

02:11:36.000 --> 02:11:46.000

This is a book club discussion number 11. We are discussing a molar tilbar, and I'm super excited to do it.

02:11:46.000 --> 02:11:58.000

This is talk a discussion. So anybody feel free to to jump in.

02:11:58.000 --> 02:12:08.000

So you know security. Then if people are saying they can't really let us know. and we'll try and restate.

02:12:08.000 --> 02:12:12.000

Where my news pay me start? Will I get my name?

02:12:12.000 --> 02:12:18.000

So you're gonna do that that line about white skin jazz.

02:12:18.000 --> 02:12:33.000

It's it's real hard like I honestly I read that, and I was like shit like I couldn't do this.

02:12:33.000 --> 02:12:45.000

So think the whole team is, whether intentionally or not kind of dealing with that sort of like racial disparity that we are still currently dealing with, but in a completely different contexts, right?

02:12:45.000 --> 02:13:02.000

Because he's old British Tv. but like if it's really close to the holiday like America, and we learn through Christopher's notes that talking with writing this in the late fifties, after the publication of the 2

02:13:02.000 --> 02:13:06.000

towers, but before basically under deadline for return to the King.

02:13:06.000 --> 02:13:20.000

So like This is a time of pressure for him so for him to taking a break from that, for from finishing return to the King to have written this says to me that it's something important that he wanted to get down on paper you know even though he didn't end up going

02:13:20.000 --> 02:13:33.000

back and finishing it. but then it was something that he felt that he had to get out, you know, so he could continue working on, and he kept picking it back out, cause we also have the denoted in the beginning.

02:13:33.000 --> 02:13:50.000

Where he picked it back up and what's 68 conceptualize it a little bit more, and also derive a little bit more on it like it's a hobby with them like overall the story here

02:13:50.000 --> 02:13:57.000

specifically at the last part, because you kind of just does the poking dozen kind of trails on them to nothing.

02:13:57.000 --> 02:14:08.000

I don't know exactly where. he was going with it I mean it starts like heavy and binding, and then just kind of goes 5 different directions all at once.

02:14:08.000 --> 02:14:14.000

Yes.

02:14:14.000 --> 02:14:19.000

I think it's interesting consider in this where We're.

02:14:19.000 --> 02:14:33.000

In the story of alma ties into the rest of the narratives that we're familiar with for middle Earth, too, because it's it's so fairly hard to precisely contextualize where geographically

02:14:33.000 --> 02:14:40.000

in the work. This is fine. there there are a couple of different statements that may be conflicting.

02:14:40.000 --> 02:14:47.000

And then also precisely at what point in the relationship between new Manor and Middle Earth.

02:14:47.000 --> 02:14:59.000

This is happening. Yeah, Yeah, that That's the tricky part right is is the timeline of when this happens with regards to everything that's going on in New York it's really shaky as to one that's

02:14:59.000 --> 02:15:06.000

taking place.

02:15:06.000 --> 02:15:25.000

And that maps onto the more critical viewpoint of the new Victorians in terms of that that colonial aspects And so the the way that this start is so tolkien's notes of

02:15:25.000 --> 02:15:32.000

of this are that it's the beginnings of a trail that sees the name of Orange, from the point of view of the wild man.

02:15:32.000 --> 02:15:44.000

Capital and and you know, since we're talking and have been with Megan on issues of race of depictions of race hazard. The father character in the days of this youth is described as broad

02:15:44.000 --> 02:16:01.000

swarthy, short, and tough, first hung heavy handed and quick to violence, and then later on in the story, We hear that these people, as I as people are depicted as wearing wine clocks and fur and I don't know about you but to me, that rings very

02:16:01.000 --> 02:16:10.000

strongly and of like a historical depiction of indigenous peoples from any numbers of colonized places or Africa, North America, Pacific Islands.

02:16:10.000 --> 02:16:21.000

It's always like that they're very quick to anger they're, you know, darkened you know tough hands and you know they're they're not wearing enough clothes and that kind of thing so that's interesting that

02:16:21.000 --> 02:16:24.000

I and I didn't know that that might be I mean that's talking.

02:16:24.000 --> 02:16:31.000

The narrator that is writing those descriptions

02:16:31.000 --> 02:16:38.000

The ancestors of the dunlins just based on like being able to see a pretty major port.

02:16:38.000 --> 02:16:44.000

You're obviously like kind of close to the scene and like there's that whole.

02:16:44.000 --> 02:16:56.000

What is in the third age basically bear and swa the world where that we know at least one pretty major newborn port is built in like.

02:16:56.000 --> 02:17:05.000

Maybe it's not ancestral done one day for like obviously simpler enough to them in like that other reason we have where we were.

02:17:05.000 --> 02:17:14.000

Talking about how the done lending we're essentially just a strange, because they're language was a little bit different.

02:17:14.000 --> 02:17:19.000

And then that estrangement just grew and grew and grew I don't.

02:17:19.000 --> 02:17:26.000

There's there's something there's something there that's like interesting to being intriguing.

02:17:26.000 --> 02:17:31.000

Well, I'm, beyond that with language becoming distinctive different.

02:17:31.000 --> 02:17:38.000

You you have in the real world. This is again the around the time of marine zoom.

02:17:38.000 --> 02:17:59.000

Free goals. As a result of colonialism. and I don't think that it may have been yeah Tolkien making great strides to say, These are, you know, indigenous people as much as he had the

02:17:59.000 --> 02:18:09.000

archetype available to him, any British. person. that went to a museum would have you know, leave stand up exhibits. yeah wax figures, and that looked exactly like that So it's an easy picture to pay

02:18:09.000 --> 02:18:12.000

And so it might be, you know. kind of leave you rating them that way.

02:18:12.000 --> 02:18:17.000

And then it to further that point with the Creole.

02:18:17.000 --> 02:18:32.000

Kind of advancing it's a good trouble go ahead.

02:18:32.000 --> 02:18:42.000

Good. I don't know this is important in the gonna grab the computer Well, log one's.

02:18:42.000 --> 02:18:54.000

True. those are go back that way. Yeah, cool.

02:18:54.000 --> 02:19:08.000

So yeah, Yeah. stand under your alright Creoles museums, racism that's where we were creole's.

02:19:08.000 --> 02:19:13.000

We have some racism. I I really don't think it was pointed.

02:19:13.000 --> 02:19:21.000

I think that it really was kind of there was this natural development that could be explained.

02:19:21.000 --> 02:19:34.000

I'm going back to that kind, of creating a natural mythology, criminal or trying to following modern events and good results of imperial powers going in, you know, interacting with less powerful.

02:19:34.000 --> 02:19:54.000

How many of these people's a Federal Then that was something that he felt he needed to reflect, not necessarily as a condemnation or an acceptance just something that needed to be.

02:19:54.000 --> 02:20:15.000

I thought it was really interesting what he did with language in since tail. I I mean it's it's during the broad part where things starting to fall apart on the line. What is this I heard of this language in a dream now I can kind of understand

02:20:15.000 --> 02:20:23.000

can we talk about Paul homer cal tell armor is the only person you know in this whole society that he's basically the hero of the story.

02:20:23.000 --> 02:20:30.000

He's the white skin rather than swarthy he's got gray eyes, slender with build rather than stocky.

02:20:30.000 --> 02:20:39.000

He's fair voice. He respects his elders like that sounds to be like a description of like the English or Northern European ideal.

02:20:39.000 --> 02:20:44.000

Right. Yeah, Eleanor has a a calling and whenever you guys everything.

02:20:44.000 --> 02:20:53.000

Eleanor says, I think it's interesting that, talking as a linguist pointed out how similar languages could be and and still not be mutually understood.

02:20:53.000 --> 02:21:09.000

Yeah, and yeah, like, like I said during the presentation, like, you know, the back theme of of language being one of the biggest barriers to

02:21:09.000 --> 02:21:15.000

Is is is a recurring thing for sure. And yeah, and and also what?

02:21:15.000 --> 02:21:28.000

What of the of the doors and now, or whatever in the people's work, towards the men where which talks, though Token just keeps going over and over, and over how the held in language doesn't change much over

02:21:28.000 --> 02:21:34.000

time, and the dwarven language is less resistant to change, but does still have some changes over time.

02:21:34.000 --> 02:21:41.000

But you know not so much that the doors that live in different areas can't understand each other like they call figure out who's dual.

02:21:41.000 --> 02:21:47.000

And then the men you know but and it's still we the off the rails.

02:21:47.000 --> 02:22:03.000

So what happened in the real world right is is that you know then, we're separated in their languages diverged, and to the point where in some cases they couldn't recognize each other Yeah, what I was preferencing earlier. when we were talking about the done lendings and how they were like

02:22:03.000 --> 02:22:11.000

linguistically split off from the the men who became via dying is in that absorbs and men reading.

02:22:11.000 --> 02:22:20.000

They talk about the 3 groups of men who came over, and how 2 of the groups who came over the mountains inable areas really really similar.

02:22:20.000 --> 02:22:37.000

You know the languages that they could talk in amongst themselves, and they kind of live separately but together. and there was a third group who was just a little bit linguistically separated from them, and They ended up living completely

02:22:37.000 --> 02:22:44.000

sequestered from the other 2, and they ended up becoming the double index later.

02:22:44.000 --> 02:22:51.000

So like all 3 of those groups weren't genetically related, but linguistically separated.

02:22:51.000 --> 02:23:11.000

It's really interesting as those are the forward hours that third group, And yet her mother, the mother of his greatest heroes. right? So to our and turn from others are from that sequester kind of okay.

02:23:11.000 --> 02:23:15.000

that's probably So that was interesting. but something that did strike me.

02:23:15.000 --> 02:23:22.000

I want to mention was, I first started reading this because I had not until prompted by You know this.

02:23:22.000 --> 02:23:29.000

This discussion was, I was wondering. like is, are these people?

02:23:29.000 --> 02:23:45.000

Said, in the area where the evil or the black and minorities Collins cause the fell from the East, and we learn, and the only do pulling colonize, or, like, say, the northwest with minorities.

02:23:45.000 --> 02:23:53.000

They sell the entire coast. So when I was trying to think like on the phone over the East, if they look like you minorities.

02:23:53.000 --> 02:24:08.000

But they're not faithful, are they and is that where this started, and then just trying to pull it away from that It's really tough to interpret the story as a whole.

02:24:08.000 --> 02:24:16.000

We can interpret it some pieces but without an ending right like it's It's not it's clear that you know.

02:24:16.000 --> 02:24:20.000

If he had some notes about like how it does sound like It would have gone on for a while.

02:24:20.000 --> 02:24:25.000

But you know the it really, without knowing how he was gonna frame how Omar is.

02:24:25.000 --> 02:24:36.000

Further adventures, you know we supposed to have he turns himself over as a hostage, and then he travels with the Newbornorians and learns a bunch from them.

02:24:36.000 --> 02:24:44.000

And that's right thing. and so without knowing how to because I mean, we barely need the new manorians in the story before it told me.

02:24:44.000 --> 02:24:54.000

And uses the plot quite literally

02:24:54.000 --> 02:25:01.000

Of this, and I I I do wonder if that would have come back around as a thought point where we we don't see this because it's not finished.

02:25:01.000 --> 02:25:15.000

I'm be on fire check off guns 2 questions and comments, one from Nancy.

02:25:15.000 --> 02:25:25.000

Again I see an influence of William Boris in the depiction of dark, ugly people enslaving tall, fair people like the House of the Wolfings or the rooms of the mountains.

02:25:25.000 --> 02:25:32.000

May be the well at the Rolls end and then Eleanor says i'd be curious to hear what people have to say about the power dynamics involved with.

02:25:32.000 --> 02:25:38.000

Tell it how L. Mars parents and the reversals there, and the consequences.

02:25:38.000 --> 02:25:45.000

Second repeat the second one i'd be curious to hear what people have to say about the power dynamics involved with Cal Elmar's parents, and the reversals there.

02:25:45.000 --> 02:25:54.000

And the consequences right, I think, I mean.

02:25:54.000 --> 02:26:09.000

One of the things that struck me is that each civilization that's depicted in this short writing Tolkien, or the narrator that he selects is critical of that's.

02:26:09.000 --> 02:26:13.000

There it's not it's jungle Gray.

02:26:13.000 --> 02:26:20.000

It's not just black, and white it's you know at every argument as to who is good, or who is that is counter with A.

02:26:20.000 --> 02:26:25.000

But your society does this. and is that better sort of sort of argument?

02:26:25.000 --> 02:26:34.000

So I I appreciated that in this right and i'm kind of going to the the roles of ages. right?

02:26:34.000 --> 02:26:45.000

I'm sorry there's the quote about the tell them I believe that the the elderly should be able to live out the their days and peas.

02:26:45.000 --> 02:26:48.000

Then, you know, if they needed to be reviewed, they should be done.

02:26:48.000 --> 02:26:52.000

That would be done with the hostcare kind of thing.

02:26:52.000 --> 02:26:58.000

So there is still that kind of revere your elders thing.

02:26:58.000 --> 02:27:07.000

But I think it was Plato, said they. you know old ages, but a second childhood, that the youth must care for the elderly kind of thing.

02:27:07.000 --> 02:27:25.000

And and so there is kind of this recognition. that with the able bodiness common power. not not an example of a fine fine physical That's That's really true.

02:27:25.000 --> 02:27:29.000

Yeah, so it's very great and it maybe it's just that.

02:27:29.000 --> 02:27:40.000

It's not talking, Never blessed it. right never really finished. Yeah. figured out what what ideals he was trying to celebrate in this .

02:27:40.000 --> 02:27:53.000

Except it clearly you talk Tell all more is clearly the the show there's no but you know we haven't like Yeah, Oh, 100% the like the the Paul rebecca's style, like hero of the story

02:27:53.000 --> 02:27:58.000

right First, you kind of bridge it down is this panel call would dive in amongst savages.

02:27:58.000 --> 02:28:12.000

Basically by Comparison, and without him it's inquired that the these men of Agar would have taken or been killed by the Newman Orans, because and it's all It's very much It's like a mowgly kind of situation or like Tarzan situation

02:28:12.000 --> 02:28:17.000

like they recognize him as one of their own and that's the only reason that there's any hesitation on their part.

02:28:17.000 --> 02:28:25.000

Not so. just go and enslave these people. yeah, so and and then go on.

02:28:25.000 --> 02:28:30.000

And and even tell them we're not finding any of the women of his people beautiful.

02:28:30.000 --> 02:28:38.000

That that was that's the the depictions on statements about women in in this piece are notable.

02:28:38.000 --> 02:28:46.000

I think I I mean he. It makes a statement for the fate of the captives was short and cruel, and then makes that statement in conjunction to it.

02:28:46.000 --> 02:29:04.000

Specific email capabilities. But I know that in there he's not tying that to a particular civilizations actions, he's tying it to the idea of of the just a known statement about how women are treated in the

02:29:04.000 --> 02:29:20.000

world, and we don't often get a lot of that from from token when in our are often i'll often say, fairly quiet in stories, and if in fact, a page later she does, she she then she she has her arguments

02:29:20.000 --> 02:29:26.000

and then becomes a woman. A few words about her life lasted, say only 2.

02:29:26.000 --> 02:29:33.000

Her children let's let's talk about what film are a little bit more.

02:29:33.000 --> 02:29:39.000

Okay, So I mean, there there is the fact that you know she does turn around.

02:29:39.000 --> 02:29:42.000

You know Howaza. Like tears apart the humanorians.

02:29:42.000 --> 02:30:02.000

And then Elmar goes back at her and said, Was it the basically that the the Agar people are not fully fully innocent as well, that elmar accuses them of hunting the people who lived there earlier So Maybe they are

02:30:02.000 --> 02:30:14.000

callingizers themselves, and I have this thought that maybe that could be the Google men that had potentially been driven up into the hills and into the mountains in the case and stuff like that's not explicitly stated But I can't think of any

02:30:14.000 --> 02:30:24.000

other people's that might have populated that land earlier than before. it's, you know, the new minorities just coming up with stories to make themselves feel better, though, and sleeping these people right?

02:30:24.000 --> 02:30:32.000

So who knows? Let me see strong words of combination there also, like a cruel in Lawless and the friends of demons.

02:30:32.000 --> 02:30:46.000

Yeah, yeah, like going back about this black ship, and how it it carries all like, young men and women, and also going back to trying to date.

02:30:46.000 --> 02:30:59.000

This do we think that this is happening. while salon is a numerator, and they are actually taking those people back to sacrifice them. and that's that's that's the people that I got But then they're

02:30:59.000 --> 02:31:11.000

talking. Of course it's like it is really nice but then they also talk about the wars that are happening in their lands at the time, and that to me sounds like the wars between the elves and Sauron.

02:31:11.000 --> 02:31:17.000

I can't think of any other wars. that would have been taking place actively in those Western shorelands.

02:31:17.000 --> 02:31:21.000

At that time, however, I mean so on that sound belongs. go on.

02:31:21.000 --> 02:31:34.000

But all the sauron's little millions are still during up shit right you've been predating that the peoples of Middle Earth are in a a great deal of tension with the Newmanorians whose ports

02:31:34.000 --> 02:31:44.000

have grown larger, and there they've been stripping the land of natural resources, particularly for timber for shifts, And so that's starts even earlier.

02:31:44.000 --> 02:31:50.000

So it's hard to pinpoint exactly at 1 point in those tensions.

02:31:50.000 --> 02:31:59.000

So of course told you himself, as i'm sure cause you know, Yeah.

02:31:59.000 --> 02:32:05.000

And it could even be a miss misinterpretation by the men of Vagar.

02:32:05.000 --> 02:32:18.000

In that. You know what they see, as wars might be very minor skirmishes in the grander, you know, in the grander scheme of the you know, Major, wars that have happened in mid alert kind of thing and they just see some fighting and I think all these

02:32:18.000 --> 02:32:22.000

these colonizers basically are warring in our land sort of thing.

02:32:22.000 --> 02:32:38.000

You ain't seen nothing yet cause they have such limited They're they're clearly so naive in terms of you know that contact with the outside world that any fighting for that might seem huge especially when it's

02:32:38.000 --> 02:32:43.000

fighting, you know. They talk about the the difference in technology between the people here, like the the metabaga, are still.

02:32:43.000 --> 02:32:48.000

You are still using Max tools and and stone tools and weapons and stuff like that.

02:32:48.000 --> 02:32:51.000

We don't even already have switch collins and steel yeah exactly.

02:32:51.000 --> 02:32:58.000

They? Yeah, they don't have a word for shit right So you know, clear anything that that looks like a even a minor skirmish.

02:32:58.000 --> 02:33:04.000

Yeah, amongst the Newman oriented, anybody could have looked very much much more violent for them.

02:33:04.000 --> 02:33:11.000

Yeah, like what the British and like the colonies hiding each other, probably look like it to the native American.

02:33:11.000 --> 02:33:18.000

100%

02:33:18.000 --> 02:33:23.000

Alright, we're gonna go back to omar again Almighty almight.

02:33:23.000 --> 02:33:27.000

Does, you know, condemn Baggars people to an extent.

02:33:27.000 --> 02:33:43.000

She also clearly, Yeah, see? also or there's something to be said here in that hurt first is that somebody in their peoples will end up looking like per yeah, that the the purse is that one of her descendants and

02:33:43.000 --> 02:33:48.000

that's ends up being calhoun or we'll be buffer kind, and that that will cause the downfall of their society.

02:33:48.000 --> 02:33:55.000

Basically what she's cursing them with is erasure of their cultural identity by way of colonization.

02:33:55.000 --> 02:34:09.000

And that's you know but even even if it's not a genocidal colonization that is still one of the biggest impacts of colonization is that cultural eration lost of of cultural identity language all those sorts

02:34:09.000 --> 02:34:21.000

of things as well you know it's possible that that is we're talking was taking the story that you know Tal Omar would have gone out into the world and had all these experiences with the new Minorians and then gone back to his

02:34:21.000 --> 02:34:35.000

people, and basically the kind of missionary to them who knows that's all speculative stuff

02:34:35.000 --> 02:34:44.000

Taking this woman to wife, which I have so many problems related That's even said, believe Yep.

02:34:44.000 --> 02:35:02.000

There is so period there there's no like equality in their power at all but well, and she's very clear that she's been torn away from her she was marrying her children

02:35:02.000 --> 02:35:17.000

A lot of ways that that sort of cultural erasure happens if it's not through direct conquest is through intermediate cultural groups, and then they've become more modular than I mean I I don't even

02:35:17.000 --> 02:35:34.000

know I kind of regret just even saying that because a lot of people are gonna bring up the white supremacist notion of losing white America because the replacement interracial marriage and things like that and

02:35:34.000 --> 02:35:47.000

i've can't divorce that stream in our real world, though from how how formal it informal past systems are created, and and how that's it it's still used to the disadvantage

02:35:47.000 --> 02:36:02.000

of people who are held at lower accounts. yup. yeah just kind of the lower ironic that he's, being essentially cursed with more of what he does already started like the use the the pebble that kind of started the ball

02:36:02.000 --> 02:36:22.000

rolling. If this were a real world situation. I just I I I feel for Elmar a lot in terms of a character that talks for what like 2 paragraphs, or whatever I I feel like I know her in

02:36:22.000 --> 02:36:43.000

a way that I don't really know any of the other like female characters Holding this written outside of the a one like this is a real person with real problems like, Imagine being strength from your husband to enter children and then being forced into

02:36:43.000 --> 02:36:59.000

a loveless marriage with this guy who's obviously obsessed with you because he thinks you look pretty and an area where you can barely even understand people's heart. and Yes, Eleanor says again, that type of cultural

02:36:59.000 --> 02:37:07.000

erasure would be keeping in will be in keeping with the nature of the story, as less black and white than, say, the fall of Donald.

02:37:07.000 --> 02:37:18.000

So yeah, sorry. Yeah, absolutely.

02:37:18.000 --> 02:37:26.000

I do want want to specifically call out some of the language the Tolkien's uses with regards to the new annoyance.

02:37:26.000 --> 02:37:33.000

So. this is the object of the new man oriented to occupy this land and alliance would be cruel's, capital, c.

02:37:33.000 --> 02:37:38.000

Of the North, drive out the dark people, and make a settlement to threaten the king.

02:37:38.000 --> 02:37:43.000

So this is told. You you're still You know obviously still working on the final details of this story.

02:37:43.000 --> 02:37:46.000

This is his first draft, and he he's chosen right off the bat.

02:37:46.000 --> 02:37:55.000

Languages like occupied and set there's no bones about you know what the major theme the tol team has.

02:37:55.000 --> 02:38:03.000

His story was right. Yeah, Nancy said. that's very similar to Vikings license would capture women, and then do things like that.

02:38:03.000 --> 02:38:09.000

Yeah, sure. So is it? Yeah. talking's not saying you know temporarily.

02:38:09.000 --> 02:38:22.000

Station people in these lands, or anything like that. It is very much subtle and occupy these lands, and then we, the new minority, and say of the Menaagar You are here can at least belong already into the dark

02:38:22.000 --> 02:38:29.000

capital making, and and I feel like that's the inventory is making a significant assumption.

02:38:29.000 --> 02:38:36.000

There, based mostly on language and appearance. address on their first impressions of the the men of Bag are right.

02:38:36.000 --> 02:38:44.000

They they don't know necessarily that that people has been taken by Sauron and influenced by Sarah, and they're just guessing.

02:38:44.000 --> 02:38:57.000

Well, The fact that any resistance at all to do an Orient will is instantly Oh, here must have been league with the enemy. Yeah, exactly.

02:38:57.000 --> 02:39:12.000

No just don't want you in our land average and and then the the Newbornorians towel tell, I think, how the last your time with dwelling in these hills is come to an end you're the men of the

02:39:12.000 --> 02:39:16.000

West have have resolved to make their homes, and the folk of the dark must be.

02:39:16.000 --> 02:39:25.000

The park, or be slain Yes, that's just what they've decided unilaterally.

02:39:25.000 --> 02:39:33.000

And again, maybe maybe does the black human orans that we're supposed to take this is a little more black and white, and that these are the people that have already been corrupted vicear on influence.

02:39:33.000 --> 02:39:37.000

But who knows? Maybe it's just the the nicer human orans?

02:39:37.000 --> 02:39:50.000

You know the people that didn't turn away from the light and trying to say maybe they're not as nice as question that i'm sure someone knows the answer to it for like I should but I don't black

02:39:50.000 --> 02:39:54.000

and Minorians corrupted after they landed in earth.

02:39:54.000 --> 02:40:02.000

Yes, you start calling under the shadow of the revenue or address it's time.

02:40:02.000 --> 02:40:18.000

You can use and they uses that designation for them for the ones who don't say they'll colonize in the month

02:40:18.000 --> 02:40:26.000

Who subjugate the people take you close the line.

02:40:26.000 --> 02:40:38.000

So it's a bring in this then and through that desk.

02:40:38.000 --> 02:41:02.000

I'll sell her on kind of you know like greedy and proud, before you before you captured seller and have figured that good one you wanna one of the genes in the middle of the

02:41:02.000 --> 02:41:06.000

dynasty. they they start, and becoming, and start with our lives.

02:41:06.000 --> 02:41:13.000

We start building lazily big no houses to the house for that.

02:41:13.000 --> 02:41:29.000

The civilization starts 6 in the line,

02:41:29.000 --> 02:41:33.000

You know, seeking ways to, you know, if you want to be long in their lives.

02:41:33.000 --> 02:41:37.000

And yeah, that that is yeah that's All right.

02:41:37.000 --> 02:41:42.000

The the unwillingness to let go of power and belongings.

02:41:42.000 --> 02:41:57.000

Is Is the other really big one? Are you looking at that

02:41:57.000 --> 02:42:02.000

They are kings. Then

02:42:02.000 --> 02:42:11.000

Well, then, their kings men they're not faithful, but like for them to have survived the downfall of numerous, not faithful.

02:42:11.000 --> 02:42:32.000

They had to already been settled in yeah middle earth that's the course well, and page 436 Tolkien's node is that's settled in the king or is this also or in this house It's.

02:42:32.000 --> 02:42:51.000

A new or togan they'll not go and so like we're, we're bounded probably within a few 100 years of a certain noble date, but given given the life spans of men and else and sorrows and what

02:42:51.000 --> 02:42:58.000

have you and it's it's a wide windows still that this be taking place on great here's certain things that are very clear about what we do have from the story.

02:42:58.000 --> 02:43:09.000

But there are certain parts where you know the way. the Tolkien was gonna frame it overall in terms of where it takes place in the exact exactly who these new men are, is unfortunately lost to us.

02:43:09.000 --> 02:43:13.000

Yeah, one of the things that struck me was: I wondered if he was writing this.

02:43:13.000 --> 02:43:32.000

If he was working on the amendment and like he put it injury for the second age, and it was like, Oh, i'm gonna spit out a have no goodbye could be I think is that thing But just curious

02:43:32.000 --> 02:44:02.000

right waiting for you early fifties, This writing, I think, started in 55, So that would have been around the time that he was scrambling finish those yeah, and you have this moment of inspiration and got at

02:44:07.000 --> 02:44:24.000

least, you know half of this Dorian maybe half of this story out on favorite stead, and we have those conference strangers as well as like how many. There's There's not really any other author out

02:44:24.000 --> 02:44:35.000

there where you have this much of his process published right where you can go through and say, and then, and then the insight that Christopher provides as well. right that over you know, in my father's life This is what was going on while he

02:44:35.000 --> 02:44:47.000

was writing this and all that, all that context as Well, so it's sort of I think it's one of the things that makes talking so fascinating to study in terms of this process and where he's at in his

02:44:47.000 --> 02:44:53.000

life when he's writing things, and then thanks so in terms of like Newman Orans.

02:44:53.000 --> 02:44:57.000

This is coming directly from the Lord of the ring. Stand up with me.

02:44:57.000 --> 02:45:03.000

So ,

02:45:03.000 --> 02:45:15.000

Would be considered among the first and most terrible of the Vladimir is corrupted by salon approximately 1,000 years before the downfall.

02:45:15.000 --> 02:45:24.000

Yeah. But yeah, that we we came up against this question too, when you're talking about the the ring races, you know.

02:45:24.000 --> 02:45:32.000

How do they get off of or or today fall and lose their fault, default with doomor, and lose their corporeal forms?

02:45:32.000 --> 02:45:37.000

And then, you know, the ring race is just a non corporate work, kind of thing.

02:45:37.000 --> 02:45:51.000

And did you have bodies with them yeah yeah It's It does seem like in general, when one is talking about Black Newman Orans.

02:45:51.000 --> 02:45:58.000

One is talking about the descendants of the king's men who settled primarily in a bar.

02:45:58.000 --> 02:46:08.000

Those are who end up becoming referred to as black and and so I didn't put this in in the Synopsis, because there's not really much textually about it.

02:46:08.000 --> 02:46:16.000

But that is definitely something you know, that they could dedicate some significant time to in the show is who these men are.

02:46:16.000 --> 02:46:22.000

The who these kings of men are. or leaders of men are that end of the coming, the ring race right, and how they end up falling up your sirens influence.

02:46:22.000 --> 02:46:45.000

But there's so little written about that and we can't We don't really have much in the way of time, so I mean. but you know the nice I mean you have I have 9 mobile men then now how how do you you know

02:46:45.000 --> 02:46:50.000

an episode of each 3 to the other guys, pulling all they will not.

02:46:50.000 --> 02:46:59.000

Yeah, it might have to be. in groups or something like that, right? you know. there's a few of them here, and then all of them come from over here or something.

02:46:59.000 --> 02:47:02.000

It. it seems it seems like a lot to end up with a backstory with all of them.

02:47:02.000 --> 02:47:20.000

Yeah, don't worry. Groups See? Yeah, one of the things I generally talk about is like why I chose to read this, and whether I think it's going to you know be adapted to, or how it might be adapted I

02:47:20.000 --> 02:47:34.000

mean I chose this because it's one of the more interesting things that they like to give has written about one of the things that we've been discussing a lot and I actually didn't know about this writing while I was making

02:47:34.000 --> 02:47:38.000

the list. I found it on a reddit post.

02:47:38.000 --> 02:47:53.000

Actually, I got some quote from that. post. and I was like this is gonna be worth reading like it's gonna have important stuff, and it's gonna be worth actually discussing.

02:47:53.000 --> 02:47:57.000

And I think it is one of the only writings we have where we were.

02:47:57.000 --> 02:48:17.000

Tolkien's actually giving us a view of what middle Earth was like outside of the nobility and outside of the normal viewpoints that we get elves, men or dwarves and any hobbies

02:48:17.000 --> 02:48:30.000

don't exist in the second age, I'm gonna die on the hill, Maybe you're. so we did not really talk about because they're really cause there's really no textual evidence whatsoever.

02:48:30.000 --> 02:48:39.000

There's maybe the orcs came, you know, started existing, or some prototype that started existing in the second age.

02:48:39.000 --> 02:48:53.000

But the history of very there is in fact only notation from Tolkien and others and others have been here longer than we've been paying attention.

02:48:53.000 --> 02:49:09.000

And i'm sorry this is totally going off on A, and they are talking to go on about all songs from his view.

02:49:09.000 --> 02:49:23.000

And if you think about how gambles, says that he was essentially that that all was part of like a prehabitat proto-obit kind of species.

02:49:23.000 --> 02:49:33.000

The songs from his youth are about things that happen in the early third age.

02:49:33.000 --> 02:49:51.000

They can have been in the second page i'm going to die on the zoom because go store right and and and yeah, are there?

02:49:51.000 --> 02:49:57.000

That's 3 that doesn't mean that the stores didn't exist.

02:49:57.000 --> 02:50:02.000

Smigo wasn't the first store These are the kind of arguments that happen in our house.

02:50:02.000 --> 02:50:15.000

Folks like that. The evidence is lack of evidence is not evident.

02:50:15.000 --> 02:50:19.000

I'm sorry I just this is something that's just thinking of my grow up, or little less.

02:50:19.000 --> 02:50:27.000

Now, thank you. I think that heartplates look and I I don't.

02:50:27.000 --> 02:50:39.000

I don't 100% hated even though I do kind of and I understand that, like It's it's gotta have hobbies. or people aren't gonna understand pretty much I think you I guess

02:50:39.000 --> 02:50:53.000

i'll be i'll be in your camp if there if there's some very clear like these are habits, and the the rings of power and television show like if they're not there's there's no differentiation it's just

02:50:53.000 --> 02:51:04.000

like that's all i'll be frustrated. they have specifically so they in in the the articles in the interview and stuff they specifically name them as our floods as a proto-habit

02:51:04.000 --> 02:51:13.000

species, and I like in the trailers, you see on the end. and in some of the interviews, as well, they've said specifically that they are inomatic peoples, and I like that.

02:51:13.000 --> 02:51:16.000

Take on an early hobby since civilization. I think that it works.

02:51:16.000 --> 02:51:19.000

I think that I I think there's interesting things to explore there.

02:51:19.000 --> 02:51:27.000

Very lord of the rings online, that is if possible, because to me it's is the ring.

02:51:27.000 --> 02:51:42.000

When Nandal was explaining the history of great proto in he mentioned mentioned scrolling people with as being all holidays.

02:51:42.000 --> 02:51:49.000

Which is, say not the public exactly, but something It could very well be either.

02:51:49.000 --> 02:51:53.000

Okay. They choose to address the one that jump the right as well.

02:51:53.000 --> 02:52:13.000

Operating the power these are reaches all right, because it's no one going into this Tv series that I can all be seeing the Jacks

02:52:13.000 --> 02:52:18.000

Yeah, they're they're billing them as as proto-habits.

02:52:18.000 --> 02:52:22.000

Yeah, the scripts for whatever that wouldn't even need directly to address the address.

02:52:22.000 --> 02:52:31.000

,

02:52:31.000 --> 02:52:49.000

We're gonna be we're we're the full ones people who are going

02:52:49.000 --> 02:52:52.000

To to pull that tangent all the way back.

02:52:52.000 --> 02:53:12.000

I thought it was interesting to actually read about some of these like kind of normal people, because obviously the Amazon show from what we've seen is going to focus a lot on Crafts people, and like people who aren't necessarily And also they seem to be actually

02:53:12.000 --> 02:53:19.000

taking. Oh, look at what's happening on art of separately from what's happening in Newborn.

02:53:19.000 --> 02:53:29.000

Once happening, you know, like with just like parts of artle and with the else. I think it's interesting that they're going to try to build our worlds out.

02:53:29.000 --> 02:53:43.000

And now we actually have some, some text to get that a little bit of labor like when Tolkien may have thought at least one part of that would work like.

02:53:43.000 --> 02:53:46.000

And so, as we tend to do in these book clubs in terms of personally.

02:53:46.000 --> 02:53:54.000

How I see this potentially tying into the actual series is, I want love to see some of these colonialism themes explored and rings of power.

02:53:54.000 --> 02:54:07.000

We have seen some people from the trailers we discussed earlier with it look like they are sort of lower born peoples, potentially from those by Western shorelands of erodor. and so maybe we will see the Newman

02:54:07.000 --> 02:54:23.000

orans potentially under our farizon's role doing some of these really heinous things, like packing these, you know, these these people on ships like animals, basically, which is literally out of the text, and man does that some images.

02:54:23.000 --> 02:54:29.000

And you know, stealing people for ritual sacrifices and slaves, and that's sort of thing like you know.

02:54:29.000 --> 02:54:37.000

I I did say earlier that you know. maybe the new Minorians were entirely to blame for the account, but they're not great people.

02:54:37.000 --> 02:54:49.000

But, anyway, talking about justice, maybe maybe they got what they deserve, even if it was kind of the valor's fault.

02:54:49.000 --> 02:54:58.000

How much of that is just like, you know, a half a dozen or a couple of dozen nobles who have just really gone off the rails, following the king.

02:54:58.000 --> 02:55:08.000

Hey? How many hundreds of like mostly innocent people, ended up ,

02:55:08.000 --> 02:55:20.000

Mostly talking about nobility. And there are all these other people who, or you know, just on the verge of starvation, or whatever, trying to leave live their lives.

02:55:20.000 --> 02:55:30.000

And then all of a sudden, Oh, here comes away cause They're kidding, But you know he goes right here.

02:55:30.000 --> 02:55:42.000

They should do something about it. If they're not right one of the big is your teams that is the little people that can rise up and change the world.

02:55:42.000 --> 02:55:48.000

Why not Newman or him? No, it's gotta be this white guy that comes from savages?

02:55:48.000 --> 02:55:58.000

He's like he's a hero. look like Skywalker.

02:55:58.000 --> 02:56:02.000

Yeah, look. he has a secret sibling. Yeah.

02:56:02.000 --> 02:56:17.000

Well, then, we're coming, back to the alert they couldn't, you know they wouldn't be peasants, because you have to be you know people who can we've got enough well for the Bill

02:56:17.000 --> 02:56:33.000

shifts they're not just simple farmers, if they did their they're entrepreneurship and they send up a hard There's also the people who are doing the hard work on the

02:56:33.000 --> 02:56:51.000

shit, but they board their shifts under under the shadow of not being able to make it apparent like needing to not make it a parents to to on that they are preparing for this journey, and so I

02:56:51.000 --> 02:56:59.000

don't think the invitation list went cause wide as one Michael Well, you have.

02:56:59.000 --> 02:57:10.000

What is it? 7 bucks a total it's not that many. They're gonna do this if they're missing.

02:57:10.000 --> 02:57:17.000

Yeah, right? Yeah. significant amount. but not a huge amount so definitely you again.

02:57:17.000 --> 02:57:32.000

Need to put the invite let's go wider could you really, I mean, if there really sounds like this it really does sound like it human or based on all the rings that we've done The the

02:57:32.000 --> 02:57:43.000

seafaring people's it was very much a privilege to be able to board those ships. So I think I would imagine I envision that even the people that are doing this sort of medial pass on those votes are still at

02:57:43.000 --> 02:57:51.000

least of say middle class sort of you know they're they're. They're not you know there's not slaves necessarily bringing those ships.

02:57:51.000 --> 02:58:05.000

They say those just to burn and stab and so shepherd it off the island by looking for your you're at least faithful to yourself.

02:58:05.000 --> 02:58:15.000

Seems to be the it may Have well been a privilege. but there was also a strain in new orleans basically rejecting. Let's see, rejecting the shifts in That's what you get in

02:58:15.000 --> 02:58:20.000

the mirrors. Why don't you love this Land Why are you going off? else?

02:58:20.000 --> 02:58:26.000

Where are you from me? and and that there's No way that that I I ?

02:58:26.000 --> 02:58:28.000

That would strain have been limited to just one person.

02:58:28.000 --> 02:58:35.000

I think it was Everything we need right here you don't need to go off with another thing.

02:58:35.000 --> 02:58:39.000

We have that whole discussion, as well as sort of the romanticization of of seafare, the sea pairing life.

02:58:39.000 --> 02:58:51.000

And how all there, and should have just, or are this just sort of you know, accepted that all Darren's heart was calling him to the sea and stuff like that and I hate the

02:58:51.000 --> 02:58:59.000

way that that story potentially ends like talking gave sort of a he did that story that we did.

02:58:59.000 --> 02:59:10.000

But we're frankly it's not familiar we're horrendous at the end, just walks into the sea and dies cause she's so sad that all Darian hasn't come back I was just like I think she could probably hear

02:59:10.000 --> 02:59:14.000

me like grown from the other room. Oh, God, really is this!

02:59:14.000 --> 02:59:24.000

How are you? It's just so painful typical jilted love or thing right?

02:59:24.000 --> 02:59:46.000

Hello, dramatic garbage, and one of the big and they're going forward, get, I mean, hey?

02:59:46.000 --> 03:00:08.000

You have you're full very very you know basically every day, while it's including at least one you are observing maybe the grand kind of making and romantic moles, and most

03:00:08.000 --> 03:00:20.000

It's all all the be outside 3 calls That's not how.

03:00:20.000 --> 03:00:27.000

Well, you know. Romantic modell I think they don't need you know students.

03:00:27.000 --> 03:00:40.000

They are driven people, that they they they have You know what you we might be.

03:00:40.000 --> 03:00:55.000

Well, the rings of power energy yeah perpetuate that we'll we'll we'll be dealing with with with the great and the good all the both. The second day or are we going to pay yeah.

03:00:55.000 --> 03:01:10.000

This would be going a very customary point in contact that's convenient, but probably more of a game and I can really show, I think, that'd be very so then that's going to be

03:01:10.000 --> 03:01:40.000

optionally in the rings I think the game of thrones analogy is probably suitable here, and the that they did want to emulate game of thrones in certain ways.

03:01:40.000 --> 03:01:48.000

and then you know everybody's talking about this is the next game of thrones. and that caused a lot of concern, because people like I don't want to see how's copulating, and stuff like that right yeah, I

03:01:48.000 --> 03:01:54.000

don't I don't want to see something as gory and and unforgiving as as game of thrones.

03:01:54.000 --> 03:02:03.000

But I think where they are going to emulate it isn't that way where they're gonna try and show both points of view, cause game of thrones didn't do that I think fairly Well, there were you know similarities that

03:02:03.000 --> 03:02:24.000

ended up having you know some decent storylines and stuff like that within all these high born peoples and all the palace, and and available.

03:02:24.000 --> 03:02:41.000

There is very little discussion already one of the below a certain level of quality, and that's no So that's not to lots of those homes takes to unrealistic that's just not what they were about and like I said the part of

03:02:41.000 --> 03:02:55.000

the reason why the rates is as convincing as a picture of all people like the you know the go

03:02:55.000 --> 03:03:09.000

There are other Alright, please do that meeting, and all of the rings told him.

03:03:09.000 --> 03:03:18.000

Never describes how Yeah, the exception of .

03:03:18.000 --> 03:03:42.000

So that's that's just an interesting point that i've seen for and how if they are going to be building these characters and being impressed by it I think we may need to end on that note because we are a

03:03:42.000 --> 03:03:49.000

couple of minutes over. and Oh, I know we're not up it gets anything, but it need interests of fairness with people that we're up against sounds.

03:03:49.000 --> 03:03:55.000

But thank you everybody for lively discussion. Be great. Thank you.