

WEBVTT

00:00:00.000 --> 00:00:10.000  
going to go ahead and start the recording.

00:00:10.000 --> 00:00:18.000  
Thank you for out tech modding and this is my session detect ma, ma,  
because

00:00:18.000 --> 00:00:21.000  
there's David there's Roland.

00:00:21.000 --> 00:00:25.000  
All right.

00:00:25.000 --> 00:00:31.000  
Okay, sorry for the various tech issues.

00:00:31.000 --> 00:00:33.000  
We're still on time.

00:00:33.000 --> 00:00:37.000  
And we're still on time. How about that are out.

00:00:37.000 --> 00:00:39.000  
Okay.

00:00:39.000 --> 00:00:42.000  
Well I guess we're ready to go then.

00:00:42.000 --> 00:00:49.000  
All right, um, if you are not presenting on the panel please mute  
yourself now.

00:00:49.000 --> 00:00:56.000  
We are being recorded and will pass it over to Janet and company.

00:00:56.000 --> 00:01:00.000  
All right. Okay, we have got a fabulous panel here.

00:01:00.000 --> 00:01:02.000  
We're going to talk about.

00:01:02.000 --> 00:01:07.000  
Aaron tree and Aaron dill and the word errand.

00:01:07.000 --> 00:01:17.000  
Very linguistically close words. So does this mean something. Well, token  
loved workplace so it's quite likely that it does mean something.

00:01:17.000 --> 00:01:27.000  
And token has more than once taken themes and motifs that were first used  
in a lighter story, and then woven them, and more serious form into this  
broader legendary them.

00:01:27.000 --> 00:01:42.000

For example, the hobbits Bard priests ages Aragorn, and its lowercase ring, the central important ring at the Lord of the Rings. So in this panel we're going to explore some connections between the poem, Aaron tree from The Adventures of Tom bomb adult

00:01:42.000 --> 00:01:56.000

and Bilbo song in Britain del Aaron job was a Mariner and consider some of the ambiguities and gaps and Arundel story. Our panelists are David Brightman David Emerson Berlin Pflieger and myself Janet Brennan Croft.

00:01:56.000 --> 00:02:07.000

We're going to save questions and discussions for the end, and David Emerson is from the start us off, hire folks.

00:02:07.000 --> 00:02:10.000

Well I came into this.

00:02:10.000 --> 00:02:11.000

I'm a musician.

00:02:11.000 --> 00:02:16.000

To start with, I'm a musician, and

00:02:16.000 --> 00:02:34.000

many years ago, I forget the exact reason why but I decided to learn to play the music for Arnold swans adaptation of the road goes ever on.

00:02:34.000 --> 00:02:46.000

And most of the most of the songs in it are from Lord of the Rings and The, the adaptations the musical settings are fairly straightforward.

00:02:46.000 --> 00:02:56.000

They're not as most of them are not as simple as a regular pop song, but they are fairly conventional panel pieces.

00:02:56.000 --> 00:03:08.000

But when I got to Aaron tree with all its 16th notes all over the page and keep changes and time to nurture painters I went, What the heck is this. And as I learned to play it.

00:03:08.000 --> 00:03:27.000

I became more and more impressed with the complexity of not only the music, but how will the music matched, and code and illuminated the lyrics. And so this led me to the lyrics.

00:03:27.000 --> 00:03:36.000

And so I went back to the source it's the only one in the, in the first edition of the book that does not come from Lord of the Rings it comes from.

00:03:36.000 --> 00:03:41.000

The Adventures of Tom mom but bill.

00:03:41.000 --> 00:03:59.000

And so I looked up this thing. And what Tolkien says about it, it says it's an example of another kind of poem which seems to have Muse habits Reimer story which returns to its own beginning and so many be recited until the hears several specimens are

00:03:59.000 --> 00:04:16.000

found in the red book but others are simple and crude, this one is much the longest and most elaborate. It was obviously made by Bilbo. This is indicated by it's obvious relationship to the long poem recited by Bilbo as his own composition in the house

00:04:16.000 --> 00:04:19.000

of L. Ron.

00:04:19.000 --> 00:04:27.000

So, so talking acknowledges the connection between Aaron tree and the Rendell poem.

00:04:27.000 --> 00:04:40.000

He says in an origin, a nonsense rhyme it is in the river Dell version found transformed and applied somewhat in Congress Lee, to the high omission Newman Aryan legends of the Arundel.

00:04:40.000 --> 00:04:46.000

Probably because Bilbo invented it's medical devices and was proud of them.

00:04:46.000 --> 00:04:57.000

Now, interestingly enough, poking. Of course we know that he has compared himself to a hobbit, there's that.

00:04:57.000 --> 00:05:10.000

There's that interview where he says I am in all respects but sighs a hobbit, and also in one of the letters of jr Tolkien as I am in fact Hobbit. This is in all size.

00:05:10.000 --> 00:05:25.000

I like gardens, trees and unrecognized farmlands I smoke a pipe and like good plane food unrefrigerated but the test French cooking. I like and even dare to wearing these old days ornamental West gets, I am fond of mushrooms out of a field have a very

00:05:25.000 --> 00:05:30.000

simple sense of humor, which even my critics, find tiresome.

00:05:30.000 --> 00:05:45.000

So he's, he's acknowledging that a lot of what he describes as hobbit behavior is his own. Is it you know the author, putting himself into his characters.

00:05:45.000 --> 00:05:51.000

And so I extrapolate this to his reference to Bilbo.

00:05:51.000 --> 00:06:04.000

He says Bilbo evidently invented these metrical devices and was proud of them. I think he's talking about himself. He's saying I Ronald Tolkien invented these metrical devices and I'm proud of them.

00:06:04.000 --> 00:06:19.000

And I have this this nonsense rhyme that, you know, as we now know he wrote a long time ago, that he incorporated into the Lord of the Rings as Bilbo his poem in the house of L.

00:06:19.000 --> 00:06:21.000

Ron.

00:06:21.000 --> 00:06:35.000

And he even admits that this is somewhat in Congress to take this, this silly piece and turn it into something that's retelling the legends of the older days.

00:06:35.000 --> 00:06:48.000

So that's where I'm coming from. For this, and then how Donald Swan fits into this, he was writing the song cycle and

00:06:48.000 --> 00:07:01.000

needed needed a closer, they needed a finale, because he had all these songs from the Lord of the Rings with as I said fairly conventional musical presentation.

00:07:01.000 --> 00:07:05.000

And he said,

00:07:05.000 --> 00:07:24.000

and he had actually seen Aaron tree, a long time before because it had been kind of circular circulating around in British academic circles, or at least more among the out of the graduates, he, he got a copy in 1949.

00:07:24.000 --> 00:07:34.000

And he said when I glanced at it again for composition, Aaron streets still looked long and daunting, but less so than some of the other poems, because I knew it better.

00:07:34.000 --> 00:07:51.000

The word music, I thought, suddenly might be matched by melody. The poem is intensely atmospheric, which can truly be based on the No. The Mary passenger is on the road like the creatures and Other Poems I'd already worked on the whole story his unsuccessful

00:07:51.000 --> 00:07:58.000

courting of the butterfly is warring against the Dumbledore is how he travels to the lonely Isles.

00:07:58.000 --> 00:08:09.000

That's his era and then returned into parts again forever It's still a messenger or whether driven Mariner far from being unsellable, it was a tone poem in itself.

00:08:09.000 --> 00:08:32.000

Oh, so here you have the tone poem of the, of the poem, you have the music, you have talking, representing himself as Bilbo in Congress Lee setting his own early silly composition, to the legends of the older days and presenting it, the elves, who say,

00:08:32.000 --> 00:08:36.000

well we don't know about this we'll have to hear it again.

00:08:36.000 --> 00:08:57.000

So that's, that's where I'm coming from with Aaron tree, and there have been three instances at conferences where I have presented the entire musical piece and analyzed it practically measure by measure, certainly phrase by phrase of how the music

00:08:57.000 --> 00:09:00.000

so perfectly fits the lyrics.

00:09:00.000 --> 00:09:19.000

And somebody suggested well if Aaron tree in a Rendell of the same rhyme scheme and meter. Could you sing a Rendell to the music to Aaron tree, but it's so tightly composed as I said so tightly tied into the lyrics the rhythm of the words and the imagery,

00:09:19.000 --> 00:09:32.000

the words and what happens in the poem that I don't think you know singing. The, the, conversely

00:09:32.000 --> 00:09:37.000

grander version to the simpler version would would.

00:09:37.000 --> 00:09:53.000

And at this point, after I had presented at the New York poking conference a few years ago, David Bregman pointed out, What he's about to say now.

00:09:53.000 --> 00:09:55.000

Okay.

00:09:55.000 --> 00:10:09.000

And David Emerson mentioned the connection between Arundale and the song, their country and the song of a Rendell the double chance in the hall of fire, and the many many chapters and the Lord of the Rings.

00:10:09.000 --> 00:10:26.000

Well, he should, because they're the same poem, sort of, the one evolved into the other, and their history may be traced in the trees and device and garden one of the volumes of the posthumous history from Lord of the Rings series, edited by Christopher

00:10:26.000 --> 00:10:28.000  
talking.

00:10:28.000 --> 00:10:44.000  
Do you know the philosophical conundrum of the man, or possibly the dwarf with an axe, that wouldn't handle wears out and He replaces it, then the middle head gets severely dented possibly from an orc neck and replaces that to all the parts of the x have

00:10:44.000 --> 00:10:59.000  
now been changed, but he never discarded the old x in line of dissent, it's the same Max, but in physical content. It's been entirely replaced. So is it the same x, or a different one.

00:10:59.000 --> 00:11:16.000  
Something like that happened to Aaron tree from the earliest 40 line poem preserved, possibly the version that Tolkien read to the Oxford student Inklings club in the early 1930s to the final text but smoking intended for the Lord of the Rings but evidently

00:11:16.000 --> 00:11:29.000  
mislaidd and forgot to put in there are at least 22 texts of this poem preserved. Some hardly differing from their predecessor, and some thoroughly rewritten, but all preserving the form of the original.

00:11:29.000 --> 00:11:46.000  
The distinctive rhythmic and rhyming scheme, and the fundamental storyline, the tale of a wandering Mariner of the final versions opening lines as Brenda was a Mariner that Terry than our Viridian two words remain as far as my eye he hasn't noticed they're

00:11:46.000 --> 00:11:55.000  
the only two words of the entire poem to do so from that 40 line original, and they are was a.

00:11:55.000 --> 00:11:58.000  
Let me show you the revolution.

00:11:58.000 --> 00:12:06.000  
The 40 line poem. This is my AV you can't read this, but this is it

00:12:06.000 --> 00:12:21.000  
begins, there wasn't Mary passenger a messenger and air under. It includes the fundamentals of Aaron trees sales offer this province becomes enamored with and breaks up with the butterfly engages in long and elaborate battles and during do and return

00:12:21.000 --> 00:12:36.000  
some to realize that you forgotten his message, whenever it was, this was quickly expanded into the 92 line version to Tokyo published in a small Oxford faculty magazine in 1933.

00:12:36.000 --> 00:12:51.000

And what I have marked here is the parts of the original which were kept on the way to that verse and he exchange two of the words in the opening lines which became, there was a memory messenger, a passenger an errand or before we end up in the published

00:12:51.000 --> 00:13:02.000

version as there was a Mary passenger a messenger a Mariner this foots passenger back in the first line, and they had Mariner another word that would survive to the end.

00:13:02.000 --> 00:13:07.000

And if that sounds confusing. Welcome to Tolkien manuscript studies.

00:13:07.000 --> 00:13:23.000

But despite the storyline being the same, the 1933 text is 52 lines longer than the 40 lines original plus about it doesn't lie to the original will last and the rewriting, so it's mostly new among the new lines or this description of his armament, when

00:13:23.000 --> 00:13:32.000

he gets goes into battle of crystal was his habits and scabbard of Chelsea didn't remember those.

00:13:32.000 --> 00:13:37.000

At this point the text forks, not for the last time.

00:13:37.000 --> 00:13:48.000

For the version that Donald Swan set, published in The Adventures of Tom Bob Dylan 1962 is for the revised and text change in several places, and a few lines at it.

00:13:48.000 --> 00:14:01.000

So here I have indicated the parts that were changed which are fairly extensive actually, most notably isn't elaboration of the home that the mariner builds for his butterfly.

00:14:01.000 --> 00:14:11.000

And when the 1933 he plundered the little islands were returned for a little while and shattered the webs of all the other cops. Remember doubles insults to the spiders and more quit.

00:14:11.000 --> 00:14:20.000

In 1962 the mariner little idols found they're not blowing grass, so he is buying necessity less violent.

00:14:20.000 --> 00:14:31.000

What Tolkien wrote next probably some years after 1933 is wholly remarkable, an intermediary or hybrid version, it's framed as Aaron tree.

00:14:31.000 --> 00:14:47.000

The story is not a Arundale. And then the focus I did some stories with someone similar enough that the ones format could accommodate the other story until the otherwise Untold Story of Arundale somewhat in Congress, as they were quoted talking with one

00:14:47.000 --> 00:14:58.000

day described this juxtaposition, but we can only be pleased that he tried, and that the knack for writing in this poetic meter did not just blow out into single impulse, as he later claimed it did.

00:14:58.000 --> 00:15:12.000

The hybrid version is 116 lines longer than the publisher entry, and it's entirely rewritten with only about six lines surviving from Aaron tree like Mark, the parts that that survived here.

00:15:12.000 --> 00:15:26.000

Include including the opening. There was a gallant passenger a messenger a Mariner changing of the married two gallons and a woven steel his aperture is scabbard of Chelsea entity, moving steel instead of crystal, which would have been rather uncomfortable

00:15:26.000 --> 00:15:30.000

for a male vest, which is what the average is.

00:15:30.000 --> 00:15:45.000

In this version, the still unnamed mariners still builds a boat and sales off. And instead of meandering around and dallying with a butterfly. He passes to elven home, where the hill of Elmer in a newly invented name for tanta Cueto, and the city of Cheerio

00:15:45.000 --> 00:16:01.000

are named there the unnamed inhabitants teach him lore and armor him build a new his boat and set a star upon its mast and send them off to battle against algolia, and to visit Evernote, which must be valid on, then he turns for home, but instead of never

00:16:01.000 --> 00:16:17.000

arriving because I'm forgetting his aerate a mighty Doom is laid on him to be forever still a passenger a messenger to never rest bear his burning lamp a far, I'ma for of Westerners these words remain with minimal change from then on.

00:16:17.000 --> 00:16:30.000

Later texts of this version change them back from gallant to marry rewrite his initial voyage shorten the story and remove the battles and the illusions to is turning homework.

00:16:30.000 --> 00:16:50.000

mighty Doom remain. After that, probably more years later came another major rewriting this time the opening lines are finally the familiar, a random was a Mariner that Terry dinner Bernie retaining was a Mariner from the previous version, and that long

00:16:50.000 --> 00:16:53.000

last, naming the mariner.

00:16:53.000 --> 00:17:01.000

The opening is entirely rewritten describing his initial fruitless voyage West.

00:17:01.000 --> 00:17:18.000

For then introducing elbowing and the similar L, that the rest is only minimally revised. So in this one, I have marked what was kept from the previous version, see the beginning was mostly changed the rest mostly kept his habits and having previously

00:17:18.000 --> 00:17:28.000

gone through mithril is no silver, but it's scabbard of tell said and he still is. And that's the similar L, that hangs off his mask.

00:17:28.000 --> 00:17:33.000

A couple more revisions, led to the text that appears in the Lord of the Rings.

00:17:33.000 --> 00:17:39.000

This time, and I've marked in this one the parts that were changed.

00:17:39.000 --> 00:17:58.000

This time it's the later part of the poem that is more revised maybe as mission developed or more explicit and this description of his armor unchanged in wording is moved back to his initial singlet, as in the earliest versions, it is no he himself, who

00:17:58.000 --> 00:18:05.000

no longer the elves of elven home armor him. Instead, they close him then in elven white.

00:18:05.000 --> 00:18:16.000

But this is not the end. Evidently according to Christopher Tolkien his father embarked on further revisions based on the previous version. So this is the second fork in the mainstream transmission.

00:18:16.000 --> 00:18:32.000

And after a couple of tries pokey the merge with a fine manuscript with a few wording changes now the average citizen triple steel, plus eight new lines about the attack of the otherwise unexplained fan origins and the fleeing of LA.

00:18:32.000 --> 00:18:43.000

But apparently talking this lady's conference, and send an unrevised version off to the publisher, and when he found the missing persons years later he assumed that they preceded the published text, instead of coming after it.

00:18:43.000 --> 00:19:06.000

Christopher talking gives instructions for constructing the revision from the published text, and if you want the full version on the door and it's in Hamilton skulls The Lord of the Rings readers companion, especially we're talking notes, there's just

00:19:06.000 --> 00:19:22.000

Is that enough to make them the same poem would have said no, except that there's more to the resemblance than that. The theme, the structure. The metrical scheme and enabling them all the history of the poems composition.

00:19:22.000 --> 00:19:34.000

It remains to be explained why did Tolkien resurrect the Aaron free version for The Adventures of Tom Bombadil, and considering it's obvious resemblance to the song of Arundale, how did he explain its existence within the legendary.

00:19:34.000 --> 00:19:48.000

The answer of the latter was easy Bilbo wrote both he applied the method of his comic poem, somewhat in Congress Lisa's Tolkien in this preface that as apologetic mode, do the legend of a rental, probably because David noted Bilbo invented it's metrical

00:19:48.000 --> 00:20:03.000

devices and was proud of them. Words that apply just as well, to build them as sub creator, as to Bobo himself for it appears that Aaron tree had some struck leader so that single obstacle publication that did it and truth the oral tradition statement

00:20:03.000 --> 00:20:19.000

noted Donald Swan to come across a copy in 1949, in 1952 Tolkien had a letter from someone who'd gotten a remember text of the phone from someone else who internally gotten it from somebody else, and with no more information than the impression that it

00:20:19.000 --> 00:20:34.000

came from an English University, wrote to all the one that she could find. Unfortunately, somebody in Oxford office recognize the poem is talking, work with that degree of circulation, it is a republication, and both in his own right and it's one setting,

00:20:34.000 --> 00:20:37.000

it continues to circulate today.

00:20:37.000 --> 00:20:38.000

Thank you.

00:20:38.000 --> 00:20:43.000

So it was a meme even back then. Yes.

00:20:43.000 --> 00:20:49.000

Okay, I'm going to take the next bit here, I'm going to share a screen.

00:20:49.000 --> 00:20:55.000

Because what I'm going to show you is some of the stuff that

00:20:55.000 --> 00:20:58.000

that

00:20:58.000 --> 00:21:03.000

David was talking about there. Is it sharing. There we go.

00:21:03.000 --> 00:21:07.000

All right. Okay, so, um,

00:21:07.000 --> 00:21:15.000

okay so here's the here's the beginning bit of it here was the lyrics, did they from the.

00:21:15.000 --> 00:21:25.000

I'm using the version published in the adventure to Tom Banville and the version in the Lord of the Rings and I was not aware that there were some further changes and Donald swan.

00:21:25.000 --> 00:21:39.000

So I'm gonna have to go running back to that but as you can see, we've got these parallels. Both are mariners both build their own ships. Both are described as tearing and wondering.

00:21:39.000 --> 00:21:54.000

They, in other words, neither of them goes directly about whatever their errand is. And then there's the their arms and their armor are described in such fantastic and poetic detail that you have to run to your dictionary, specifically as David mentioned

00:21:54.000 --> 00:22:07.000

they both have a scabbard of gel suddenly they have weapons made of ebony wood and they have objects made out of Emerald. And in case you're wondering just said any is a semi precious gemstone, you might be familiar with agate, that's a type of chart

00:22:07.000 --> 00:22:16.000

70. So, it really sounds pretty darn impractical for a scabbard but it has survived through every version of this poem.

00:22:16.000 --> 00:22:35.000

Okay, and then each interacts with a winged female. I was just reading this is work on winged women that was one of that women who fly. I've been recommending and all over the place but it's really a fascinating study of the winged female character in

00:22:35.000 --> 00:22:50.000

folklore and legend and so on. So we've got these winged females own wings later faith is not part of the elbows refundable song, but an errand tree the relationship with the play the butterfly ends in bitter quarrelling.

00:22:50.000 --> 00:23:05.000

So, inventory seems to be that sort of tweed diminutive very fantasy that token road, and some of its earliest poetry, but later came to reject. But some of that language and imagery still ends up in the more serious form in the window column.

00:23:05.000 --> 00:23:19.000

So Aaron three shares a kinship with plates of fantasy like Roku shows Queen Mab speech and rumble and Juliet, or bottoms encounter with the fairies and A Midsummer Night's Dream or Alice's Adventures in Wonderland.

00:23:19.000 --> 00:23:27.000

It's quaint and pretty but there's a sense of this kind of ambiguous menace of Fairyland just around the corner if you could see it.

00:23:27.000 --> 00:23:40.000

You can catch a glimpse of something maybe mortals are not meant to see. Maybe even a risk to your sanity the risk of falling into a fugue state and being trapped and very repeating the same events over and over the way Aaron trees designed to repeat

00:23:40.000 --> 00:23:42.000

from the start.

00:23:42.000 --> 00:23:56.000

And here's where I want to propose an unusual reading of their entry, because the protagonists of both poems also encounter enchantment and bewilderment and ambiguity describing their surroundings they're never described Herod.

00:23:56.000 --> 00:24:07.000

So here's the standard for Randall Randall wonder bewildered on enchanted ways, expanding on this in the summer early on, he was defeated by shadows and enchantment.

00:24:07.000 --> 00:24:21.000

In his first attempt to reach valid or we could say that he was trapped in what we might call the girdle of Eleanor comparing it to the girdle which the powerful meal it made my millions woven around Dory ass to the molder its enemies.

00:24:21.000 --> 00:24:33.000

Both girls might be considered as a setting for fairy and drama, but a drama with the purpose of keeping the mortal from seeing true fairy rather than inviting the mortal in the ferry, like in Smith aboard major.

00:24:33.000 --> 00:24:45.000

So here's the parallel passage in Eritrea, and here's my, my new proposal which more I think about it, it's becoming my head cannon. Not only is this the same poem, as David said, it's the same person.

00:24:45.000 --> 00:25:02.000

I think that our unnamed protagonist here can be read as a rental. I think Aaron tree can be read as a poem about a Rendell being trapped in the girdle of Eleanor bewildered and forgetful of this message, having the sort of of ensures that humans have

00:25:02.000 --> 00:25:10.000

when they are trapped in lands of different metals, until he escapes, or was expelled. And suddenly remembers what he was supposed to be doing.

00:25:10.000 --> 00:25:19.000

And often might this cycle this fugue state had been repeated until Elwin brought him that he needed to get through this maze. The somewhere else.

00:25:19.000 --> 00:25:38.000

So a final point is that our unnamed Aaron tree protagonist message and Aaron are never defined for us at Rendell story similarly remains ambiguous as Berlin is going to talk about next be unfair this year.

00:25:38.000 --> 00:25:50.000

Okay, um, how do I do this just your screen, is that what your screen, and then choose which screen you're sharing.

00:25:50.000 --> 00:26:00.000

Okay.

00:26:00.000 --> 00:26:07.000

Nobody know this doesn't seem to be working it says join a live zoom demo.

00:26:07.000 --> 00:26:12.000

You have to choose what you want to share but you're just on one screen Hmm.

00:26:12.000 --> 00:26:21.000

Well, I was sharing desktop one, because that's what everybody is.

00:26:21.000 --> 00:26:26.000

But it doesn't seem to be working.

00:26:26.000 --> 00:26:28.000

Click Share.

00:26:28.000 --> 00:26:33.000

And I get this live screen demo.

00:26:33.000 --> 00:26:37.000

Go ahead with with what

00:26:37.000 --> 00:26:52.000

where I am now just to save time and I think what you need to do is just browse to the window where you had your presentation or whatever it is. You were wanting to share.

00:26:52.000 --> 00:26:55.000

It's just the window which window is open.

00:26:55.000 --> 00:27:00.000

Yeah, so this this PowerPoint, its power. Well, no.

00:27:00.000 --> 00:27:07.000

Okay, so it's just it's just my screen. Yeah, we can see your paper on the left.

00:27:07.000 --> 00:27:08.000  
Yeah.

00:27:08.000 --> 00:27:12.000  
Me on the right.

00:27:12.000 --> 00:27:18.000  
What we see on the right is your desktop and your email.

00:27:18.000 --> 00:27:22.000  
Okay, I've got desktop one.

00:27:22.000 --> 00:27:27.000  
Microsoft Word quite bored.

00:27:27.000 --> 00:27:29.000  
iPhone.

00:27:29.000 --> 00:27:37.000  
It shouldn't be desktop one should make paper. Is it the word document that you're trying to share with everybody.

00:27:37.000 --> 00:27:43.000  
No just my screen we can see your screen. Yeah, we can see you.

00:27:43.000 --> 00:27:50.000  
So want to share anything. Look, just rather than go through all of this.

00:27:50.000 --> 00:27:53.000  
If everybody can see me.

00:27:53.000 --> 00:28:12.000  
I'm content to to be up in the upper right hand corner there. Okay, what I want to do is first of all to thank both David's and Janet for setting things up for me, so beautifully.

00:28:12.000 --> 00:28:16.000  
because what you have been doing here.

00:28:16.000 --> 00:28:25.000  
I am going to suggest is precisely what Tolkien had in mind for Aaron Jill.

00:28:25.000 --> 00:28:36.000  
As soon as he got an inkling of who Arundel might be.

00:28:36.000 --> 00:28:42.000  
We all know the story of his reading

00:28:42.000 --> 00:28:54.000  
Kindle woulda Crist coming across those two lines ala Aaron go angle A beer test or from Iran yard Muslim center.

00:28:54.000 --> 00:29:15.000

Hail Arundale raised angels over Middle Earth sent unto men, and being blown away turned on mystified intrigued and trying to come to grips with all of those feelings.

00:29:15.000 --> 00:29:37.000

The story that is in Carpenter which you will probably know is that he wrote his own poem about the lines, in which he tried to get some, some picture of what might actually be going on.

00:29:37.000 --> 00:29:46.000

The Voyage of Arundel and show those lines to his friend.

00:29:46.000 --> 00:29:50.000

GB Smith

00:29:50.000 --> 00:30:16.000

income in conjunction with the original kill wolf lines, the story in Carpenter is that Smith said they're really interesting. What are they about, because they are a little ambiguous know a lot ambiguous, both the original lines, until kings poem.

00:30:16.000 --> 00:30:19.000

Tolkien said, I don't know.

00:30:19.000 --> 00:30:30.000

I will have to find out which Carpenter interprets as meaning.

00:30:30.000 --> 00:30:49.000

I don't know what I told him, have written in a sort of alien archetypal instinctive sense. I will have to find out what I myself am doing.

00:30:49.000 --> 00:30:56.000

I think he spent a lot of the next 40 years doing exactly that.

00:30:56.000 --> 00:31:18.000

And I think that he also had in mind that this Arundale character would occupy the place in his ever growing legendary some of the character that everybody has to try to figure out.

00:31:18.000 --> 00:31:21.000

He meant him.

00:31:21.000 --> 00:31:25.000

I propose, and I'm hoping to start an argument.

00:31:25.000 --> 00:31:29.000

He meant him to be a mystery.

00:31:29.000 --> 00:31:47.000

More than that, he suggested, I think, in everything he wrote that he meant that mystery to be unsolvable in Tolkien and the Great War.

00:31:47.000 --> 00:32:15.000

JOHN Garth actually talks about Arundel and proposes that he might be Tolkien's own version of a similar character in actual dramatic mythology Wada Wade, who's apparently kind of notorious in Germanic studies for the same reason that Aaron Delia's in

00:32:15.000 --> 00:32:22.000

talking studies, because you can't get your hands on him.

00:32:22.000 --> 00:32:35.000

There are numerous references to water, and to the tale of water, but the actual tale has never been discovered.

00:32:35.000 --> 00:32:44.000

Only, it's outlines and the edges of the other references to it.

00:32:44.000 --> 00:32:59.000

And then there's that blank, where water should be. I'm suggesting that Tolkien knowingly conscious consciously intentionally meant.

00:32:59.000 --> 00:33:10.000

Aaron dill, to occupy or to not occupy that same absent position

00:33:10.000 --> 00:33:24.000

in his own in his own studies, he's kind of like, Who's that Woody Allen character that keeps popping up and everybody else's movie.

00:33:24.000 --> 00:33:25.000

Yeah, okay.

00:33:25.000 --> 00:33:31.000

Aaron deal is talking like everybody else's story.

00:33:31.000 --> 00:33:49.000

But there is no tale of errands, as there clearly was meant to be supposed to have been. Have you got all those tenses.

00:33:49.000 --> 00:34:03.000

And my evidence for this is that, this is what Tolkien said, I'm going to give you a quote that you all know by heart.

00:34:03.000 --> 00:34:07.000

Once upon a time I had in mind.

00:34:07.000 --> 00:34:15.000

To make a body of more or less connected legend, which I could dedicate simply to England to my country.

00:34:15.000 --> 00:34:26.000

I get this. I would draw some of the great tales in fullness and leave many only place in the scheme and sketched.

00:34:26.000 --> 00:34:45.000

And that is exactly what he did with Aaron do. And that is what a to David's and Janet, have been wrestling with this morning and that's what we're all sitting around, trying by our presence to outline.

00:34:45.000 --> 00:34:50.000  
It is it the presence of an absence.

00:34:50.000 --> 00:34:57.000  
It's Aaron dill, where he isn't there, and I suggest the Tolkien never met him to be there.

00:34:57.000 --> 00:35:08.000  
Christopher Tolkien talks again and again, especially in those last three volumes about a tail, it was never written.

00:35:08.000 --> 00:35:16.000  
Why was it well he doesn't say why, but he he appears to address the problem.

00:35:16.000 --> 00:35:24.000  
And if you read what Christopher himself includes in those three volumes.

00:35:24.000 --> 00:35:37.000  
The Fall of gondola and Baron and Lucien, and the children of Horan, What, what he's doing there is,

00:35:37.000 --> 00:35:43.000  
is outlining

00:35:43.000 --> 00:35:48.000  
a figure that he never meant to fill in.

00:35:48.000 --> 00:36:12.000  
If you, if you look at some of the some of the actual references that Christopher talks about. They're sitting around the table fire and area or health winner is listening to all these tales, and somebody says, And now we will bring the greatest tale

00:36:12.000 --> 00:36:19.000  
of all that tail, the tail What follows is the tale of error and Bill.

00:36:19.000 --> 00:36:20.000  
Full stop.

00:36:20.000 --> 00:36:27.000  
Because, another character in one version it's I most als says, Not now.

00:36:27.000 --> 00:36:30.000  
We've had enough for tonight.

00:36:30.000 --> 00:36:39.000  
Let's postpone this for another evening. And it's that kind of bait and switch that Tolkien

00:36:39.000 --> 00:36:54.000

engineers, through his characters that brings you right up to a tale of Aaron will cut off fanfare, and then Nope, sorry folks. Not tonight.

00:36:54.000 --> 00:37:00.000

It is the biggest t us in the whole legendary.

00:37:00.000 --> 00:37:03.000

And I think he did it on purpose.

00:37:03.000 --> 00:37:06.000

So, that's my story.

00:37:06.000 --> 00:37:09.000

And up with it.

00:37:09.000 --> 00:37:17.000

I turn it over to you guys and ask you what you'd like to do with it.

00:37:17.000 --> 00:37:18.000

Yes, brilliant.

00:37:18.000 --> 00:37:25.000

Okay, we do have a few minutes for discussion so Wow. All right. Okay, well let's go.

00:37:25.000 --> 00:37:28.000

I love that interpretation.

00:37:28.000 --> 00:37:40.000

It may not be the only one I'm thinking of an offer, having writer's block and thinking okay I really want to tell this tale but I just can't figure out how to do it.

00:37:40.000 --> 00:37:51.000

And so he projects his inability on to on to hit the characters in this story, who say no, we're not going to tell that.

00:37:51.000 --> 00:38:00.000

So that's another possible explanation. Maybe he meant to do it. Maybe he just got stuck and invented an excuse why it wasn't what he wrote Aaron tree he wrote Arundel build those poem.

00:38:00.000 --> 00:38:12.000

But he wrote Aaron tree he wrote, Aaron dill, a bill bows poem. He wrote all of gondola, which is a setup for Aaron do.

00:38:12.000 --> 00:38:19.000

It's the whole story exists to get Eric deal, right there.

00:38:19.000 --> 00:38:28.000

So that he can be on the scene in time to get the Silmaril, so everything points to Arundel.

00:38:28.000 --> 00:38:39.000

He said, even the fall have gone Dylan, is a kind of setup because the actual form of Nagaland occurs way near the end of the story. Yeah, everything else comes first.

00:38:39.000 --> 00:38:49.000

Yeah. Yeah, I think, I think it was clever enough to kill King. To do that, I take him at his word.

00:38:49.000 --> 00:38:57.000

I would leave many only placed in the scheme and sketched.

00:38:57.000 --> 00:39:16.000

I don't recall instances of Tolkien experiencing full writer's block in that it couldn't begin the story, have a lot of trouble finishing

00:39:16.000 --> 00:39:38.000

over all the unfinished tales.

00:39:38.000 --> 00:39:49.000

And young that might be sort of what's going on with Arundale I've got him here. Now what do I do with him. But yeah, I got him aware.

00:39:49.000 --> 00:39:51.000

Yeah.

00:39:51.000 --> 00:39:56.000

Oh, like he takes the fellowship up to Bowens tomb and then just doesn't know where to go from there.

00:39:56.000 --> 00:39:58.000

Three years.

00:39:58.000 --> 00:40:09.000

But the tale of Aaron dill is, in a nutshell, completed in all of the sketched versions.

00:40:09.000 --> 00:40:11.000

He goes back.

00:40:11.000 --> 00:40:23.000

We do have a number of complete versions of the tale of which Bilbo song is one, but they're very short and nebulous.

00:40:23.000 --> 00:40:38.000

Yeah. And they're not the tail, their references to the tail there's spin offs of the tail is great, or, you know, Hamlet, that didn't exist, but there is no tail.

00:40:38.000 --> 00:40:39.000

Yeah.

00:40:39.000 --> 00:40:46.000

Yeah. JOHN you have your hand up. Yes, thanks. I mean first of course thanks to all of you. It's so interesting.

00:40:46.000 --> 00:41:07.000

You know I very much like Berlin's hypothesis that makes a lot of sense to me. But thinking about what David Emerson said, I'm trying to think, even if talking didn't completely consciously think I'm not going to finish this because I need to leave this.

00:41:07.000 --> 00:41:24.000

You know, this ambiguous. If it was something more tending towards writer's block around that story, we would want to think, Well, why did he have writer's block around that story and I think it takes us too much the same point, which is.

00:41:24.000 --> 00:41:43.000

It was so Erica was so crucial to him, I mean that word was what got him going on the legendary and by not finishing that he leaves the depth is there that he was afraid would be taken away by publishing the still no really and it's still there.

00:41:43.000 --> 00:41:59.000

So his central thing is left to be mysterious to continue to be enchanting whether he thought that through I'm going to do that, or whether he just couldn't do anything else with it because it had that meeting for him it certainly makes sense to me in

00:41:59.000 --> 00:42:00.000

that way.

00:42:00.000 --> 00:42:11.000

Well that's good that's hard, some stuff you've said about his some problems he's had was that the idea of finishing something and getting it out there.

00:42:11.000 --> 00:42:16.000

So yeah I like that interpretation, that's interesting.

00:42:16.000 --> 00:42:23.000

I don't as Berlin pointed out the tale of her until is the finish it is the end of the legendary them.

00:42:23.000 --> 00:42:44.000

And maybe hit his problem with ending things. He didn't want the legendary him to end he didn't want the Summerland to be finished. And so he didn't write the final tale, let it finish the silver million acquainted silver really in the late 40s text,

00:42:44.000 --> 00:42:59.000

the one to two Ellen Another one is, he said, what he thought, Oh, that's true. Was it completed text. What Christopher mentions and I think it's in the Baron and Lucy and volume.

00:42:59.000 --> 00:43:26.000

And I wish that I had this moment here, I may be able to pull it up but I'll just add limit for the time being, is that the silver rule was not the silver will until quite late in the development of the whole of the whole legendary him that it was the

00:43:26.000 --> 00:43:38.000

same similar real that Arundel silverrail was the same one that Baron and Lucien cut from the iron crown was a very late development.

00:43:38.000 --> 00:43:43.000

Oh, and I read that and I thought, whoa.

00:43:43.000 --> 00:43:48.000

In hindsight, of course it's the same silver.

00:43:48.000 --> 00:43:55.000

That makes perfect sense. It turns it into an icon. It focuses that it concentrates it.

00:43:55.000 --> 00:44:07.000

But Tolkien didn't have that in mind when he first started out on the air until venture.

00:44:07.000 --> 00:44:22.000

You'll also notice mentioned that when the poem first becomes specifically a tale of Arundale that it's a star that set upon his mask the summary only interest later on.

00:44:22.000 --> 00:44:30.000

Another example of the importance of the summer girls only becoming apparent in later developments of the story.

00:44:30.000 --> 00:44:36.000

I was thinking it was a star upon his brow. But then I realized, Yes, that's there's that.

00:44:36.000 --> 00:44:45.000

There's that too but that's also in Smith would major. Yes, yes, yes.

00:44:45.000 --> 00:44:51.000

So the star, they set up in one of the versions it's they set a star upon his mask.

00:44:51.000 --> 00:44:56.000

And then it's in the later version is the symbol but set upon it fast.

00:44:56.000 --> 00:45:15.000

But the embed version with the star. That's where the idea of the burning lamp, the flame buffer of Western US enters so that importance is attached to the star even before it comes to somewhere else.

00:45:15.000 --> 00:45:19.000

So it's kind of waiting for the summer able to be developed.

00:45:19.000 --> 00:45:26.000

Yes, I think so. What I'm hearing from you guys.

00:45:26.000 --> 00:45:31.000

Which is, guys, I'm not. Guys, it's not a gender board.

00:45:31.000 --> 00:45:52.000

For me, okay what I'm hearing from you people, all of you is that you don't think told you was clever enough to have figured out something like this and put it in his apology intention Lee, that it must have just been something that he came to, because

00:45:52.000 --> 00:46:12.000

he couldn't think of anything anyway. To end the story. I think he was a tricky old devil and he was smarter than any one of us here. I think he was perfectly capable of building a gap in unintentional gap.

00:46:12.000 --> 00:46:23.000

Yeah, yeah, is legendary and examples abound in the mythologies that he knew, not just the tale of water.

00:46:23.000 --> 00:46:43.000

But the big cuna in the middle of of the secret and good room story for gatherings torn out middle of the story that have been grist for scholars Mills, ever since.

00:46:43.000 --> 00:46:56.000

Thomas chippy, just to turn this whole thing around and look at the other end of the telescope. Tom ship he says Tolkien really like. Filling in the gap.

00:46:56.000 --> 00:47:00.000

That's what he does in Sigurd good room.

00:47:00.000 --> 00:47:16.000

And I don't think it would be a side whose compass to turn this telescope back around and build in a gap for others to fill in.

00:47:16.000 --> 00:47:25.000

Well yes, I love your, your. Add your analysis of talking being so clever.

00:47:25.000 --> 00:47:33.000

That David's hairs got long.

00:47:33.000 --> 00:47:45.000

Yeah, We were starting to run over time and I've said we've got to john was waving his hand, and then Robin yeah I just muted it. Okay, so that was that going.

00:47:45.000 --> 00:47:56.000

Okay. JOHN first. So real quick, Berlin I was not trying to say that Tolkien couldn't figure out how to end it and so he left it. I was trying to say talking needed to leave it.

00:47:56.000 --> 00:48:10.000

And so he couldn't figure out how to end it. In other words, I see the same motive that you're talking about the need to leave a central thing unexplained I was just raising the possibility that although I agree that he's smarter than any of us in this

00:48:10.000 --> 00:48:18.000

room that he might not have been thinking it consciously, it might have been growing out of his unconscious but it was a need to not finish that was primary.

00:48:18.000 --> 00:48:21.000

Gotcha, thank you John and Robin.

00:48:21.000 --> 00:48:30.000

Okay, I apologize for this question. Nobody's going to be able to answer it but it's one that I think about a lot in Tolkien studies.

00:48:30.000 --> 00:48:45.000

What does it matter if someone is able to say he consciously intended this versus, he, he was unconscious versus. It was a mistake and we haven't seen everything.

00:48:45.000 --> 00:48:57.000

What are the stakes that so, so much of talking studies and it's not only Tolkien studies, depends on getting this authorial intentionality.

00:48:57.000 --> 00:49:00.000

Well there's a can of worms.

00:49:00.000 --> 00:49:10.000

I just want to say I loved what everybody said this was a fantastic session. And I'm happy with not resolving that intentionality in any way because that to me.

00:49:10.000 --> 00:49:20.000

But for those of you who care what are the stakes, why do you need to do this, or careers.

00:49:20.000 --> 00:49:27.000

I think that an author is trying to communicate with us, and it's helpful to try and understand what they were trying to give indicate.

00:49:27.000 --> 00:49:40.000

Try to understand. Versus somehow conclusively prove and I don't I don't think Berlin was claiming that you can conclusively prove it this is just her idea.

00:49:40.000 --> 00:49:52.000

I know and I know this is how Berlin approaches that because I've communicated with her about it in terms of the arch in the Keystone. And that's why I love her work, but to it again, more worms.

00:49:52.000 --> 00:50:06.000

I just came off of the choking seminar diversity where a number of us were viciously attacked. Using the concept of authorial intentionality about choking was Catholic that he would hate queries that we hate talking.

00:50:06.000 --> 00:50:14.000

So, we can use the intentionality language, I don't myself, because I don't give a damn.

00:50:14.000 --> 00:50:29.000

I'm queer, and I read talking clearly, but in our academic setting and in such a way that it works but it's out there as a weapon. And if you're talking about worrying about careers i mean i'm doing all this stuff now because I'm retired, but there are

00:50:29.000 --> 00:50:44.000

academics who are at risk for doing things that people who claim certain intentionality to talking and this extends to other versions. So, do we have a responsibility to think about that.

00:50:44.000 --> 00:50:58.000

Well, one thing we can do is we can use the tool of intentionality to show that there's other people's claims that Dawkins intentionality are wrong, which they are of course that.

00:50:58.000 --> 00:51:10.000

The question is what do we have here Do we have the One Ring, or do we have a two edged sword, that's the that's the real question, or do we have both.

00:51:10.000 --> 00:51:12.000

let you.

00:51:12.000 --> 00:51:17.000

Let me see, let me play back what I'm hearing Robin and you're right or not.

00:51:17.000 --> 00:51:29.000

I'm hearing a question about what he meant by what he wrote as over against.

00:51:29.000 --> 00:51:35.000

Did he did he not right it, whatever it is.

00:51:35.000 --> 00:51:52.000

And I wonder if it would be useful to explore the distinction between those The words are on the page, whether they mean column was queer, or don't is up to interpretation.

00:51:52.000 --> 00:51:55.000

But we do have the words.

00:51:55.000 --> 00:52:02.000

What I am trying to explore is, is this.

00:52:02.000 --> 00:52:10.000

Are these the words that are the non words that talking head in London.

00:52:10.000 --> 00:52:13.000

He says, This is what I would do.

00:52:13.000 --> 00:52:15.000

I would just get them.

00:52:15.000 --> 00:52:25.000

I would put them in place in that middle space where all the other channels are around and looking at it.

00:52:25.000 --> 00:52:30.000

But he doesn't say, I would say what they need.

00:52:30.000 --> 00:52:34.000

It does, throw us a curveball bow.

00:52:34.000 --> 00:52:47.000

Because if he intended to leave an app, and, like, and, as an example, in his own work of the kind of thing he was saying like with water.

00:52:47.000 --> 00:53:05.000

It seems odd that his gap is his, his tail that was merely sketched and left for others to elaborate on was the most important tale in the legendary him that everything was building up to it seems an odd choice of what to leave sketchy.

00:53:05.000 --> 00:53:17.000

But on the other hand, as you say he was cleverer than most of us and so it could be just you know him laughing behind his hand from the grave and all of us dithering about this question.

00:53:17.000 --> 00:53:47.000

And on that we really have to get out and let the next people into the room to get themselves set up so we can continue this in the discord channel for this room, or elsewhere via email, whatever.