

1148

02:05:22.050 --> 02:05:23.930

The Mythopoeic Society: Alright. So now we'll get started.

1149

02:05:24.050 --> 02:05:29.129

The Mythopoeic Society: Thanks for coming everyone. My name is Chip Crane. We're moderating this panel and our

1150

02:05:29.230 --> 02:05:31.630

The Mythopoeic Society: panel one sort of all

1151

02:05:31.710 --> 02:05:35.079

The Mythopoeic Society: a remote Carl Hosteter and Peter Grabowskis.

1152

02:05:35.792 --> 02:05:40.320

The Mythopoeic Society: Also just a little bit of intro. Of course, Bios are in the the big program.

1153

02:05:40.620 --> 02:05:41.165

The Mythopoeic Society: but

1154

02:05:42.459 --> 02:06:00.440

The Mythopoeic Society: Carl is been a scholar of Tolkien kind of when in the linguist group for many, many years, and he's known for a lot of his, his work original like bringing a lot of Tolkien's unpublished writings to to light, most notably, and recently, the the nature of Middle Earth.

1155

02:06:00.480 --> 02:06:06.200

The Mythopoeic Society: which came out in 2,021, editing a lot of Tolkien's writings about the

1156

02:06:06.340 --> 02:06:07.849

The Mythopoeic Society: the metaphysics, and how the.

1157

02:06:07.850 --> 02:06:10.539

Anna Smol: Take a shower because my hair is disgustingly sticky.

1158

02:06:11.380 --> 02:06:13.740

Anna Smol: I'm taking the talk with me.

1159

02:06:13.740 --> 02:06:18.319

Carl F. Hostetter: Can folks mute their microphones if you're not asking a question or.

1160

02:06:19.937 --> 02:06:24.379

The Mythopoeic Society: But most notably his History of Middle Earth. Also

1161

02:06:24.440 --> 02:06:35.840

The Mythopoeic Society: also, even more recently, the the Battle of Malden, Tolkien's translation and Notes, and Peter Peters edited volume just came out last year.

1162

02:06:37.086 --> 02:06:45.173

The Mythopoeic Society: above, and his original drafts of the homecoming, and a lot of wonderful pieces there. I highly recommend both of those to anyone interested.

1163

02:06:45.620 --> 02:07:04.339

The Mythopoeic Society: and and Peter. Peter and I both teach at the University of Maryland. We both teach professional writing, and we co-teach a class on Tolkien and Oxford. We take students to England in the winter. It's Peter's brainchild that he graciously invited me to join him in, and we're co-teaching a zoom zoom version of that right now. In fact, this half of the summer

1164

02:07:05.610 --> 02:07:09.200

The Mythopoeic Society: alright, just before we begin. This is mainly about the

1165

02:07:09.230 --> 02:07:32.060

The Mythopoeic Society: piece that's called after Bath Finrad Andres Andres which I knew a lot. I knew a lot of Tolkien for a while before I was familiar with this, so I didn't want to assume everybody is familiar with that piece. Maybe while that's why you came. But I wondered how many folks are familiar with that piece like, maybe you've read it, or you've looked at it somewhat. So most of most of the group. That's good. Okay.

1166

02:07:32.412 --> 02:07:40.599

The Mythopoeic Society: I'm I won't be saying a whole lot, I'll do some. QA. But just as a brief intro to the, to the text for those less

1167

02:07:40.600 --> 02:08:08.430

The Mythopoeic Society: familiar, it appears in the history of Middle Earth volume 10 Morgoth rings with the paperback editions here, Christopher Tolkien says, likely finished in 1,959, might have started it as early as 55, but some somewhere in there, based on, you know, the paper it was written on, and some other the newspaper that it was wrapped in and so forth, which is, of course, post lord of the Rings period. Now, the text itself volume like this, just under 20 pages.

1168

02:08:08.600 --> 02:08:17.279

The Mythopoeic Society: and it's sort of like a short stroke. More of a conversation doesn't have really a plot. It's a dialogue between 2 characters, Finroth, the Elf.

1169

02:08:17.360 --> 02:08:21.549

The Mythopoeic Society: and an old woman, old human woman named Andres.

1170

02:08:21.860 --> 02:08:22.810

The Mythopoeic Society: and

1171

02:08:23.000 --> 02:08:38.279

The Mythopoeic Society: of course, you know, Finrad, just as a reminder for folks less familiar is one of the sons of Finarf, son of son of Finarfin, one of the sons of who is one of the sons of Finway, head of the Noldori. Fin Finrad is also a brother of Galadriel.

1172

02:08:38.540 --> 02:08:45.450

The Mythopoeic Society: and he has 2 other brothers, Agnor and Engrad, and he later plays a major. Later in

1173

02:08:45.880 --> 02:09:12.710

The Mythopoeic Society: Middle Earth time plays a major role in in the Baron Luthian story, and Peter will be saying more about how the characters setting and how the piece is situated within the larger legendar, and some things like that. He's going to start, and then Carl will then examine certain theological and metaphysical aspects of the after bath, as we often call it for short, as as outlined in the piece, and in Tolkien's Commentary on it, which follows in in this volume.

1174

02:09:12.950 --> 02:09:16.199

The Mythopoeic Society: And so, without further ado, I'll turn it over to Peter first.st

1175

02:09:16.440 --> 02:09:20.130

Carl F. Hostetter: Can I just interject something here, putting my linguist hat on before we start.

1176

02:09:20.130 --> 02:09:20.720

The Mythopoeic Society: Yes, Gordon.

1177

02:09:20.720 --> 02:09:26.339

Carl F. Hostetter: I don't think a lot of people know that the name Andreth is actually glossed by Tolkien in another source

1178

02:09:26.430 --> 02:09:29.579

Carl F. Hostetter: as meaning patience. It's an abstract noun.

1179

02:09:29.920 --> 02:09:37.189

Carl F. Hostetter: so you can decide for yourself how well that applies to Andreth or or not. But I just thought I'd put that out there

1180

02:09:37.390 --> 02:09:38.090

Carl F. Hostetter: so.

1181

02:09:38.400 --> 02:09:39.600

The Mythopoeic Society: I'll fix that.

1182

02:09:41.410 --> 02:09:42.065

Peter Grybauskas: Okay.

1183

02:09:43.250 --> 02:09:46.157

Peter Grybauskas: well, hey, it's great to see some of you.

1184

02:09:46.910 --> 02:09:50.150

Peter Grybauskas: I appreciate the invitation. I'm sorry I

1185

02:09:50.270 --> 02:09:53.788

Peter Grybauskas: couldn't make it out to mythcon in person this year.

1186

02:09:54.340 --> 02:09:57.655

Peter Grybauskas: but I'm also grateful for the opportunity to

1187

02:09:58.350 --> 02:10:00.465

Peter Grybauskas: to reread the author Bath, which

1188

02:10:01.580 --> 02:10:04.385

Peter Grybauskas: which is having a bit of a moment right now, and

1189

02:10:05.220 --> 02:10:10.640

Peter Grybauskas: and going over the text, you know, in preparation for this session on

1190

02:10:10.730 --> 02:10:12.880

Peter Grybauskas: highlighting a few passages, and

1191

02:10:13.250 --> 02:10:20.460

Peter Grybauskas: you know you lose track of time. And suddenly, as I've marked 70% of the text out for dramatic reading, you know. But

1192

02:10:20.700 --> 02:10:24.810

Peter Grybauskas: but since we only have, I think, 50 min in the session. I think that would be

1193

02:10:24.930 --> 02:10:32.042

Peter Grybauskas: a gross misuse of our time here, so I will. I will try to keep this brief, and I know that Carl has quite a bit to say about the

1194

02:10:32.630 --> 02:10:35.350

Peter Grybauskas: metaphysical and

1195

02:10:36.420 --> 02:10:57.880

Peter Grybauskas: philosophical implications of this text. So I was just gonna go briefly over. Well, actually starting with a little note that Tolkien appends to his commentary. This is this is all, of course, in Morgoth's Ring, the 10th volume of the history of Middle Earth, but he follows up. Christopher anyway, follows up the dialogue with

1196

02:10:57.960 --> 02:11:06.628

Peter Grybauskas: commentary from Tolkien himself about the philosophical presuppositions and the positions of the characters and and

1197

02:11:07.200 --> 02:11:19.800

Peter Grybauskas: and some of the implications therein. But then he also says, well, the argument is not, of course, presented in the alphabet in these terms, or in this order or so precisely

1198

02:11:19.980 --> 02:11:27.469

Peter Grybauskas: the author. Beth, is a conversation in which many assumptions and steps of thought have to be supplied by the reader.

1199

02:11:27.810 --> 02:11:31.309

Peter Grybauskas: actually, though it deals with such things as death

1200

02:11:31.390 --> 02:11:44.149

Peter Grybauskas: and the relations of elves and men to Time and Arda and to one another, its real purpose is dramatic. To exhibit the generosity of Finrod's mind, his love and pity for Andrath.

1201

02:11:44.180 --> 02:11:49.210

Peter Grybauskas: and the tragic situations that must arise in the meeting of elves and men.

1202

02:11:50.556 --> 02:11:56.103

Peter Grybauskas: So I wanted to to sort of emphasize that that term dramatic, actually

1203

02:11:56.750 --> 02:11:59.540

Peter Grybauskas: And I'm not sure that I

1204

02:11:59.630 --> 02:12:04.700

Peter Grybauskas: not sure I'm going to take this so far as to say that that Tolkien's imagining the

1205

02:12:05.100 --> 02:12:07.316

Peter Grybauskas: staging of this and

1206

02:12:07.930 --> 02:12:08.735

Peter Grybauskas: but

1207

02:12:09.560 --> 02:12:10.870

Peter Grybauskas: But for a

1208

02:12:11.210 --> 02:12:17.680

Peter Grybauskas: for for someone like me. I I find that timing of of obviously the mid 1950 S. We're talking about. And

1209

02:12:17.730 --> 02:12:28.500

Peter Grybauskas: the Tolkien's just had a surprising publication of of a 1 act play that he's tucked away quite sneakily in an academic journal. Right? That's the homecoming of Badmouth.

1210

02:12:28.750 --> 02:12:30.989

Peter Grybauskas: What a great gag! If this were

1211

02:12:31.210 --> 02:12:39.460

Peter Grybauskas: for Tolkien's second published play. He'll it'll be an appendix to the Silmerilian, which will surely be released one of these days. Right?

1212

02:12:39.994 --> 02:12:48.269

Peter Grybauskas: But but it has, I think some really compelling dramatic features. And and I. I note the comparison to the homecoming, I guess

1213

02:12:48.460 --> 02:12:53.195

Peter Grybauskas: primarily, because, of course, it is this dialogue between 2 characters right?

1214

02:12:53.640 --> 02:12:57.419

Peter Grybauskas: Apart from, I think, the very end of the text.

1215

02:12:57.580 --> 02:12:59.990

Peter Grybauskas: which which gives us sort of.

1216

02:13:00.810 --> 02:13:02.120

Peter Grybauskas: I think.

1217

02:13:02.910 --> 02:13:20.019

Peter Grybauskas: thrilling and and scary sort of call to arms right. Finrod says he's gonna gotta go. Where are you? Headed? Well to the swords and the walls and and the siege right? A reminder of the the sort of the backdrop against which this

1218

02:13:20.740 --> 02:13:23.609

Peter Grybauskas: placid conversation takes place right

1219

02:13:23.700 --> 02:13:29.420

Peter Grybauskas: near the end of of what what Tolkien calls the long peace. This period between them.

1220

02:13:29.600 --> 02:13:35.199

Peter Grybauskas: during which Morgoth seems to be pinned in

1221

02:13:35.450 --> 02:13:43.590

Peter Grybauskas: in the North right, although he will soon be breaking the siege in the what's called the battle of sudden flame.

1222

02:13:46.480 --> 02:14:00.449

Peter Grybauskas: okay, so the the 2 figures right? So I wanted to say a little bit about that setting, that sort of timing in which Tolkien has set the piece, and then, of course, just to give a brief overview of of our 2 major figures right

1223

02:14:00.600 --> 02:14:01.060

Peter Grybauskas: and

1224

02:14:01.820 --> 02:14:12.519

Peter Grybauskas: and as I believe Chip noted right. Of course this was one piece that Tolkien explicitly marked out at some point to be additional material, right? A sort of

1225

02:14:12.530 --> 02:14:15.210

Peter Grybauskas: appendix, or part of the appendices to

1226

02:14:15.240 --> 02:14:18.150

Peter Grybauskas: to the silver Lillian. So in that sense it.

1227

02:14:18.290 --> 02:14:26.771

Peter Grybauskas: and the fact that it is, of course, also a rare sort of finished text. It it does, it does. I don't know.

1228

02:14:27.580 --> 02:14:38.319

Peter Grybauskas: It is attractive in the sense of of what it, what it does and what Tolkien is doing there, and it also marks out maybe an interesting stage of transformation in the larger mythology. In that

1229

02:14:39.148 --> 02:14:48.509

Peter Grybauskas: we can see many of Tolkien's really late works right as Carl's edit collection. The nature of Middle Earth shows

1230

02:14:48.780 --> 02:14:50.090

Peter Grybauskas: being really

1231

02:14:51.980 --> 02:15:03.229

Peter Grybauskas: I hate to say bogged down, but but mired in the in this, the philosophical and metaphysical discussions sort of not concerned primarily with story anymore.

1232

02:15:03.430 --> 02:15:11.009

Peter Grybauskas: But here in the mid fifties, right where we're talking about these myths about to undergo great transformation.

1233

02:15:12.510 --> 02:15:19.170

Peter Grybauskas: in the alphabet. I think we have a kind of remarkable marriage, if you will, between

1234

02:15:19.230 --> 02:15:26.750

Peter Grybauskas: drama, between storytelling and and world building. Right? So, on the one hand, you can read this as

1235

02:15:27.000 --> 02:15:40.580

Peter Grybauskas: the most deliciously geeky essay on Death and Immortality and time, and the relationship between elves and men, but on the other we have a sort of stirring romance, a great little one act play, and maybe an indication of

1236

02:15:41.153 --> 02:15:47.086

Peter Grybauskas: some of the other rhetorical and dramatic arts that might have been practiced.

1237

02:15:47.710 --> 02:15:53.789

Peter Grybauskas: and this brief, you know, 2 and a half century or so period that that's called the long piece.

1238

02:15:55.640 --> 02:16:08.450

Peter Grybauskas: okay. So why, I've noted the long piece right? And I think Tolkien notes at 1 point that the alphabet is assumed to have taken place around 40.9 in the 1st stage. Right?

1239

02:16:08.947 --> 02:16:15.559

Peter Grybauskas: So so I don't know. 40 or 50 years before the the siege is is definitively broken. Right?

1240

02:16:17.065 --> 02:16:20.352

Peter Grybauskas: before to borrow from another

1241

02:16:21.250 --> 02:16:24.181

Peter Grybauskas: Tolkien text before the dragon comes.

1242

02:16:26.030 --> 02:16:26.750

Peter Grybauskas: but

1243

02:16:28.210 --> 02:16:37.280

Peter Grybauskas: okay. And as for our characters. Right? We have finrod who is so well known to anyone who's read the Silver Lillian right? It feels like.

1244

02:16:37.430 --> 02:16:38.330

Peter Grybauskas: Hmm!

1245

02:16:38.760 --> 02:16:41.442

Peter Grybauskas: He has a bit of a starring role right?

1246

02:16:41.990 --> 02:16:52.311

Peter Grybauskas: the founder of Nargothron. Right? The the kind of guy who gets lost on a hunt and discovers a new species right? That is man, and has this

1247

02:16:53.000 --> 02:16:57.736

Peter Grybauskas: sort of long standing bond and love for the second.

1248

02:16:58.559 --> 02:17:02.989

Peter Grybauskas: the followers right, the the second children of of Arrow

1249

02:17:03.980 --> 02:17:17.639

Peter Grybauskas: and and I think, reading the alphabet in conversation with the summer Illin, as I suppose, talking again explicitly, would have liked us to do. We see so much kind of

1250

02:17:18.701 --> 02:17:22.068

Peter Grybauskas: conversation there, and enrichment. We see

1251

02:17:23.020 --> 02:17:23.580

Peter Grybauskas: the

1252

02:17:24.400 --> 02:17:37.311

Peter Grybauskas: and the of course, the moving scene of his, his discovery of of Bayor and his people sleeping by the campfire, and creeping up and borrowing their harp, and being sort of their 1st teacher,

1253

02:17:37.790 --> 02:17:43.440

Peter Grybauskas: giving them sort of the gift of music and learning their tongue and teaching them lore. I didn't.

1254

02:17:43.770 --> 02:17:49.636

Peter Grybauskas: So they are being named, of course, the Finrod's vassal and

1255

02:17:50.309 --> 02:17:57.936

Peter Grybauskas: and if we go on beyond the scene, the immediate action or conversation of the Arthur Bath. Right?

1256

02:17:58.639 --> 02:18:03.800

Peter Grybauskas: A number of meaningful things happen in that when the siege is broken

1257

02:18:04.378 --> 02:18:12.909

Peter Grybauskas: the one has to do with Andreth's love for Finrad's brother, which I'll get to in a moment, but the other has to do with some

1258

02:18:13.340 --> 02:18:18.100

Peter Grybauskas: finrad being saved by Bar here, and so the giving of his ring, and

1259

02:18:18.160 --> 02:18:27.189

Peter Grybauskas: and this bond, and and in fact, ultimately his great sacrifice in in aiding Baron and Luthian in their quest, and in sort of

1260

02:18:29.350 --> 02:18:36.379

Peter Grybauskas: I guess, putting his money where his mouth is, and and there's a there's a little throwaway moment in the author, Beth, when he talks.

1261

02:18:36.480 --> 02:18:41.850

Peter Grybauskas: when they kind of come to the heart of the matter, and talk through Andreth's bitterness of her.

1262

02:18:42.442 --> 02:18:43.770

Peter Grybauskas: The sort of

1263

02:18:44.459 --> 02:18:49.400

Peter Grybauskas: failure of this romance with Finrod's brother, and Finrod says, Well, maybe

1264

02:18:49.459 --> 02:18:58.090

Peter Grybauskas: if there's ever a moment in which men and elves will will marry right, it will be for some other sort of high doom. Right? And of course

1265

02:18:58.270 --> 02:18:59.959

Peter Grybauskas: that of Baron and Luthian.

1266

02:19:00.430 --> 02:19:02.629

Peter Grybauskas: It's a bit of foresight, I suppose.

1267

02:19:04.219 --> 02:19:09.019

Peter Grybauskas: okay. But Finrad is such a well known figure, and and and the the

1268

02:19:09.129 --> 02:19:22.360

Peter Grybauskas: I'm not sure. I suppose we do learn some new things about him. We certainly see as Tolkien notes, and and that bit about the drama of the text right his generous mind, right, his eagerness really to

1269

02:19:22.480 --> 02:19:31.051

Peter Grybauskas: to, to discuss and to learn from from man and from Andreth and and his, I think, clear respect for her.

1270

02:19:31.510 --> 02:19:36.037

Peter Grybauskas: But but, on the other hand, Andreth is

1271

02:19:36.660 --> 02:19:48.159

Peter Grybauskas: yeah. If you do a kindle search for Andreth in the summer illion. I've just done one. She she nowhere appears right. So she was to be perhaps only part of the appendices, although

1272

02:19:48.350 --> 02:19:51.659

Peter Grybauskas: there is a very curious, of course some of you will know

1273

02:19:51.720 --> 02:19:57.890

Peter Grybauskas: late linguistic text that suggests that she's come around to deliver

1274

02:19:58.370 --> 02:20:08.929

Peter Grybauskas: a kind of prophecy, maybe some strange riff on the old hope. I'm not sure of her own that mentions Turin to Rambar coming

1275

02:20:09.030 --> 02:20:13.448

Peter Grybauskas: and and slang the Morgoth's great dragon.

1276

02:20:14.360 --> 02:20:18.099

Peter Grybauskas: But but here again, if we think about how.

1277

02:20:18.300 --> 02:20:19.700

Peter Grybauskas: but maybe it's

1278

02:20:20.190 --> 02:20:23.369

Peter Grybauskas: feels lacking at times in the silver lian.

1279

02:20:23.420 --> 02:20:30.339

Peter Grybauskas: some of that rich immediacy, and some of that rich characterization that we have come to expect from

1280

02:20:30.730 --> 02:20:39.840

Peter Grybauskas: from something more novelistic like the Lord of the Rings, we we get actually quite a bit of that in this, in this brief dialogue, right? And we get some

1281

02:20:39.930 --> 02:20:43.329

Peter Grybauskas: a really, I think, beautiful characterization of this.

1282
02:20:43.560 --> 02:20:45.909
Peter Grybauskas: Well, not yet old, but

1283
02:20:46.130 --> 02:20:56.809
Peter Grybauskas: but in in her middle years, right so embittered, but so smart, and not not cowed at all by Finron, but really giving as good as she

1284
02:20:56.980 --> 02:20:58.921
Peter Grybauskas: as she, as she gets

1285
02:20:59.890 --> 02:21:06.329
Peter Grybauskas: okay. And of course, this interesting series of dramatic ironies right? We have

1286
02:21:07.720 --> 02:21:20.870
Peter Grybauskas: 1st of all, our 2 characters know very well that, you know Andreth is deeply in love with Finron's brother, and that only comes out at the very end of their dialogue, right?

1287
02:21:21.563 --> 02:21:29.570
Peter Grybauskas: And again, that not only undress but ignores love for her. Any any of that really action is is missing from it

1288
02:21:29.850 --> 02:21:32.199
Peter Grybauskas: from the 1977 silvery

1289
02:21:32.910 --> 02:21:36.909
Peter Grybauskas: and we also have the rather unfortunate discovery. If you

1290
02:21:37.410 --> 02:21:47.039
Peter Grybauskas: go back to the tale of years to find that the one notable casualty in the battle of sudden flame is going to be Agnor right, her her lover. So

1291
02:21:47.110 --> 02:21:48.749
Peter Grybauskas: so, in spite of her

1292
02:21:48.870 --> 02:21:53.198
Peter Grybauskas: heartfelt plea that that he not be reckless right?

1293
02:21:53.880 --> 02:21:54.810
Peter Grybauskas: He's

1294

02:21:55.990 --> 02:22:00.689

Peter Grybauskas: finrods again. His sort of foretelling or his foresight comes true, and

1295

02:22:00.830 --> 02:22:02.010

Peter Grybauskas: he sees that

1296

02:22:02.080 --> 02:22:11.630

Peter Grybauskas: though this text kind of comes out of the bitterness of of a woman feeling like her lifespan is, is far too short, and

1297

02:22:11.900 --> 02:22:15.090

Peter Grybauskas: and feeling sort of scorned by the love of her life.

1298

02:22:15.370 --> 02:22:19.060

Peter Grybauskas: Well, Agnora actually is, is the 1st so.

1299

02:22:19.662 --> 02:22:21.709

Peter Grybauskas: To head to the house of Mondos.

1300

02:22:22.260 --> 02:22:25.628

Peter Grybauskas: Okay, I think I will. Stop there.

1301

02:22:26.200 --> 02:22:31.460

Peter Grybauskas: But I'm looking forward to hearing Carl, and maybe some questions later.

1302

02:22:33.050 --> 02:22:36.559

Carl F. Hostetter: Okay, I'm gonna try to share my slides here.

1303

02:22:37.210 --> 02:22:39.700

Carl F. Hostetter: which I think you'll see are necessary.

1304

02:22:47.320 --> 02:22:48.740

Carl F. Hostetter: here.

1305

02:22:53.980 --> 02:22:55.849

Carl F. Hostetter: okay. Can everybody see that.

1306

02:23:00.090 --> 02:23:00.960

JJ Schultz II: Yes.

1307

02:23:02.790 --> 02:23:03.809

Carl F. Hostetter: Jeff, are we good?

1308

02:23:04.820 --> 02:23:06.320

The Mythopoeic Society: Yeah, we're good. Okay?

1309

02:23:06.494 --> 02:23:06.669

Carl F. Hostetter: Great.

1310

02:23:06.670 --> 02:23:07.320

The Mythopoeic Society: Yeah.

1311

02:23:08.490 --> 02:23:09.145

Carl F. Hostetter: So

1312

02:23:10.380 --> 02:23:14.500

Carl F. Hostetter: having looked at the the dramatic aspects of it. Thank you, Peter.

1313

02:23:14.530 --> 02:23:19.080

Carl F. Hostetter: I'm going to turn to theological metaphysical perspectives.

1314

02:23:19.280 --> 02:23:23.090

Carl F. Hostetter: and particularly the theological and metaphysical content

1315

02:23:23.400 --> 02:23:24.759

Carl F. Hostetter: of the Andres.

1316

02:23:26.230 --> 02:23:28.421

Carl F. Hostetter: Excuse me, the the alphabet

1317

02:23:29.390 --> 02:23:31.430

Carl F. Hostetter: So to start with.

1318

02:23:32.520 --> 02:23:40.160

Carl F. Hostetter: The alphabet is commonly regarded as one centrally concerned with the bodily death of mortal men.

1319

02:23:40.170 --> 02:23:44.250

Carl F. Hostetter: as against the natural bodily immortality of elves.

1320

02:23:44.840 --> 02:23:50.730

Carl F. Hostetter: 2. As Tolkien wrestling with whether bodily death is, in fact, a gift of a Louvatar to men.

1321

02:23:51.030 --> 02:23:53.860

Carl F. Hostetter: and so, as part of their original nature.

1322

02:23:54.160 --> 02:24:00.800

Carl F. Hostetter: or whether it is rather a punishment due to the fall of man, and so an alteration of the original nature of man.

1323

02:24:01.880 --> 02:24:14.129

Carl F. Hostetter: And 3, rd it's often pointed out, based on a comment that Tolkien made that I'll share shortly. It's often regarded as prefiguring, and in a sense a parody of Christianity.

1324

02:24:14.949 --> 02:24:26.109

Carl F. Hostetter: Because it introduces the what's called the old hope of men, which basically prefigures the the entry of arrow into his own creation.

1325

02:24:26.510 --> 02:24:29.500

Carl F. Hostetter: so as to write its marring by melcor

1326

02:24:29.620 --> 02:24:34.340

Carl F. Hostetter: with its obvious reference, if you will, to the incarnation of Christ.

1327

02:24:36.290 --> 02:24:41.119

Carl F. Hostetter: and what I hope to show in the course of this is that these are correct.

1328

02:24:41.640 --> 02:24:46.689

Carl F. Hostetter: but they're also wrong, and I'll show you what I mean by that as we go through

1329

02:24:51.050 --> 02:25:00.209

Carl F. Hostetter: so 1st question of the of it being a parody of Christianity. So this arises, this is frequently quoted when the alphabet is discussed.

1330

02:25:00.860 --> 02:25:01.920

Carl F. Hostetter: Talking, wrote

1331

02:25:02.530 --> 02:25:04.810

Carl F. Hostetter: in 1955,

1332

02:25:05.320 --> 02:25:13.250

Carl F. Hostetter: amongst some draft materials. So before predating the version of the alphabet, the full version that's given in Morgan's right

1333

02:25:13.510 --> 02:25:15.769

Carl F. Hostetter: he wrote this comment, query.

1334

02:25:15.980 --> 02:25:23.219

Carl F. Hostetter: is it not right to make Andreth refuse to discuss any traditions or legends of the fall? That is the fall of man

1335

02:25:23.870 --> 02:25:28.559

Carl F. Hostetter: already it is, if inevitably, too like a parody of Christianity.

1336

02:25:28.900 --> 02:25:32.680

Carl F. Hostetter: any legend of the fall would make it completely so, and he queries not

1337

02:25:33.800 --> 02:25:34.600

Carl F. Hostetter: now.

1338

02:25:34.790 --> 02:25:52.159

Carl F. Hostetter: before we continue on on that path, I I want to. I want to reemphasize a couple of things here first.st This this note was made in 1,955, and it pertains to draft materials preceding the version of the text full version of the text that's given in Morgan's way.

1339

02:25:54.279 --> 02:25:55.309

Carl F. Hostetter: And

1340

02:25:55.900 --> 02:26:02.699

Carl F. Hostetter: also that despite whatever misgivings he had when he made this comment on that draft material.

1341

02:26:02.760 --> 02:26:08.130

Carl F. Hostetter: he did, in fact, go on and supply just such a discussion and the legend of the fall

1342

02:26:08.490 --> 02:26:12.380

Carl F. Hostetter: which I won't detail and just I won't deal with in specifics here.

1343

02:26:12.778 --> 02:26:18.070

Carl F. Hostetter: But he did supply this as an as an appendix to his commentary.

1344

02:26:18.885 --> 02:26:23.789

Carl F. Hostetter: which it both are are specified as as intended to be

1345

02:26:24.359 --> 02:26:28.850

Carl F. Hostetter: appendices with the offer, Beth to the silver only itself.

1346

02:26:29.010 --> 02:26:32.880

Carl F. Hostetter: So whatever misgivings he had in 1,955,

1347

02:26:33.030 --> 02:26:39.360

Carl F. Hostetter: he apparently did, did not have them. Later, a few years later, say circular 1,959.

1348

02:26:39.490 --> 02:26:46.739

Carl F. Hostetter: When he finished this, and then marked it for inclusion in the in the Silver Lillian, as it would eventually be public.

1349

02:26:47.650 --> 02:26:48.410

Carl F. Hostetter: Okay.

1350

02:26:50.910 --> 02:26:58.950

Carl F. Hostetter: now, what I think is not so well cited in this conjunction is Christopher Tolkien's own comment on all this?

1351

02:27:00.433 --> 02:27:05.419

Carl F. Hostetter: He he says, States, obviously by it

1352

02:27:06.560 --> 02:27:10.659

Carl F. Hostetter: he, Tolkien, was not referring to the legend of the fall.

1353

02:27:11.000 --> 02:27:19.529

Carl F. Hostetter: He was saying clearly that the introduction of such a legend would make it presumably the author Beth itself as a whole. Apart from that legend

1354

02:27:20.270 --> 02:27:23.590

Carl F. Hostetter: altogether into quote a parody of Christianity.

1355

02:27:24.200 --> 02:27:30.350

Carl F. Hostetter: Was he referring, then, to the astonishing conception in the alphabet of the great hope of men. The old hope.

1356

02:27:30.440 --> 02:27:35.340

Carl F. Hostetter: the Arrow himself will enter into Arda to oppose the evil of Melcor.

1357

02:27:39.120 --> 02:27:43.370

Carl F. Hostetter: he says, but this surely is not parity, nor even parallel.

1358

02:27:44.100 --> 02:27:49.089

Carl F. Hostetter: but the extension, if only represented as vision, hope, or prophecy.

1359

02:27:49.150 --> 02:27:54.029

Carl F. Hostetter: of the quote theology of Arta into specifically and of course, centrally

1360

02:27:54.190 --> 02:27:55.640

Carl F. Hostetter: Christian belief.

1361

02:27:56.600 --> 02:28:01.900

Carl F. Hostetter: Now, what I want to explore here is his observation

1362

02:28:02.340 --> 02:28:03.225

Carl F. Hostetter: that

1363

02:28:04.810 --> 02:28:07.000

Carl F. Hostetter: the legend of the fall.

1364

02:28:07.370 --> 02:28:10.260

Carl F. Hostetter: and and including the old Pope.

1365

02:28:11.449 --> 02:28:12.709

Carl F. Hostetter: Would not.

1366

02:28:13.520 --> 02:28:17.289

Carl F. Hostetter: it would nonetheless be in continuity with

1367

02:28:17.350 --> 02:28:25.949

Carl F. Hostetter: the theology of Arda that is presented in the alphabet. You can't extend something by breaking off something entirely from it.

1368

02:28:26.240 --> 02:28:30.179

Carl F. Hostetter: So it has to be whatever whatever he envisioned

1369

02:28:30.510 --> 02:28:36.299

Carl F. Hostetter: as adding to the author, bath would be would follow it in continuity.

1370

02:28:36.590 --> 02:28:41.570

Carl F. Hostetter: And so I'm taking the cue to take that, and then go look at the author, Beth.

1371

02:28:42.800 --> 02:28:48.739

Carl F. Hostetter: For the theology of Arta, that it reflects, apart

1372

02:28:48.840 --> 02:28:53.039

Carl F. Hostetter: from the legend any legend of the fall or expression of the Great Hope.

1373

02:28:56.630 --> 02:28:59.960

Carl F. Hostetter: and I mean by that to show that it is, in fact, still

1374

02:29:01.227 --> 02:29:07.810

Carl F. Hostetter: rooted in in what could be called Christian, and to an extent specifically Catholic

1375

02:29:07.920 --> 02:29:09.620

Carl F. Hostetter: theology and metaphysics.

1376

02:29:11.240 --> 02:29:12.070

Carl F. Hostetter: Okay.

1377

02:29:13.920 --> 02:29:19.355

Carl F. Hostetter: so also, almost unique amongst Tolkien's works. And

1378

02:29:20.680 --> 02:29:28.080

Carl F. Hostetter: something for which I'm quite grateful myself. Talking, provided his own extensive commentary on the alphabet that is him writing.

1379

02:29:28.860 --> 02:29:43.424

Carl F. Hostetter: It's not entirely clear whether he's really writing as his as himself fully, or whether he's envisioning that there's some commenter who happens to have his temporal and and philosophical and

1380

02:29:43.900 --> 02:29:51.670

Carl F. Hostetter: academic perspective, right? But we'll set that distinction aside for now. And we'll just we'll just call it Tolkien's commentary.

1381

02:29:51.760 --> 02:29:58.249

Carl F. Hostetter: Okay, in the sense that he wrote it, and that it does seem to reflect his own thoughts on on the thing that he had written.

1382

02:29:58.840 --> 02:30:10.150

Carl F. Hostetter: Okay, so this commentary starts out. It says the octobeth is not presented as an argument of any cogency for men in their present situation, or the one in which they believe themselves to be.

1383

02:30:10.230 --> 02:30:16.949

Carl F. Hostetter: though it may have some interest for men who start with similar beliefs or assumptions to those held by the elvish King Vinrod.

1384

02:30:17.690 --> 02:30:21.090

Carl F. Hostetter: Now I want to pause here and point out that. So

1385

02:30:21.200 --> 02:30:24.800

Carl F. Hostetter: Tolkien says it's not presented as an argument.

1386

02:30:25.790 --> 02:30:28.090

Carl F. Hostetter: This is arguably true.

1387

02:30:28.460 --> 02:30:30.749

Carl F. Hostetter: However, it is nonetheless an argument.

1388

02:30:30.930 --> 02:30:35.380

Carl F. Hostetter: and that's 1 of the things I'm going to demonstrate here, and in fact, Tolkien himself

1389

02:30:35.900 --> 02:30:39.130

Carl F. Hostetter: shows us how that argument is structured

1390

02:30:39.260 --> 02:30:54.490

Carl F. Hostetter: in. In, as we all know from Monty Python, an argument is a connected series of statements designed to establish proposition. Well, that's exactly what the Tolkien's analysis and the commentary of the author, Beth shows it to be

1391

02:30:54.590 --> 02:31:01.030

Carl F. Hostetter: a connected series of statements that build upon another to lead to certain conclusions and deductions.

1392

02:31:01.240 --> 02:31:11.830

Carl F. Hostetter: And it's some of those that I'm going to go through today to tease out. What is this underlying theology? Slash metaphysics that the author Beth reflects

1393

02:31:13.050 --> 02:31:19.459

Carl F. Hostetter: so. Oh, I would also point out that here we have Tolkien again, saying, Well, it's not

1394

02:31:19.690 --> 02:31:22.820

Carl F. Hostetter: an allegory. In other words, not. It's not

1395

02:31:23.420 --> 02:31:28.740

Carl F. Hostetter: present. I'm not. I don't intend this to make it by this an argument to those of you

1396

02:31:28.810 --> 02:31:29.576

Carl F. Hostetter: who

1397

02:31:31.160 --> 02:31:35.550

Carl F. Hostetter: need need convincing of the truth or the truth of these things.

1398

02:31:35.840 --> 02:31:41.419

Carl F. Hostetter: Right? So in that sense, it's like, it's not an allegory, but it is applicable, it is

1399

02:31:41.500 --> 02:31:47.560

Carl F. Hostetter: it? It? Ha! May have some interest for men who start with similar beliefs. Okay.

1400

02:31:49.460 --> 02:31:54.399

Carl F. Hostetter: so this is not. In other words, this is not Tolkien's given a theological treatise.

1401

02:31:58.040 --> 02:31:58.960

Carl F. Hostetter: okay.

1402

02:31:59.420 --> 02:32:13.579

Carl F. Hostetter: So Tolkien then goes on, it must be understood that he, meaning Finron, starts with certain basic beliefs which he would have said were derived from one or more of these sources, his created nature, angelic instruction, thought, and experience.

1403

02:32:14.620 --> 02:32:18.230

Carl F. Hostetter: So now talking, then, goes on to list

1404

02:32:18.600 --> 02:32:21.560

Carl F. Hostetter: these certain basic beliefs

1405

02:32:22.060 --> 02:32:24.280

Carl F. Hostetter: that that Finron held.

1406

02:32:25.220 --> 02:32:26.590

Carl F. Hostetter: among which are

1407

02:32:26.640 --> 02:32:27.690

Carl F. Hostetter: one.

1408

02:32:29.510 --> 02:32:31.940

Carl F. Hostetter: there exists arrow, the one

1409

02:32:31.990 --> 02:32:36.010

Carl F. Hostetter: that is. But this is Tolkien. I'm quoting Tolkien's commentary.

1410

02:32:37.020 --> 02:32:45.420

Carl F. Hostetter: There exists arrow, the one that is one God, Creator, who made, or more strictly designed the world, but is not himself the world.

1411

02:32:46.330 --> 02:32:52.339

Carl F. Hostetter: Okay? Well, this is just classical. God of the philosophers, classical Theism.

1412

02:32:52.630 --> 02:32:54.269

Carl F. Hostetter: There is one God

1413

02:32:54.700 --> 02:32:56.660

Carl F. Hostetter: who created everything.

1414

02:32:57.000 --> 02:33:00.470

Carl F. Hostetter: and he's radically one. He has no parts.

1415

02:33:00.570 --> 02:33:04.190

Carl F. Hostetter: He is trans utterly transcended. He's beyond the world.

1416

02:33:04.510 --> 02:33:09.420

Carl F. Hostetter: Okay, so this is monotheism, classical monotheism, one on one.

1417

02:33:09.890 --> 02:33:12.449

Carl F. Hostetter: That's the the 1st starting point.

1418

02:33:15.140 --> 02:33:18.660

Carl F. Hostetter: He then goes on to say another basic truth

1419

02:33:19.570 --> 02:33:27.999

Carl F. Hostetter: or belief. There are on earth incarnate creatures, elves and men. They are made of a union of Froa, that is, body and faia spirit.

1420

02:33:28.920 --> 02:33:41.480

Carl F. Hostetter: This, he would say, in other words, talking or Finron would say, was a known fact concerning elvish nature, and could therefore be deduced for human nature from the close kinship of elves and men.

1421

02:33:42.640 --> 02:33:43.420

Carl F. Hostetter: Okay.

1422

02:33:43.530 --> 02:33:45.430

Carl F. Hostetter: so a union?

1423

02:33:45.770 --> 02:33:51.450

Carl F. Hostetter: Well, the incarnates elves, and men are made of a union of body and spirit.

1424

02:33:53.860 --> 02:33:57.539

Carl F. Hostetter: That also is sort of classical.

1425

02:33:58.550 --> 02:33:59.460

Carl F. Hostetter: Metaphysics.

1426

02:34:03.880 --> 02:34:06.400

Carl F. Hostetter: Now, what's the nature of this union?

1427

02:34:08.470 --> 02:34:16.449

Carl F. Hostetter: Tolkien says, re, regarding things that arrow introduced into the the music

1428

02:34:17.030 --> 02:34:18.949

Carl F. Hostetter: independent of the valor.

1429

02:34:19.560 --> 02:34:24.329

Carl F. Hostetter: he says, the newness of the themes of the children of arrow elves and men.

1430

02:34:24.340 --> 02:34:30.900

Carl F. Hostetter: As Arrow's addition to the music consisted in the association of fair, again, spirits

1431

02:34:31.170 --> 02:34:41.080

Carl F. Hostetter: with, or housing them in froar bodies belonging to Aea in such a way that either were incomplete without the others.

1432

02:34:41.940 --> 02:34:43.470

Carl F. Hostetter: In other words.

1433

02:34:43.840 --> 02:34:50.730

Carl F. Hostetter: a. In the the body. The the personhood of an incarnate

1434

02:34:51.370 --> 02:34:52.650

Carl F. Hostetter: is A

1435

02:34:52.950 --> 02:35:00.789

Carl F. Hostetter: is a necessary unity of body and spirit. You can't separate the 2, and still have

1436

02:35:01.090 --> 02:35:02.670

Carl F. Hostetter: the incarnate person.

1437

02:35:03.470 --> 02:35:06.669

Carl F. Hostetter: The identity is not

1438

02:35:06.800 --> 02:35:11.260

Carl F. Hostetter: entirely reflected by the spirit, it also

1439

02:35:11.510 --> 02:35:12.850

Carl F. Hostetter: is

1440

02:35:13.130 --> 02:35:17.139

Carl F. Hostetter: inextricably bound to a physical body.

1441

02:35:24.880 --> 02:35:35.500

Carl F. Hostetter: This this unity is necessary. It's also natural, that is, it is part of it is the nature of the incarnance to be such a unity.

1442

02:35:36.400 --> 02:35:41.500

Carl F. Hostetter: Tolkien says, separation of Feya and Varroa is unnatural.

1443

02:35:41.740 --> 02:35:46.350

Carl F. Hostetter: and proceeds not from the original design, that is, arrows original design.

1444

02:35:46.530 --> 02:35:50.840

Carl F. Hostetter: but from the marring of Arda, which is due to the operations of Melcord.

1445

02:35:51.030 --> 02:35:52.610

Carl F. Hostetter: so, in other words.

1446

02:35:52.940 --> 02:35:55.309

Carl F. Hostetter: but by given nature

1447

02:35:56.150 --> 02:35:58.350

Carl F. Hostetter: by Arrow's intent.

1448

02:35:59.020 --> 02:36:00.430

Carl F. Hostetter: the incarnate

1449

02:36:00.440 --> 02:36:07.600

Carl F. Hostetter: naturally is a unity in its necessary in its essence and in its nature a unity of body and spirit.

1450

02:36:08.220 --> 02:36:09.030

Carl F. Hostetter: Okay.

1451

02:36:11.270 --> 02:36:12.570

Carl F. Hostetter: And finally.

1452

02:36:13.270 --> 02:36:16.949

Carl F. Hostetter: this unity is perpetual by design.

1453

02:36:17.490 --> 02:36:27.169

Carl F. Hostetter: proa, body and feya spirit, he would say, Finrod would say, are wholly distinct and kind, and not on the same play plane of derivation

1454

02:36:27.420 --> 02:36:28.590

Carl F. Hostetter: from Arrow.

1455

02:36:29.010 --> 02:36:38.630

Carl F. Hostetter: And there's a footnote here where he says, because they are were held, spirits were held to be directly created by arrow and sent into Aa.

1456

02:36:38.720 --> 02:36:41.999

Carl F. Hostetter: whereas AR was achieved immediately by the dollar.

1457

02:36:42.170 --> 02:36:46.969

Carl F. Hostetter: So, in other words, whereas the physical world. The world of material

1458

02:36:48.097 --> 02:36:52.399

Carl F. Hostetter: was shaped and formed and finished and developed

1459

02:36:52.630 --> 02:36:54.079

Carl F. Hostetter: by the wall are

1460

02:36:54.090 --> 02:36:56.489

Carl F. Hostetter: the spirits of the Incarnates.

1461

02:36:56.890 --> 02:36:58.529

Carl F. Hostetter: are derived

1462
02:36:58.610 --> 02:37:04.739
Carl F. Hostetter: only and utterly from Arrow himself, and they are sent into

1463
02:37:04.820 --> 02:37:06.800
Carl F. Hostetter: Aya as the

1464
02:37:06.880 --> 02:37:08.630
Carl F. Hostetter: the world of existence

1465
02:37:10.870 --> 02:37:11.670
Carl F. Hostetter: now.

1466
02:37:12.340 --> 02:37:14.200
Carl F. Hostetter: so, pausing here.

1467
02:37:14.914 --> 02:37:21.090
Carl F. Hostetter: I know all of these are characteristically Christian beliefs about the nature

1468
02:37:21.210 --> 02:37:22.970
Carl F. Hostetter: of a human person

1469
02:37:24.570 --> 02:37:28.299
Carl F. Hostetter: being reflective of Aristotelian to mystic metaphysics.

1470
02:37:28.610 --> 02:37:31.649
Carl F. Hostetter: It's a topic I won't go into fully here.

1471
02:37:32.069 --> 02:37:41.660
Carl F. Hostetter: If you'd like to know a little bit more. I reference it in my appendix, one to the nature of middle earth, with some other references to much fuller treatments.

1472
02:37:42.760 --> 02:37:44.312
Carl F. Hostetter: and it is

1473
02:37:44.960 --> 02:37:50.050
Carl F. Hostetter: In marked contrast, for example, with Manichaeism or other forms of Gnosticism, Gnosticism.

1474
02:37:50.230 --> 02:37:53.079
Carl F. Hostetter: Gnosticism, as a family of

1475
02:37:53.320 --> 02:37:54.989
Carl F. Hostetter: beliefs of

1476
02:37:55.000 --> 02:38:02.134
Carl F. Hostetter: widely varying character generally are, are, share a common belief that in in some sense,

1477
02:38:02.620 --> 02:38:04.529
Carl F. Hostetter: the person is a spirit.

1478
02:38:05.140 --> 02:38:14.519
Carl F. Hostetter: The spirit is trapped in a body, a material body, and it is the spirit's goal to escape that body free itself

1479
02:38:14.560 --> 02:38:18.229
Carl F. Hostetter: so that it can become itself fully again.

1480
02:38:18.630 --> 02:38:20.360
Carl F. Hostetter: This is

1481
02:38:20.530 --> 02:38:25.270
Carl F. Hostetter: completely in contrast with what Tolkien has said here

1482
02:38:25.470 --> 02:38:30.660
Carl F. Hostetter: about the nature of the union of body and spirit in the incarnates

1483
02:38:31.810 --> 02:38:33.390
Carl F. Hostetter: utterly at odds with it.

1484
02:38:39.440 --> 02:38:40.240
Carl F. Hostetter: Now.

1485
02:38:40.660 --> 02:38:41.710
Carl F. Hostetter: next.

1486
02:38:43.000 --> 02:38:49.269
Carl F. Hostetter: Tolkien discusses that Finron Finron observes that since men die

1487
02:38:49.800 --> 02:38:51.340
Carl F. Hostetter: without accident.

1488
02:38:52.290 --> 02:38:55.219

Carl F. Hostetter: in other words, by old age, for example.

1489

02:38:55.340 --> 02:38:58.150

Carl F. Hostetter: and whether they will to do so or not.

1490

02:38:58.280 --> 02:39:02.749

Carl F. Hostetter: their fair must have a different relation to time

1491

02:39:03.000 --> 02:39:05.150

Carl F. Hostetter: different than those of the owls.

1492

02:39:05.560 --> 02:39:15.530

Carl F. Hostetter: The elves believed, though they had no certain information, that the fair of men, if disembodied, left time sooner or later, and never returned.

1493

02:39:16.390 --> 02:39:19.640

Carl F. Hostetter: The elves deduced that this was natural to men.

1494

02:39:20.000 --> 02:39:21.290

Carl F. Hostetter: that is.

1495

02:39:21.300 --> 02:39:23.589

Carl F. Hostetter: was by the design of arrow.

1496

02:39:24.090 --> 02:39:29.260

Carl F. Hostetter: and suppose that the brevity of human life was due to this character of the human theia.

1497

02:39:29.420 --> 02:39:33.090

Carl F. Hostetter: that it was not designed to stay long, in our.

1498

02:39:33.240 --> 02:39:34.710

Carl F. Hostetter: in other words.

1499

02:39:34.740 --> 02:39:40.239

Carl F. Hostetter: by the original intent of error by the very nature of man, and not.

1500

02:39:40.610 --> 02:39:44.880

Carl F. Hostetter: as a consequence of anything Melcor did, or of any fall of man.

1501

02:39:46.040 --> 02:39:50.430

Carl F. Hostetter: Men are men will, and are intended

1502
02:39:51.000 --> 02:39:52.200
Carl F. Hostetter: to die

1503
02:39:52.590 --> 02:39:54.200
Carl F. Hostetter: in some sense.

1504
02:39:56.100 --> 02:39:59.269
Carl F. Hostetter: and and after you know some amount of time

1505
02:39:59.990 --> 02:40:11.339
Carl F. Hostetter: longer or shorter, certainly short. With with respect to the the expected length of life of any elf which is actually unknown in its in millennia.

1506
02:40:11.950 --> 02:40:12.870
Carl F. Hostetter: Okay.

1507
02:40:13.320 --> 02:40:17.279
Carl F. Hostetter: But the point. The main point here is what Tolkien is saying is.

1508
02:40:18.120 --> 02:40:22.690
Carl F. Hostetter: men were intended to in some sense die

1509
02:40:23.200 --> 02:40:27.529
Carl F. Hostetter: even before the marring of Erdo.

1510
02:40:28.990 --> 02:40:30.220
Carl F. Hostetter: Critical point.

1511
02:40:36.790 --> 02:40:38.669
Carl F. Hostetter: Now concomitant with that

1512
02:40:40.034 --> 02:40:44.230
Carl F. Hostetter: Finrod makes another observation in the autograph proper.

1513
02:40:44.900 --> 02:40:47.690
Carl F. Hostetter: Speaking to Andra.

1514
02:40:47.930 --> 02:40:48.989
Carl F. Hostetter: he says.

1515

02:40:49.090 --> 02:40:57.389

Carl F. Hostetter: but do you know that the elder say of man that they look at no thing for itself, that if they study it, it is to discover something else

1516

02:40:57.450 --> 02:41:03.969

Carl F. Hostetter: that if they love it, it is only so, it seems, because it reminds them of some other dearer thing.

1517

02:41:04.410 --> 02:41:06.940

Carl F. Hostetter: Yet with what is this comparison?

1518

02:41:07.090 --> 02:41:09.470

Carl F. Hostetter: What are these other things?

1519

02:41:10.000 --> 02:41:14.280

Carl F. Hostetter: We are both elves and men in Arda and of Arda.

1520

02:41:14.880 --> 02:41:19.870

Carl F. Hostetter: and such knowledge as men have is derived from our or so it would appear.

1521

02:41:20.250 --> 02:41:24.470

Carl F. Hostetter: Whence, then, comes to this memory that ye, Andra and Ben

1522

02:41:24.920 --> 02:41:26.580

Carl F. Hostetter: have with you.

1523

02:41:26.590 --> 02:41:28.979

Carl F. Hostetter: even before you begin to learn.

1524

02:41:29.520 --> 02:41:35.500

Carl F. Hostetter: is it not of other regions? Excuse me, it is not of other regions in Arda from which you had journeyed.

1525

02:41:35.540 --> 02:41:40.689

Carl F. Hostetter: We also have journeyed from afar, the implication being they have not seen any such thing.

1526

02:41:43.280 --> 02:41:44.030

Carl F. Hostetter: Yeah.

1527

02:41:47.950 --> 02:41:48.780

Carl F. Hostetter: Now

1528

02:41:49.010 --> 02:41:51.780

Carl F. Hostetter: this restlessness of men

1529

02:41:52.430 --> 02:41:54.379

Carl F. Hostetter: with the material world

1530

02:41:56.280 --> 02:41:59.589

Carl F. Hostetter: is further said to hear, to be natural.

1531

02:42:01.456 --> 02:42:06.220

Carl F. Hostetter: In the commentary, Tolkien says, they also insisted that desires.

1532

02:42:06.830 --> 02:42:19.229

Carl F. Hostetter: especially such fundamental desires as are here dealt with, were to be taken as indications of the true natures of the incarnates, and of the direction in which their unmarked fulfillment must lie.

1533

02:42:19.820 --> 02:42:21.970

Carl F. Hostetter: In other words, that

1534

02:42:22.000 --> 02:42:26.949

Carl F. Hostetter: by their nature men are endowed with certain desires.

1535

02:42:27.110 --> 02:42:31.829

Carl F. Hostetter: a certain restlessness, certain longing for something that is not present

1536

02:42:33.177 --> 02:42:37.439

Carl F. Hostetter: in in a to in a manner to which elves are not.

1537

02:42:39.720 --> 02:42:44.200

Carl F. Hostetter: and that they take that restlessness as a sign of

1538

02:42:44.530 --> 02:42:45.720

Carl F. Hostetter: fundamental

1539

02:42:46.140 --> 02:42:48.550

Carl F. Hostetter: human. That is mortal

1540

02:42:48.590 --> 02:42:49.750

Carl F. Hostetter: nature.

1541

02:42:50.260 --> 02:42:51.840

Carl F. Hostetter: It is intended.

1542

02:42:52.030 --> 02:42:53.409

Carl F. Hostetter: it is inherent.

1543

02:42:53.970 --> 02:42:57.080

Carl F. Hostetter: and has nothing to do with the marine environment.

1544

02:43:06.140 --> 02:43:09.039

Carl F. Hostetter: Continuing on in the commentary

1545

02:43:09.320 --> 02:43:10.809

Carl F. Hostetter: building on this.

1546

02:43:11.890 --> 02:43:20.610

Carl F. Hostetter: Tolkien says that the fair of men, Finar reasons must have been designed to leave Arda willingly, or indeed by desire.

1547

02:43:21.480 --> 02:43:28.779

Carl F. Hostetter: Then, basing his argument on the axiom that severance of Froa and Faa is unnatural and contrary to design

1548

02:43:29.380 --> 02:43:34.189

Carl F. Hostetter: a step, we covered a little while ago in this building argument.

1549

02:43:35.560 --> 02:43:39.520

Carl F. Hostetter: Binron comes to the conclusion that the failure of unfallen men

1550

02:43:39.850 --> 02:43:45.939

Carl F. Hostetter: would have taken with it its Froa into the new mode of existence free from time.

1551

02:43:47.330 --> 02:43:58.119

Carl F. Hostetter: What this means is and I'm omitting a lot of details that that demonstrate this more fully. Is that men by their nature

1552

02:43:59.250 --> 02:44:00.650

Carl F. Hostetter: do die.

1553

02:44:00.780 --> 02:44:05.899

Carl F. Hostetter: but that death does not take the form of the severance of

1554

02:44:05.960 --> 02:44:09.260

Carl F. Hostetter: body and spirit of fro and faia.

1555

02:44:09.380 --> 02:44:11.870

Carl F. Hostetter: but that both together

1556

02:44:12.920 --> 02:44:14.450

Carl F. Hostetter: go on

1557

02:44:14.500 --> 02:44:17.190

Carl F. Hostetter: to some other mode of existence.

1558

02:44:17.600 --> 02:44:19.190

Carl F. Hostetter: So bodily

1559

02:44:19.670 --> 02:44:25.430

Carl F. Hostetter: mortal men, by intent and original design, by their nature.

1560

02:44:27.080 --> 02:44:32.590

Carl F. Hostetter: go bodily into this next mode of existence, free from time.

1561

02:44:34.400 --> 02:44:40.020

Carl F. Hostetter: Now this might already sound familiar to some people here, but Tolkien will make it quite explicit here shortly.

1562

02:44:48.840 --> 02:44:49.450

Carl F. Hostetter: So

1563

02:44:50.950 --> 02:44:52.350

Carl F. Hostetter: in the author beth

1564

02:44:52.450 --> 02:44:56.339

Carl F. Hostetter: proper Finrod expands upon this.

1565

02:44:56.790 --> 02:45:02.309

Carl F. Hostetter: for for what is the death that you mourn but the severing of these 2 Olymphaea?

1566

02:45:02.420 --> 02:45:07.869

Carl F. Hostetter: And what is the deathlessness that you have lost, but that the 2 should remain united forever.

1567

02:45:09.240 --> 02:45:15.279

Carl F. Hostetter: then this must surely follow the fail, and it departs. Must take it with, take with it the Hoa.

1568

02:45:15.420 --> 02:45:20.610

Carl F. Hostetter: And what can this mean, unless it be that the Phaya shall have the power to uplift the hero

1569

02:45:21.170 --> 02:45:27.820

Carl F. Hostetter: as its eternal spouse and companion into an endurance everlasting beyond Aea and beyond

1570

02:45:29.990 --> 02:45:31.939

Carl F. Hostetter: Penrod's own statement on them.

1571

02:45:34.850 --> 02:45:38.889

Carl F. Hostetter: Now elsewhere, Tolkien makes an allusion to this

1572

02:45:39.730 --> 02:45:45.130

Carl F. Hostetter: by referencing war of the rings, and this is a good place to share that.

1573

02:45:45.692 --> 02:45:52.940

Carl F. Hostetter: He's talking about how the elves were allowed to pass oversea even after the undying lands had been removed from

1574

02:45:53.090 --> 02:45:55.350

Carl F. Hostetter: physical existence in our

1575

02:45:56.050 --> 02:46:00.290

Carl F. Hostetter: that elves were allowed to pass, oversee and go to

1576

02:46:00.976 --> 02:46:01.829

Carl F. Hostetter: I'm on

1577

02:46:01.900 --> 02:46:03.170

Carl F. Hostetter: or Tolarisian.

1578

02:46:04.080 --> 02:46:10.139

Carl F. Hostetter: but he notes the passing oversee of mortals which is recorded in war of the rings. Think of

1579

02:46:10.240 --> 02:46:11.490

Carl F. Hostetter: Frodo, and

1580

02:46:11.710 --> 02:46:18.740

Carl F. Hostetter: eventually Sam and others is not quite the same thing as that of elves. It was in any case a special

grace.

1581

02:46:18.990 --> 02:46:24.500

Carl F. Hostetter: an opportunity for dying according to the original plan for the unfallen.

1582

02:46:24.660 --> 02:46:35.199

Carl F. Hostetter: They went to a state in which they could acquire greater knowledge and peace of mind, and being healed of all hurts both of mind and body, could at last surrender themselves.

1583

02:46:35.270 --> 02:46:40.399

Carl F. Hostetter: die of free will and even of desire in estel or hope.

1584

02:46:41.020 --> 02:46:44.580

Carl F. Hostetter: a thing which are going to achieve without any such aid.

1585

02:46:46.180 --> 02:46:51.360

Carl F. Hostetter: So what Tolkien is saying is that in in the unfallen state.

1586

02:46:51.400 --> 02:46:54.459

Carl F. Hostetter: the body and spirit of

1587

02:46:54.710 --> 02:46:56.129

Carl F. Hostetter: of men

1588

02:46:56.160 --> 02:46:59.139

Carl F. Hostetter: was by design supposed to depart

1589

02:46:59.850 --> 02:47:02.230

Carl F. Hostetter: art of the physical world.

1590

02:47:03.080 --> 02:47:05.009

Carl F. Hostetter: and go on to this new mode

1591

02:47:06.464 --> 02:47:13.929

Carl F. Hostetter: and but that it could still be done even after the fall, by a special grace. In the case of Frodo, for example.

1592

02:47:15.085 --> 02:47:16.629

Carl F. Hostetter: And others, and

1593

02:47:16.720 --> 02:47:21.743

Carl F. Hostetter: and and of which Argorn, as a Numerian of pure of

1594

02:47:22.250 --> 02:47:23.740

Carl F. Hostetter: closer

1595

02:47:24.736 --> 02:47:30.400

Carl F. Hostetter: status and faculties, as it were, to the 1st Numenoreans

1596

02:47:30.880 --> 02:47:38.399

Carl F. Hostetter: could do this of his own will did not need a special grace to achieve this, and of course we see that happen in the appendices where

1597

02:47:38.430 --> 02:47:40.129

Carl F. Hostetter: Aragorn lays down

1598

02:47:40.310 --> 02:47:43.070

Carl F. Hostetter: and dies of his own free will.

1599

02:47:43.150 --> 02:47:48.909

Carl F. Hostetter: the difference being there, of course, that his body, so far as we know, is not taken up.

1600

02:47:49.000 --> 02:47:54.090

Carl F. Hostetter: but he does at least have the have the faculty of deciding when he will.

1601

02:47:54.250 --> 02:47:56.410

Carl F. Hostetter: when he will give up his spirit.

1602

02:47:57.360 --> 02:47:58.030

Carl F. Hostetter: Okay.

1603

02:47:58.030 --> 02:47:58.700

The Mythopoeic Society: Carl.

1604

02:47:58.940 --> 02:47:59.590

Carl F. Hostetter: Yes.

1605

02:48:00.040 --> 02:48:03.769

The Mythopoeic Society: Move into the Q. And a. Because we're getting near the end of our time.

1606

02:48:04.090 --> 02:48:04.900

Carl F. Hostetter: Okay?

1607

02:48:05.110 --> 02:48:13.529

Carl F. Hostetter: So anyways cutting to the chase. Then what is all this talking? What what is talking talking about here? He's talking about what's called the Assumption

1608

02:48:14.641 --> 02:48:17.798

Carl F. Hostetter: in in Catholic theology the assumption is

1609

02:48:18.882 --> 02:48:26.339

Carl F. Hostetter: is how the Virgin Mary, who was the only unfallen purely human person.

1610

02:48:27.423 --> 02:48:31.309

Carl F. Hostetter: That she did. The the Catholic Church teaches that she did not

1611

02:48:32.870 --> 02:48:39.720

Carl F. Hostetter: did not die, and her body was was not left behind to corrupt, but that she was taken up bodily

1612

02:48:40.070 --> 02:48:45.399

Carl F. Hostetter: and body and spirit into heaven that is known as the Assumption of the Virgin Mary

1613

02:48:45.570 --> 02:48:50.300

Carl F. Hostetter: and Tolkien specifically cites this, and uses the same terms. In other words.

1614

02:48:50.380 --> 02:48:57.029

Carl F. Hostetter: assumption was the natural end of each human life, though, as far as we know, it has been the end of the only unfallen member

1615

02:48:57.050 --> 02:48:58.280

Carl F. Hostetter: mankind.

1616

02:48:58.980 --> 02:49:02.730

Carl F. Hostetter: and which Christopher Tolkien himself notes. That is the Virgin Mary.

1617

02:49:06.720 --> 02:49:08.650

Carl F. Hostetter: Okay, I'll skip that.

1618

02:49:11.440 --> 02:49:12.290

Carl F. Hostetter: So

1619

02:49:12.867 --> 02:49:22.080

Carl F. Hostetter: I would just point out that this this gives you a new perspective. If you look at the where? Where? The

eino Lindalay talks about the gift of man.

1620

02:49:22.730 --> 02:49:30.489

Carl F. Hostetter: I'd I'd invite you to go. Read that with all, with all this metaphysics in mind, and you'll I think you'll see what the gift

1621

02:49:30.580 --> 02:49:35.440

Carl F. Hostetter: you'll see more precisely and more fully what what the gift actually constitutes.

1622

02:49:35.720 --> 02:49:37.169

Carl F. Hostetter: And it is this

1623

02:49:37.780 --> 02:49:42.543

Carl F. Hostetter: so? The gift of man is death, but it is, in fact, of

1624

02:49:42.950 --> 02:49:47.329

Carl F. Hostetter: in the form of the of an assumption of body and spirit together

1625

02:49:47.510 --> 02:49:49.620

Carl F. Hostetter: to leave time in history.

1626

02:49:50.446 --> 02:49:52.680

Carl F. Hostetter: It is a natural faculty

1627

02:49:53.070 --> 02:49:54.660

Carl F. Hostetter: for unfallen men.

1628

02:49:55.473 --> 02:49:59.909

Carl F. Hostetter: And unfallen men have a natural desire to do so.

1629

02:50:01.250 --> 02:50:11.160

Carl F. Hostetter: and it is the loss of that faculty and the corruption of that desire, and not the loss of any elder like immortality that men never had. In the 1st place, that resulted from the fall.

1630

02:50:13.490 --> 02:50:30.749

Carl F. Hostetter: the alphabet proper. Thus in itself, and quite apart from its append appended legend of the fall reflects and rests upon theology, metaphysical, theology, theological, metaphysical, and anthropological tenants that are essentially and characteristically Christian, and indeed catholic.

1631

02:50:31.420 --> 02:50:32.470

Carl F. Hostetter: And that's it.

1632

02:50:34.590 --> 02:50:36.980

The Mythopoeic Society: Darling Peter, we'll move into some Q. And a.

1633

02:50:38.350 --> 02:50:42.260

The Mythopoeic Society: And I'll I'll doesn't pick it up on the mic for them. I'll repeat it.

1634

02:50:45.360 --> 02:50:51.258

The Mythopoeic Society: Yes. So the question really for Carl as I'm sure you know,

1635

02:50:52.744 --> 02:50:56.600

The Mythopoeic Society: Philosophers were greatly occupied.

1636

02:50:58.770 --> 02:50:59.350

Carl F. Hostetter: I'm sorry.

1637

02:50:59.350 --> 02:51:02.850

The Mythopoeic Society: In platform. Dr. Habit.

1638

02:51:03.819 --> 02:51:16.829

The Mythopoeic Society: And I'm just. My question is, you know, open, or as studying or influenced by those those philosophers.

1639

02:51:17.030 --> 02:51:17.500

Carl F. Hostetter: Yes.

1640

02:51:17.500 --> 02:51:18.760

The Mythopoeic Society: You get that, Carl.

1641

02:51:19.030 --> 02:51:23.659

Carl F. Hostetter: If I understood what you were asking. You're asking whether Tolkien was influenced by

1642

02:51:23.710 --> 02:51:26.020

Carl F. Hostetter: Aristotelian Ptolemism.

1643

02:51:27.190 --> 02:51:32.449

Carl F. Hostetter: and the answer is, yes, we know that for a fact. Not only did he have a copy of the Summa Theologica.

1644

02:51:32.470 --> 02:51:37.149

Carl F. Hostetter: but we also know very recently that he both read this book.

1645

02:51:37.440 --> 02:51:44.420

Carl F. Hostetter: which is a work by a very famous Thomistic philosopher, Catholic Thomistic philosopher, Jacques Martin.

1646

02:51:44.630 --> 02:51:51.639

Carl F. Hostetter: and that he even commented upon it. And there's recently an auction a copy of this book with Tolkien's own comments, which are

1647

02:51:51.670 --> 02:52:03.529

Carl F. Hostetter: informed and take up. You know, some of these issues, like the nature of existence, are in it, so we certainly both had an interest which he also expressed elsewhere, explicitly, and pursued it

1648

02:52:04.380 --> 02:52:05.689

Carl F. Hostetter: and engaged it

1649

02:52:06.150 --> 02:52:07.849

Carl F. Hostetter: so. Yes, we do know that.

1650

02:52:07.850 --> 02:52:10.389

The Mythopoeic Society: Specifically, I was wondering if you.

1651

02:52:11.290 --> 02:52:20.600

The Mythopoeic Society: specifically, I was wondering if he was reading about the questions of how the body itself goes up to heaven.

1652

02:52:22.460 --> 02:52:22.910

Carl F. Hostetter: So I.

1653

02:52:22.910 --> 02:52:23.820

The Mythopoeic Society: We wondered if told.

1654

02:52:23.820 --> 02:52:31.209

Carl F. Hostetter: Not in this, not in this short book. But there are traditions about the Islam. Are you talking about within Middle Earth or within Catholicism?

1655

02:52:32.110 --> 02:52:35.140

The Mythopoeic Society: Catholicism.

1656

02:52:35.140 --> 02:52:35.460

Carl F. Hostetter: Yet.

1657

02:52:35.460 --> 02:52:36.800

The Mythopoeic Society: Thanks to.

1658

02:52:36.800 --> 02:52:42.689

Carl F. Hostetter: It's too big a topic to even really do more than just mention here that it. There's a rich body of

1659

02:52:42.730 --> 02:52:47.480

Carl F. Hostetter: of thought and tradition about this in both the Western and the Eastern Churches.

1660

02:52:47.510 --> 02:52:52.379

Carl F. Hostetter: So if you want to contact me, I can try to point you in the right direction.

1661

02:52:55.540 --> 02:52:58.069

The Mythopoeic Society: Okay, great thanks. Anybody else.

1662

02:52:59.890 --> 02:53:02.629

The Mythopoeic Society: Okay? Well, 1, 1 more, and then we'll bit wrap up.

1663

02:53:09.220 --> 02:53:13.909

The Mythopoeic Society: We're talking a lot and we're confusing. I feel like we're wrong at all.

1664

02:53:15.380 --> 02:53:21.879

The Mythopoeic Society: Just a question. I'm not convinced that on my end

1665

02:53:21.940 --> 02:53:23.479

The Mythopoeic Society: I'll repeat it for you, Carl. Hold on.

1666

02:53:23.480 --> 02:53:24.090

Carl F. Hostetter: Yeah.

1667

02:53:24.460 --> 02:53:27.100

The Mythopoeic Society: This on red pies in humans.

1668

02:53:28.330 --> 02:53:31.070

The Mythopoeic Society: And she doesn't have children.

1669

02:53:31.100 --> 02:53:33.329

The Mythopoeic Society: But I was 16Â min ago.

1670

02:53:39.030 --> 02:53:41.259

The Mythopoeic Society: so on then what do we do with.

1671

02:53:42.630 --> 02:53:44.369

The Mythopoeic Society: let's see where I spend.

1672

02:53:44.790 --> 02:53:48.130

The Mythopoeic Society: I didn't love her. But at all she's, gonna

1673

02:53:48.330 --> 02:53:52.570

The Mythopoeic Society: she's, she's why and she's really angry? I think.

1674

02:53:53.110 --> 02:53:55.089

The Mythopoeic Society: So I guess where? Where is she?

1675

02:53:55.420 --> 02:53:57.289

The Mythopoeic Society: Desktop? I'm sorry.

1676

02:53:58.330 --> 02:54:16.100

The Mythopoeic Society: Question Peter. Carl. Want to feel that? She asked. Tommy asks, where Andres is in this conversation, you know. Is she. She doesn't have as much voice. She's not necessarily convinced by Finrod. I think this goes back to Peter's point. He emphasize that the point that it is a drama

1677

02:54:16.526 --> 02:54:20.090

The Mythopoeic Society: even, you know, and so forth. And then he

1678

02:54:20.300 --> 02:54:24.780

The Mythopoeic Society: outline some of the underlying ideas like Carl pointed out. But either if you want to field that.

1679

02:54:30.970 --> 02:54:39.430

Carl F. Hostetter: So. I I would just point out that, in fact, in in the Andre, in the author of Proper Andreth, actually contributes to some of these

1680

02:54:39.560 --> 02:54:42.850

Carl F. Hostetter: theological slash metaphysical insights.

1681

02:54:42.980 --> 02:54:46.709

Carl F. Hostetter: So there's actually things that Finrod is learning

1682

02:54:47.190 --> 02:54:51.820

Carl F. Hostetter: of a metaphysical nature of a from Andres.

1683

02:54:52.280 --> 02:54:58.680

Carl F. Hostetter: But the commentary I'm I'm really just hitting the highlights and the outline the Tolkien provided. So yeah.

1684

02:55:01.050 --> 02:55:02.929

Carl F. Hostetter: I don't know if that answers your question, but

1685

02:55:03.670 --> 02:55:07.479

Carl F. Hostetter: but she's not passive. She's an active participant in this.

1686

02:55:08.420 --> 02:55:11.741

Peter Grybauskas: Yeah, maybe I would add that, yeah, you have

1687

02:55:12.260 --> 02:55:17.020

Peter Grybauskas: Finrod introduces this idea of the restlessness, right? Or the

1688

02:55:19.072 --> 02:55:33.129

Peter Grybauskas: the study of things, for what? For what? They seem to remind us of something beyond Arta. Right? And this you see, Andreth, sort of having a a quickening of the pace of the heart right? And then on on the flip side, right? You have, Finrod

1689

02:55:33.220 --> 02:55:44.250

Peter Grybauskas: really intrigued by this this idea of an old hope. Right? So there's a nice kind of interchange there. That that I would agree is is not at all passive.

1690

02:55:46.060 --> 02:55:48.490

Carl F. Hostetter: No. In fact, Finrod derives hope

1691

02:55:48.830 --> 02:55:51.759

Carl F. Hostetter: himself from what Andre says.

1692

02:55:52.140 --> 02:55:53.860

Carl F. Hostetter: which is wonderful.

1693

02:56:02.810 --> 02:56:04.330

Carl F. Hostetter: Yeah, yeah.

1694

02:56:04.330 --> 02:56:11.449

The Mythopoeic Society: Thanks for everybody and for coming. Thanks, Carl on Peter. And hopefully, maybe more conversations on this great work.

1695

02:56:13.310 --> 02:56:14.729

Carl F. Hostetter: Thank you. Thanks. Everyone.

1696

02:56:14.730 --> 02:56:15.400

Peter Grybauskas: Thank you. Guys.