

06:37:27.000 --> 06:37:32.000

Awesome. Thanks so much. Janet. Yeah, so I am very excited about this topic.

06:37:32.000 --> 06:37:40.000

This is one that I chose, primarily out of my personal interest of the show and less so a specific expertise in the area.

06:37:40.000 --> 06:37:51.000

But yeah, so we'll get right into it. If we can leave questions till the end, feel free to write them down in the chat or stuff. I'll take a look afterwards. But, yeah, I'll start going through.

06:37:51.000 --> 06:37:56.000

So the good, the bad and the mind body problem. So do a sick punishment and torture in the good place.

06:37:56.000 --> 06:38:07.000

So opening upon this show, the question of what or even if anything happens after death is a constant fixation of humanity at every point in history.

06:38:07.000 --> 06:38:18.000

The answer to that question is neither static nor universal. Literary philosophical and religious movements continue to reflect and influence writings on the matter.

06:38:18.000 --> 06:38:24.000

Michael Schur's sitcom The Good Places approaches the question of the afterlife with a modern perspective.

06:38:24.000 --> 06:38:34.000

The principal worldview of the audience of each depiction of hell, historically shifts from a primarily religious ideology, perspective to one founded on secular philosophy.

06:38:34.000 --> 06:38:41.000

Dante Alighieri's epic poem *Inferno* reflects views of the afterlife in the fourteenth century influenced by Roman Catholicism.

06:38:41.000 --> 06:38:53.000

Well, the good play for reflects our modern world. This transition from a traditional to a modern depiction of hell, changes some of the fundamental understandings of the systems that govern the writings notions of the afterlife.

06:38:53.000 --> 06:38:54.000

So as I discussed the show, I'm not certain how familiar all of you are with the show.

06:38:54.000 --> 06:39:05.000

I'll give you a brief overview just the structure. So within the show, the good place, the terms heaven and hell are not used to refer to separate parts of the afterlife.

06:39:05.000 --> 06:39:15.000

Rather heaven is terms of good place and hell is turned with a bad place. However, in the first season, which my paper focus on, what they're referring to is the good place is actually secretly the bad place.

06:39:15.000 --> 06:39:32.000

So this is a new, system of hell that, Michael, who is the, the main demon on the show, there is also like the creator of the show is Michael Schur.

06:39:32.000 --> 06:39:37.000

So if I'm referring to sure I'll use his last name, but if I use Michael, then I'm referring to one of the main characters.

06:39:37.000 --> 06:39:54.000

So Michael creates this this new, version of, hell, which he calls the good place, and he's attempting to trick the humans into believing that they are in heaven, while secretly torturing them by placing them in uncomfortable situations primarily.

06:39:54.000 --> 06:40:01.000

So therefore, when I'm using the terms of good place, I'm referring to what is known to us as hell.

06:40:01.000 --> 06:40:16.000

Other things to note, is that, it is a TV show. So using some graphics at the beginning that are taken shots from the show under fair use, but the rest of it is drawings that I've done myself.

06:40:16.000 --> 06:40:25.000

So starting out, we have the first opening of the very first shots of the first, season.

06:40:25.000 --> 06:40:27.000

So we get this beautiful picture of the main character. So our main character is Eleanor Selstra.

06:40:27.000 --> 06:40:36.000

And this is the first extreme close up of Eleanor. So this is the starting point of the whole story.

06:40:36.000 --> 06:40:45.000

While Dante starts his journey as a man wandering in the woods, the Sure, start to, journey with a view of her eyes.

06:40:45.000 --> 06:40:51.000

This sets the tone in the image as we get it a snapshot of both Eleanor's body and her soul.

06:40:51.000 --> 06:40:58.000

So the eyes are physical lens through which Eleanor sees the world around her. There are also known as the window to the soul.

06:40:58.000 --> 06:41:04.000

So this is a vantage point through which the Eleanor, the audience can see Eleanor's.

06:41:04.000 --> 06:41:06.000

Mental and emotional states. Throughout the series. There are various close ups of Eleanor.

06:41:06.000 --> 06:41:22.000

Primarily focusing in on her eyes. They either signal to a flashback of her time on earth, or they give a glance into her emotional state at the time.

06:41:22.000 --> 06:41:27.000

So I'm gonna frame this presentation in my arguments. And the following discussion around this image.

06:41:27.000 --> 06:41:31.000

I've created a series of drawings which will explore specific themes of the paper and each drawing builds upon the previous one.

06:41:31.000 --> 06:41:40.000

And will all come together that the end into one cohesive tapestry of ideas to jump into discussion with.

06:41:40.000 --> 06:41:55.000

So the first drawing is of this long shot. Both body and mind are present. The jumping off point will serve as a lens, which is hilarious, through which I'll examine this modern depiction of hell in contrast to our traditional depiction of health.

06:41:55.000 --> 06:42:09.000

So jumping right in. In shifting from a traditional to a modern, a fundamental change is a shift shift from punishment to torture, which reflects each writer's position on philosophical concepts of the self.

06:42:09.000 --> 06:42:23.000

In particular in definition I'm going to using from the Oxford English Dictionary. So punishment is defined as the infliction of penalty or sanction in retribution for an offense or transgress.

06:42:23.000 --> 06:42:41.000

Which was inflicted that which is inflicted as a penalty and torture is defined as inflicting a severe pain or suffering upon to torment to distress to or afflict grievously, also to exercise the mind severely or to puzzle perplex greatly.

06:42:41.000 --> 06:42:50.000

So when taking these definitions, we're moving from a shift of traditional punishment within hell, to a more modern view of what torture may look like.

06:42:50.000 --> 06:43:07.000

We also shift in particularly in terms of philosophical concepts. The mind body problem, known but proposed by Rene Descartes infers that the mind and body are separate substances and provides a lens through which the writers position on punishment and torture may be analyzed.

06:43:07.000 --> 06:43:18.000

So in definitions of the mind body problem, we are going to be using this definition. So the view that the universe contains 2 radically different kinds of substance.

06:43:18.000 --> 06:43:30.000

The first being the mind, which is defined as a thinking unextended substance and second body, ie matter, defined as an extended unthinking substance.

06:43:30.000 --> 06:43:43.000

So in referring to the mind body problem throughout the, the paper, what Dante would traditionally refer to as the spirit or the soul is the similar to the substance that Descartes would describe as the mind.

06:43:43.000 --> 06:43:51.000

So those words are used interchangeably.

06:43:51.000 --> 06:44:00.000

So jumping right in so I can go back and forth between the 2 sides in between the traditional and the modern.

06:44:00.000 --> 06:44:06.000

So, in Dante, in don't, in Dante's depiction of hell.

00:00:08.000 --> 00:00:16.000

One moment. Yeah. In Dante's depiction of hell, it is ruled by the part by the idea of Contra Pao.

00:00:16.000 --> 00:00:25.000

Which is translated as counter poise. This punishment endured by the shades, Dante and Vergo encounter is a counter-suffering.

00:00:25.000 --> 00:00:37.000

Quote, proportionate to and in kind of sins chosen by the center. These punishments are described in relation to their physical nature, even though the spirits in hell are shades without a true fleshy body.

00:00:37.000 --> 00:00:48.000

However, following the last judgment outline in the scriptures, Catholics believe that spirit and body will be unified again in heaven and health upon the last days of judgment following Christ's return.

00:00:48.000 --> 00:00:55.000

Following a monotheistic religious approach, Dante's depiction of hell situates the body as the principal substance.

00:00:55.000 --> 00:01:00.000

The one through which perfect contra pao supports some level of materialism. As the shades or souls and hell are not in their ideal form.

00:01:00.000 --> 00:01:10.000

Until the resurrection of the physical body.

00:01:10.000 --> 00:01:22.000

So going back over to our tradition for a modern depiction. As we look at, what it appears to be in terms of weighing what is good, what is bad.

00:01:22.000 --> 00:01:31.000

Conversely in the good place that Michael creates, the individuals are tortured due to their moral point status, not due to specific transgressions against others or God.

00:01:31.000 --> 00:01:43.000

So moving from that punishment status to that torture status, we're no longer concerned with the specific transgressions or offense, merely inflicting pain based upon a certain status.

00:01:43.000 --> 00:01:49.000

So Michael explains to them how the system of checks and balances from world goodness have been tracking their whole lives.

00:01:49.000 --> 00:01:58.000

Quote during your time on earth every one of your actions has a positive or negative value depending on how much good or bad that action put into the universe.

00:01:58.000 --> 00:02:04.000

This is set up to have all 4 of the main characters believe they are in the real good place. And load them into a false sense of security, forcing them to be on their toes.

00:02:04.000 --> 00:02:18.000

As 2 of them know they don't belong. So that is part of the premise with Eleanor specifically when she arrives in house or in the good place she is aware that she does not belong in heaven.

00:02:18.000 --> 00:02:28.000

So throughout the first season, she is tortured. Primarily on her own view of herself, as a bad person who does not belong.

00:02:28.000 --> 00:02:37.000

The shift. That happens here is rather than defining themselves as caretakers of a specific sin or sin type as we see in Inferno.

00:02:37.000 --> 00:02:46.000

They're defined by their overall point status through their individual struggles with, with morality are used against them to a specific pain.

00:02:46.000 --> 00:02:52.000

Rather than weighing one sin against another or an eye for an eye and traditional biblical perspective.

00:02:52.000 --> 00:03:05.000

It is based on their entire status as an individual. So Michael devices, different torture situations, often dealing with the humans insecurities, perceived laws or their status as a good or bad person.

00:03:05.000 --> 00:03:14.000

The shift from a retributive punishment to purposeful torture redefines the intentions of the pain experienced in the afterlife.

00:03:14.000 --> 00:03:20.000

The approach to torture is dualistic in nature as the body and the mind are recognized as separate entities.

00:03:20.000 --> 00:03:32.000

And that specific torture is developed in light of that separation. Previous to the first season of the good place, we receive a flashback that has Michael proposing his idea for a new health.

00:03:32.000 --> 00:03:42.000

And in that we see what we We recognize as more traditional health, enlisting physical pain and torture in various ways.



00:03:42.000 --> 00:03:52.000

And so this new torture is set to really focus in on the mental and emotional states. So separating out the old being the body and the new being the mind.

00:03:52.000 --> 00:04:01.000

So in the good place, Eleanor Shell's Drop, Chidi, A, A, Tahini, and Jason Mendoza all experience the social, emotional, and mental torture.

00:04:01.000 --> 00:04:06.000

The mind and mental torture. The mind and mental states are. The mind and mental states are isolated from traditional physical portrait by Michael in his proposal.

00:04:06.000 --> 00:04:13.000

The mind and mental states are isolated from traditional physical portrait by Michael in his proposal for this new arrangement of how.

00:04:13.000 --> 00:04:19.000

So what is the significance of these shifts in philosophical perspectives on the afterlife and modern fantasy?

00:04:19.000 --> 00:04:33.000

How does this change in depiction inform the modern audience about what is hellish in this modern world? In the first section of this presentation, I will discuss how the historical context of Catholicism and punishment in relation to Inferno.

00:04:33.000 --> 00:04:41.000

I will discuss how Dante's depiction of Hell is ruled by religious ideology and primarily depicts a physical punishment.

00:04:41.000 --> 00:04:46.000

I will continue to connect this to broader ideas about materialism and the relationship between biological processes and religious views.

00:04:46.000 --> 00:04:59.000

In the second section, I will examine how the mind body problem and substance dualism proposed by Descartes follow functions in the good place as the mind and mental states are subject to torture.

00:04:59.000 --> 00:05:10.000

The shift from punishment to torture will play a key role in my argument. About the change from a religious ideology to philosophical theory as the guiding principle in regard to a shift to modernism.

00:05:10.000 --> 00:05:17.000

Finally, in the third section, I'll explore the implications of how a modern hell and how it reflects the modern human experience.

00:05:17.000 --> 00:05:22.000

Through an analysis of the pictures of Hell in Dante's Inferno and Michael Schur's The Good Place.

00:05:22.000 --> 00:05:32.000

I will demonstrate how changing perspectives on the relationship between the mind and the body have led to a redefinition of the intentions of pain that's depicted in the afterlife.

00:05:32.000 --> 00:05:45.000

The shift in depiction informs the modern audience about what is hellish in their world, revealing the significance of contemporary fantasy and coping with fears surrounding the question of what happens after death.

00:05:45.000 --> 00:06:01.000

So going through this for section, physical, our punishment, physicalism, fleshy body, and traditional health.

00:06:01.000 --> 00:06:16.000

So this inscription, over the gates of hell in the third contour of Inferno, refers to hell as an original intentional component of creation, particularly the line before me there was no created things.

00:06:16.000 --> 00:06:22.000

This implies that even before the first sin was committed before the Garden of Eden was even conceived, hell existed.

00:06:22.000 --> 00:06:34.000

Thus, Hell is presented as an innate and inevitable destination for centers. As a function of God's love, wisdom and justice, Dante's house serves as a retributive space where centers are held accountable.

00:06:34.000 --> 00:06:38.000

This reflects biblical retribution. Quote, you have heard the law that says the punishment must match the injury.

00:06:38.000 --> 00:06:45.000

An eye for an eye and a tooth for a tooth. Matthew, chapter 5, verse 38.

00:06:45.000 --> 00:06:56.000

Dante leverages the Contra Paso, which translated means counter suffering. To connect biblical retribution and physical punishment enacted on the shades.

00:06:56.000 --> 00:07:02.000

Punishment is defined as the infliction of penalty or sanction and retribution for an offense or transgress.

00:07:02.000 --> 00:07:09.000

That which is inflicted as a penalty. So even here we have punishment intrinsically linked with retribution and the payment of a penalty.

00:07:09.000 --> 00:07:17.000

Dante's Introduction to Hell supports the position that Hell was divinely intended as an expanse for the punishment of souls.

00:07:17.000 --> 00:07:26.000

Eternal pain and unending punishments.

00:07:26.000 --> 00:07:36.000

So continuing on with this discussion of punishment. Let's let load.

00:07:36.000 --> 00:07:46.000

There are some valid arguments among scholars in terms of what is retribute of hell and if. Dantes, depiction of hell is truly retribution.

00:07:46.000 --> 00:08:14.000

As they move through the cells they encounter different shades in active counter suffering. Early on. They find that if they are speaking about eternal punishment that there is some difference between what is true or what is suffering in regards to a specific SIN or in a case of Virgil suffering in regards to their status as a pagan.

00:08:14.000 --> 00:08:20.000

So there is no suffering in hell as predestined by God. So how can there be eternal punishment without the perpetual suffering of victims.

00:08:20.000 --> 00:08:32.000

This position is asked by Alexander and Akin. Who quotes ask the answer to this question seems to be a consequence of the most basic tenants of monotheistic theology.

00:08:32.000 --> 00:08:36.000

All sins are crimes against an infinite being that is infinitely good and therefore no sin can harm God.

00:08:36.000 --> 00:08:51.000

All sons may deserve infinite punishment. In this sense, Dante's depiction are wholly in keeping with the medieval Roman Catholic understanding of sin.

00:08:51.000 --> 00:08:59.000

So this position is also supported by Steinberg who notes that Dante has a sense of the fundamental difference between paganism and Christianity.

00:08:59.000 --> 00:09:05.000

Those who did not follow God are punished for their sin, their unbelief, and their paganism and are placed in hell.

00:09:05.000 --> 00:09:19.000

Quote, according to Dante's description of his final resting place and his significance. His placement in limbo seems to be result of theological legalism and bad luck rather than a flaw of his humanity or a crack in his noble mobility.

00:09:19.000 --> 00:09:30.000

This view supports the idea that Virgil stands as an example of a soul whose status as a pagan rather than as a morally corrupt individual, lands him in hell with a traditional worldview.

00:09:30.000 --> 00:09:34.000

Whereas in a modern version of hell, Virgil may not have ended up in Limbo.

00:09:34.000 --> 00:09:48.000

Virgil's place of limbo within how further confirms the status as a punishable is not measured by his moral standing, but by these theological theological convictions and a contradiction with what Dante considers to be biblical truth.

00:09:48.000 --> 00:09:55.000

The move from a traditional view of the body in the mind also supports the move from the idea of punishment to the idea of torture.

00:09:55.000 --> 00:10:15.000

So abandoning this idea of eternal punishment, which is somewhat supported by biblical theory, allows for the idea that a person may be judged based on their moral standing, and not understanding within a

specific theological, and not understanding within a specific theological, set of rules, and not understanding within a specific theological, set of rules, allowing for Virgil, who traditionally would have

00:10:15.000 --> 00:10:31.000

end up in hell within this modern shift to have a possibility. Of being moved into the good place.

00:10:31.000 --> 00:10:46.000

Sorry, I've just got my notes on this other computer. So going back. Let me load this.

00:10:46.000 --> 00:10:51.000

As Dante and Virgil move through the circles of hell, they encounter shades and active counter suffering.

00:10:51.000 --> 00:10:59.000

So early on, Dante knowing the Catholic belief in the resurrection of the body. On the last day judgment, as Virgilists return to flesh, will increase the pain the souls in hell experience.

00:10:59.000 --> 00:11:08.000

So even here we see Dante considering what is separating the soul and what is separating of the body.

00:11:08.000 --> 00:11:17.000

Quote the wherefore I said master these torments here will they increase after the mighty sentence or lesser be or will they be as burning?

00:11:17.000 --> 00:11:26.000

And he said to me, return unto thy science, which wills that is the thing more perfect is the more it feels pleasure of pain, unquote.

00:11:26.000 --> 00:11:27.000

So thus the Centers and How will be perfectly punished through physical pain that fits their respective sins.

00:11:27.000 --> 00:11:39.000

The reunification of the body in the mind signals some significance of the body over the mind as in Dante's depiction.

00:11:39.000 --> 00:11:48.000

This aligns Dante's for velocity of the self with a physicalist perspective. Notes I'm not making the argument here that Dante's depiction is aligned with physicalism.

00:11:48.000 --> 00:11:57.000

But rather there's depiction in some senses, carries some of the principles of physicalism.

00:11:57.000 --> 00:12:02.000

As defined by the Stanford and Encyclopedia Philosophy. Physicalism is the the Csis.

00:12:02.000 --> 00:12:15.000

That everything is physical or that everything supervenes on or is necessitated by the physical. So not necessarily that everything in Dante's depiction is literally physical, but that the physical seems to have, the necessary, status.

00:12:15.000 --> 00:12:32.000

It is the, the, property that super beans on other things. Though there is a point where, souls and how are defined as non physical, the eventual and ideal form is physical.

00:12:32.000 --> 00:12:41.000

This is evidenced by the overwhelmingly physical punishment that Dante and Virgil witnessed as the flaying according of spirits in the sixth canto by Cerberus.

00:12:41.000 --> 00:12:48.000

Quote red eyes has he and unconscious beard and black and belly large and armed with claws in his hands.

00:12:48.000 --> 00:12:54.000

He runs the spirits, flays and quarters them. How will the rain make us some unto dogs?

00:12:54.000 --> 00:13:04.000

One side they make a shelter for the other off turn themselves the wretched robots. When servers perceived us, the great worm, his mouth opened, and he displayed his tusks.

00:13:04.000 --> 00:13:13.000

Not a limb he had was motionless. So even in this picture of physical. Of torment and punishment of the shades, which are deemed spirits, so a non physical substance.

00:13:13.000 --> 00:13:27.000

The description of their pain is inherently physical in its nature. This Christmas account of tortured the spirits of gluttons in the third circle demonstrates the pain resulting from punishment.

00:13:27.000 --> 00:13:34.000

Even though they don't have a physical body yet inferring a super meaning of physical traits even upon the spirit.

00:13:34.000 --> 00:13:51.000

Watson and Jones devised a study to test adults believes that biological processes continue into the afterlife. A significant result of the study was evidencing a connection between religious views and the belief in a physical body or physical processes continuing after death.

00:13:51.000 --> 00:14:04.000

Quote, priming religious as priming a religious view as opposed to biological conception of death increases participants endorsement of the continuation of both physiological and biological processes.

00:14:04.000 --> 00:14:17.000

Unquote. Basically summing that up is that they believe that if they had religious views, there was a higher chance they believe that the physical process of the bodies continued after death.



00:14:17.000 --> 00:14:24.000

The influence of religious narrative is shown to be related to an individual's belief about what processes continue after death.

00:14:24.000 --> 00:14:35.000

Thus the connection between religious ideology and belief about the afterlife is inherently tied to both a physical and a psychological understanding of philosophy of the human self.

00:14:35.000 --> 00:14:50.000

At least in part, I'm not making the argument. That Dante's Theology or portrayal of how is entirely physicalist, but at least in terms of the connections, but at least in terms of the connections between resurrection of the body and the idea of the connections between resurrection of the body and the idea of punishment, a body and the idea of punishment, a physicalist perspective does hold

00:14:50.000 --> 00:14:56.000

some

00:14:56.000 --> 00:15:08.000

So going into the second part, talking about substance dualism and the torture of the mind, specifically, as it is found in the good place.

00:15:08.000 --> 00:15:14.000

So opening up with a quote. It took me a while to figure it out, but just now as we were all fighting and yelling at each other and each one of us demanding we should go to the bad place.

00:15:14.000 --> 00:15:26.000

I thought to myself, Man, this is torture. This is the bad place, unquote. So this is Eleanor in the end of the first season as she discovers and comes to the conclusion that she is actually in the bad place.

00:15:26.000 --> 00:15:37.000

So upon reflecting on her experiences, she discovers that what she has been through is torture. So during the last episode, we see this entry into the probeial gates of hell.

00:15:37.000 --> 00:15:54.000

Realistically, the characters have been in house since they died. Yet this is the first time throughout the narrative they become consciously aware of where they are and the implications of their recent experiences.

00:15:54.000 --> 00:16:01.000

In contrast to Dante who first arrives at the Gates of Hell and receives a warning via the inscription at the gates.

00:16:01.000 --> 00:16:04.000

Cont Trader Dantes descent in hell. Their torture blinds them to the reality of the space that they are in.

00:16:04.000 --> 00:16:15.000

Interestingly, all the characters have been tortured since the day they arrived. Either by Michael directly or by each other.

00:16:15.000 --> 00:16:23.000

They know that they either don't really belong, they face impossible choices or they're even, socially isolated.

00:16:23.000 --> 00:16:32.000

They do not experiment, experience direct punishment or retributive penalty for SIN. Or their actions on Earth.

00:16:32.000 --> 00:16:40.000

Rather they are judged as a center of a type. They are simply tortured for their status as a morally lesser individual.

00:16:40.000 --> 00:16:48.000

The religious terminology is nonexistent within the show. Which is a key different difference in Schur's depiction versus Dantes.

00:16:48.000 --> 00:16:58.000

It is addressed in the first episode. When Eleanor questions who was right about the afterlife quote well, let's see.

00:16:58.000 --> 00:17:05.000

Hindus are a little bit right. Muslims a little bit, Jews, Christians, Buddhists, and religion, guess about 5%, unquote.

00:17:05.000 --> 00:17:19.000

The removal of a governing religious view. Allows for punishment to become torture. Punishment is enacted in response to an offense which requires a set of rules to which and that is in sports.

00:17:19.000 --> 00:17:33.000

But torture does not have a suffering to encounter. So going back to the eye for an eye, if there know is if there's no initial, penalty, no I to commit, then it simply is just torture.

00:17:33.000 --> 00:17:40.000

In the addition of pain. It is the addition of pain based on moral merits in this case.

00:17:40.000 --> 00:17:50.000

This definition, talking about torture, specifically highlights the mind in regard to torture, inferring that torture can either be physical or non-physical.

00:17:50.000 --> 00:17:56.000

So moving from that definition of punishment to Twitter.

00:17:56.000 --> 00:18:10.000

Roneta Cart proposed the mind body problem in the fourteenth century, which questions how the body and the brain, so a physical substance and the mind or the soul and non physical substance can interact.

00:18:10.000 --> 00:18:27.000

Descartes positions this as Cartesian dualism. Quote, the view that the universe contains 2 radically different kinds of substance, one mind defined as thinking, unexpected substance, and 2 body, ie matter, defined as an extended unthinking substance.

00:18:27.000 --> 00:18:33.000

Dicker knows the Cartesian dualism has a warranted the possibility of immortality.

00:18:33.000 --> 00:18:42.000

Quote, for the destruction of the body does not entail the extinction of the mind, This highlights a key different in the 2 depictions of how.

00:18:42.000 --> 00:18:51.000

Well, Dante's Inferno includes some mention of the soul. It does not recognize the mind or mental states with any great level of the detail.

00:18:51.000 --> 00:18:58.000

However, quote once the physical is accounted for, we still have to account for the mental states. End quote.

00:18:58.000 --> 00:19:09.000

The mental states are said to an understanding of the mind body problem. Quote, there is a conceptual link between pain and pain behavior and that the behavior belongs to the sense of the concept.

00:19:09.000 --> 00:19:29.000

It may well belong to that sense of the concept, but it does not belong to the reference. From my behavior, you cannot tell what I'm dreaming, imagining, pondering, recommending, this example is if you look at someone's eyes, you have no idea the internal emotional or mental pain they may be experiencing.

00:19:29.000 --> 00:19:41.000

This point supports the idea that the humans in the good place are experiencing dualistic torture. As their pain is not necessarily connected to an identifiable behavior, such as wood saying or crying in agony.

00:19:41.000 --> 00:19:50.000

Rather, some of the characters are unaware of the torture and pain being inflicted upon their counterparts as they are unable to see the mental states of one another.

00:19:50.000 --> 00:19:57.000

So even as Eleanor comes to the conclusion of her own torture, within the show she has not seen the building of torture upon others.

00:19:57.000 --> 00:20:02.000

A great example of this is the many flashbacks that Eleanor has to her time on earth.

00:20:02.000 --> 00:20:13.000

She is often reminded of the way that she experienced pain on earth and this is a way that Michael uses to torture her while she is in the afterlife.

00:20:13.000 --> 00:20:20.000

While waiting on a train with Jason within one of the episodes, Eleanor begins to explain to him why she is not a good person on earth.

00:20:20.000 --> 00:20:29.000

She flashes back to the day she was emancipated from her parents. This flashback takes place on the fourteenth birthday, which neither of her parents remembered that special date.

00:20:29.000 --> 00:20:42.000

Internally she's experiencing and reliving the pain of rejection of her parents as a child. Yet there is no whaling or with saying rather as the audience we get to witness her mental state as shown in the flashback.

00:20:42.000 --> 00:21:01.000

Her disappointment and apathy toward her parents. Pain is somewhat exceptional in comparison to other mental phenomena so in regards to phenomena, there is no clear and tangible link with patterns of behavior, and other behaviors.

00:21:01.000 --> 00:21:09.000

So there is no identifying if someone is in pain or not in paying specifically, just in regards to behavior.

00:21:09.000 --> 00:21:19.000

So no such links are justable in case of any other mental phenomena as well. So extending beyond just the experience of pain.

00:21:19.000 --> 00:21:27.000

So there is not a single nerve that Michael could pinpoint to elicit that specific pain, or torture device that could physically force that prospect.

00:21:27.000 --> 00:21:36.000

And a little remembering the pain that shakes that she's separated from her parents is not something that could be elicited through, any amount of physical torture.

00:21:36.000 --> 00:21:47.000

The torture is only feasible because the emotional and social situation is manipulated in such a way that Eleanor is consistently confronted with her past and who she is.

00:21:47.000 --> 00:21:59.000

The afterlife is tortuous for Eleanor, not because she is flayed and cordered physically, but just because her emotional mental states are manipulated and cuts parts of her soul deeply.

00:21:59.000 --> 00:22:03.000

A dual-sick approach to the afterlives also continually circles back to life on Earth.

00:22:03.000 --> 00:22:12.000

The shift from a religious health to a dual sick health stretches stresses at the experience of the individual experiences that are diverse and dynamic.

00:22:12.000 --> 00:22:21.000

Arguably this portrayal of hell draws more realistic parallels to human experiences before death.

00:22:21.000 --> 00:22:36.000

So wrapping it up here. In conclusion, when we're talking about all of these things together, The depiction of Helen popular media has shifted from a primarily religious perspective to a more secular philosophical one.

00:22:36.000 --> 00:22:41.000

The shift is evident in the comparison between Dante's Inferno and Michael Schurz the Good Place.

00:22:41.000 --> 00:22:49.000

While both depictions deal with the question of the afterlife, they approach it from vastly different philosophical positions across centuries.

00:22:49.000 --> 00:22:56.000

Dantes hell is ruled by religious ideology and primarily depicts physical punishment using the concept of contra peso.

00:22:56.000 --> 00:23:04.000

Well, the good place reflects our modern world and depicts mental torture based on a system of checks and balances for overall moral goodness.

00:23:04.000 --> 00:23:11.000

The shift from a religious to a philosophical approach reflects a change in society's understanding of the human self.

00:23:11.000 --> 00:23:19.000

Dante's depiction of how reflects a physicalist perspective, where the body is the principal substance and the mind soul is secondary.

00:23:19.000 --> 00:23:33.000

In contrast, the good place recognizes the line in the mental states as separate entities from the body. The rest this recognition of the mind reflects the philosophy of dualism which proposes that the mind and the body are indeed separate substances.

00:23:33.000 --> 00:23:34.000

The shift from a retribution of punishment to purposeful torture defines, redefines the intentions of pain.

00:23:34.000 --> 00:23:50.000

Those experience in health. They approach the torture as dualistic in nature as the body and mind are recognized as separate entities and thus specific door torture is developed in light of that separation.

00:23:50.000 --> 00:23:52.000

This depiction of hell and media reflects the modern human experience and informs the audience about what is hellish in this modern world.

00:23:52.000 --> 00:24:06.000

The shift from a religious to a philosophical approach allows for one to express fears about the uncertainty of what happens after death.

00:24:06.000 --> 00:24:14.000

The modern depiction of hell. Stresses the experience of the individual experiences that are diverse and dynamic.



00:24:14.000 --> 00:24:31.000

This portrayal of Hal draws more realistic parallels about the human experience before death. This essay or this presentation demonstrates how changing perspectives on the relationship between the mind and body have led to a redefinition of the intentions of pain depicted in popular media of the afterlife.

00:24:31.000 --> 00:24:40.000

The Shiston depiction forms the modern audience about what is hellish, revealing the significance of contemporary fantasy and coping with these fears surrounding the question of what happens after death.

00:24:40.000 --> 00:24:49.000

And conclusion the shift of depiction of health from punishment to torture reflects the changing philosophical societal and individual perspectives on health.

00:24:49.000 --> 00:25:00.000

As well as the self. The shift from religious ideology to perspective philosophical theory as the guiding principle in regards to shift to monetism stresses the importance of the individual.

00:25:00.000 --> 00:25:11.000

And it draws the realistic parallels between the human experience before death and after death. The significance of modern fantasy and coping with these fears is revealed through this change in depiction.

00:25:11.000 --> 00:25:18.000

Ultimately, the picture of Helen modern media reflects the changing philosophical societal perspectives on the self.

00:25:18.000 --> 00:25:25.000

And reflects the audience. Live experience about what is hellish in their modern world.

00:25:25.000 --> 00:25:34.000

And then there's work excited.

00:25:34.000 --> 00:25:40.000

Alright, thank you very much. Alright.

00:25:40.000 --> 00:25:47.000

Looking to see we don't, we just had one question about one of the illustrations, but we figure that's a slab of meat there.

00:25:47.000 --> 00:25:48.000

Yeah.

00:25:48.000 --> 00:26:01.000

Okay, I would fit with what you were saying. Alright, let's I wanna take that off the screen, then stop sharing, and then we can start having some discussion here.

00:26:01.000 --> 00:26:05.000

Great. Okay.

00:26:05.000 --> 00:26:13.000

All right. Any questions to start with here? I see, Eric has his hand up.

00:26:13.000 --> 00:26:17.000

That's right, Eric always has his hand up. So I have a comment and then a question.

00:26:17.000 --> 00:26:32.000

My comment is that the Lexalonus eye for an eye is not about retribution it was about that the punishment should equal the crime.

00:26:32.000 --> 00:26:43.000

Which was entirely different than the Jewish law code than most of the other law codes at that time for example If a person killed a horse.

00:26:43.000 --> 00:26:51.000

And you were a slave, you could be put to death. If you were a rich man and you killed someone's horse, you could pay 10 bucks and that would be it.

00:26:51.000 --> 00:26:52.000

So that's what I for I mean, it's not retribution. It's that the punishment should fit the crime.

00:26:52.000 --> 00:27:11.000

My question is Why did you choose Dante? To compare to this modern TV show as opposed to modern literature about.

00:27:11.000 --> 00:27:15.000

Good question. Dottie was actually one of the first depictions of, that I personally write about hell outside of the Bible.

00:27:15.000 --> 00:27:30.000

So that was something interesting from my childhood to kind of go back to, but also in discussion as I was working on this abstract and presentation.

00:27:30.000 --> 00:27:45.000

I'm currently working at a Bible camp, which is pretty funny. And in asking people, you know, like, what do you know about how, what do you think about how, it is like the the general individuals view of house you can see highly influenced by Roman Catholicism as well as Dante's depiction of how, which also fits with this modern TV show.

00:27:45.000 --> 00:27:52.000

So one of the premises of the good place is that it's applicable and approachable philosophy for all.

00:27:52.000 --> 00:28:03.000

So the way that they explain some of these really deep and intricate, philosophical theories is done in such a way so that they can be relatable and understandable to the average individual that they can be relatable and understandable to the average individual.

00:28:03.000 --> 00:28:26.000

So that they can, be relatable and understandable to the average individual. So in approach new comparison between what's traditional and modern, I wanted to take it from the approach that would be the most generally acceptable or the most so the way that dot his inferno has influenced how is beyond.

00:28:26.000 --> 00:28:38.000

Significant in my view as I've talked to different individuals. And so, yeah, that's how I came to that decision there.

00:28:38.000 --> 00:28:41.000

Does that answer your question?

00:28:41.000 --> 00:28:44.000

Okay.

00:28:44.000 --> 00:28:46.000

Craig, you were next.

00:28:46.000 --> 00:28:58.000

Yeah, thank you so much. Caitlin for this. Really enjoyed that. And I have to say that like Chidi, I'm a moral philosopher and that's why nobody likes me.

00:28:58.000 --> 00:29:12.000

Okay, so let me just get that out of the way. Alright. But, as I was thinking about this, I was wondering in terms of Maybe contrasting kind of a classical.

00:29:12.000 --> 00:29:22.000

Understanding of justice where you could take Aristotle who, you know, who is used in the show and even Kant.

00:29:22.000 --> 00:29:33.000

But kind of a classical understanding of justice. Aristotle Augustine Aquinas where people get what they deserve in terms of you know justice.

00:29:33.000 --> 00:29:43.000

And then almost kind of a, post modern notion because Sean, you know, Michael's boss is really kind of a rank utilitarian.

00:29:43.000 --> 00:29:55.000

You know, he just wants to get as much, you know, utility out of the torture as possible and it seems to me And I don't know, you know, so my question is this, do you see the.

00:29:55.000 --> 00:30:07.000

Kind of the tension between you know, Eleanor and Chidi and others are punished on the basis of their, of their crimes, their sins, whatever.

00:30:07.000 --> 00:30:12.000

And then Shawn's kind of approach to Let's just get as much out of this as we can with torture.

00:30:12.000 --> 00:30:24.000

So, I don't know if you can comment on this, tension between justice and torture in terms, you know, justice as punishment and torture as, you know, maybe net utility, if you will.

00:30:24.000 --> 00:30:42.000

I think that's a really interesting approach and I think, at least for me and understanding of the show is that even the way that Michael devises the torture of both like cheaty and Eleanor, for example, part of it does focus around their actions on Earth.

00:30:42.000 --> 00:30:52.000

It seems to be less and response to specifically punishing them for something they did. Michael and Sean both don't seem to be concerned with practicing counter suffering or holding them accountable their actions.

00:30:52.000 --> 00:31:04.000

The the significance of the connection between their torture and the afterlife and their actions on Earth. It rather seems to be connected to their perspective.

00:31:04.000 --> 00:31:08.000

And giving them that that flashback and that remembering of how they enacted pain on someone else.

00:31:08.000 --> 00:31:19.000

And it's like that connection seems to be what enacts pain for them. In the afterlife.

00:31:19.000 --> 00:31:25.000

And so less so the nature of the sin, but less so and more so like the experience of remembering what you did to somebody else and that now it's happening to you.

00:31:25.000 --> 00:31:36.000

And like the, social emotional pain of that. But I do think it's interesting that as we see when Michael shifts and he proposes this new plan.

00:31:36.000 --> 00:31:47.000

Sean is really happy with the results because he's seeing a record pain or a record, torture coming off these humans because what they can get emotionally and socially out of them they could never get physically.

00:31:47.000 --> 00:32:02.000

And so I would say like Sean and Michael's pursuit at least initially as a changes throughout the show of continuing this list line of torture over punishment or even like justice.

00:32:02.000 --> 00:32:07.000

Is not to punish them but it's just to get the most like utilitarian like pain out of them.

00:32:07.000 --> 00:32:25.000

I think the other interesting shift is like that problem of eternal punishment. Which is highly discussed amongst like different theologians is kind of loving God eternally torture and alternatives to punish someone.

00:32:25.000 --> 00:32:35.000

And so an answer to that to the removal of of religion allows for them to not care because you can eternally torture someone for however long you want and there's no problem if you don't believe in punishment and you don't believe in justice.

00:32:35.000 --> 00:32:46.000

Because justice in that sense is just torture, for a little bit of time or for eternity.

00:32:46.000 --> 00:32:56.000

Okay. David and then Lee have one in the, yeah, had one in the, chat.

00:32:56.000 --> 00:33:09.000

Okay, I was appreciating your contrast between the hell in vision by Dante who is thoroughly embedded in a religious worldview.

00:33:09.000 --> 00:33:16.000

And the modern sense where religion plays. A much smaller part in the general cultural consciousness.

00:33:16.000 --> 00:33:25.000

I mean, we're still aware of it, but it's not. It's not the paradigm by which we perceive reality.

00:33:25.000 --> 00:33:35.000

It's more a scientific thing. And where, the Dante, what was that, medieval or Renaissance?

00:33:35.000 --> 00:33:42.000

That view was. Is. Dominated by the concept then now we're more about morality.

00:33:42.000 --> 00:33:49.000

Oh, these are. These are kind of extremes illustrated by these 2 different fiction counts of.

00:33:49.000 --> 00:33:59.000

Punishment versus I was wondering If you. Had any example of something in between in that transitional state.

00:33:59.000 --> 00:34:20.000

Between that. Totally religious worldview. And today's worldview. Something maybe from the, eighteenth or nineteenth century where where the the concept that that's of sin was kind of being modified and ameliorated.

00:34:20.000 --> 00:34:27.000

Was there a difference? In the depictions of hell. During, that transition time.

00:34:27.000 --> 00:34:37.000

Hmm. That is interesting. There's none that come immediately to mind. But if I think about, some of the literature that I've read throughout like Victorian literature.

00:34:37.000 --> 00:34:57.000

And there is some displacement between, a spiritual spiritual beings and then physical incarnations of those beings so thinking about like monsters in Victorian century and thinking about how they often had like strong connections to Sing, or to some view of demons or stuff like that.

00:34:57.000 --> 00:35:20.000

I do think there is that shift, or to some view of demons or stuff like that.



00:35:20.000 --> 00:35:33.000

I do think there is that is a crazy moment. It's not something that happens often, it's a miracle.

00:35:33.000 --> 00:35:51.000

Whereas we shift in like some of the things that we see and I think that Victorian literature is we see some of the more physical representations of someone of a figure like Satan, as I'm sure we see others throughout there that are more connecting between the spiritual and physical world.

00:35:51.000 --> 00:36:13.000

So I'd say like in terms of like historically, there is more spiritual physical lines between it's like it's very more binary one is the other and one is the other and I do think that we see some stuff there between blurring those lines and blurring those dualities to have some kind of liminal middle space between what is physical and what is spiritual.

00:36:13.000 --> 00:36:15.000

Outside of that there's no like specific depictions of how that I can think of that fit into that middle space at the moment.

00:36:15.000 --> 00:36:26.000

But definitely something to consider thinking about.

00:36:26.000 --> 00:36:29.000

Yeah, interesting.

00:36:29.000 --> 00:36:41.000

Okay, Leo was asking about. Research and study into deeper links between body and mind. Meaning some folks to in fact call our experience the body mind.

00:36:41.000 --> 00:36:42.000

Hmm.

00:36:42.000 --> 00:36:48.000

And what you think that might do to future fictional depictions of hell or torture?

00:36:48.000 --> 00:36:55.000

That's a really good question. I think particularly as we move to future depictions of hell, I think we'll see.

00:36:55.000 --> 00:37:06.000

Embodiment, become more important. So if you're thinking about inferno, we have like a complete importance of the physical as we move to something like a good place.

00:37:06.000 --> 00:37:13.000

We have this like people want to include the mine in the mental space. And so there's like this inherent like focus on that.

00:37:13.000 --> 00:37:18.000

And I think we'll probably shift back to some of where it is more that middle space. So thinking about embodiment.

00:37:18.000 --> 00:37:25.000

And so what embodiment theory means and to be the to exist within that space, you have to be able to move within that space.

00:37:25.000 --> 00:37:32.000

And so the physical movements within that space is what gives the mind important. Importance in terms of those mental states.

00:37:32.000 --> 00:37:35.000

So I think we will shift, eventually over to something that is more embodied in that like body mind experience.

00:37:35.000 --> 00:37:39.000

But I personally think that that will take a while in terms of the reality of how new something like this is.

00:37:39.000 --> 00:38:01.000

So I think the good place started in 26 is when it first started airing on TV. In terms of the reality of how new something like this is.

00:38:01.000 --> 00:38:21.000

So I think the good place started in 2016 is when it first started

00:38:21.000 --> 00:38:33.000

I see, going back to that question about kind of a middle point. Between the medieval and the modern Eric was suggesting a great divorce or dissent into hell.

00:38:33.000 --> 00:38:43.000

Those are intriguing. Intriguing ones to look at. Yeah, and I was, commenting kind of inspired by that.

00:38:43.000 --> 00:38:57.000

Maybe somewhere in this period. Yeah, somebody might know more about this. Was there? A movement toward, I mean, we're seeing it this.

00:38:57.000 --> 00:38:58.000

Hmm.

00:38:58.000 --> 00:39:07.000

Movement towards more rehabilitated approach to prison as and less punitive was this something that was paralleled in religious debates, during Victorian times as well.

00:39:07.000 --> 00:39:08.000

Thanks.

00:39:08.000 --> 00:39:10.000

I'm going across it somewhere, but.

00:39:10.000 --> 00:39:26.000

Okay. I don't think that's an interesting thing to think about. I think like, particularly my knowledge of like, particularly my knowledge of like, Victorian rehabilitation in terms of prison systems was not the primary mode of like, Victorian rehabilitation in terms of prison systems was not the primary motive.

00:39:26.000 --> 00:39:28.000

And that's kind of where prisons systems was not the primary motive. And that's kind of where prisons, systems start.

00:39:28.000 --> 00:39:37.000

I think if you look at, following the, system was not the primary motive. And that's kind of where prisons, not the primary motive. And that's kind of where prisons, systems start.

00:39:37.000 --> 00:39:41.000

I think if you look at, following the closure of prison systems in Australia, you may see some change in, the connections between like colonialism and the idea of keeping prisoners.

00:39:41.000 --> 00:39:47.000

Just separate often as far off place basically like in a form of eternal punishment, keeping there until they die.

00:39:47.000 --> 00:39:55.000

As we move towards, a modern judicial system that has like finds and there's limitations and there is.

00:39:55.000 --> 00:40:01.000

In theory, rehabilitation is a goal in prison systems. I don't know that we see that even today.

00:40:01.000 --> 00:40:09.000

But I think that part of that shift over from that time period to now would make a difference for sure.

00:40:09.000 --> 00:40:13.000

But yeah, I do think that that movement towards like a less punitive approach is also where they end up at the end of the good place.

00:40:13.000 --> 00:40:30.000

So if you watch through to the end of the show, they basically get rid of hell and they make the afterlife a learning experience where people are able to learn more reality in a space where there is not the consequences of Earth.

00:40:30.000 --> 00:40:48.000

So I think that that still is like very, very new in terms of a retribution of health, or retributive afterlife becoming a rehabilitative or a less punitive afterlife.

00:40:48.000 --> 00:41:03.000

Mercury comments on Victorian ghost stories and yes, thinking about Marley's change, thinking about, the the work houses that were such a terror to the poor.

00:41:03.000 --> 00:41:09.000

And that was not rehabilitated. That was that was punitive. Yeah, Dorian Grey, hell is living experience.

00:41:09.000 --> 00:41:21.000

That's interesting. Yes. Yeah, and then Craig comments the Jesuits were thinking about rehabilitation.

00:41:21.000 --> 00:41:29.000

It's early as the 1,500. So this is I guess it's a very long debate that as you say we're still having.

00:41:29.000 --> 00:41:38.000

There's still this. Conflict in why we in prison people and what we do to them while they're in prisons.

00:41:38.000 --> 00:41:40.000

Eric, yes.

00:41:40.000 --> 00:41:58.000

My understanding of kind of in the history of, legal justice meted out was that people used to receive punishment for a crime and then they were let go.

00:41:58.000 --> 00:42:12.000

In the Victorian time coming out of the Enlightenment, the idea was that you could rehabilitate people thus the term penitentiary and people were expected to go into these institutions and become good.

00:42:12.000 --> 00:42:30.000

Rather than paying for their crime So, mmm, I mean, yet you have to really think about the history of, of retribution towards criminals and how that is changed over the centuries.

00:42:30.000 --> 00:42:37.000

Cause I think saying that the Victorian times was punishment. It wasn't during the Victorian times.

00:42:37.000 --> 00:42:43.000

The idea was trying to make people better. So. Just put that in there.

00:42:43.000 --> 00:42:44.000

Yeah.

00:42:44.000 --> 00:42:51.000

That's a very fair point. I do think we may see that legally, but I think part of it is like the the societal view of that afterwards.

00:42:51.000 --> 00:42:59.000

So seeing them coming back into society is, where you see things like they're being, like, handing out manuals on how to spot a criminal.

00:42:59.000 --> 00:43:13.000

So even someone who may be rehabilitated and put back into society. They're termed and typed according to like our first criminologist, coming, I can't remember his name, but they start handing out kind of these manuals on these physical things.

00:43:13.000 --> 00:43:18.000

You can spot who's a criminal who's not a criminal and those are based on who was in the early prison system.

00:43:18.000 --> 00:43:23.000

So I think there is like a middle ground between between those 2 things for sure.

00:43:23.000 --> 00:43:37.000

Okay, we are out of time. This has been fascinating. And let's see there's one more thing I am gonna copy it and put it into the discord if anyone wants to continue the conversation there.

00:43:37.000 --> 00:43:47.000

So thank you very much. That was really interesting. Alright, bye bye.