught, I didn't catch all of them, because I'm often, like I said I'm often doing my editing, and then I'll look at the time and go, Oh, Miss Jeopardy again.

00:06:08.000 --> 00:06:15.000

For those who don't know, I used to work on the show.

00:06:15.000 --> 00:06:20.000

Leslie is move muted.

00:06:20.000 --> 00:06:27.000

But yeah,

00:06:27.000 --> 00:06:35.000

did you want to stop sharing your screen.

00:06:35.000 --> 00:06:38.000

Donald, was that on purpose.

00:06:38.000 --> 00:06:40.000

Did we lose him.

00:06:40.000 --> 00:06:52.000

I think he may have hit something. Okay, well, this is the value of having time protect checks know hang out together.

00:06:52.000 --> 00:06:56.000

I want to tell you, this is a very silly story.

00:06:56.000 --> 00:07:09.000

I'm coming to science fiction and fantasy gatherings in costume. Um, years ago I went to world fantasy con when it was in Monterrey, he was on.

00:07:09.000 --> 00:07:15.000

And we all assumed that we were going to get put on our costumes and go to this.

00:07:15.000 --> 00:07:26.000

And you know have a grand old time. Well, it was the one year on Halloween, in Monterey, California, mind you.

00:07:26.000 --> 00:07:43.000

When they didn't want anybody to cosplay. No costume. They had Halloween cocktail party instead. But no one was supposed to come in a costume they were supposed to dress up, and it was specifically all about agents editors and writers.

00:07:43.000 --> 00:07:52.000

Yeah, so we of course came down from Berkeley, and our regalia for Halloween.

00:07:52.000 --> 00:07:56.000

Bash adn.

00:07:56.000 --> 00:08:20.000

I was really lonely conference to that fantasy con is, in fact, as, as you say Wesley it's a agents editors and writers conference and it's not really geared towards fans although my experience has been that they're welcome as long as they're willing

00:08:20.000 --> 00:08:39.000

to that year, we had all attended in costumes, and we're boardrooms there D amp D rooms, there were hospitality rooms, but that year was the year it changed, and they did it on Halloween, in California, with the irony of the entire have

00:08:39.000 --> 00:08:51.000

a couple years. A couple years ago, I volunteer for a State Department program that brings women in tech from the Middle East Africa, Central and South Asia to California for internships, and it was on Halloween almost every year which means you have

00:08:51.000 --> 00:09:04.000

to explain this bizarre American cultural tradition to women from 22 different countries. And they've gotten to know me and so I had one friend who was from Turkmenistan and one from Cameroon, and they say, Jessica.

00:09:04.000 --> 00:09:14.000

What are you doing today and I'm like I'm gonna go carve pumpkins, and they're like, oh, why, and I was like oh it's Halloween. It's one of our tradition she's like, what are you going to carve them like I was like, Oh, like demons and ghosts and she's

00:09:14.000 --> 00:09:26.000

very politely sits back, do you believe in demons and ghosts. And I'm like, No, the people who really believe in them tend to not celebrate Halloween that much she's like, all right, so they, they don't like the pumpkin like guess the demons and ghosts

00:09:26.000 --> 00:09:39.000

don't like the pumpkin she's like, wait, I understand you carve the pumpkins, so you can cook them for pumpkin pie at Thanksgiving and I'm like no those are different pumpkins, but we had to have this whole conversation about like you know how in your

00:09:39.000 --> 00:09:52.000

own culture there are things that make no sense to anyone outside of your culture. He's like yes we have things like that too. And I'm like, yeah, that's Halloween, that's I can't explain it in a way that will ever make sense to anyone outside of this

00:09:52.000 --> 00:09:57.000

culture. Like, why do we carve demons and ghosts into pumpkins.

00:09:57.000 --> 00:10:02.000

I, it makes a lot of sense if you're from this culture, makes well.

00:10:02.000 --> 00:10:17.000

You can see it as a way of trying to get the ghosts and demons to go away by her very logical question of do I believe the demons are ghosts are coming to my home.

00:10:17.000 --> 00:10:23.000

It doesn't matter if they're not there because the pumpkins are driven them away.

00:10:23.000 --> 00:10:41.000

proves that gardening can work. Yeah, there's not an invisible tab. Under this chair, though unfortunately they are scientists in this group so they're like Jessica correlation is not causation.

00:10:41.000 --> 00:10:47.000

an evidence of jack and jack can those is correlation not causation.

00:10:47.000 --> 00:11:07.000

But, school, we are all scientists we're all in the system sciences or psychology. And we had our big, we had a big gathering every year where everybody came in and talked about our dissertation research, but it was on Halloween so the Student Committee

00:11:07.000 --> 00:11:21.000

decided we needed a costume ball, but there are literally people from all over the world at my grad school who had no idea what Halloween was so the day before you had an entire afternoon discussing Halloween where it came from, and we invited some experts

00:11:21.000 --> 00:11:35.000

to come in and give papers, and it was actually an amazing piece of scholarship. But, um, it was great fun. It was great fun and we all dressed up and hired a Celtic rock band and had a good time.

00:11:35.000 --> 00:11:40.000

That's late fall I'm nothing like grad school students for partying.

00:11:40.000 --> 00:11:58.000

This is McDonald Thank you for letting us chat about Halloween during your time, the floor is yours. I am back having lost my internet connection randomly for some unknown reason you're all good, but we're going to attempt rejoinder to Berlin Pfleger

00:11:58.000 --> 00:12:04.000

on the legend conflicting side of poking singular self.

00:12:04.000 --> 00:12:14.000

So, this will work better if I actually start the slideshow. Won't it.

00:12:14.000 --> 00:12:17.000

Okay.

00:12:17.000 --> 00:12:36.000

Berlin Pflieger is one of our most in stock traders on all things talking in her classic book splintered like she offers an account of tokens genius that she brings into sharper focus in the recent as say the arch and the Keystone, which was a plenary

00:12:36.000 --> 00:12:51.000

paper at Miss con 2019 her thesis is that readers, see conflicting things in joking, because they are simply there. And this, she does not treat from calling it contradiction is the key to his greatness.

00:12:51.000 --> 00:13:01.000

He is the Keystone that holds the conflicting views, the contrary stresses together so that they form one beautiful Gothic arch. The legendary them.

00:13:01.000 --> 00:13:21.000

It is interesting metaphor that effectively captures and analysis that contains enough truth that I think the attempt to bend it just a little closer to reality can produce an important insights Pflieger attempts to reconcile the contradictions, she sees

00:13:21.000 --> 00:13:31.000

in Tokyo issuing, excuse me, as shooing attempts to reconcile the contradictions she sees and tokens writings sleeker sees them as reflecting the man himself.

00:13:31.000 --> 00:13:44.000

The more I read about Tolkien she says the less homogenous a figure I find, but this is good and enables Tolkien to capture in his fiction the very same complexity that we find in the real world.

00:13:44.000 --> 00:13:55.000

It is in flickers you the unresolved conflict in cocaine himself. That makes this richness possible. He is a paradoxical man.

00:13:55.000 --> 00:14:04.000

He is a man of and sees, who's invested world derives its energy from paradox, and polarity.

00:14:04.000 --> 00:14:17.000

The central conflict that Pflieger sees is that between darkness and light adumbrated in the conflict between despair and hope and concentrated in the authors, so called betrayal of Fred at some of our.

00:14:17.000 --> 00:14:34.000

It entails a secondary conflict between Christianity and paganism poking the Christian wants to like to win. The Tolkien The man is not quite so sure is he thinks he is that it will flicker sees these conflicts explicate it in tokens essays illuminated

00:14:34.000 --> 00:14:53.000

by his letters and embodied in his secondary world Pflieger finds not just contracting things but Opposing Viewpoints in the two essays, built the masters and the critics and on various stories.

00:14:53.000 --> 00:15:03.000

Each of them focuses on one of the two first side of the great polarity between darkness and light and not she thinks in ways that are entirely compatible.

00:15:03.000 --> 00:15:14.000

One celebrates pagan darkness and despair the other the Christian hope quote the bandwidth essay extols a worldview that faces death with courage and accepted as finally the end.

00:15:14.000 --> 00:15:34.000

The fairy story essay exalts the escape from the escape from death that brings the happy ending inevitable defeat or catastrophe. Tolkien somehow embodies both an earlier figure was aware that these contrasting themes do not have to be seen as representing

00:15:34.000 --> 00:15:38.000

a conflict, much less a contradiction.

00:15:38.000 --> 00:15:44.000

Each essay she writes acknowledges that both light and darker elements held an interdependent tension.

00:15:44.000 --> 00:15:54.000

Without the little circle of light protected against it, darkness would lack meaning and the ever present possibility of this catastrophe is what makes the joy of deliverance so piercing.

00:15:54.000 --> 00:16:00.000

While Tolkien has sympathy with the courage that allows Beowulf to oppose the monsters without any hope.

00:16:00.000 --> 00:16:08.000

It is for Pflieger just as clear that for him this is no way contradicts Christianity. I'm agreeing up to this point.

00:16:08.000 --> 00:16:17.000

She realizes that Christian acceptance of the fall leads inevitably to the idea that imperfection in this is the state of things in this world.

00:16:17.000 --> 00:16:32.000

As Tolkien expresses it in the bandwidth essay, the realization that man. Each man, and all his works shall die is one that no Christian need the spot.

00:16:32.000 --> 00:16:48.000

Nevertheless, Pflieger still sees a conflict but without resolution because, According to her the balance is tipped light and dark or continuing forces and tokens fiction but the emotional weight is on the dark side.

00:16:48.000 --> 00:16:56.000

We'll have to explore tokens own view later but flicker thinks it any attempt to reconcile the two perspectives robs them of their power.

00:16:56.000 --> 00:17:04.000

Already in splitter light, she expressed the relationship of darkness and light and strong terms.

00:17:04.000 --> 00:17:18.000

The very choices of the two things for the two essays, is an indication of that antithesis, so deeply rooted in tokens nature that he could be so powerfully attracted to to such opposing outlooks, she was playing the the anti Nami intention in his own

00:17:18.000 --> 00:17:19.000

psychology.

00:17:19.000 --> 00:17:34.000

Now in the recent essay the starkness of the contrast is presented simply in terms of contradiction, quote, the contradiction comes less from without from the subject matter of the two essays than from within.

00:17:34.000 --> 00:17:38.000

from the author's own inclinations.

00:17:38.000 --> 00:17:53.000

Well, surely, much of the power of tokens vision comes from his ability to evoke both darkness and light and give them both their do, and flickers analysis is helpful in the way it brings this point to the fore by the fact that Tolkien himself would have

00:17:53.000 --> 00:17:56.000

expressed their relationship differently.

00:17:56.000 --> 00:18:06.000

explicitly not as contradiction must give us pause it raises further questions to which we must return air the end.

00:18:06.000 --> 00:18:14.000

But first we must turn to figures exposition of the inner side of this conflict.

00:18:14.000 --> 00:18:30.000

The conflict between darkness and light in the outer world manifests itself, internally as a conflict between despair and hope the contradiction, the absence of any resolution in favor of Hope is most clearly Cindy what is to Pflieger tokens be trail of

00:18:30.000 --> 00:18:45.000

of his hero for, though. Indeed, she sees Frodo as possibly the most cruelly and unjustly treated hero in the history of literature, but Tolkien does to Frodo is worse than what he does to tour it.

00:18:45.000 --> 00:18:49.000
That would be pretty bad.

00:18:49.000 --> 00:18:59.000
There is a happy ending but for those who sacrifices made it possible does not get to enjoy it. His will have been been ground down by the ring is seen as an in comprehensible cruelty.

00:18:59.000 --> 00:19:13.000
It is unthinkable she writes that the best habit of them all after his long struggle is sacrificed so the humility and mercy is shown, she got bad though the rain is destroyed anyway by an unexpected Providence Frodo must live with an awareness of his

00:19:13.000 --> 00:19:16.000
failure that will never go away.

00:19:16.000 --> 00:19:24.000
hits the inadvertent victory as she calls it and some of our does not less than the blackness of photos feet.

00:19:24.000 --> 00:19:31.000
The feet. There is no you catastrophe know constellation giving a glimpse of joy.

00:19:31.000 --> 00:19:40.000
Not for Fred is unable to live at peace in the Shire he is saved and has to flee to Amman to seek healing.

00:19:40.000 --> 00:19:43.000
But do we even know that he will find it.

00:19:43.000 --> 00:19:50.000
I know what you're going to tell me Pflieger objects the great havens the fire green country. My point is, we never get there.

00:19:50.000 --> 00:20:04.000
She explains in his letters Tolkien made it clear that Bobby sins front of development or to be healed. If that could be done before he died that healing is by no means a foregone conclusion.

00:20:04.000 --> 00:20:08.000
Whereas, death is

00:20:08.000 --> 00:20:16.000
so well for patients to seek healing his healing in the foreign country is not show.

00:20:16.000 --> 00:20:29.000
Therefore there is no recovery no consolation no glimpse of joy beyond the walls of the world. The fact that front as healing is merely hinted at means that darkness and despair, not light and hope are the last taste left in the mouth.

00:20:29.000 --> 00:20:47.000

For Tokyo hope and desire seems always to be balanced by despair, she says, so that his final vision remains a vision, only called into question by his hard one knowledge of the dark in splintered light Pfleger uses the word balanced, but in the arts

00:20:47.000 --> 00:20:53.000

and the Keystone the impression we get is that overbalanced would be the more accurate term.

00:20:53.000 --> 00:21:03.000

Well Pfleger does not see it either work is resolution darkness and light disparate hope then remaining conflict.

00:21:03.000 --> 00:21:17.000

Hope without guarantees, she writes much give little hint of what comes after salvation and redemption in the music player right maybe alluded to, even for shadow but they are not made manifest.

00:21:17.000 --> 00:21:32.000

For Pfleger hope accepted by faith is not much of a hope when segments the darkness front of the faces quote released from bondage to the circles of the world is a release with promise tokens text give know gives no guarantees.

00:21:32.000 --> 00:21:43.000

There is an historic no assurance of any future beyond death, the unknown must be accepted in faith, that is exactly the point in the quote.

00:21:43.000 --> 00:21:51.000

Yes, it is. But is it the point Pfleger thanks again more on this later.

00:21:51.000 --> 00:22:06.000

Photos experiences seminar is seen as something from which recovery is impossible in this world and all but impossible in the next what remains absolutely impossible in this world is any assured hope of such recovery, every positive foreshadowing of a

00:22:06.000 --> 00:22:24.000

hopeful final destiny is just kept the restoration is to sell after the destruction to the ring for example is quote wishful thinking. The view is through Sam's eyes and Sam is blinded by hope, and love the fact that light and hope are kept in the arch

00:22:24.000 --> 00:22:31.000

at all becomes an astounding achievement of this view, and that is what Pfleger thinks is precisely the point.

00:22:31.000 --> 00:22:34.000

And I think she's almost right.

00:22:34.000 --> 00:22:42.000

One virtue if leaders approach is that it forces us to take the darkness with full seriousness so that any cheap victory is swept away for good.

00:22:42.000 --> 00:22:49.000

And surely giving darkness its full value is essential to getting the full impact of the catastrophe.

00:22:49.000 --> 00:23:10.000

Yes, it is and flickers analysis, up to a point is a good explanation of why, but we should ask, Is there a way to retain that insight. While affirming a greater level of coherence in Tokyo install Pflieger thinks that's a doomed quest, but we shall attempt

00:23:10.000 --> 00:23:13.000

it air, the end.

00:23:13.000 --> 00:23:23.000

Another form of the unresolved conflict figure sees at the heart of tokens vision is that between the paganism have the bandwidth is an essay, and the Christianity of on fairy stories.

00:23:23.000 --> 00:23:38.000

Tolkien stories, clearly do not have the explicit theological content we find in a work like The Chronicles of Narnia, which makes possible an endless debate over how much Christian content is there and how deep it goes reminiscent of a similar discussion,

00:23:38.000 --> 00:23:41.000

and they will have criticism.

00:23:41.000 --> 00:23:47.000

Tolkien himself made statements that could be seen as not wholly consistent,

00:23:47.000 --> 00:23:59.000

he famously wrote to father Robert Murray, that the Lord of the Rings is a fundamentally religious and Catholic work, but then he told interviewer Harry resonate that it's not a Christian myth anyhow.

00:23:59.000 --> 00:24:06.000

He told wh out and that he intended the book to be consonant with Christian thought and belief.

00:24:06.000 --> 00:24:23.000

But for your comments consonant with is a long way from fundamentally, and conclude talking is more come comfortable with paradox then some of his readers Pflieger sees confirmation of the distance between fundamentally and consonant with in an exchange

00:24:23.000 --> 00:24:27.000

Murray head with a grad student in 1980.

00:24:27.000 --> 00:24:43.000

Murray read the Tolkien was very complex in depressed man in my own opinion in his creative creation is that it project is very depressed view of the universe as least as much as it reflects his Catholic faith.

00:24:43.000 --> 00:24:52.000

He admits that there is a case to be made about talking the Catholic but concludes it, I simply could not support interpretation that made this, the key.

00:24:52.000 --> 00:25:02.000

Well Pflieger doesn't accept any such interpretation, either. She rightly acknowledges that the religious or philosophical basis on which the word stands the governing principles.

00:25:02.000 --> 00:25:07.000

All these are explicit in the similarly on implicit in the Lord of the Rings.

00:25:07.000 --> 00:25:16.000

But what is that religious or philosophical basis for Pflieger it is, unsurprisingly ambiguous.

00:25:16.000 --> 00:25:31.000

Only she says in the most general sense can the silver alien be characterized as Christian and in no sense at all. Can the Lord of the Rings, that both words are informed with the spirit of Christianity is clear.

00:25:31.000 --> 00:25:44.000

However, the secret after explicit Christian reference will find little in either book to get a grip on into quote, what my question how it worked can be informed but the spirit of that which makes no appearances in it.

00:25:44.000 --> 00:25:51.000

The key word here is explicit how explicit doesn't element have to be to be significant.

00:25:51.000 --> 00:25:55.000

Is it the stone table or nothing.

00:25:55.000 --> 00:26:13.000

Or why is this important to Pflieger, because the less profoundly and I'm ambiguously Christian, the religious or philosophical basis of tokens work he is, the more room there is in, is it for the end justices and contradiction that she sees as the key.

00:26:13.000 --> 00:26:15.000

So hopefully your concludes.

00:26:15.000 --> 00:26:24.000

But readers see Is there even when they're seeing contradictory things instead of wrestling with tokens contradictions instead of trying to reconcile them.

00:26:24.000 --> 00:26:37.000

I propose that we take them for what they are opposing and conflicting sides of one person whose contention makes him what he is the Keystone that creates the arch.

00:26:37.000 --> 00:26:42.000
Without it, there is just a pile of bricks.

00:26:42.000 --> 00:26:48.000
I think this is one of the most interesting and

00:26:48.000 --> 00:26:52.000
and enlightening.

00:26:52.000 --> 00:26:53.000
Talking we've had in recent days and if I'm trying to give a corrective to it.

00:26:53.000 --> 00:27:09.000
We've had in recent days and if I'm trying to give a corrective to it. It's with great gratitude for the fact that that I think Berlin has raised some really really good questions. Even if I'm not going to answer them in quite the same way.

00:27:09.000 --> 00:27:16.000
So, there's the Keystone, let's move on to the cornerstone.

00:27:16.000 --> 00:27:22.000
There's one more than one way to give order to a pile of bricks, I'm going to attempt my way now.

00:27:22.000 --> 00:27:41.000
Is it possible to find a greater coherence between the contrasting themes that flicker delineate so well and find it in a way that makes that coherent and effective window into the power of cocaine's vision as effective opened into the power of proteins

00:27:41.000 --> 00:27:42.000
vision.

00:27:42.000 --> 00:27:59.000
Perhaps we can find in this pile, not just the key zones Keystone, but also the cornerstone of a foundation that could let us see these breaks as part of the power from which we can still look out upon the see clearly Tolkien song though conflict, much

00:27:59.000 --> 00:28:11.000
less a contradiction between darkness and despair, and the light and hope of you catastrophe. And he thought the content of this Christian faith provided the bigger picture into which both of those elements coherently fit.

00:28:11.000 --> 00:28:26.000

Peter Christ, I think summarizes it well tokens characters he says are crypto Christians, They do not know, believe mentioned wonder about or elegant eyes Christian doctrine.

00:28:26.000 --> 00:28:29.000
Clearly, That's true.

00:28:29.000 --> 00:28:40.000
But Christ says they exemplify exactly what life would be like if the Christian claims were true. I hope to show that that is also correct.

00:28:40.000 --> 00:28:57.000
This is shown by tokens own comments about light and darkness, it is shown by his own comments about his legendary him, and most importantly, it is shown by the plot structure of legendary in itself, and the beliefs of the wise within it.

00:28:57.000 --> 00:29:14.000
In her book Pflieger was aware that these contrasting themes do not have to be seen in conflict, much less contradiction token thought that man, each man and all men and all their work showed by is a thing no Christian need despise nevertheless flicker

00:29:14.000 --> 00:29:27.000
still saw a conflict without resolution because the balance is tipped the emotional way is on the dark side and the way that she reads it in the recent so he doubles down on the conflict as contradiction.

00:29:27.000 --> 00:29:42.000
But is the balance really tipped or is what Pflieger for sees as an imbalance, simply a reflection of the fact that we know less than the characters still live in our de Mart.

00:29:42.000 --> 00:29:57.000
And in an age of our tomorrow in the morning is a present fact, and the restoration and unfinished process that requires us to as the Apostle Paul put it, walk by faith and not by sight.

00:29:57.000 --> 00:30:02.000
Tolkien expressed it exactly the same letter to any Ronald.

00:30:02.000 --> 00:30:18.000
I am a Christian and indeed a Roman Catholic so that I do not expect history to be anything but a long defeat. Though it contains. And in a legend may contain more clearly and movingly some samples or glimpses of final victory.

00:30:18.000 --> 00:30:35.000
I wonder what legend he might have been talking about the fact that these samples are only glimpsed faith, not site does not for cocaine make them any less poignant or powerful than the darkness rather the contrary, as he wrote to Camilla, and when the

00:30:35.000 --> 00:30:49.000

chief purpose of life for any one of us is to increase according to our capacity, the knowledge of God by all means we have to be moved by it to praise and things.

00:30:49.000 --> 00:31:07.000

The possibility of praise and thanks. In the midst of present suffering and in the absence of any final victory yet experienced in the is precisely what Tolkien's Christian faith purports to offer such hope is based in the primary world on the knowledge

00:31:07.000 --> 00:31:17.000

of God that Tolkien Christian revelation could give us. And in the secondary world on an understanding of the character of a little bit tar that is ultimately what sustains the wise.

00:31:17.000 --> 00:31:30.000

Tolkien would not have accused him of contradiction for holding to it. The place to start in any discussion of tokens you have his own story is the famous letter to Murray.

00:31:30.000 --> 00:31:41.000

The Lord of the Rings is of course it fundamentally, of course, a fundamentally religious and Catholic work unconsciously so at first, but consciously in the revision.

00:31:41.000 --> 00:31:56.000

For the religious element is absorbed into the story and the symbolism, let her make some strong claims consciously and the revision means that despite the lack of conscious awareness or intention of including Christian meaning at first.

00:31:56.000 --> 00:32:11.000

Tolkien not only became increasingly aware of the many ways in which is almost deeply held religious beliefs had informed the work, but took deliberate steps to strengthen their presence and role as the word.

00:32:11.000 --> 00:32:15.000

I don't know what else consciously in the revision could mean.

00:32:15.000 --> 00:32:20.000

The result was sexually felt justified in using the verb, the adverb fundamentally.

00:32:20.000 --> 00:32:29.000

There's nothing approaching allegory, but the religious element is not that significant or deeply ingrained for that being absorbed into the story.

00:32:29.000 --> 00:32:43.000

I would argue that the burden of proof is on anyone who would discount these claims. I think they are upheld by the weakness of the arguments Pflieger urges against them, and by the fact that as I hope to show they are justified by the most coherent reading

00:32:43.000 --> 00:32:48.000
of the legendary on itself.

00:32:48.000 --> 00:33:06.000
Pfleger lays great stress on Murray's opinion that Tolkien was depressed that the Lord of the Rings reflects that depression as much as as Christianity, and that therefore Murray could not support an interpretation that made its Christianity, Central,

00:33:06.000 --> 00:33:21.000
but that is precisely what it is an opinion, it needs to be set beside class Kilby's opinion. After spending extended time with Tolkien helping him with the alien that my experience with Tolkien made it clear to me that he was a devout Christian and very

00:33:21.000 --> 00:33:33.000
sure of a larger fulfillment beyond the grave Murray's opinion is interesting, but if we find that Christian things and motifs play a central role in the story.

00:33:33.000 --> 00:33:50.000
It hardly constitutes an argument against that row Pfleger also cites tokens comment that the book is not a Christian myth anyhow, and that he intended the work to be consonant with Christian thought and belief in your country is it consonant with is

00:33:50.000 --> 00:34:05.000
is a long way from, fundamentally, but there's not necessarily any paradox in those statements at all. Tolkien could very well have meant by not a Christian myth, simply that the story was not written to be a precise parallel to the gospel in the way

00:34:05.000 --> 00:34:08.000
the Tolkien objected to, and then audio books.

00:34:08.000 --> 00:34:22.000
The structure of the secondary world and the meaning of what happens in it could still be fundamentally Christian in significant ways and consonant with does not have to be a long way from fundamentally, it can be but it doesn't have to be.

00:34:22.000 --> 00:34:24.000
So how should we take it.

00:34:24.000 --> 00:34:33.000
I think we are generally to interpret the Ryder statements as being consistent in fact when they are capable of being written that way unless we have a very good reason not to.

00:34:33.000 --> 00:34:38.000
I don't find the reasons Pfleger advances to be compelling.

00:34:38.000 --> 00:34:45.000

That Tolkien myth fundamentally is confirmed by the draft a letter to Michael straight.

00:34:45.000 --> 00:34:55.000

I would claim he says I did not think it presumptuous and once I will instructed to have as one object the elucidation of truth, and the encouragement of good morals.

00:34:55.000 --> 00:35:03.000

In the real world by the agent device of exemplifying them and unfamiliar embodiments that may tend to bring them home.

00:35:03.000 --> 00:35:13.000

Okay, the self deprecation does not cancel the elucidation nor does the familiarity of the embodiments compromise their effectiveness for some readers, it helps in bringing them home.

00:35:13.000 --> 00:35:35.000

Ultimately the story itself must tell us whether Tokyo, or Murray's vision is correct.

00:35:35.000 --> 00:35:46.000

from enjoying the Shire he has saved and the inescapable reality of his pain is juxtaposed with me or hits of the possibility of healing and I'm on the healing we never get to see.

00:35:46.000 --> 00:35:49.000

In other words for Pflieger site Trump's faith.

00:35:49.000 --> 00:35:58.000

And the fact that site of suffering is not matched by sight of healing for stalls, any view of the work that sees resolution between them.

00:35:58.000 --> 00:36:05.000

Is that a fair reading, or is there evidence that Tolkien was up to something else.

00:36:05.000 --> 00:36:16.000

It appears that he certainly thought that he was in letters to different people at different times it's easy to find passages that do not appear to be consistent.

00:36:16.000 --> 00:36:33.000

In a draft to Mrs j Berman photo failed because the power of evil in the world is not finally resistible by finite creatures however good, But in the draft them is is Eileen Eldar for I don't it's not a moral failure because the breaking of his mind and

00:36:33.000 --> 00:36:49.000

pressure. After torment is parallel to the breaking of his body, the contradiction is only apparent in the first statement photo fails to complete his assignment, while the second qualifies this failure was not a moral failure, but rather a matter of

00:36:49.000 --> 00:36:52.000
having simply been overwhelmed by the ring.

00:36:52.000 --> 00:37:06.000
In either case, Frodo deserved Tolkien says all honor because he spent every drop of his power of will and body. And that was just sufficient to bring him to the Destin point.

00:37:06.000 --> 00:37:11.000
We're going good takeover. and no further.

00:37:11.000 --> 00:37:28.000
Talking them did not simply think of Frodo as carrying a burden of guilt that hindered his finding peace in the Shire cooking describes photos growing disquiet as including a temptation, out of the dark, to feel and and reasoning self reproach.

00:37:28.000 --> 00:37:37.000
But this is described as a temptation for the wrestles with, and sometimes used to not as simply the ongoing quality of his inner life.

00:37:37.000 --> 00:37:55.000
Yes, he could not finally shake it off and yes he needed emotional healing that he could not find in the Shire, but token follows the tentative statement of which legalized Greg way healing, if that can be done with a more positively affirmative conclusion

00:37:55.000 --> 00:38:11.000
Frodo went to a purgatory into a reward for a while, a period of reflection and peace and a gaining of a true understanding of this position in bitterness in littleness, and in greatness spent still in time in the natural beauty of art on Mars the earth

00:38:11.000 --> 00:38:29.000
spoke by evil Frodo with their. He was rewarded with peace and understanding and tokens final summation the earlier tentativeness in Division of photos future has disappeared

00:38:29.000 --> 00:38:46.000
into the sunset dress of letters, responding questioners Tolkien gives his most extensive commentary on the meaning of friends experience at one Tolkien explains the salvation of the world and photos own salvation is achieved by his previous pity and

00:38:46.000 --> 00:39:02.000
forgiveness of injury. Any prudent person would have told Frodo that God would certainly betrayed him and him to pity him to forbear to kill him was a piece of folly, or a mystical belief in the ultimate value in itself of pity and generosity.

00:39:02.000 --> 00:39:06.000
Even if disastrous in the world of time.

00:39:06.000 --> 00:39:23.000

He did rob him and injure him in the end, but by a grace that last betrayal was at a precise juncture, where the final evil deed was the most beneficial thing anyone could have done for Frodo by a situation situation created by His forgiveness, he was

00:39:23.000 --> 00:39:28.000
saved himself and relieved of his bird.

00:39:28.000 --> 00:39:43.000
Doom was very justly is honors by everybody except his fellow hobbits and the Shire Tolkien thought the front of salvation was achieved. He was also relieved of his burden and just recorded the highest honors.

00:39:43.000 --> 00:39:48.000
His salvation is not just achieved its achievement is at the very heart of pokey vision.

00:39:48.000 --> 00:39:53.000
Now, it's true that.

00:39:53.000 --> 00:40:06.000
Excuse me. It's true that photos relief. Let me catch up in the slides here is true that photos relief was not fully experienced in the world of time.

00:40:06.000 --> 00:40:24.000
Photos bleak and the value of pity is revealed as correct, not by his experience in tied his life in the Shire, but precisely by the force shadow wings of healing beyond it that include the dream it Bama deals house or wins intention, arrogance faith

00:40:24.000 --> 00:40:27.000
to be on the circles of the world there is more than memory, etc.

00:40:27.000 --> 00:40:38.000
We do not see the sunrise in the far green country, not because it's more doubtful than darkness, but because we like Sam Marion Pippin still in the world of time.

00:40:38.000 --> 00:40:56.000
But if we can suspend our disbelief in the premises of tokens world that lack of sight does not make the sunrise sunrise less real whether or not we can believe that the Christian story is true in the primary world in Tokyo secondary world we are precisely

00:40:56.000 --> 00:41:03.000
asked to suspend our disbelief in the real possibility of walking by faith and not by sight.

00:41:03.000 --> 00:41:09.000
As the key to True Vision.

00:41:09.000 --> 00:41:11.000
Looking at.

00:41:11.000 --> 00:41:22.000

If you reread all the passages dealing with Frodo in the ring, you will see that not only was it quite impossible for him to surrender the ring, but that his failure was Adam rated from far back.

00:41:22.000 --> 00:41:29.000

He was honored because he had accepted the burden voluntarily and had been done all that was within his utmost strength to do.

00:41:29.000 --> 00:41:37.000

He and the cause were saved by Mercy by the Supreme value and efficacy of pity and forgiveness.

00:41:37.000 --> 00:41:42.000

Once again, Frodo and the calls are safe, not just the cause.

00:41:42.000 --> 00:41:52.000

The difference is that the cause, saving Shire happens in time, because the Shire exists within the circles of the world.

00:41:52.000 --> 00:42:02.000

For down salvation is a fact. But it's a fact that cannot, it will not be fully experienced within the circles of the world in time.

00:42:02.000 --> 00:42:17.000

We walk by faith and not by sight. This is not a contradiction. It is a recognition recognition of the eschatological that is teleological and world historical framework within which we live.

00:42:17.000 --> 00:42:28.000

As you probably know eschatology is that branch of Christian theology that deals with the end times with how history is going to end.

00:42:28.000 --> 00:42:40.000

And I think there's an eschatology from Middle Earth as well and it's the thing that makes sense of what Pflieger sees as a contradiction.

00:42:40.000 --> 00:42:50.000

So much for tokens comments outside of the work authors are not infallible interpreters, have their own work, but Tolkien was a good interpreter works in general.

00:42:50.000 --> 00:42:57.000

Therefore we should accept his interpretation of the legendary him. If it is supported by the story itself.

00:42:57.000 --> 00:43:11.000

I believe there we will find that consistent perspective of the wise of Middle Earth, combined with key elements of the plot to suggest that token knew exactly what he was doing.

00:43:11.000 --> 00:43:26.000

This light for those compromise victory at the climax of the trilogy turns out to be part of a larger pattern of experience that we could simply call life in our the mark for order has been marred by the rebellion Intel Core.

00:43:26.000 --> 00:43:36.000

And that is an inescapable fact that will not go away until the final court of the music flowing from the third thing that lies only with a little bit tar himself.

00:43:36.000 --> 00:43:40.000

That is why the silver alien ends like this.

00:43:40.000 --> 00:43:42.000

Here is the Sumerian.

00:43:42.000 --> 00:43:58.000

If it has passed from the high and the beautiful to darkness and ruin this was evolved the fate of our tomorrow. And if any change shall come in the morning be amended, I mean why would you even bring that up, except to make people wonder if that's going

00:43:58.000 --> 00:44:00.000

to happen.

00:44:00.000 --> 00:44:12.000

If any change shall come in the morning be amended my way and Varda may know, I think they do, but they have not revealed it and it is not declared in the do's of men das.

00:44:12.000 --> 00:44:31.000

The amending lies in the third thing, and hits, not even Monday Varda or Monday was fully comprehend it, nor can they reveal it to me and Or else, but they know it is coming, because the music has already been played, and in fact did in in a resolution

00:44:31.000 --> 00:44:51.000

that is therefore, every bit as much a part of ultimate reality as male cores discord is its memory is already part of their experience. So when a loop of tar said he let it be the final chord became as certain part of the history of Arda, as any moment

00:44:51.000 --> 00:44:55.000

being experienced in the present or remembered from the past.

00:44:55.000 --> 00:45:04.000

Yet the damage unreleased by Mel core can never be wholly mended until the end, which is not part of the Third Age nor yet the fourth.

00:45:04.000 --> 00:45:13.000

Both of these realities are true of our the as we experience it in time and they are not logically contradictory.

00:45:13.000 --> 00:45:22.000

It is because of their faith in the coming final chord that the children will look at our can oppose the evil works of more guff and sorrow and do so with hope.

00:45:22.000 --> 00:45:32.000

Even in times of great darkness, but it is a hope they know full well will never be complete fulfill

00:45:32.000 --> 00:45:41.000

that knowledge is why darkness and light hope and despair joy and sorrow, always appear together in tokens tales, why we never get to see on the white light.

00:45:41.000 --> 00:45:45.000

Although an image of it does flicker around the high elves.

00:45:45.000 --> 00:46:00.000

There is no minimizing of the darkness lies that milk or the mighty and a curse more Gotham clear sowed in the hearts of elves and men are a seed that does not die and cannot be destroyed and ever denied it sprouts a new and will bear dark fruit, even

00:46:00.000 --> 00:46:03.000

unto the latest days.

00:46:03.000 --> 00:46:13.000

That is why if joyful is the fountain that rises in the sun it springs are in the wells of sorrow and fathoms in the foundations of the earth.

00:46:13.000 --> 00:46:28.000

And that is why the word of the ring ended in victory and looked for, and in sorrow long for saying it's because of where this is in the overall history of the world as it moves toward the toward the end.

00:46:28.000 --> 00:46:32.000

not because there's any inherent contradiction between light and darkness.

00:46:32.000 --> 00:46:49.000

This pairing of light and darkness joy and sorrow is a consistent motif, not because Tolkien was conflicted over which was stronger or which would ultimately win because he's telling stories about the age of RMR in which we live, between the marketing

00:46:49.000 --> 00:47:03.000

and the final court about this age of the world and doers. While these measures of the music play out, it will always be true. That is surely as the Lord began and labor so Mel core would undo it are corrupted.

00:47:03.000 --> 00:47:14.000

And yet, their labor was not all in vain. How can you have that last sentence. It's only if you have that larger context that the last sentence makes any sense at all.

00:47:14.000 --> 00:47:30.000

CS Lewis. This is why he shows up in this slide, by the way, CS Lewis understood such language well in a letter to Tolkien of 1962 he wrote, I know that one can at best, only wound, not kill the dragon.

00:47:30.000 --> 00:47:42.000

All my philosophy of history hangs upon a sentence of your own deeds were done that were not wholly in vain.

00:47:42.000 --> 00:47:47.000

It really captures the the the complex balance that Tolkien has given us.

00:47:47.000 --> 00:48:04.000

Both men capture the essence of a shared Christian philosophy of history that flows from Christian eschatology all utopianism of the present all foolish promises of a war to end all wars are ruled out because of the fall in our past.

00:48:04.000 --> 00:48:16.000

Yet despair is equally ruled out hope remains in deeds not wholly invalid can be done because of the ESCA time in our future.

00:48:16.000 --> 00:48:33.000

That's good time the final chord of the great music is why hope remains despite the depths of the darkness that flicker describes so well. and why these holy invader worth attempting and sacrifices worth making, even by mortals like Aragorn who know full

00:48:33.000 --> 00:48:37.000

well that they will not live to see their final fruition.

00:48:37.000 --> 00:48:41.000

Luca tar is still conducting the symphony he is still at work in are the.

00:48:41.000 --> 00:49:02.000

That is why again das wisdom really is wisdom, and not the honorable folly, it must seem to one like dinner for whose faith has been overwhelmed by sight, through the palantir working on his own hubris Gandalf is wise precisely because he can remember

00:49:02.000 --> 00:49:06.000

the whole story and how it ends.

00:49:06.000 --> 00:49:13.000

And consequently he does not think like one whose vision is limited to what can be seen with the eyes of flesh.

00:49:13.000 --> 00:49:23.000

Behind that there was something else that were something beyond any design of the Rainmaker I can put it no plainer than by saying that Bilbo was meant to find the ring and not by its maker.

00:49:23.000 --> 00:49:34.000

That may be an encouraging thought Gandalf could not put it any plainer then but the silver alien makes it cleaner, when you see it as the backdrop and the larger context.

00:49:34.000 --> 00:49:45.000

The same perspective moves Gilder to say that in this meeting there may be more than chance.

00:49:45.000 --> 00:49:49.000

Though

00:49:49.000 --> 00:50:00.000

we find my place again moves guild or to say that in this meeting there may be more than chance. It enables L. Ron to believe that the members of the council were called, though he did not call them.

00:50:00.000 --> 00:50:12.000

You were coming are here Matt in the very nick of time by chances it may seem that it is not so believe rather than didn't so ordered that we who sit here and no others must now find counsel for the parents of the world.

00:50:12.000 --> 00:50:15.000

Who's ordered it wasn't him.

00:50:15.000 --> 00:50:32.000

The wise are the wise precisely because they know who is ordering things and to quiet, and that is why they listened to and amplify the voice of Olmo in the armor of fate.

00:50:32.000 --> 00:50:34.000

There we go.

00:50:34.000 --> 00:50:36.000

in the armor of faith.

00:50:36.000 --> 00:50:50.000

As the children of Earth name it, there is ever a rift in the walls of a breach until the filmmaking, which we call the end. So it shall be while I endure a secret voice that gainsay us in a light, where darkness was decreed, and they know that the end

00:50:50.000 --> 00:51:05.000

is not yet, because we in the present. We live in our the marred as the ring bear Frodo is the place in the legendary I'm where the themes of the music, meet with their greatest intensity.

00:51:05.000 --> 00:51:07.000

I think this.

00:51:07.000 --> 00:51:17.000

This will be my explanation to why as to why Frodo is not actually being betrayed in the ending.

00:51:17.000 --> 00:51:30.000

As the ring bear, bear he is the place in the legendary and with the themes of the music meet with their greatest intensity. His experience them is not unique, it is life and art of Mark writ large.

00:51:30.000 --> 00:51:48.000

It is life and art of hard and concentrated form, his experiences the same experience everyone has it's just more clear in him, the elves must eventually lose rhythm Dale or Loria to return to Emma, More home in all of them must say goodbye all to quickly

00:51:48.000 --> 00:51:50.000

that everything they have built.

00:51:50.000 --> 00:52:05.000

Perhaps the ends express this reality most clearly in their search for the wise and the statement that I think is paradigmatic for the whole work, and could be a description of Frodo as well.

00:52:05.000 --> 00:52:22.000

We believe that we may meet again in the time to come and perhaps we will find somewhere a land where we can live together, and both be content, but it is for boated that that will only be when we have both lost all that we now have is that not a description

00:52:22.000 --> 00:52:34.000

of everyone's experience in Middle Earth Frodo to must lose all that he now has back into the Shire to find something higher, the wounds of the ring remove the veil.

00:52:34.000 --> 00:52:41.000

They mean that he faces consciously and more quickly. what is ultimately true for every other person as well.

00:52:41.000 --> 00:52:56.000

Sam will eventually have to say farewell to Rosie, with or without the understanding that Aragorn shows in the tale of Aragorn in Ireland, or good does not sugarcoat it, there is no comfort for such pain within the circles of the world.

00:52:56.000 --> 00:53:11.000

But, walking by faith and not by sight he knows how the music ends and can therefore say, let us not be overthrown at the final test to have over announced the shadow in the ring in sorrow, we must go but not in despair.

00:53:11.000 --> 00:53:14.000

That doesn't sound like a lack of resolution to me.

00:53:14.000 --> 00:53:25.000

Behold, we are not bound forever to the circles of the world and beyond them is more than memory, the Shire then is a very good thing and worth saving.

00:53:25.000 --> 00:53:31.000

But it is a pleasant in on the journey, not the final destination.

00:53:31.000 --> 00:53:49.000

This world is named Middle Earth. After all, after the medieval concept of the place of testing suspended in a very precise middle between heaven and hell for those wounds impel him onward at a more rapid pace toward that higher destination.

00:53:49.000 --> 00:53:54.000

They do not compromise, either its existence, or its certainty.

00:53:54.000 --> 00:54:00.000

Photos last days in the Shire I think our narrated in a manner consistent with this outlook.

00:54:00.000 --> 00:54:14.000

He truly suffers Gandalf observes that there are some moves that cannot be wholly cured, at least not in this world. In photo has moments when it's gone forever and now all those darken empty, but he always recovers from those moments, and he has good

00:54:14.000 --> 00:54:28.000

days that he is able to enjoy days when his salmon, feel the true. I am all right. Otherwise, say for his missing finger.

00:54:28.000 --> 00:54:33.000

He is able to put his real pain in context and be philosophical about it.

00:54:33.000 --> 00:54:37.000

I have been too deeply hurt, Sam.

00:54:37.000 --> 00:54:41.000

I tried to say the shy and it's been saved, but not for me.

00:54:41.000 --> 00:54:47.000

It was often be So Sam and things are in dangerous Someone has to lose them give them up so that others may keep them.

00:54:47.000 --> 00:55:00.000

The point is, he's able to believe that his sufferings had a purpose, which I think is absolutely key to whether or not your sufferings are devastating to you or not.

00:55:00.000 --> 00:55:09.000

He is able to believe that his sufferings had a purpose. that's absolutely essential.

00:55:09.000 --> 00:55:17.000

most significant. It is reported at the end that he was filled with a sadness that was yet blast and without bitterness.

00:55:17.000 --> 00:55:30.000

This is not a betrayal nor is it an ending with all its soberness to a tail that embodies a contradiction without resolution between light and darkness despair and hope.

00:55:30.000 --> 00:55:46.000

There is no reason not to feel the full force of the foreshadowing of a fully blessing in for Frodo r1 had said, if your hurts grieve you still in the memory of your Britain is heavy, then you may pass into the West until all your wounds and readiness

00:55:46.000 --> 00:55:47.000

are healed.

00:55:47.000 --> 00:56:01.000

She did not say for a chance of healing, or in case you can be healed. But until all your wounds in weariness are healed until all your wounds and we're in this are healed.

00:56:01.000 --> 00:56:14.000

This is a little bit from one passage that Pflieger quotes but when we're words inside the story have to have precedence over the words outside the story.

00:56:14.000 --> 00:56:19.000

When there is any conflict between the one gentle reminder we had a five minute warning.

00:56:19.000 --> 00:56:26.000

Thank you. and we are almost done. Fortunately,

00:56:26.000 --> 00:56:40.000

it's in the light of that promise that we read that, it seems to him that in as in his dream in the house of Bombadil for shadowing this there for some reason, the gray rain curtain turned all the silver glass and was rolled back, and he'd be held by

00:56:40.000 --> 00:56:59.000

chores and began them as far green country under a swift sunrise Pflieger may not ever get there in her essay I certainly hope she will get there in reality, but Frodo does Keystone or corner stuff.

00:56:59.000 --> 00:57:08.000

Well perhaps we can see both if we stand back at the right distance to see the tower, as

00:57:08.000 --> 00:57:24.000

the spec begins on Islam and Christianity are indeed presented with a creative tension that precisely because it is able fully to embody the power of both sides of those pairs drives the plot so that it pierces the profoundness depth of reality and I

00:57:24.000 --> 00:57:29.000

think fingers SA is so valuable in the way it brings this out.

00:57:29.000 --> 00:57:38.000

But Tolkien as the Keystone those this two sided arch together is a wonderful metaphor for which we're very grateful to Berlin.

00:57:38.000 --> 00:57:44.000

But perhaps a better understanding of the Christian philosophy of history.

00:57:44.000 --> 00:58:00.000

The biblical eschatology that underlies tokens work can allow us to see that it is the coherence, not the contradiction between those pairs been seen in that larger context that allows them to function so powerfully.

00:58:00.000 --> 00:58:08.000

It allows us in other words to see that the Keystone and the arch at host together are solid the grounded in the cornerstone of tokens worldview.

00:58:08.000 --> 00:58:12.000

That is why from the top of this tower.

00:58:12.000 --> 00:58:20.000

We may still look out upon the sea.

00:58:20.000 --> 00:58:36.000

You don't need the primary sources you know them as well as I do if you find the line of thinking in this paper interesting and you want more where it's come from comes from, you can hear.

00:58:36.000 --> 00:58:38.000

Thank you.

00:58:38.000 --> 00:58:41.000

We have, what a minute or two to spare.

00:58:41.000 --> 00:58:47.000

Since we have a little bit of a break. Starting right after this we can go right up to the hour I want to make sure you have time for questions.

00:58:47.000 --> 00:58:54.000

Thank you.

00:58:54.000 --> 00:59:14.000

Um, I wanted to follow up on something you said about Berlin's approach to a family, because it is betrayal, and that it's not a Christian myth. I'm back.

00:59:14.000 --> 00:59:19.000

I think it was at the

00:59:19.000 --> 00:59:34.000

Nashville DEF CON I gave a paper called Frodo and the failure of the Christ figure which hasn't been printed in Miraflores simply because Janet thinks I need to expand on some of my argument.

00:59:34.000 --> 00:59:51.000

I haven't had time to do that. But my point was that Tolkien was not going to write a Christ figure who gets the happy ending. Because as a devout Christian.

00:59:51.000 --> 00:59:54.000

There is only one Christ.

00:59:54.000 --> 01:00:09.000

So no Christ figure in his literature is going to have a complete experience of the Christ aspect, you know from the sacrifice to the resurrection.

01:00:09.000 --> 01:00:17.000

And that's why Frodo doesn't get it that we see, because he's mortal. We don't get it the side of death.

01:00:17.000 --> 01:00:33.000

And the other point was that I think Tolkien was very affected by something, Charles that's fear that Charles Williams is very adamant about, and that is that a savior cannot save himself.

01:00:33.000 --> 01:00:36.000

Only Christ can do that because Christ is God.

01:00:36.000 --> 01:00:41.000

And so, there's no way for you to get the happy ending.

01:00:41.000 --> 01:00:44.000

Because he does save the world.

01:00:44.000 --> 01:00:46.000

but not for himself.

01:00:46.000 --> 01:00:48.000

He doesn't look at.

01:00:48.000 --> 01:00:52.000

Yeah, no way he's going to get it at the end of the book.

01:00:52.000 --> 01:00:58.000

Yeah, but we are shown that he ultimately gets it.

01:00:58.000 --> 01:01:11.000

Yeah shadow that that Frodo is not damned he's not last. He's right. Remember the Middle Earth equivalent of saved may be Frodo gets it.

01:01:11.000 --> 01:01:12.000

Yeah.

01:01:12.000 --> 01:01:28.000

But he, he doesn't get it in the way we see it in terms of storytelling, huh, yeah that that's another way of explaining why you just get right up to that vision but then.

01:01:28.000 --> 01:01:36.000

Everything goes away from God gets to see it but we don't write

01:01:36.000 --> 01:01:46.000

a yield to the next person. Well no, I think, I think what you're saying is, is complimentary and interesting and I hope you do flesh it out.

01:01:46.000 --> 01:01:49.000

Yeah, it's just, Janet.

01:01:49.000 --> 01:01:59.000

I haven't had the time to do the scholarship that I needed to add.

01:01:59.000 --> 01:02:12.000

That's okay, I think I'm next. Um, it's an excellent paper but it seems to me that the largest part of it is a fuselage towards an occupied position.

01:02:12.000 --> 01:02:22.000

I'm nothing, although Berlin does talk about the

01:02:22.000 --> 01:02:40.000

tentativeness in that one statement of talking about what photo will get. She is in no way denying that the final Christian eschatological victory exists in talking her argument is that it's a very thin.

01:02:40.000 --> 01:02:52.000

In the story, you are acknowledging that it's thin, and you're saying that the reason for that is because it's a story told within the context of art of art.

01:02:52.000 --> 01:03:09.000

Berlin agrees with you. That's why it's then. The problem is, whether you how you see it. You said early in the paper that by studying the Lord of the Rings itself, we will discover whether Marie's vision is accurate or not.

01:03:09.000 --> 01:03:20.000

Well, Maria, read the Lord of the Rings, so he, his interpretation. It says completely valid as any other readers interpretation.

01:03:20.000 --> 01:03:23.000

I think that the.

01:03:23.000 --> 01:03:43.000

The resolution between these contradictory viewpoints is not to be seen in any evidence from the Lord of the Rings itself, or from tokens of the writings, is to be seen in the perspective of the viewer alone.

01:03:43.000 --> 01:04:01.000

And I would say that there's one point in your paper where you hit upon what I think is the proper metaphor, you might say, if you wish to be

digging enough in saying it that Berlin's problem is that she spent too much time looking into Dennis whores

01:04:01.000 --> 01:04:06.000
palantir.

01:04:06.000 --> 01:04:12.000
That is very interesting, summation.

01:04:12.000 --> 01:04:24.000
I'm not sure I read her essay exactly the same way you do and of course it's out there and everybody can go back through it.

01:04:24.000 --> 01:04:45.000
And in case you didn't know, this is a filler version of what you just heard, will be in mythical work very very glad that that's going to happen so that the to the conversation can continue.

01:04:45.000 --> 01:04:53.000
And one thing I want to reiterate, is that if I said anything worth hearing in this paper.

01:04:53.000 --> 01:05:09.000
You can give half of the credit to Berlin, because you wouldn't think that my great ball could stand on those dainty feminine shoulders, but certainly something that's happening here.

01:05:09.000 --> 01:05:15.000
Good job of summarizing her points at the beginning.

01:05:15.000 --> 01:05:28.000
So,

01:05:28.000 --> 01:05:31.000
I think that.

01:05:31.000 --> 01:05:35.000
I think that if you limit yourself to the Lord of the Rings.

01:05:35.000 --> 01:05:46.000
I would agree with what you say that it's not in the story if you see the Lord of the Rings. As part of larger hole that includes the silver alien, and the island.

01:05:46.000 --> 01:05:50.000
I Ireland ballet.

01:05:50.000 --> 01:06:03.000
I think it is. That is, you know, how is Gandalf able to take risks that sound like under stupid stupidity to dinosaur.

01:06:03.000 --> 01:06:17.000
And in fact, towns like under stupidity to even, even us sometimes and and the answer is that

01:06:17.000 --> 01:06:34.000

he has access to knowledge about the way the world works, and about who's ultimately in control of things that make those risks possible.

01:06:34.000 --> 01:06:42.000

And he said, to encourage the free people of Middle Earth to continue the struggle.

01:06:42.000 --> 01:06:49.000

And it is that memory of the great music that enables him to do that.

01:06:49.000 --> 01:06:50.000

The wise.

01:06:50.000 --> 01:06:54.000

The wise are those who accept that perspective.

01:06:54.000 --> 01:07:09.000

The foolish, like denna for like Solomon, like they have done almost fortunately he was recovered, are the ones who refused to see it are the ones who who don't look at things that way.

01:07:09.000 --> 01:07:17.000

Well, I said, it's a very interesting thing that are done which is. You say that the Lord of the Rings.

01:07:17.000 --> 01:07:29.000

Maybe does not give that perspective but the summit really does. I'd say it's almost the other way around. The Lord of the Rings seemed to me to be a much more optimistic book, and the summer aliens seems to be much more pessimistic one.

01:07:29.000 --> 01:07:47.000

Even though it does contain the material that you say it does, but I think that is obvious enough from the Lord of the Rings itself, the tokens philosophy of the point that talking about in the end of what you were saying about how, what kind of the candles.

01:07:47.000 --> 01:07:56.000

Hope, in what seems foolishness. I think that's entirely evident from tokens philosophy The Lord of the Rings itself and doesn't need to some brilliant to explain it.

01:07:56.000 --> 01:08:20.000

Um, I think the Lord of the Rings is more optimistic. But I think the basis for that optimism is made explicit in the Sumerian and Pflieger actually said something like that, explicit implicit in the Lord of the Rings explicit in the Sumerian

01:08:20.000 --> 01:08:22.000

time for one more question.

01:08:22.000 --> 01:08:26.000

David always gives me an interesting conversation.

01:08:26.000 --> 01:08:28.000

Nancy, so.

01:08:28.000 --> 01:08:46.000

Okay. Um, three comments here. First of all those of us who grew up in the Judeo Christian tradition probably just sort of take the Lord of the Rings for granted, but a good way to see the Christian aspect is to view it from a non Christian perspective,

01:08:46.000 --> 01:09:03.000

such as the Taoist view discussed in the latest Miss car from, like, the Wizard of Oz. See, which shows you a very different way of viewing things, or even from the pagan point of view, which yet What do you have to be.

01:09:03.000 --> 01:09:25.000

You can see in the sagas, such as the treatment of Reagan Reagan by C mood or Siegfried who kills Reagan, or invalid news version seat free who kills Mima compared with photos pity for Golem, and these illuminate non Christian views, which helped to put

01:09:25.000 --> 01:09:42.000

the Christian view of the Lord of the Rings in perspective, second comment. Is it if we really wanted the Frodo to be saved in the Big Hero look at the alternate version in the history of Middle Earth where he came on all gung ho the big warrior walked

01:09:42.000 --> 01:10:02.000

all of saw Sharkey men all of that. And it rings false, whereas the final version. It was so poignant for us because it does ring true to our world, whether we are Christians who believe in an ultimate salvation over those of us who do not, it does reflect

01:10:02.000 --> 01:10:12.000

our experience, and as Bruce Leonard put it produce post traumatic syndrome is also realistic from some who has come back from combat.

01:10:12.000 --> 01:10:28.000

My final question about and somebody who's got it right. Great. When tokens later about conscious patient was he referring to the second edition or fun, before he, the first, I don't remember when that was published, because it conscious addition would

01:10:28.000 --> 01:10:37.000

be the standing silence and I can tell, I can tell that speak of that he's talking about revising the text before it was published.

01:10:37.000 --> 01:10:39.000

Okay.

01:10:39.000 --> 01:10:54.000

Thank you everybody so ever so much for your comments and your question and your wisdom, was really delightful to see the presentation, you can use your applause emoji if you'd like to, we've got a half an hour break between now and the next session.

01:10:54.000 --> 01:11:07.000

You're welcome to hang out in this room if you'd like to your welcome to the cut to the discussion on the discord channel, if that is something that you would like, or you're likely Welcome to get a sandwich, because I think eating is an important part

01:11:07.000 --> 01:11:20.000

of not becoming angry at academic conferences. So, thanks everybody when the when it comes out. I hope you'll revisit it and see what you think. At that point, great job done.

01:11:20.000 --> 01:11:23.000

Good job.

01:11:23.000 --> 01:11:25.000

Thank you, everybody.

01:11:25.000 --> 01:11:31.000

See you later. Thanks everybody later lunchtime.

01:11:31.000 --> 01:11:33.000

Yep.

01:11:33.000 --> 01:11:36.000

Nancy Do you mind if I put your hand down.

01:11:36.000 --> 01:11:39.000

She's gotten, nevermind.

01:11:39.000 --> 01:11:41.000

Oh my, am I going to be alone in the room.

01:11:41.000 --> 01:11:46.000

I didn't know. Just me and my sparkle water.

01:11:46.000 --> 01:11:58.000

Go get a snack just because I was gonna, I was gonna, I was waiting I was watching the room to make sure everything was cool. Yes, say, You got it. Okay, I'm gonna go get more Chinese food, we're good.

01:11:58.000 --> 01:12:02.000

Sophie Oh, wait, no, come back.

01:12:02.000 --> 01:12:04.000

Make me a host, no and here.

01:12:04.000 --> 01:12:13.000

I'll make you a host I gotcha, or ag well yeah who's next in your room is next in here.

01:12:13.000 --> 01:12:16.000

There you go with you in here anyway.

01:12:16.000 --> 01:12:24.000

I made it easy for myself I'm camping in the yellow room, you're smart. Okay, excellent I gotta get the blue anyway so I'm actually leaving, doesn't matter.

01:12:24.000 --> 01:12:33.000

Okay, so either Tim, or Tim or Philip, or any of the other many responsible humans. I am going to leave this room relatively unattended.

01:12:33.000 --> 01:12:38.000

Sorry, what was I was just asking you to.

01:12:38.000 --> 01:12:44.000

If you wanted me to lower your hand but that you signed off so you didn't need me to. It was a question. I miss it.

01:12:44.000 --> 01:12:49.000

You're totally fine. Awesome.

01:12:49.000 --> 01:13:19.000

Very cool. Okay, I'm going to turn off my screen to go get some food, I will.

01:22:45.000 --> 01:23:15.000

I am back to turn off my video so everybody doesn't have to watch me eat.

01:33:25.000 --> 01:33:33.000

Rob I gently muted you because you could hear you talking when I don't think you intended us to.

01:33:33.000 --> 01:33:43.000

You can unmute yourself or you can ask me too if you'd like me to.

01:33:43.000 --> 01:34:12.000

Let's see. Next up, looks like we'll have saga rewritten Matthew kidney we're in your setup period. Do you need to be able to share your screen.