

08:06:00.000 --> 08:06:10.000

Alright, thank you everyone for joining our, session today, our panel today, extra long on the rings of power.

08:06:10.000 --> 08:06:16.000

Spots on your screen, there might be messages that need to be dismissed.

08:06:16.000 --> 08:06:25.000

I am, I am going to be moderating this panel and I I'm the steward of right now I'm going to do it in third person.

08:06:25.000 --> 08:06:26.000

Okay.

08:06:26.000 --> 08:06:33.000

Tim lens is the steward from Ethiopia conferences of the Mithopaic society, producer, occasional co host of queer lodgings, tollking podcast, queer lodgings.

08:06:33.000 --> 08:06:47.000

Dot com and lifelong I attended his first myth con in 2018 and was immediately struck with an appreciation for its unique blend of academics, Spanish content, camaraderie, and goblin head smashing.

08:06:47.000 --> 08:06:48.000

Yeah.

08:06:48.000 --> 08:06:51.000

Tim has a PhD in biochemistry from Georgia Tech, which is virtually useless in this situation.

08:06:51.000 --> 08:07:03.000

That's me editorializing my own bio, but has also dabbled in media studies, his undergraduate thesis at McMaster University, full war science fiction as a reflection of the public consciousness.

08:07:03.000 --> 08:07:08.000

Is also co host of a Jeopardy famous annual middle earth movie marathon. And joining me for this panel.

08:07:08.000 --> 08:07:19.000

Who shows up first as I scroll? Pablo Gus is a graduate of the University of New Mexico, now teaching high school physics.

08:07:19.000 --> 08:07:25.000

In the past, he's been a mythcon panelist for the Single Leaf project, Tolkien and Birmingham.

08:07:25.000 --> 08:07:36.000

Protecting the Shire, a habit society's journey at the University of New Mexico and the Rings of Power Book Club, seduction knowledge and metallurgy in the second age of middle Earth.

08:07:36.000 --> 08:07:51.000

He also has a non edible flower named after him in New Mexico. Mia, Leah, Hagen, uses she her in her pronouns is just another geeky queer girl with BFA in film and a career in dog walking.

08:07:51.000 --> 08:08:02.000

She co-hosts career lodgings, the Tolkien podcast, and co-leads the Grey Haven Smile, a gathering of Tolkien fans centered in the US Pacific Northwest.

08:08:02.000 --> 08:08:08.000

She lives between the mountains and the sea with 2 rabbits too much yarn and too few books.

08:08:08.000 --> 08:08:18.000

And Grace Moon, she hers is a writer podcast, educator and activist. She is a steward of the Mythopaic Society and co host of Queer Lodging's The Talking Podcast.

08:08:18.000 --> 08:08:32.000

She holds a master's in education in educational policy and leadership from Marquette University, as well as the BA from Rockford University in history and theater and serves on the steering committee for Buy Plus Pride Milwaukee.

08:08:32.000 --> 08:08:43.000

Grace collects books like Small Clucks, Gems and Gold, her non literary hobbies include quilting, fiber arts, gardening, and almost any craft she can get her hands on.

08:08:43.000 --> 08:08:49.000

So next slide please.

08:08:49.000 --> 08:08:58.000

All right, so our panel today is on Amazon's Blockbuster, Lord of the Rings adaptation, the Lord of the Rings, the Rings of Power, which had its first season air almost a year ago at this point last September and October.

08:08:58.000 --> 08:09:09.000

Our session title is season one. Rings of Power Season One, Underworlds, Overworlds and Ocean Worlds.

08:09:09.000 --> 08:09:12.000

Next slide, please.

08:09:12.000 --> 08:09:16.000

Spoiler alert if it's not obvious we are going to be spoiling basically the entire season including major.

08:09:16.000 --> 08:09:26.000

If you care about that and you have not seen this season yet. Please don't go any further, but plenty of people don't care about being spoiled.

08:09:26.000 --> 08:09:29.000

So next slide, please.

08:09:29.000 --> 08:09:39.000

So just a little bit of an outline of where we're gonna go here. This is sort of gonna be just a retrospective on season one and how it adapted Tolkien's works.

08:09:39.000 --> 08:09:41.000

We're going to go through a comparison of the season one of the show versus the rings of power book club predictions that we made.

08:09:41.000 --> 08:09:51.000

I'll talk a little bit more about that in a minute, some interpretations of the source material.

08:09:51.000 --> 08:10:07.000

Adaptational choices that were made when making the show. Tolkienian themes in rings of power, some character and relationship highlights, which is basically just a spanning about certain characters and relationships and some speculation on that season 2 and beyond.

08:10:07.000 --> 08:10:16.000

And then part 2 of this presentation, which will start at. But an hour from now will be open discussion where the audience will be able to.

08:10:16.000 --> 08:10:22.000

Join in and we can all talk about rings of power. Next slide please.

08:10:22.000 --> 08:10:33.000

1 si don't wanna do rail you too bad. Grace, do you mind if I withdraw your co host privileges so we don't have that gray blog at the top of the presentation.

08:10:33.000 --> 08:10:34.000

We would be delighted if you did.

08:10:34.000 --> 08:10:37.000

Oh yeah, that's what's doing that. So for

08:10:37.000 --> 08:10:40.000

As long as I can still keep screen sharing, we're good.

08:10:40.000 --> 08:10:41.000

Okay, cool.

08:10:41.000 --> 08:10:53.000

So for anybody that was at, or attended virtually, Miss Conn. 52 last year in Albuquerque, we did do a presentation on the rings of power book club that Alicia, 52 last year in Albuquerque.

08:10:53.000 --> 08:10:54.000

We did do a presentation on the Rings of Power Book Club that Alicia hosted and Grace myself and Pablo were some of the participants in it.

08:10:54.000 --> 08:11:01.000

A few others dropped in a note as well. Basically, we wanted to prime ourselves to the show. So we read, as much second age.

08:11:01.000 --> 08:11:15.000

Content as we could find. This is the reading list that we read and we actually had a discussion at the, event on, the Tel Elmar segment.

08:11:15.000 --> 08:11:18.000

And then shortly after Grace.

08:11:18.000 --> 08:11:28.000

This happened and all of this stuff for pretty much all of this stuff plus some other stuff, and, of all got, consolidated into this volume.

08:11:28.000 --> 08:11:33.000

So we will put the reading list in our Discord channel for anybody that wants to leave through all these different volumes.

08:11:33.000 --> 08:11:37.000

So we will put the reading list in our Discord channel for anybody that wants to leave through all these different volumes, but most of it is in the fall of Newman or edited by Brian Sibley.

08:11:37.000 --> 08:11:45.000

Next slide. So when we were doing that book club, when we did the presentation, we basically came up with some predictions on how the series could go.

08:11:45.000 --> 08:11:54.000

And now we want to just kind of give us ourselves a little bit of a report card on how we did.

08:11:54.000 --> 08:12:01.000

Next slide, please. So on the left here you have sort of the season one synopsis versus the predictions that we made.

08:12:01.000 --> 08:12:05.000

So season one, this is gonna go a little bit out of order, but I'm trying to generally stay chronological.

08:12:05.000 --> 08:12:13.000

You have a prolong with young Giladriol and her brother Finrod who is unnamed for rights reasons.

08:12:13.000 --> 08:12:26.000

You see them together in. Morgoth, you see Moore got destroying Telpian and Laurel in the 2 trees of Eleanor, the War of Wrath and Finrod ends up being slain in a search for sour on.

08:12:26.000 --> 08:12:31.000

In the book club predictions, we basically, we didn't know how much they had licensing to.

08:12:31.000 --> 08:12:38.000

So we just said flash backs to the first stage of middle earth. Next please.

08:12:38.000 --> 08:12:45.000

So that is the 2 trees. And as realized in the show, next please.

08:12:45.000 --> 08:12:50.000

That is what the war of wrath, sort of flashback, which was very hellish next.

08:12:50.000 --> 08:13:01.000

And then, Yeah, so a couple of other things. So then, Galladri, after Finn Rod's mission to locate sour on and bring him to justice.

08:13:01.000 --> 08:13:16.000

She takes on the role as commander of the Norman, Northern Armies. And hiking Gilgalad and Lyndon sends our on a diplomatic mission to all their unknown to a region and Kazakh to basically re-establish contact and friendly relations with the dwarfs there.

08:13:16.000 --> 08:13:31.000

This ends up being a little bit of a fame because Lyndon is actually experiencing some fading representing represented by a disease in the malar trees which you can see on the right there.

08:13:31.000 --> 08:13:35.000

Next, please.

08:13:35.000 --> 08:13:49.000

As does go to, to Kaza Doom and, meets up with his old friend Prince Doer in the fourth and then they collaborate with the Elves of Region to create a Grand Forge next please.

08:13:49.000 --> 08:13:57.000

We just have a picture there of some elb. So that's during the fourth on the left and you're gonna get a lot of these pictures and a lot of other big pictures later on in the presentation so you'd be able to see better.

08:13:57.000 --> 08:14:09.000

And they, the dwarves have discovered me thrill around this time, which may or may not be infused with the light of a summer, TBD.

08:14:09.000 --> 08:14:15.000

Grace is gonna talk a little bit about that. But the me thrill they find seems to have the ability to reverse this fading in Linden.

08:14:15.000 --> 08:14:34.000

So in the book plug, predictions, we did say that we'd probably see the friendship between the Elves of Region and the meanwhile, over in the Southlands on the eastern part of the map, the men of the Southlands, or Rune are in conflict conflict with some orcs tunneling under their lands and raiding their villages.

08:14:34.000 --> 08:14:40.000

And there's a band of elves that oversee the area, but they are viewed as colonizers by some of the men.

08:14:40.000 --> 08:14:49.000

So in the bottom there you can see possibly the tail of how Basically a dollar organ and now for fighting and Grace will go into it more.



08:14:49.000 --> 08:14:55.000

And, one of the elves in the Southlands with some of the South Lunders.

08:14:55.000 --> 08:14:59.000

Next, please.

08:14:59.000 --> 08:15:14.000

So, Giladriol encounters and befriend Sauron who is in disguise as Hal Brand, who's, how brand has guys is the reluctant king of the Southlands, again spoiler alert, on a shipwreck in the seas.

08:15:14.000 --> 08:15:18.000

And, Alendia, ends up saving Giladra and had, a brand bringing them to Newman or where they implore Queen Regent Muriel for assistance in the Southland.

08:15:18.000 --> 08:15:30.000

So in our predictions, we did predict that, would return to middle earth in corporeal form, which does happen.

08:15:30.000 --> 08:15:38.000

And then he still there is training to become a member of the New Minorian Navy, but he's distracted by a woman's faint voice on the seas calling his name.

08:15:38.000 --> 08:15:45.000

We haven't really learned much about that yet. Yeah, sorry, Tim.

08:15:45.000 --> 08:15:51.000

So Queen Regent Muriel is plagued by dreams of a wave overtaking new manor.

08:15:51.000 --> 08:15:58.000

An electable wave one might even say far as on begins to undermine theial and so discord.

08:15:58.000 --> 08:16:06.000

Discord should not be capitalized there among the unfaithful men of NU and, TARP volunteer, ends up dying towards the end of the season.

08:16:06.000 --> 08:16:14.000

We did predict in our predictions that Tarmerials leadership would be challenged by far as on as happens in the Ecalabath.

08:16:14.000 --> 08:16:23.000

I then Gandolf arrives in middle earth but without his memory and connects with a group of nomadic carfle, basically proto-hobits.

08:16:23.000 --> 08:16:28.000

We didn't have said that Asari could feasibly appear in the second age, depends on what.

08:16:28.000 --> 08:16:45.000

Text your reading as to when they actually show up in in Gandhoff does end up regaining his self-awareness after an encounter with the cultists of Sarah and who they initially believe him to be their master.

08:16:45.000 --> 08:16:53.000

In Giladrio, Muriel, and a bunch of other Newmanorians end up traveling to the Southlands with an expedition.

08:16:53.000 --> 08:16:59.000

And of traveling to the Southlands with an expeditionary force to push back the orcs. There you have Muriel and her, she's end up traveling to the Southlands with an expeditionary force to push back the orcs.

08:16:59.000 --> 08:17:15.000

There you have Muriel and her, Sun Crown there, with some of the other Newmanorians on horseback and Mordor ends up being created via a very dramatic volcanic eruption, really crazy special effects caused by an alliance of orcs and southern men led by Adar, who is one of the first.

08:17:15.000 --> 08:17:24.000

Calls himself an and then how brand and sour on is seen at the end of the season entering Mordor in the finale of, finale episode.

08:17:24.000 --> 08:17:30.000

So, we had said, so on would establish themselves in Mordor. We thought that might not be it until season 2.

08:17:30.000 --> 08:17:37.000

We see him going into Mordor at the end of season one. Next, please.

08:17:37.000 --> 08:17:43.000

And, this is going back a little bit time wise, but sour on in the guys of how brand befriends Kell Bryn Bor.

08:17:43.000 --> 08:17:49.000

You could say he does so on a fair forum and they collaborate in the pursuit of forging the rings of power.

08:17:49.000 --> 08:18:02.000

Glad Real ends up learning how brands true identity and, Keller and the Smiths, of Region and at foreign, forging the 3 Eldon rings of power, but without the direct involvement of Sauron.

08:18:02.000 --> 08:18:10.000

So we had said in the predictions that Sauron would influence Calibran more in the Smiths of Arigian, Kelborn and Galadrio are distrustful.

08:18:10.000 --> 08:18:15.000

Kelwyn is not here yet, but goadrille did end up being distrustful of.

08:18:15.000 --> 08:18:28.000

And that sour on instructs Kalibur and bore and the smith to forge the rings of power again those were season 2 predictions next please I'm gonna hand it over to Pablo now.

08:18:28.000 --> 08:18:34.000

Alrighty, so I'm gonna be talking to you a little bit about the production team's interpretation of the text.

08:18:34.000 --> 08:18:47.000

Largely focusing on their, visual traces of interpretation, but also touching on some characters and what makes them special Next.

08:18:47.000 --> 08:18:59.000

We're gonna start off with the Harford's. The, as Tim said, these are the nomadic proto habits brought in because according to the show's creators quote, it just wouldn't feel like middle Earth without them close quote.

08:18:59.000 --> 08:19:10.000

There existence while not very canonical in the second age, can be justified because they never did anything historic or noteworthy before the third age, comes from the red book.

08:19:10.000 --> 08:19:20.000

And they weren't doing anything but they were around. Says the show's creators. And so that brings us to next slide.

08:19:20.000 --> 08:19:26.000

We have Lyndon, which is depicted as this beautiful golden, realm of the elves.

08:19:26.000 --> 08:19:32.000

We get a few shots of the realm across the series. That dinner scene Tim showed was one of them.

08:19:32.000 --> 08:19:53.000

Mostly they're just walking through the forest of Linden. There are several, scenes focused on this natural Acropolis, which stands the Great Tree of London as it's it seems to me that the writers were gonna be trying to create a, lineage of trees similar to the descendants of Telperion, but with Lauren as a progenitor as well.

08:19:53.000 --> 08:20:00.000

Next slide.

08:20:00.000 --> 08:20:07.000

With that, you can see here in the blurry background that during the fourth was given, a tree.

08:20:07.000 --> 08:20:17.000

In that line by L. And you can see we have relatively short here at Lrun. This center is being hosted by D.

08:20:17.000 --> 08:20:26.000

Next slide. Kind of do, which makes a few appearances aside from a couple of nice panoramas like this.

08:20:26.000 --> 08:20:35.000

So a surprisingly, The show only has a couple of steams inside the Dorado itself.

08:20:35.000 --> 08:20:38.000

We see outside a couple of times we see Dern's dining room, from a few different angles and redecorated.

08:20:38.000 --> 08:20:54.000

Depending on the needs of the scene. Overall, Kaz, Doom is Pretty stereotypically and, Next slide.

08:20:54.000 --> 08:21:02.000

Right outside. Of Kazan, doom, we have, which we get a few panoramas like this.

08:21:02.000 --> 08:21:10.000

Which is packed as this nice, fully developed, facility right on the West Gate, no real mention is made of leadership or anything going on.

08:21:10.000 --> 08:21:20.000

Inside the city except for next slide.

08:21:20.000 --> 08:21:27.000

Keller Rivers workshop, which looks a lot like this. There's a few scenes, notably the forging of the rings.

08:21:27.000 --> 08:21:37.000

That we have, but otherwise. Not much else. Next slide.

08:21:37.000 --> 08:21:46.000

That brings us to the, realms of men. We have Newman or here throughout the, show or the first season.

08:21:46.000 --> 08:22:03.000

We have a decent number. Of scenes within the city. The architecture is decidedly Western. Whereas, next slide.

08:22:03.000 --> 08:22:11.000

There ships are gonna have this kind of. Chinese junk influence style. It's kind of a mixture of a trium.

08:22:11.000 --> 08:22:27.000

And a junk. It's really interesting. And we mostly get close up shots of the urban environments of the island plaza or in the palace and we occasionally get these kind of jacks and ask anoramas.

08:22:27.000 --> 08:22:31.000

Next slide.

08:22:31.000 --> 08:22:40.000

And in the palace we get Nima the fair, which. Many cases kind of serves as a character in and of itself.

08:22:40.000 --> 08:22:50.000

Creating or amplifying for boating and drama in many scenes throughout the first season. And much of the conflict to plot around Numa is drawn by.

08:22:50.000 --> 08:22:55.000

Next slide. Gladriole and her character. Who serves as a central plot drive roll through the first season.

08:22:55.000 --> 08:23:05.000

And has been as a result highly praised and harshly criticized depending on your choice overview.

08:23:05.000 --> 08:23:13.000

Raiders, from depicting Giladri as a warrior and a leader, a,er of the Northern Army.

08:23:13.000 --> 08:23:21.000

And while that particular title is not a word in Tolkien's writing specifically. She most certainly saw her fair share of battle in the show.

08:23:21.000 --> 08:23:30.000

Her battle experience is largely shown through flashy bite scenes like the following. Next slide.

08:23:30.000 --> 08:23:50.000

There are many ways to kill an ork. Come at me. We will see who can score flesh.

08:23:50.000 --> 08:24:05.000

Don't plant roots. Keep moving.

08:24:05.000 --> 08:24:11.000

Oh!

08:24:11.000 --> 08:24:16.000

Well done. Lieutenant.

08:24:16.000 --> 08:24:26.000

It's good.

08:24:26.000 --> 08:24:28.000

Hmm, next slide. So, I don't know this 10.

08:24:28.000 --> 08:24:32.000

There are many ways to come up.

08:24:32.000 --> 08:24:37.000

Go's one of those characters Tolkien was grappling with and flashing out at the end of his life.

08:24:37.000 --> 08:24:45.000

One of the consistent elements of her character was that she was at all times a total badass.

08:24:45.000 --> 08:24:50.000

She saved, Caliburn ship and Elquine Delay. She could forge her own sword.

08:24:50.000 --> 08:24:59.000

She let it to parchment of Fingalphin's army through the north and the hellcaraxy to ambush orks on where maybe that's where we get the commander of the Northern Army's inspiration.



08:24:59.000 --> 08:25:10.000

So with tokens ratings, there is significant justification for her warriorship and leadership. Given how much of that story remains unwritten.

08:25:10.000 --> 08:25:15.000

I think the writers have done a great job in crafting her character and filling in that history.

08:25:15.000 --> 08:25:19.000

Next slide.

08:25:19.000 --> 08:25:29.000

Lastly, we have this is star. I'm gonna call him Gandoff. He makes a dramatic appearance, falling from the sky as meteor to be discovered by the Harpets, Norian Poppy.

08:25:29.000 --> 08:25:34.000

Spends a lot of the season looking about is with it as he does in this screenshot.

08:25:34.000 --> 08:25:50.000

He does occasional acts of magic with mixed outcomes pursued by white robe cultists. Throughout the season, it's clear that he's supposed to be one of the writers candidates for who is Sauron in the second age.

08:25:50.000 --> 08:26:00.000

It's not him. I've decided he's scanned off simply because he's with big wizardy looking guy called who would have a natural spot for half links.

08:26:00.000 --> 08:26:07.000

Just as a result of his personal history. And that's the end of my segment. Take it over.

08:26:07.000 --> 08:26:12.000

Then it comes to me to talk about adaptational changes and choices. A few quotes that I wanted to bring up.

08:26:12.000 --> 08:26:20.000

In particular from Tolkien, that are often cited when we talk about adaptation of any of this works.

08:26:20.000 --> 08:26:35.000

That one of those is that the cycle should be linked as a majestic colony at leave scope for other minds and hands, that letter to Milton Waldman in 1951 and then also that the canons of narrative and any medium cannot be wholly different.

08:26:35.000 --> 08:26:45.000

And the assertion that the failure of adaptation then is in exaggeration or unwanted matter, not perceiving where the core of the original lies.

08:26:45.000 --> 08:26:59.000

I wanted to talk a little bit too about some comments that Brandon Sanderson, another Mythopoeic author who's written his interconnected Cosmere series and also finished the Wheel of Time for Robert Jordan has on adaptation.

08:26:59.000 --> 08:27:02.000

He has a little bit of credential here because he has been consulted on the adaptations for the Wheel of Time series on Amazon as well.

08:27:02.000 --> 08:27:19.000

And he talks specifically in the context of Lord of the Rings, the Peter Jackson films about how sometimes changes necessary because an adaptation you have to show rather than tell.

08:27:19.000 --> 08:27:24.000

In books characters can ruminate there can be wood, like there can be narration, all of that in adaptation, you have to demonstrate.

08:27:24.000 --> 08:27:31.000

And so his assertion is that sometimes a true faithful adaptation results in bad visual storytelling and a change has to occur to fit the medium.

08:27:31.000 --> 08:27:42.000

That the best adaptations may make dramatic change, but importantly, keep the soul of the work intact.

08:27:42.000 --> 08:27:53.000

So this is where I think we should be assessing the success of an adaptation, not how letter by letter it is to a work, but if it captures the spirit in essence.

08:27:53.000 --> 08:28:00.000

One of the first things that I want to talk about is time compression. This is one of the first things that was announced about the show that they were going to be using time compression to tell this story.

08:28:00.000 --> 08:28:10.000

And there are some reasons why I think it's a pretty good idea. The second age spans 3,441 years.

08:28:10.000 --> 08:28:16.000

I did the math on that. If we were to split that out evenly, that would be covering an average of 86 years per episode.

08:28:16.000 --> 08:28:18.000

That's not going to result in great storytelling. So then folks say, well, well, but just the story of the forging of the rings.

08:28:18.000 --> 08:28:28.000

All right, that's 1,940 years. Results in 48.5 years per episode.

08:28:28.000 --> 08:28:53.000

This is a better ratio but still if we were to structure at tail like this in adaptation, human characters would be dying of old age every one to 2 episodes, verbs a new manorian kings dying out every maybe like half season all of old age and each non-Elf character played would have to be played by a continual cast of actors rotating in to portray the character across different spans of their life from

08:28:53.000 --> 08:28:58.000

birth to death. It would be impossible to do Tolkien any justice in that sort of chaotic context.

08:28:58.000 --> 08:29:11.000

So all of all the beauty of his work would be lost. So I think time compression. Is a clever way to try to, to alive those issues.

08:29:11.000 --> 08:29:19.000

The only thing that we would really get out of trying to tell the story in that way is a very clear understanding of how much more longer-lived elves are than anyone else.

08:29:19.000 --> 08:29:35.000

And there are better ways to do that for storytelling. Another off, off talked about and off, concerned piece of the, rings of power is the Mithril legend that they that they put forward.

08:29:35.000 --> 08:29:53.000

It raises some red flags, this tail, the song of the roots of the Thal gear, it's about an elf fighting a barrog over a tree that has a silver roll in it and then lightning strikes and that puts Mithril in the ground and folks rightly so we're going, Tolkien did not write that.

08:29:53.000 --> 08:30:06.000

And they're correct because it's supposed to raise those red flags. In this scene where Gil Gallad forces El Ron to tell this story, L-run protests saying that the story is apocryphal.

08:30:06.000 --> 08:30:18.000

And that means that it's not part of official canon and not just, you know, Tolkien's canon and the, that we understand in the primary world, but it's not considered.

08:30:18.000 --> 08:30:33.000

Canon or official within the secondary world either within the world of the show. Apocryphal means writings or statements whose origin and veracity are in doubt legends and anecdotes that have never been verified.

08:30:33.000 --> 08:30:48.000

We're supposed to be concerned. About this, the script tells us to be. And if we needed just a little bit more confidence, Patrick McKay, the one of the showrunners said in an interview in October of last year, but also we know El Ron is a lawmaster and he is aware of this tale.

08:30:48.000 --> 08:30:56.000

He says in that fifth episode that it's apocryphal, I would trust his read on a piece of lore.

08:30:56.000 --> 08:31:04.000

Another contested pieces, the order that the rings are forged in seem to be different than the order that token lays it out in the oven rings being forged.

08:31:04.000 --> 08:31:17.000

First, at this point we don't know whether that's going to be just the narrative of the show and we're just gonna have to live with it or if in future seasons that they may complicate our understanding of what the timeline has been with flashbacks or non-linear timeline or anything.

08:31:17.000 --> 08:31:29.000

So I think on this one, I'm waiting to season 2 to, you know, pass a lot of judgment, figure out how ruffled my feathers are.

08:31:29.000 --> 08:31:42.000

We get a lot of questions about where's Calabrian and before that was Keliborn that was answered in episode 7 of the show that Kelliborne and Gladwell are already married, and but we don't have an answer about Calabrian.

08:31:42.000 --> 08:31:46.000

I don't know that we're actually going to see this character. There aren't a lot of dates that are really specific to her life in the second age.

08:31:46.000 --> 08:31:54.000

We know that she marries L. Ron in third age 109, but that's outside the scope of the show.

08:31:54.000 --> 08:32:03.000

They're not to adapt anything from the third age. Calabrian meets El Ron after the sack of a Region.

08:32:03.000 --> 08:32:09.000

This is an event that shifted due to time compression, so we're not sure relatively where this would occur.

08:32:09.000 --> 08:32:20.000

And they meet in Revndell, which hasn't been founded yet. A lot of people point out while her birth year is in the second age 300 and so she should be born already no matter what.

08:32:20.000 --> 08:32:27.000

But her birth year is actually never clearly defined. It's one reference from I think nature of Middle Earth that places it at that second H.

08:32:27.000 --> 08:32:36.000

300 mark that a lot of you know, Tolkien Gateway and other things promote, but throughout the rest of the writings, it's a contested date.

08:32:36.000 --> 08:32:41.000

It's not always even Calabrian who is the child of Galladio in Calaborn.

08:32:41.000 --> 08:32:48.000

Sometimes there's a sun instead, sometimes a collaborating but the date isn't stated. So this may be a story line that we don't see due to time compression.

08:32:48.000 --> 08:32:56.000

This may also be a storyline that because there's so much flexibility in Tolkien's writings that they may choose to adapt, we're just gonna have to wait and see.

08:32:56.000 --> 08:33:06.000

Another common complaint is that the storyline places Sauron and also Gladriole and Numan or earlier than Sauron is written to be there in Gladriales never written to be there at all.

08:33:06.000 --> 08:33:25.000

But this is actually a great adaptational choice because we have to consider audiences who have very little familiarity with Tolkien's works or none at all who are coming in as well as those who of us who are a little bit more deeply red.

08:33:25.000 --> 08:33:37.000

And so this allows a new audience to establish a connection between Sauron and Newman or that it's going to be very important in developing that plot throughout the rest of the series.

08:33:37.000 --> 08:33:43.000

With both Sarn and Gladriole, there is nothing to support them ever going there. At this point in time in the second age in Tolkien's ratings.

08:33:43.000 --> 08:33:48.000

But to my to my recollection, there's also nothing that prohibits the idea that they could have.

08:33:48.000 --> 08:34:18.000

It's just a void in the scaffold of text that we have. A lot of people could critique the scenes in the early episode of, in her company in fourth race And one reason why this is a phenomenal adaptational choice

is that they're able to incorporate a number of aspects that we know of Giladrio from leading, leading the older across the grinding ice, all of this.

08:34:18.000 --> 08:34:29.000

but this becomes a show don't tell moment because we get to understand very very early on the resiliency, the physical resiliency of elves.

08:34:29.000 --> 08:34:39.000

And this is going to be something that's very, very key for us to have that understanding of later on, how well they can withstand cold and heat, swim and physical exertion.

08:34:39.000 --> 08:34:55.000

This scene actually helps delay the groundwork for Elrond and Doran in the Sikh and this contest of breaking rocks because we as the audience have an understanding that by the time El Ron gives in, he shouldn't, he shouldn't have been winded.

08:34:55.000 --> 08:35:02.000

He shouldn't have been exhausted by that. There's something more going on. So it's building a scaffold for us as the audience to be able to climb.

08:35:02.000 --> 08:35:11.000

We also know the characters are living in the moment. They don't know their future. We do, but this moment we're a Lenndale and Sauron are, you know, embracing in thanks is this great moment of like, wow, they don't know what's coming.

08:35:11.000 --> 08:35:29.000

We have another moment like that when the sealed door walks past Hall Brand's bunk in the belly of the ship where it's wow what a significant meeting that they have no idea the importance of.

08:35:29.000 --> 08:35:39.000

And there are a lot of ways in which the show has done their homework and I think it's worth pointing out because they're frequently critiqued as not knowing the lore or whatever.



08:35:39.000 --> 08:35:45.000

There's some really neat moments that are in here too that have been really exciting for me at least to see.

08:35:45.000 --> 08:35:46.000

Even see things as simple as in the background, the flora and fauna of middle earth.

08:35:46.000 --> 08:35:59.000

In London, there are a ton of Burch trees, which is, you know, Tolkien's favorite tree is he noted in some of his letters.

08:35:59.000 --> 08:36:16.000

There's this moment that happens here at Twilight between Arondi and Bronwyn that it's the first time that their hands ever touch to class pans and that they're, you know, try building this romance, this forbidden love.

08:36:16.000 --> 08:36:33.000

And the fact that this happens at Twilight, I was just head over heels about it because there's a small quote in War of the Jewels that talks about the Elves and War of the Jewels that talks about the Elves and Twilight and what in War of the Jewels that talks about the Elves and Twilight and what an auspicious time of day it is, how close to their

08:36:33.000 --> 08:36:44.000

heart Twilight and Dawn are because even though they love the the height of the sun in the summer and they delight in that the most the most heartfelt time for them is at Twilight and at dawn.

08:36:44.000 --> 08:36:54.000

Because they awoke under stars. And there's just a lot of things that are this attention to detail that we have to see in the adaptation.

08:36:54.000 --> 08:37:02.000

We maybe don't get told because it's coming from things that they don't have the explicit rights to adapt, but they're following some of these trails.

08:37:02.000 --> 08:37:08.000

Staying on this couple for a minute. These are 2 characters who are invented for the show. Neither one of them are from Tolkien's works.

08:37:08.000 --> 08:37:30.000

But we can look to places that have inspired their character creation because as I look at their storylines, see a lot of Arthur Bath and and in that tension between you know, and Elphin human relationship that, that never resulted in marriage and these 2 are, you know, they're having that relationship, but they're not a married couple.

08:37:30.000 --> 08:37:49.000

And then for Bronwyn, we also see a lot of inspiration in, who becomes a leader of her people during a time of crisis and we can see how these other elements of the legendarium subtly begin to braid in to this adaptation.

08:37:49.000 --> 08:38:07.000

Add our is another example of this where all of the. All of the information and conflicting information that the token was writing about orcs and the morality of their creation and the theory behind them get to be explored through this created character for the show.

08:38:07.000 --> 08:38:25.000

And there are a ton of things in, especially that first, that first monologue voice over that tells us about a lot of the history where we get to see a lot of things written on screen even if we don't get to to hear all of it in the dialogue.

08:38:25.000 --> 08:38:27.000

So, so, Gladial said there had not been a sunrise, but even then there was light and of course this is the 2 trees and we get a chance to see them.

08:38:27.000 --> 08:38:37.000

There's another line that she talks about later on about light were being reflected in the water in the sky.

08:38:37.000 --> 08:38:45.000

Now this is a line that's been widely panned by critics online as being odd and strange and they're not understanding it.

08:38:45.000 --> 08:38:53.000

But of course, with the light source being the 2 trees, light is not coming from the sky, but is reflected in both the sky and the water.

08:38:53.000 --> 08:39:05.000

And this is a subtle way of working that understanding in of, in the first age. There's a reference to the kin slaying with this little boat that, adriole makes it a swan boat and then other elves end up sinking it by attacking it.

08:39:05.000 --> 08:39:19.000

We have visions of first age battles including. This one, which is the battle of unnumbered tiers and.

08:39:19.000 --> 08:39:26.000

The that pile of helmets. Is a reference to the Hill of the slain from that particular battle.

08:39:26.000 --> 08:39:47.000

In Finrod's death, though we don't get all the details explained to us, we can see the werewolf scratches on his arm and those of us who catch that reference can, you know, delight in understanding that they've paid attention to as many of these details as possible.

08:39:47.000 --> 08:39:48.000

Even though they can't give us the whole Baron and Lydian of Finrod's story.

08:39:48.000 --> 08:39:55.000

In talking about how to impress the idea that the elves are so much more long-lived than anyone else.

08:39:55.000 --> 08:40:17.000

They have this moment with the tapestry in the halls of lore in in NUMANOR and where for Gallagher, this is a memory, and Linda looking at it beside her, this is ancient history and we grasp the the magnitude of the difference in their lives and perceptions and lifespans.

08:40:17.000 --> 08:40:22.000

And then there are a couple of really neat Easter eggs. For instance, this one is some of the carvings and tier.

08:40:22.000 --> 08:40:35.000

And here we have a bird and a baby in its cause or an eagle and child. The pub from from Oxford where the inklings would sometimes meet.

08:40:35.000 --> 08:40:50.000

In Newmanor, we see layers of architecture, not just this new and beautiful Newmanorian architecture, but around, for instance, the tree, we see old and crumbling and decaying elven architecture.

08:40:50.000 --> 08:40:59.000

So we see the layers of history that exist within NUMANOR and the tensions that are already happening even before we're talking to anyone within the city.

08:40:59.000 --> 08:41:09.000

And keeping with, for a minute, there's some really amazing statues in here. In the, jail, which is clearly a repurposed room, really amazing statues in here.

08:41:09.000 --> 08:41:10.000

In the jail, which is clearly a repurposed room. There's a statue of the Maya Union with her long hair going down into the water.

08:41:10.000 --> 08:41:26.000

We have the entrance to the harbor and being guarded or welcomed by the Statue of Ulmo, and being guarded or welcomed by the Statue of Ulmo, who's holding the horns of Yelmo, who's holding the horns of Yelmir and the foam haired water horses are with him.

08:41:26.000 --> 08:41:47.000

That passage toward the harbor is lined by these gigantic faces of representing all of the previous rulers of NUMBER, the Kingstones, and then we do have, Errendale up here, this massive statue of Erin Dill in one of the ways that we know it's your is that L wing in bird form is there behind him on his shoulder as well.

08:41:47.000 --> 08:41:57.000

So some fantastic attention to detail. Speaking of your, there are often moments when they have L.

08:41:57.000 --> 08:42:04.000

Rons looking to the sky into the stars and in a very contemplative or melancholic sort of way.

08:42:04.000 --> 08:42:12.000

And then in this scene in particular from Lyndon, the scene then switches to numbered and the statue of Erin Dale.

08:42:12.000 --> 08:42:23.000

And we can see also the idea of the SILMERL upon his. Brow mimicking the star itself and his hand out stretched as though to clasp it.

08:42:23.000 --> 08:42:24.000

Hmm.

08:42:24.000 --> 08:42:31.000

And then one last thing while we're on the topic of statues, I do want to point out in this memorial garden where I'm glad you're looking to like Miss Finrod.

08:42:31.000 --> 08:42:36.000

If you look to the right, you will also see Lutheran and the hound who on.

08:42:36.000 --> 08:42:41.000

Carved into those trees. So there are a lot of Easter eggs and a lot of attention to detail.

08:42:41.000 --> 08:42:44.000

That has gone into this.

08:42:44.000 --> 08:42:48.000

And I will pass it now over to L.

08:42:48.000 --> 08:42:57.000

So, we wanted to highlight some of the themes that we found in Tolkien's writing that we can see very clearly reflected in this show.

08:42:57.000 --> 08:43:06.000

So I'm going to show some quotes from Tolkien's works and some screen caps and some quotes from this show on the slides while I'm talking.

08:43:06.000 --> 08:43:20.000

Next slide. So it's well established in the text that as a fair form and that is key to his abilities and his actions in the second age.

08:43:20.000 --> 08:43:29.000

It's also really important that South on is notably not wholly evil. He even speaks a little bit in the show about Morgoth and his hold over him.

08:43:29.000 --> 08:43:33.000

Next slide.

08:43:33.000 --> 08:43:50.000

Token notes over and over again that he was given the chance to repent and he genuinely has an impulse to do so, but his desire to linger and to repair and reorganize and rehabilitate the ruin of Middle Earth is just too strong for him to resist.

08:43:50.000 --> 08:43:56.000

You might say he just. Next slide.

08:43:56.000 --> 08:44:07.000

Just wants to make Middle Earth great again. Yeah. Let's get back to his motives. Next slide.

08:44:07.000 --> 08:44:20.000

The decision to make Salon's internal struggle between repentance and rejection of the one both more visible and also highly ambiguous on screen is a really interesting one.

08:44:20.000 --> 08:44:29.000

I think it gives us a chance to recognize that South on the deceiver is just as good at deceiving himself as any as anyone else is.

08:44:29.000 --> 08:44:42.000

I think that these tiers that he sheds in this scene could be genuine. But those tiers could also just as easily be crocodile peers and meant to to deceive.

08:44:42.000 --> 08:44:45.000

Next slide.

08:44:45.000 --> 08:44:51.000

Sauron's powers in the second age are of manipulation, seduction, deception, and flattery.

08:44:51.000 --> 08:45:04.000

They're very slow and subtle working. In the third age, of course, he just says, you know, screw that ish and goes come straight to dominating other people's wills and minds to make them do what he wants.

08:45:04.000 --> 08:45:13.000

But in the second age, he lies. He exploits people's desires. Their weaknesses and their fears and their doubts to his advantage.

08:45:13.000 --> 08:45:21.000

I think he loses some of this. Emotional ability when he loses his spare physical form at the end of the second age.

08:45:21.000 --> 08:45:37.000

Speaking of fair physical forms. Next slide. Even though it's the phrase not of the flesh but over flesh that makes, Giladereal suspicious antenna go up.

08:45:37.000 --> 08:45:51.000

Pretty comfortable using his power of the flesh too. I mean, how else are we supposed to take how brand rolling up into Kilobram Boris workshop in the medieval equivalent of his boxers going, the Kelibram bore?

08:45:51.000 --> 08:45:58.000

Oh, I've heard all about you, the Smith I apprenticed on beer, told me all about you.

08:45:58.000 --> 08:46:05.000

There are several layers of seduction. Possibly going on here. I'm just saying that's all.

08:46:05.000 --> 08:46:07.000

Next slide.

08:46:07.000 --> 08:46:16.000



The choice to make a collateral more directly involved and actively deceived. Bye, S is another interesting one.

08:46:16.000 --> 08:46:23.000

I think it gives us a chance to see Giladriille being more dynamic in her ultimate rejection of him.

08:46:23.000 --> 08:46:32.000

And we also get to see Salon's powers of gas lighting and manipulation at work. Next slide.

08:46:32.000 --> 08:46:43.000

It's very uncomfortably familiar to many people. Socialized as women. We also get to see a little bit of how they're rather 2 of a kind.

08:46:43.000 --> 08:46:54.000

S in a way that Gladiol doesn't really want to be seen. She is more than a little bit afraid of her own darkness, which we also see throughout the show.

08:46:54.000 --> 08:46:59.000

Next slide.

08:46:59.000 --> 08:47:07.000

I do think that we need more than the small hint that we're given here of Galladra's explicit desire for rulership.

08:47:07.000 --> 08:47:14.000

Her emotional journey in the show is transformed into something more obvious that can be seen on screen.

08:47:14.000 --> 08:47:26.000

He struggles with people questioning her and doubting her from the outside rather than the more subjective internal struggle that we see, you know, kind of in third person passive in the texts.

08:47:26.000 --> 08:47:37.000

The, also desires power. And to rule. That's really important to her character. Next slide.

08:47:37.000 --> 08:47:47.000

Another theme that we wanted to discuss was one of the theme of lost or secret or undisclosed information.

08:47:47.000 --> 08:47:57.000

Next slide. Information of the second age and about the second age is scarce. Both in middle earth and here in the round world.

08:47:57.000 --> 08:48:07.000

We not only get to see people searching for and finding lost information in the floor halls of both Numan or Erika.

08:48:07.000 --> 08:48:08.000

Next slide.

08:48:08.000 --> 08:48:17.000

But we also get to see the consequences of those incomplete records. Those forgotten stories and oral memories.

08:48:17.000 --> 08:48:28.000

The much the detriment of these characters, the have not having enough of this information or having lost this information, leads them to disaster on more than one.

08:48:28.000 --> 08:48:38.000

Next slide. We also get to see people actively keeping secrets from each other. Which Once again, reminds me of the trope of.

08:48:38.000 --> 08:48:45.000

Poor communication kills. Next slide.

08:48:45.000 --> 08:48:56.000

We get to see the consequences of these secrets and the discomfort, especially of El Ronde. He's kept out of the loop and used by Dilgal, Gale Gallad.

08:48:56.000 --> 08:49:05.000

And he can try, he's trying to honor his oath to Doran and also to his king and ultimately next slide.

08:49:05.000 --> 08:49:12.000

He has to keep his suspicions about what happened between Hal Brand and Galadriol to himself too.

08:49:12.000 --> 08:49:23.000

I really love the use of Elrond here, to show this theme. He hates secrets and continually try to tell the truth instead in the show.

08:49:23.000 --> 08:49:31.000

He is constantly placing himself. In the position of mediator and of course in the third age he's still going to have that role.

08:49:31.000 --> 08:49:39.000

Help hold the council where everyone will get the chance to speak honestly with everybody else and reveal their secrets that they've been keeping.

08:49:39.000 --> 08:49:46.000

They'll work together to find a solution. Next slide.

08:49:46.000 --> 08:49:55.000

And speaking of working together. I love how this theme of alliances between people's, appears throughout the show.

08:49:55.000 --> 08:50:04.000

It's a big one of tokens. He really knows how to portray the fact that we're always stronger together.

08:50:04.000 --> 08:50:15.000

And the characters in the show come to realize that in some very big and powerful ways. Next slide.

08:50:15.000 --> 08:50:29.000

We see the seeds being planted of the last alliance between London and Newman or and we also see a little tiny bit of the seeds that the later relationship between the native peoples of Middle-earth, that is the South Winders.

08:50:29.000 --> 08:50:37.000

And the men of Numan or. That relationship will become rather complicated to say the least.

08:50:37.000 --> 08:50:40.000

Next slide.

08:50:40.000 --> 08:50:49.000

So speaking of relationships, we wanted to highlight a few characters and relationships that people have really responded to here.

08:50:49.000 --> 08:51:05.000

Next slide. Starting with the power throttle that, by far is one of the more universally, positively remarked and regarded of the these characters.

08:51:05.000 --> 08:51:18.000

The people love the trouble and so do I, obviously. I think that one thing that Tolkien does masterfully is show us a lot of different ways of love and being in love and loving.

08:51:18.000 --> 08:51:27.000

Elrond and, are old friends. Cough cough, they're just bros, just friends.

08:51:27.000 --> 08:51:35.000

Jordan and Disa are married, may have children, and they are still Absolutely smitten with each other.

08:51:35.000 --> 08:51:44.000

And as soon as D and Eldon meet one another, she warmly brings him into our family like they've known each other forever.

08:51:44.000 --> 08:51:51.000

It's really a credit to these actors. Just how warm and familiar this relationship feels.

08:51:51.000 --> 08:51:57.000

They give a lot of life, I think, to this, to this relationship between all 3 of them.

08:51:57.000 --> 08:52:00.000

Next slide.

08:52:00.000 --> 08:52:12.000

And speaking of actors. Bringing something to a relationship. Bronwyn and Aron Dear are just in the beginning stages of a romance, but It's very clear.

08:52:12.000 --> 08:52:24.000

Even without. Telling each other explicitly. Just how much they feel for each other and they know how much the other feels for them.

08:52:24.000 --> 08:52:33.000

I feel like this relationship was one commented on, quite a lot as remarkably tender and sweet.

08:52:33.000 --> 08:52:39.000

And I really think that it's a credit to both of these actors, but especially East Mile who was nominated for an Emmy, a Hollywood Critics Choice Critics Award and a Crick's Choice Award for his acting.

00:00:00.000 --> 00:00:05.000

I really think that both of them have really Made us kind of fall in love with them and Hi, Literally surprised at, how invested I was at their relationship.

00:00:05.000 --> 00:00:14.000

Next slide. And lastly, Adar, who I think is another. Highlight of this show.

00:00:14.000 --> 00:00:33.000

Joseph Molli's performance is tragic and Brightening and he's often very He's very tender and very cruel at the same time to his children, which is what he calls his orc followers.

00:00:33.000 --> 00:00:44.000

He's absolutely adored by them as a father. They call him Lord Father. His actions are all ostensibly to find and create a homeland for them.

00:00:44.000 --> 00:00:49.000

But that doesn't always mean that they're going to just move into an empty space. They'll kind of do what they want no matter who or what else might be.

00:00:49.000 --> 00:01:01.000

Already living there. I do want to note that Add AR will be played by another actor, Sam Hazel De in season 2.

00:01:01.000 --> 00:01:12.000

So he's got some pretty big shoes to fill. But I'm really excited to see the kind of journey that he's going to bring us on, in the seasons to come.

00:01:12.000 --> 00:01:17.000

Which speaking of seasons to come.

00:01:17.000 --> 00:01:18.000

We'll pass it on.

00:01:18.000 --> 00:01:26.000

I'm gonna breeze through this because we only have like a minute left, but we have revised our predictions for season 2 and beyond.

00:01:26.000 --> 00:01:37.000

Next slide. Season 2 we think could, we already have confirmed that Calibor and Ki and possibly a younger Sheila may show up.

00:01:37.000 --> 00:01:48.000

Return into different guys possibly anatar the Lord of gifts to instruct Caliber more than Smith's to forge the rings of men and towards, Kelvin Bohr and the Gwy.

00:01:48.000 --> 00:02:09.000

Done would then rebel under Sauron's influenced against Giladrio in Calaborn and, establishes himself in Mordor, builds barred or extends his power to the east, finds the Easter and Gandhoff is headed for run which is now Mordor and potentially learns more about his origins and mission.

00:02:09.000 --> 00:02:16.000

This is all speculation. Except for the confirmed characters. Next slide. Alright, I'm gonna cut myself off.

00:02:16.000 --> 00:02:27.000

I'm gonna be good. Maybe we can revisit our, predictions in our discussion session, but can you go to our summary slide?

00:02:27.000 --> 00:02:30.000

Leeds.

00:02:30.000 --> 00:02:37.000

So to summarize, a lot of season one can be either directly or indirectly tracked back to Tolkien's writings either via direct adaptation via nods to other events or characters.

00:02:37.000 --> 00:02:49.000

There are of course certain adaptational choices that have been made due to the format of this of the show, materials.

00:02:49.000 --> 00:02:52.000

Selectively licensed by the token to state that sort of thing. We can talk more about that in the discussion.

00:02:52.000 --> 00:03:01.000

And there are a lot of Tolkienian themes that can be found in season one. And obviously we have 4 more seasons to come.

00:03:01.000 --> 00:03:12.000

So. Everybody please stick around if you can and in 10 min we will have a great big discussion session.

00:03:12.000 --> 00:03:18.000

Excellent. For now, I'm going to stop sharing the screen. So I can see everyone's lovely faces.

00:03:18.000 --> 00:03:20.000

Yeah.



00:03:20.000 --> 00:03:22.000

Okay.

00:03:22.000 --> 00:03:26.000

So.

00:03:26.000 --> 00:03:28.000

Crammed a lot.

00:03:28.000 --> 00:03:29.000

Oh my goodness.

00:03:29.000 --> 00:03:30.000

Hello. Okay.

00:03:30.000 --> 00:03:32.000

Not to catch up on chat. Oh my god, there's a lot in the chat. Okay.

00:03:32.000 --> 00:03:33.000

I'm gonna need this whole 10 min just to catch it.

00:03:33.000 --> 00:03:41.000

There's a lot of chat. I've been keeping it. It's mostly just me and Tim Bolton talking.

00:03:41.000 --> 00:03:42.000

Yeah.

00:03:42.000 --> 00:03:46.000

Yeah, I'd like, I need to, I need to. Hey, a minute. Yeah, as you say, it seems like most of you just shooting the breeze.

00:03:46.000 --> 00:03:51.000

Do I get to make commentary on my reading of the chat?

00:03:51.000 --> 00:03:52.000

Yeah.

00:03:52.000 --> 00:03:53.000

Sure.

00:03:53.000 --> 00:04:01.000

Tim Bton, Tim Lens, I'm maybe, your show checks are getting deposited, in the wrong accounts because they've got you confused.

00:04:01.000 --> 00:04:02.000

I don't know

00:04:02.000 --> 00:04:05.000

Yeah.

00:04:05.000 --> 00:04:06.000

They're the same person, guys. Come on.

00:04:06.000 --> 00:04:07.000

Yeah. That's a real shame. Okay. Hey, are the same person, correct?

00:04:07.000 --> 00:04:11.000

Yeah. The.

00:04:11.000 --> 00:04:14.000

Yeah.

00:04:14.000 --> 00:04:15.000

Yeah.

00:04:15.000 --> 00:04:16.000

Yeah.

00:04:16.000 --> 00:04:17.000

Oh, I understand that reference.

00:04:17.000 --> 00:04:18.000

I got that joke.

00:04:18.000 --> 00:04:19.000

Yeah.

00:04:19.000 --> 00:04:20.000

I understand that reference.

00:04:20.000 --> 00:04:21.000

Yeah

00:04:21.000 --> 00:04:24.000

I understood that. Yeah. Now we have Yeah.

00:04:24.000 --> 00:04:30.000

Yay!

00:04:30.000 --> 00:04:33.000

Sure everybody's. In their next.

00:04:33.000 --> 00:04:35.000

Okay.

00:04:35.000 --> 00:04:40.000

Yeah, JJ Schultz had a great comment of they only have rates to the habit and more to the rings.

00:04:40.000 --> 00:04:46.000

And really just follow up. They don't even have full rights to that. Yeah, they're limited in what they can.

00:04:46.000 --> 00:04:55.000

What they can adopt. The even though you know technically they have rights to lord of the rings they can't cover anything in the third age.

00:04:55.000 --> 00:04:58.000

So.

00:04:58.000 --> 00:05:05.000

Oh my god, they really did. It calculated the number of helmets in that pile. That's massive.

00:05:05.000 --> 00:05:09.000

And the dude realized that he screwed it up and went back and corrected himself. Yeah.

00:05:09.000 --> 00:05:10.000

Oh my gosh.

00:05:10.000 --> 00:05:16.000

And went back and did it. Oh my god, I love nerds. Gosh, okay.

00:05:16.000 --> 00:05:18.000

I love him so much.

00:05:18.000 --> 00:05:24.000

I also really appreciate that the top comment still is still not enough.

00:05:24.000 --> 00:05:25.000

Hi.

00:05:25.000 --> 00:05:26.000

Yeah. Hmm.

00:05:26.000 --> 00:05:33.000

Yeah. Hmm.

00:05:33.000 --> 00:05:51.000

Mercury and Thames back and forth about Hall brand. Being saran. Yeah, like as I go back, I look at it and I'm like, yeah, they laid all of that groundwork.

00:05:51.000 --> 00:05:52.000

I feel you, man. I feel ya. I feel you.

00:05:52.000 --> 00:06:04.000

Even in ways that weren't just a mystery box. But I liked my other ideas better. I'm coming around but So I look through through our presentation from last year and was like, oh, yeah, remember when I thought that I like that idea.

00:06:04.000 --> 00:06:20.000

I do believe that they really are having. Good time and I really trying hard. To remain true to the feelings.

00:06:20.000 --> 00:06:21.000

Yeah. I think, go ahead.

00:06:21.000 --> 00:06:30.000

If not the exact letter of the books. In the stories. And That's not an easy road to go down.

00:06:30.000 --> 00:06:36.000

And cause there are nerds that will sit there and tell them, you missed this letter, you missed this.

00:06:36.000 --> 00:06:43.000

Apostrophe you missed this hyphen you know, and rake them over the calls for it.

00:06:43.000 --> 00:06:50.000

And I, you know, and Yeah, amongst other things making Gladriole more than just a whimpy woman.

00:06:50.000 --> 00:06:51.000

Hi.

00:06:51.000 --> 00:07:14.000

Which of course if you've read anything more, even if you've read closely like the Mirror of Galadriel chapter in Lord of the Rings, you wouldn't think that, but If you're basing your ideas on like you know, a broader cultural idea of who women should be, then Yeah, you might view, in that way you might miss those things.

00:07:14.000 --> 00:07:20.000

And so think that this is a deviation when in reality it's Just putting some of the text on screen.

00:07:20.000 --> 00:07:31.000

Yes. Yeah, well, like I said, you know, like. One of the first things I saw when I thought glad real fighting I went, yes.

00:07:31.000 --> 00:07:40.000

But I saw. You know, the fan boys going. How is she able to hold a sword?

00:07:40.000 --> 00:07:47.000

And I'm sitting there going. Did you read about the, at all?

00:07:47.000 --> 00:07:57.000

Yeah, I just, I really like, you know, I feel like, you know, she's, missing from so much of the second age that it.

00:07:57.000 --> 00:08:03.000

If you don't give her, give her something to do and give her a lot more. Agency then.

00:08:03.000 --> 00:08:10.000

How she's one of the few characters that you can really follow through the entirety of the legend.

00:08:10.000 --> 00:08:15.000

Not you can't really even do that with with Elrond. So it's sort of like.

00:08:15.000 --> 00:08:23.000

I, it's like she's like a natural choice, I think, to, get that, you know, that role too.

00:08:23.000 --> 00:08:24.000

Yeah.

00:08:24.000 --> 00:08:25.000

But. It's like her in like, or like the 2.

00:08:25.000 --> 00:08:34.000

Like I said, but you know, it's, she's, but she's. She's a woman, you know, you know, and like I said, that's the biggest problem is there's so many people just they're going, how can you let a woman, you know?

00:08:34.000 --> 00:08:46.000

Here's. There's definitely a strong strain of it feels very misogynistic. Or at least a lot of the commentary feels very crowded in the misogyny specifically.

00:08:46.000 --> 00:08:56.000

Like I don't know how angry people would have been if it, if it hadn't, you know, if it hadn't been, if it hadn't, you know, if it hadn't been, you know what I mean?

00:08:56.000 --> 00:08:57.000

It's like, it's like.

00:08:57.000 --> 00:09:01.000

There's an alternate version of this show that follows, I guess, is your other best possibility.

00:09:01.000 --> 00:09:09.000

And the first season is mostly just him sipping tea in the havens and the first season is mostly just him sipping tea in the havens and like tending his garden sipping tea in the havens and like tending his garden, I guess.



00:09:09.000 --> 00:09:10.000

Hey.

00:09:10.000 --> 00:09:11.000

Just chilling. Just chilling. Yeah, it's.

00:09:11.000 --> 00:09:17.000

You know. Oh, we, we can give the people what they say they want, but I don't think that's what the people want.

00:09:17.000 --> 00:09:18.000

Like a

00:09:18.000 --> 00:09:24.000

Yeah, it's sort of like. Yeah. So, so yeah, I don't know.

00:09:24.000 --> 00:09:31.000

I, yeah, I'm kind of like, I'll really, enjoy a lot about this show.

00:09:31.000 --> 00:09:39.000

I also like I completely understand like there's some really valid criticisms and it frustrates me.

00:09:39.000 --> 00:09:47.000

And I know like I'm talking like directly to you, Alicia basically, like I know that we've discussed on our show.

00:09:47.000 --> 00:10:06.000

That. How frustrating it is to to not be able to kind of give criticisms and talk about the things that we have issues with because we're being drowned out over a lot of the really awful stuff like the misogyny and the racism.

00:10:06.000 --> 00:10:28.000

So it kind of, it kind of pushes you into a position of being. You know, like put on the defensive, I guess, which is really unfair, I think, to a lot of people, who who have issues with this show who have valid issues with this show, you know?

00:10:28.000 --> 00:10:33.000

But yeah, you're so busy. Depending.

00:10:33.000 --> 00:10:34.000

Yeah, that's

00:10:34.000 --> 00:10:46.000

Well, and that is 100% why I dropped out of this panel. I dropped out of this panel because I am I've just disengaged because I'm so I'm so sick of having to couch every single critique I have of the show and all of this.

00:10:46.000 --> 00:10:51.000

The show is not horrible. I'm not a racist. I just think that it's bullshit.

00:10:51.000 --> 00:10:53.000

They randomly decided that habits are in the second age, even though we have no fucking canonical evidence of it.

00:10:53.000 --> 00:11:09.000

Like that sort of thing. And I just, I, it's, going back to what we were talking about in our hell as other people panel it is wearying.

00:11:09.000 --> 00:11:10.000

To have to constantly do that.

00:11:10.000 --> 00:11:25.000

Yeah. Yeah, yeah. I'm Yeah, I'm kind of like, yeah, I'm like, I'm definitely in the position where like, you know, like I enjoy a lot about a lot this show and I also like I hold space for.

00:11:25.000 --> 00:11:33.000

For people being tired for sure.

00:11:33.000 --> 00:11:41.000

And so like there are things that I absolutely critique about the show and it's like I to the point where I've been like, okay, we're gonna have a discussion about it.

00:11:41.000 --> 00:11:52.000

We're gonna have a positive discussion over here in a negative discussion over here. We're going to be in separate threads because It's all interwoven, but we can we can have different framework.

00:11:52.000 --> 00:12:09.000

So. I wanted to talk more positively at the front. Of this and then you know put some of the positive things and so that when we have critique, it's grounded in critique instead of vitriolic hatred like so much of the internet discussion.

00:12:09.000 --> 00:12:16.000

It immediately devolves to.

00:12:16.000 --> 00:12:17.000

Yeah.

00:12:17.000 --> 00:12:20.000

Yeah, the internet, the internet rage machine. Takes life out of all of us and it wears me out.

00:12:20.000 --> 00:12:31.000

And it sucks because it takes a lot of the subtlety. Yeah, it takes a lot of the subtlety out of potential criticism.

00:12:31.000 --> 00:12:32.000

Yeah.

00:12:32.000 --> 00:12:41.000

Which is, you know, valid and understandable, right? As you know, people. You know, you get you some people get lumped in with the trolls because they didn't like something even if they are being respectful about their dislike or whatever, right?

00:12:41.000 --> 00:12:42.000

Yeah. Yeah.

00:12:42.000 --> 00:12:43.000

Yeah.

00:12:43.000 --> 00:12:49.000

Saying I don't like this and you have to not like it too is different than saying I don't like it, but if you like it, that's fine.

00:12:49.000 --> 00:12:50.000

Yeah.

00:12:50.000 --> 00:12:54.000

Yeah, it's just like, you know, it for me, I was sitting there going, what are the habits doing in the second age?

00:12:54.000 --> 00:13:01.000

Yeah, I'm one of those people. But I think what they did with the habits is interesting.

00:13:01.000 --> 00:13:10.000

And so as a result. I'm still sitting there right what are the habits doing in the second age but I'm not throwing out the baby with the bathwater.

00:13:10.000 --> 00:13:11.000

You know.

00:13:11.000 --> 00:13:12.000

Okay.

00:13:12.000 --> 00:13:21.000

The Hartfords are such a great example of like what for me, like they worked on the first viewing and I'm now to the point where I'm like, I feel like a bad person because I every time I rewatch now I kind of like if I'm rewatching for a purpose or whatever it can just skip those parts.

00:13:21.000 --> 00:13:34.000

Because I don't have this much sustained enjoyment of it. But I never want to start with like, oh, I don't like the Hartford because that's a loaded thing in discussion and all that.

00:13:34.000 --> 00:13:40.000

Like I do like the Harvey's. They're just not my favorite part of this.

00:13:40.000 --> 00:13:41.000

And to be honest.

00:13:41.000 --> 00:13:42.000

Yeah. It feels like you're opening a door. Yeah, go ahead.

00:13:42.000 --> 00:13:43.000

Yeah.

00:13:43.000 --> 00:13:44.000

They're not, yeah, not as.

00:13:44.000 --> 00:13:53.000

I really, I kind of agree with the shows producers when I found that quote and I forgot which magazine we've seen Chris will get you there in just a sec.

00:13:53.000 --> 00:13:56.000

That the Hey, kind of doesn't feel like middle earth without them, especially to a new audience, right?

00:13:56.000 --> 00:14:13.000

That that's definitely the singular, most recognizable. Thing about Tolkien's work to the lay person is a hobby.

00:14:13.000 --> 00:14:14.000

Hmm.

00:14:14.000 --> 00:14:18.000

And so especially in the interest of promoting a show, get them in there, get them there fast and we see through the season.

00:14:18.000 --> 00:14:29.000

Even that they become less and less featured as we keep going on. Although I think they're gonna still keep poking their heads up.

00:14:29.000 --> 00:14:31.000

Anyway, Chris.

00:14:31.000 --> 00:14:32.000

Yeah. Yeah. Yeah.

00:14:32.000 --> 00:14:37.000

So, we are into our section. Chris, I'll come on you first, but we do have a couple of just preface slides before we get started just because wanted to just frame our conversations.

00:14:37.000 --> 00:14:43.000

Here a little bit.

00:14:43.000 --> 00:14:45.000

Speaking of all the things we've been talking about.

00:14:45.000 --> 00:14:46.000

Yeah.

00:14:46.000 --> 00:14:47.000

Yeah.

00:14:47.000 --> 00:14:48.000

Tim, do you want me to screen share again for a couple of minutes here?

00:14:48.000 --> 00:14:52.000

Yes.

00:14:52.000 --> 00:14:53.000

So welcome to the second part of our Rings of Power panel where we will be having just sort of open discussion.

00:14:53.000 --> 00:15:04.000

Everybody feel free doesn't have to be formal. We can kind of just, you know, just speak out.

00:15:04.000 --> 00:15:21.000

But we, Yeah, next slide. Next slide again. So we just want to acknowledge and we did talk about this a lot during the first part of our panel that talking second age writings are very fragmentary.

00:15:21.000 --> 00:15:28.000

They're mostly unfinished and even often contradictory. There's places where Tolkien contradicts himself because it was on published material a lot of the time.

00:15:28.000 --> 00:15:43.000

And really significant gaps do exist in the narratives and timeline for canon characters. There is hundreds or thousands of years where elves are just unaccounted for.

00:15:43.000 --> 00:15:44.000

Yeah.

00:15:44.000 --> 00:15:48.000

And so, you know, there's space in there for, hey, this person was doing X at time z kind of thing.

00:15:48.000 --> 00:16:04.000

And the Tolkien estate was well where. This material, the second age material particularly from where the rings in the habit mostly to Amazon to create a series that was focused on the second age.

00:16:04.000 --> 00:16:15.000

And rings of power is simply another adaptation slash interpretation of Tolkien's writings.

00:16:15.000 --> 00:16:16.000

Yeah.



00:16:16.000 --> 00:16:18.000

Next slide, please. Much like All of them. Okay, they are very widely different interpretations of columns.

00:16:18.000 --> 00:16:20.000

Good.

00:16:20.000 --> 00:16:26.000

None of them broke, Golm. None of the Roke Tolkien's original works in any way, shape or form.

00:16:26.000 --> 00:16:34.000

You can always still go back to them. One of these we're going to be viewing a little bit later.

00:16:34.000 --> 00:16:35.000

Okay.

00:16:35.000 --> 00:16:38.000

I'll let you maybe decide which one that might be. One of my favorites is, is swollen down there in the bottom.

00:16:38.000 --> 00:16:39.000

Yeah.

00:16:39.000 --> 00:16:42.000

You got the bottom left corner. That's from the new. New staging of the Lord of the Rings musical.

00:16:42.000 --> 00:16:53.000

So, you know, there's room for all of these different interpretations to exist simultaneously, they don't damage the original.

00:16:53.000 --> 00:16:56.000

Next slide, please.

00:16:56.000 --> 00:17:04.000

With that in mind, rings of power, we are well aware has been divisive, and, fans, you know, to 2 sense.

00:17:04.000 --> 00:17:11.000

Media response and criticism is very highly subjective. It's our Not everybody is gonna agree on it.

00:17:11.000 --> 00:17:14.000

We just wanna keep this discussion constructive and respectful. For instance, I hated rings of power.

00:17:14.000 --> 00:17:29.000

Is not constructive or black elves don't exist is not particularly constructive, but I found this element of season one to be an interesting choice because That's more constructive conversation that we can have.

00:17:29.000 --> 00:17:32.000

So with that, Chris, please start us off. Yeah.

00:17:32.000 --> 00:17:40.000

Oh Okay. I don't know if I'm on screen or not because I've got this.

00:17:40.000 --> 00:17:45.000

Okay. I just want something came up about the habits and What are they doing in the second age?

00:17:45.000 --> 00:17:53.000

Well, this is from the prologue to the fellowship of the ring. It's on page 11.

00:17:53.000 --> 00:18:05.000

And this is what it says, the beginning. Of Hobbit's lies far back in the elder days that are now lost and forgotten.

00:18:05.000 --> 00:18:08.000

That's a direct quote from the prologue. And the other days, I mean, okay, that's ambiguous.

00:18:08.000 --> 00:18:22.000

And technically, it's ambitious because After the end of the third age. The first 3 ages were then referred to as the elder days.

00:18:22.000 --> 00:18:31.000

From the perspective of the fourth age, but it's very problematic to interpret this as meaning that the habits lies far back.

00:18:31.000 --> 00:18:48.000

In some general it time during the first or third age. I think it's pretty clear that when Tolkien wrote this, he meant that the that the habits go back to the first age they just were not known about and that's That's how I read that sentence.

00:18:48.000 --> 00:18:58.000

The beginning of Hobbit slice far back in the elder days that are now lost and forgotten. So the fact that they are there.

00:18:58.000 --> 00:18:59.000

Yeah.

00:18:59.000 --> 00:19:03.000

Alright, I'm gonna say my piece and I'm gonna share it up, okay? Cause I've had this, so many times.

00:19:03.000 --> 00:19:10.000

When you're looking at the prologue of the Lord of the Rings, you're looking at the kind of framing story of the translation. And blah, blah, blah.

00:19:10.000 --> 00:19:26.000

When you go through the actual text, there is a conversation surrounding a golem and how golem was a sort of I'm gonna paraphrase here a sort of proto-hobbit and he remembers from when he was young.

00:19:26.000 --> 00:19:41.000

Old stories surrounding the battles of the last alliance and that area and if he is a proto habit and his institutional like cultural knowledge only goes back to the last of Alliance.

00:19:41.000 --> 00:19:47.000

I don't think it makes a lot of sense for Hobbits to be that far back in the second age.

00:19:47.000 --> 00:19:58.000

Now granted, we don't know about. Evolution and all of that within middle Earth, that's kind of outside the scope of this, but.

00:19:58.000 --> 00:19:59.000

I mean.

00:19:59.000 --> 00:20:08.000

I think that it is, perfectly reasonable to read older days in this context as with in the context of when these stories are being written.

00:20:08.000 --> 00:20:12.000

And I have said.

00:20:12.000 --> 00:20:34.000

That's reasonable. That's a reasonable reading. But I would say that given that Golem knows about the last alliance and in what we're watching in the, of power, the last alliance is only a few 100 years in the future.

00:20:34.000 --> 00:20:35.000

Hmm.

00:20:35.000 --> 00:20:40.000

And so I would say that there were habits back then and I would say that there were habits back then and I would say that there were habits back then and I would say that because that the point about

00:20:40.000 --> 00:20:58.000

The, actually reinforces that at least back into the end of the second age there were certainly habits where they came from before then But it pushes the reference to elder days back beyond the third age and therefore makes it seem more likely to refer.

00:20:58.000 --> 00:21:10.000

To the elder days from the point of view of the third age, which means the first age, which means that habits were around.

00:21:10.000 --> 00:21:11.000

Hmm.

00:21:11.000 --> 00:21:17.000

Nobody, you know, they weren't in the histories, but they were around. And so that adaptation where you want to.

00:21:17.000 --> 00:21:18.000

As the ceiling.

00:21:18.000 --> 00:21:22.000

Talk about things that aren't recorded, it makes sense to have habits. But that's One, that's just one reading of the data.

00:21:22.000 --> 00:21:35.000

I have a feeling that if you took the writers room for season one out for a couple of rounds at the pub, they would be willing to admit that they know it's a stretch, but it's a plausible stretch.

00:21:35.000 --> 00:21:36.000

You know.

00:21:36.000 --> 00:21:44.000

Yeah, I suspect that you're right. I kind of feel like. Yeah, I kind of feel like they might have had to make some.

00:21:44.000 --> 00:21:55.000

Some compromises. particularly around, the Hobbit, around the Harper, I should say, and, how they kind of fit into things.

00:21:55.000 --> 00:22:05.000

I do kind of, I should say, and how, how they kind of fit into things. I do kind of, I do kind of feel like, you know, that point about, you know, not really knowing how like evolutionary works and how,

00:22:05.000 --> 00:22:11.000

See how evolution comes into it. We're only talking about a few 1,000 years. But anyway, go ahead.

00:22:11.000 --> 00:22:12.000

Sorry.

00:22:12.000 --> 00:22:16.000

Well, I was going to say that we don't have a whole lot of stories from a few 1,000 years ago in our own history.

00:22:16.000 --> 00:22:40.000

We have a handful. You know we have what you know like probably the strongest remnants of what We told around, you know, campfires and stuff, or in fairytales really, but we don't have We don't have all of the stories that the ancient Egyptians told one another.

00:22:40.000 --> 00:22:48.000

We don't have all the stories that we, you know, the ancient classical Greeks told one another and they wrote a lot of those down.

00:22:48.000 --> 00:22:54.000

And they were lost a lot of them too. And so it's sort of like I kind of feel like.

00:22:54.000 --> 00:22:59.000

Yeah, I kind of feel like that there's a lot of. There's a lot of room for.

00:22:59.000 --> 00:23:15.000

Some, historical, historical realism in a way and kind of a historical. Look who I guess to kind of give this some space to.

00:23:15.000 --> 00:23:19.000

To do things in, you know.

00:23:19.000 --> 00:23:27.000

There's also, just a piece from the Council of Elron chapter in Lord of the Rings and Fellowship.

00:23:27.000 --> 00:23:39.000

Where. Basically just sort of lensingly admits that you know the L and records don't they don't really have much on habits they've Never really paid attention to them.

00:23:39.000 --> 00:23:56.000

So some of the record keeping and the gaps in knowledge within the context of this secondary world allow room for mistakes or omissions in the historical record.

00:23:56.000 --> 00:24:15.000

My question would be what would the alternative be? What would Where in the habits come from? I mean, In 3,000 years you suddenly have this.

00:24:15.000 --> 00:24:16.000

What?

00:24:16.000 --> 00:24:23.000

Population of miniature people. They had to come from somewhere. Biology and history works. He didn't just, you know, he knew that it was implausible to suppose that the Hobbies didn't exist.

00:24:23.000 --> 00:24:33.000

But he also wrote the origin story of the doors as you know, alla, they, they, sprung up, cause, Al, Allay, invented them.

00:24:33.000 --> 00:24:34.000

So, you know, there's

00:24:34.000 --> 00:24:44.000

You have that kind of story for the Hobbits. It still had to happen sometime. It had, you know, and we're just, we're not talking about enough time for it to happen.

00:24:44.000 --> 00:24:52.000

After the end of the second age. So it's, it just see it's a fact that the hobbies existed in the second age.

00:24:52.000 --> 00:25:01.000



Let's just depict them. I mean, to me, it's just simple logic, but I realize that that varies from person to person.

00:25:01.000 --> 00:25:09.000

And I think the reason why it makes the most compelling, what the most compelling argument for why adaptationally they're put in is that.

00:25:09.000 --> 00:25:31.000

Yeah, we can make the argument that they should or shouldn't be there, but it's the statement that they've made of that people who aren't particularly familiar with the writings of the second age, which encompasses a lot of token fans as well as very casual viewers are expecting habits and wizards and battles and elves.

00:25:31.000 --> 00:25:40.000

And if they're only going to give, give the 2 of those things. Their understanding that that's not going to meet people's expectations and they're not going to meet the moment.

00:25:40.000 --> 00:25:48.000

Hey, that's true. Though I think arguing that IS what invites people to argue against it and say, well, but I don't want that.

00:25:48.000 --> 00:25:54.000

And so therefore, if your only logic is that it ought to be there for dramatic reasons, then I don't think it should be there.

00:25:54.000 --> 00:25:59.000

But I'm thinking that it ought to be there for a logical reasons, for the whole idea of having a consistent world.

00:25:59.000 --> 00:26:01.000

There's

00:26:01.000 --> 00:26:11.000

I mean, there are a lot of things that you could throw in that wouldn't be logical, but if you're gonna approach it from that point of view of.

00:26:11.000 --> 00:26:29.000

Trying to extrapolate from what you know from the third age histories and what you know, the few things you know from the second age.

00:26:29.000 --> 00:26:30.000

There's also we talk about like.

00:26:30.000 --> 00:26:35.000

Then a few things are pretty obvious. And I agree, what's obvious is very subjective. So, you know, but me, it's all, there would be habits or something like in the second age.

00:26:35.000 --> 00:26:36.000

So that.

00:26:36.000 --> 00:26:42.000

We often talk about loyalist reasons for something. This is based in, you know, Sherlock Holmes, Arthur Conan Doyle, right?

00:26:42.000 --> 00:26:51.000

Doyleist reasons why an event occurs is because the author or creator or creative minds behind it put it in for a real world.

00:26:51.000 --> 00:27:01.000

Reason, which you know, and talking about Sherlock Holmes like, well, you know, the author forgot that this piece of continuity was supposed to exist or forgot this or just invented it then.

00:27:01.000 --> 00:27:17.000

And there's Watsonian reasons, which is like, oh, no, well, you know, Watson didn't record this or he was leaving it out for a particular reason.

00:27:17.000 --> 00:27:18.000

Hmm.

00:27:18.000 --> 00:27:22.000

There's an in world explanation for it. So I think this might be a place where there's a Doyleist reason why habits exist and a Watsonian explanation that we can look to for it.

00:27:22.000 --> 00:27:23.000

Good way of looking at.

00:27:23.000 --> 00:27:27.000

Yeah.

00:27:27.000 --> 00:27:28.000

What is the dog?

00:27:28.000 --> 00:27:39.000

Well, yeah, that one was bound to come up, I think. If you all indulge me, we can go back and talk about our predictions for season 3 and beyond.

00:27:39.000 --> 00:27:40.000

Yes, let's do that.

00:27:40.000 --> 00:27:47.000

Grace, can you share slides and then we do have some sort of. A discussion primers as well if we need them.

00:27:47.000 --> 00:27:51.000

Yeah, I was gonna say I kind of doubt that we're gonna need them. Considering, but.

00:27:51.000 --> 00:27:54.000

We've already filled 15 min.

00:27:54.000 --> 00:27:57.000

What's gonna say? We've done pretty well so far, so.

00:27:57.000 --> 00:28:00.000

I think we're a talkative bunch over here. Let me.

00:28:00.000 --> 00:28:01.000

Yeah.

00:28:01.000 --> 00:28:02.000

Yeah.

00:28:02.000 --> 00:28:06.000

Definitely. Me at least.

00:28:06.000 --> 00:28:10.000

Trying to get back to here. Season. To protect predictions we did so we were on season 3.

00:28:10.000 --> 00:28:13.000

Alright, so we did, yeah, we did season 2. 3. So season 3, and this is basically hasn't changed very much since.

00:28:13.000 --> 00:28:35.000

Our rings a power book club last year, but season 3 seems to be. Probably fall around the war of the, Where we get kill over and banner, who knows how they're at, how graphic they're actually gonna make.

00:28:35.000 --> 00:28:51.000

The banner. We'll see. Founding of lost, Lauren by Giladriol and then, our far is on the golden around this time might usurp the specter.

00:28:51.000 --> 00:28:54.000

Spector, sceptre of new, we've been talking too much about afterlife stuff.

00:28:54.000 --> 00:28:55.000

Yeah.

00:28:55.000 --> 00:29:05.000

Okay. And this at this point, would be taken prisoner at Newman or seduces actual language.

00:29:05.000 --> 00:29:09.000

Although Mercury will probably

00:29:09.000 --> 00:29:15.000

Okay.

00:29:15.000 --> 00:29:19.000

They are correct, but I can always hope.

00:29:19.000 --> 00:29:20.000

That's gonna say we can always hope.

00:29:20.000 --> 00:29:34.000

Tell us that they probably won't actually show. Turning the Yeah, it'd be an interesting choice to ignore that for Sauron and Keller.

00:29:34.000 --> 00:29:35.000

Quick coated villains, my friend.

00:29:35.000 --> 00:29:38.000

And then. For a hour on, but. And then, It's true.

00:29:38.000 --> 00:29:43.000

Turning the newanorians away from the light of A and the valor. Next, please.

00:29:43.000 --> 00:29:55.000

And season 4 and anyway feel free to jump in if you have comments or think that we're way off but then you know new manorian civil war falls on i mean basically once we get to a point.

00:29:55.000 --> 00:30:10.000

It's domino's right everything just sort of falls one after the other, you know, we don't know exactly where they're gonna insert, you know, Gand off in the Harfoot's into some of the later seasons.

00:30:10.000 --> 00:30:11.000

Right.

00:30:11.000 --> 00:30:15.000

I mean, right now the Harleets are kind of off doing their own thing. It's just great and the stranger slash I'm pretty sure again off.

00:30:15.000 --> 00:30:16.000

Yeah.

00:30:16.000 --> 00:30:24.000

They've hinted that we can't be guaranteed to see all of the sets of characters that we saw in season one in season 2.

00:30:24.000 --> 00:30:25.000

And.

00:30:25.000 --> 00:30:32.000

Yeah, I kind of, I, my feeling about this entire timeline, I mean, maybe all, but I'll wait until we get into the entire seasons to go for it.

00:30:32.000 --> 00:30:38.000

Oh, sure. So then you have our fires on in the new Minorians doing a very ill fated boat trip to Eleanor and being defeated.

00:30:38.000 --> 00:30:51.000

Then fall of Newman or we've already seen that tweet teased with Muriel's dream of the inlectable wave and, Lindy and Sons.

00:30:51.000 --> 00:31:07.000

I mean, we know we, there's there and Arian has been mentioned that hasn't showed up yet we have no casting for an ARE either who knows maybe in Arnon's over on the west coast of Arda or something doing something there and we'll end up seeing him in later seasons.

00:31:07.000 --> 00:31:13.000

But you know, presumably I'll end deal and sons will save the seedling of and then we would have the founding of the realms in exile.

00:31:13.000 --> 00:31:27.000

So the founding of our Nora and Gondor by, Descendants. And then season 5 is.

00:31:27.000 --> 00:31:34.000

All hell breaks loose, are on a tax gone door, burns the white tree. This is where we could have the NASCLE coming in.

00:31:34.000 --> 00:31:35.000

This is kind of closes everything up full circle with, Lord of the Rings in the Hobbit.

00:31:35.000 --> 00:32:02.000

You know, so we'd have those 3 lords of Newman or we're not sure if we've met them yet, but there are 3 lords of doom and or that do end up as and then I think probably the, you know, the couple of huge set pieces, that will kind of finale this, the series will be the last alliance of, of, of, and.

00:32:02.000 --> 00:32:09.000

and, the, of, and then the defeat of, and then we have basically right up to the prologue to the, and then the defeat of Sauron.

00:32:09.000 --> 00:32:15.000

And then we have basically right up to the prologue to the Peter Jackson Lord of the Rings movies, the war of the last alliance.

00:32:15.000 --> 00:32:40.000

Have the death of the Wendy, Gill Gallard and Orifer who we haven't met yet but is canonically kicking around at this point and is all of the other of the last alliance and we might even see sealed we're refusing to we might even be recreating the from the Peter Jackson movies and you know, That would again kind of bring us full circle.

00:32:40.000 --> 00:32:54.000

So any does anybody think there's anything that I haven't said that we might see? There is stuff where that you know it doesn't necessarily fit in the narrative, but they could go back and pull from it.

00:32:54.000 --> 00:32:55.000

So.



00:32:55.000 --> 00:33:08.000

There is something that I'm going to point out, but I'm also gonna preface this with, I understand that folks have different ideas or comfort levels with spoilers based on, you know, what's in the text versus information that may have leaked from the show.

00:33:08.000 --> 00:33:15.000

This is going to be an information that may have leaked one. If you want to go ahead and mute me for a second, I will give you a thumbs up when I when I am done talking about it.

00:33:15.000 --> 00:33:33.000

But, we have seen a, an image of a full face. Passed for Kellibrimore with eyes closed that appears to look like perhaps a death mask or.

00:33:33.000 --> 00:33:39.000

Or, you know, the sort of prop that they would use for calibre and banner.

00:33:39.000 --> 00:33:50.000

And if they've already made that that was the last year and if they've already made that either they're working very far ahead or we might see that if those set of events in season 2.

00:33:50.000 --> 00:33:54.000

Which does sort of depress my hopes for, A lot of really good anatar calibre more content.

00:33:54.000 --> 00:34:07.000

I'm just not sure not certain that that's gonna bode well for my hopes but Yeah.

00:34:07.000 --> 00:34:11.000

Yeah. My feeling is that our season, 5 predictions are probably going to be the most the most correct.

00:34:11.000 --> 00:34:35.000

Like I kind of feel like it's difficult to think of a timeline in which. In which the basically the last alliance and the bounding of Gondor and Arnor, aren't kind of like the central questions of season 5.

00:34:35.000 --> 00:34:46.000

It's it's in the in between parts, but I'm kind of like, I think this can be kind of fast and loose because we weren't expecting the forging of the 3 rings in season one.

00:34:46.000 --> 00:34:48.000

So it's kind of like. I kind of feel like things will be a lot more fluid in season 2 through 4.

00:34:48.000 --> 00:34:59.000

I feel like it's sort of like we can kind of track where it'll be like.

00:34:59.000 --> 00:35:14.000

At least the second half of season 4 will be. You know, the Al Qaeda and the founder of Newman order and the founding of Gondo and Arnor in the last alliance, but it's sort of like.

00:35:14.000 --> 00:35:25.000

In between, it's kind of like what's that gonna look like? I think that's kind of a little bit more up in the air, especially with, the time compression that we're doing.

00:35:25.000 --> 00:35:27.000

So.

00:35:27.000 --> 00:35:37.000

In my recent rewatch I also noticed there are a lot of hints dropped in the dialogue about the western coast, NUMBER, L LENEELS family and their northern relatives.

00:35:37.000 --> 00:35:46.000

This should be good, you know, groundwork. Building for, for, you know, those folks being on ships that sail away instead of, you know, follow up on.

00:35:46.000 --> 00:36:11.000

But I wonder if we're actually gonna get to see that in this upcoming season, and be able to see some of that, those tensions within NUMAN or rising, even with like, or, his daughter created for the show ARE and like going and meeting some of those family members so like that.

00:36:11.000 --> 00:36:12.000

Right.

00:36:12.000 --> 00:36:21.000

Right? Like are we going to finally get to see an audience who is, in the show, you know, he's off on the West Coast, I think, of Newman order and doesn't really speak to his family anymore.

00:36:21.000 --> 00:36:22.000

Yeah.

00:36:22.000 --> 00:36:27.000

And I mean, I kind of They're not gonna leave a sealed door, under that pile of rubble for very long.

00:36:27.000 --> 00:36:28.000

Yes.

00:36:28.000 --> 00:36:38.000

So I think that if that's going to be another interesting question to see how long it takes. How long it takes

00:36:38.000 --> 00:36:39.000

Counterpoint counterpoint.

00:36:39.000 --> 00:36:40.000

You know, he's, he's totally dead. He's not coming back. That would be, that would be a choice.

00:36:40.000 --> 00:36:42.000

Oh no. That would be a big choice.

00:36:42.000 --> 00:36:46.000

Counterpoint idea. It's not the Harper's that we're not going to see in season 2.

00:36:46.000 --> 00:36:47.000

It's a seldom, he's just lying there waiting for his horse the whole season.

00:36:47.000 --> 00:36:50.000

The whole time. The whole time panic is just like looking for him. Oh god. Yeah.

00:36:50.000 --> 00:36:58.000

There There! And Barrett's like, no, you threw away my apple.

00:36:58.000 --> 00:36:59.000

Yeah.

00:36:59.000 --> 00:37:00.000

Okay. You jerk, he threw an apple.

00:37:00.000 --> 00:37:06.000

That was one of the strangest choices. I should have put it in the slide show, throwing away a happy, when you could have fed it to any of those horses.

00:37:06.000 --> 00:37:08.000

I was.

00:37:08.000 --> 00:37:09.000

Yes.

00:37:09.000 --> 00:37:17.000

Yeah, terrible choice. What a terrible choice. Yeah, like how long is it gonna take basically for a sealed order to get to get back to, and, will that.

00:37:17.000 --> 00:37:37.000

Cause, you know, will that like, well, you go back to his father first, will he maybe try to get over to what our N is and see, you know, kind of kind of shake things up a little bit in that way.

00:37:37.000 --> 00:37:38.000

For a long time.

00:37:38.000 --> 00:37:44.000

Or I wonder what storytelling utility there would be in having him in Middle Earth for a little while longer before returning like there may be some things that surprise me and I go was that was not on my bingo card but okay I see why we did that.

00:37:44.000 --> 00:37:49.000

And there are good to be things like, well, that was a choice. Chris.

00:37:49.000 --> 00:37:56.000

Yeah, I was gonna say we know that. Is that what? What's your name?

00:37:56.000 --> 00:37:58.000

Yori?

00:37:58.000 --> 00:37:59.000

No, right.

00:37:59.000 --> 00:38:10.000

The, the, Nori and Wizard are on their way to rooms. So I mean, it seems hard to believe that, how many episodes we have in the second season that we're not gonna see room.

00:38:10.000 --> 00:38:11.000

Hmm.

00:38:11.000 --> 00:38:26.000

I mean, that's I mean that seems pretty straightforward. What that means is going to happen except, you know, there's We know what we know a little tiny, details about the, and their relation to Sara.

00:38:26.000 --> 00:38:32.000

And I think that's something that's going to be explored in. Second season.

00:38:32.000 --> 00:38:44.000

And I think depiction of the Easterlings will be really interesting to see because historically they are depicted with, you know, a lot of that orientalism kind of, aesthetic.

00:38:44.000 --> 00:38:45.000

So how

00:38:45.000 --> 00:38:48.000

So how is how is Amazon gonna deal with that because Yeah.

00:38:48.000 --> 00:38:59.000

Yeah, and I mean, and they've already, they've already shown that they're trying to shy away from the sort of xenophobe like othering a billing characters with making the orcs a lot lighter in skin tone.

00:38:59.000 --> 00:39:07.000

Most of the orcs a lot lighter in skin tone than the Peter Jackson movies or a lot of other adaptations or even fan art or.

00:39:07.000 --> 00:39:08.000

Right.

00:39:08.000 --> 00:39:11.000

Interpretations have done so that'll be interesting.

00:39:11.000 --> 00:39:34.000

There's always the unfortunate question of how. The very vocal and ill-behaved sections of the internet are going to react to those characterizations because there's been a lot of statements so far along the lines of, I don't want to derail us too much into this, but along the lines of, well, new manorian characters, these characters shouldn't be people of color, the only people

00:39:34.000 --> 00:39:50.000

of color should be the Easterlings should be the hard dream. So there's there is definitely some racism that is given some piping hot takes online.

00:39:50.000 --> 00:39:51.000

Uncharted.

00:39:51.000 --> 00:39:53.000

But an interesting question is what are, going to be doing and why are they going there and what's going to happen?

00:39:53.000 --> 00:40:05.000

I mean, If you start thinking about the possibilities that they sort of transcend any sort of. We have to have negativity about it.

00:40:05.000 --> 00:40:06.000

Yeah.

00:40:06.000 --> 00:40:07.000

And part of me likes that because it's Yeah, and it's uncharted territory, right?

00:40:07.000 --> 00:40:11.000

Because that, you know, none of that is anywhere in the books. It's all filling in blanks.

00:40:11.000 --> 00:40:21.000

And so it's kind of nice for those of us that have read all the second age content to have some areas where we really don't know what's gonna happen and where we're gonna go.

00:40:21.000 --> 00:40:29.000

We have some really vague things about in the deep history, the first age history of men coming from that direction and what they did.

00:40:29.000 --> 00:40:36.000

And I just imagine that. Just seeing what happened in the first season and the things they tried to pull together.

00:40:36.000 --> 00:40:43.000

That they're aware of all the, you know, all the little details and are working on ways to.

00:40:43.000 --> 00:40:47.000

Hi, tie them together, but you know, we'll see.



00:40:47.000 --> 00:40:53.000

So we've been monopolizing the conversation a little bit. Anybody else in the audience that wants to voice an opinion or throw out a

00:40:53.000 --> 00:40:56.000

Did I see Andrew wanting to talk?

00:40:56.000 --> 00:41:02.000

Sure. I think Andrew said earlier he he was gonna come with some questions.

00:41:02.000 --> 00:41:10.000

I don't necessarily have any questions right now because I got here so late that I'm kind of, this kind of seeing what you guys are saying right now, but.

00:41:10.000 --> 00:41:11.000

We're all chatting now, so if you have any. Okay.

00:41:11.000 --> 00:41:24.000

I am I am kind of this I am sick of the casting like you know the issues that people you know the vocal fan base and the vocal minority that has to Good, mad about casting and those decisions that I was just.

00:41:24.000 --> 00:41:25.000

Okay.

00:41:25.000 --> 00:41:33.000

Yeah, it holds us back from having the more nuanced conversations, right?

00:41:33.000 --> 00:41:40.000

Well, we also do have some discussion points sort of, pre loaded as well. Grace, if you like to pop up.

00:41:40.000 --> 00:41:41.000

I don't see many of those weekend. I go.

00:41:41.000 --> 00:41:46.000

I had something else that I wanted to broach and talk about. I just didn't want it monopolize the whole conversation.

00:41:46.000 --> 00:41:47.000

Yeah.

00:41:47.000 --> 00:41:48.000

Yeah.

00:41:48.000 --> 00:41:51.000

But there was, just something that I wanted to broach and talk about. I just didn't want to monopolize the whole conversation.

00:41:51.000 --> 00:41:56.000

But there was, just something that I wanted to bring up because we've made a lot of, you know, like jokes and wisecracks that are actually pretty genuinely felt about.

00:41:56.000 --> 00:42:12.000

Sauron and his fair guises and the way that he beguiles or seduces characters like Keller, BOAR and FARZAN.

00:42:12.000 --> 00:42:34.000

I wanted to just acknowledge that there's a tension between its 2023 and we could be representing this in a much more nuanced way and also there are a lot of really reductive views of folks who, who would absolutely pitch a fit if anything were made, even marginally more textual.

00:42:34.000 --> 00:42:36.000

And I don't. I don't know how you would as a showrunner thread that needle.

00:42:36.000 --> 00:42:50.000

Selfishly I wish they would just work to please me. That'd be great. But I do wish that they were a little bit more at least overtly some textual if that makes sense in some of these things.

00:42:50.000 --> 00:43:12.000

I remember a talk that Mercury gave and just in the comment section I have this actually written down on my desk at work because I was tuning in from work about how when it comes to representation, certainly things that were adapted in the past.

00:43:12.000 --> 00:43:22.000

You know. It their products at their time kind of thing all that but things that are done now need to be overt and not shy away.

00:43:22.000 --> 00:43:32.000

And I think that this is the place where rings of power, much as I enjoy it, is probably going to disappoint its queer audiences.

00:43:32.000 --> 00:43:40.000

I'm prepared for that, sadly.

00:43:40.000 --> 00:43:41.000

Yeah.

00:43:41.000 --> 00:43:42.000

Already disappointing their queer audiences. As far as I am concerned.

00:43:42.000 --> 00:43:43.000

Yeah, I just, I just wrote.

00:43:43.000 --> 00:43:49.000

I do love Sara, and, it's underwear going like, hello, the Keller Brimport, I just wanted in an episode of that.

00:43:49.000 --> 00:43:50.000

Oh my.

00:43:50.000 --> 00:43:51.000

The Calabamba. Oh my, I've heard all about you.

00:43:51.000 --> 00:43:55.000

I needed more minutes of that, okay?

00:43:55.000 --> 00:43:56.000

Yeah, 100 100% agreed.

00:43:56.000 --> 00:44:07.000

Yeah, I don't really wanna get like super in the weeds on this, but. What?

00:44:07.000 --> 00:44:12.000

And it makes me very unhappy.

00:44:12.000 --> 00:44:14.000

Yeah.

00:44:14.000 --> 00:44:17.000

Why? Because queer men can't seduce women. Is that what you're saying?

00:44:17.000 --> 00:44:29.000

I am saying he is seducing a woman as opposed to seducing calibre who is who is supposed to be canonically.

00:44:29.000 --> 00:44:30.000

So, where is if we?

00:44:30.000 --> 00:44:31.000

Because in the Yeah.

00:44:31.000 --> 00:44:32.000

Well, it was much easier to seduce, that's all.

00:44:32.000 --> 00:44:33.000

Yeah.

00:44:33.000 --> 00:44:34.000

That's what.

00:44:34.000 --> 00:44:45.000

And if we got a little bit more of that. Of leaning into that like using some of the same versions of techniques on Galadriol and Kellabrimba and there was some equal screen time.

00:44:45.000 --> 00:44:55.000

Yeah, sure you get like the evil bisexual trope but like this would this would make it more textual and At least be more discernible subtext.

00:44:55.000 --> 00:44:56.000

It could be.

00:44:56.000 --> 00:44:58.000

Honestly, I would be more angry about it if they position Sauron specifically as being bisexual.

00:44:58.000 --> 00:45:12.000

Because like that is my real big sticking point with queer coding is that bisexual people in particular when we when they're queer coding villains.

00:45:12.000 --> 00:45:19.000

It's often bisexual people who are demonized because when we get demonized from both sides, right?

00:45:19.000 --> 00:45:33.000

That's one of the concerns too of. If they did do more over representation of, you know, and taking on a form that looks feminine or is overtly bisexual.

00:45:33.000 --> 00:45:34.000

Or gender ambiguous.

00:45:34.000 --> 00:45:35.000

Like there's a long history of queer coding villains and there's gonna be there's gonna be some pitfalls no matter what they do.

00:45:35.000 --> 00:45:43.000

They're going to disappoint me no matter what they do and I'm just gonna have to look for the things that I do enjoy.

00:45:43.000 --> 00:45:47.000

My little crumbs.

00:45:47.000 --> 00:45:48.000

Wow.

00:45:48.000 --> 00:46:00.000

Yeah, or a gender like, right? Like gender ambiguous or something like that when Sauron returns, you know, as anatar as is often depicted in fan art or other interpretations.

00:46:00.000 --> 00:46:13.000

Well, I just put out there that Il was attracted to, to, from the beginning and was completely seduced by him for most of the How many episodes there were there, you know, 3 quarters of?

00:46:13.000 --> 00:46:14.000

You are valid.

00:46:14.000 --> 00:46:16.000

Yeah. Yeah.

00:46:16.000 --> 00:46:17.000

So I don't know what that means. A sexually interview, but he was. And he was producing me.

00:46:17.000 --> 00:46:24.000

Yeah, I'm kinda like, my. Yeah, it's like my bisexuality is showing with H brand.

00:46:24.000 --> 00:46:33.000

So it was kind of. I think there's a lot more to it than then the nature was gets individually.

00:46:33.000 --> 00:46:44.000

Yeah, I think we I think most of us could probably agree. Regardless of how it was executed that Charlie Vickers was excellently cast for that role.

00:46:44.000 --> 00:46:58.000

Yeah, I really think that. Yeah, especially when I when I rewatched it, it became about a hundred percent, 150% like more delightful for me to watch him.

00:46:58.000 --> 00:47:08.000

And kind of think about his choices and think about, you know, specifically what he's, what he's doing and what he's choosing to do.

00:47:08.000 --> 00:47:16.000

With his knowledge. Yeah I really think that he's That such a good actor and such a good.

00:47:16.000 --> 00:47:22.000

Gave a really, really strong and interesting performance for sure.

00:47:22.000 --> 00:47:23.000

Hi.

00:47:23.000 --> 00:47:30.000

Well, the other side of it for me was that I was disappointed in myself and I hadn't seen all the little signs that it was all that it was all deception.

00:47:30.000 --> 00:47:31.000

Yeah.

00:47:31.000 --> 00:47:32.000

Hmm.

00:47:32.000 --> 00:47:49.000

Hi. Hands up, I totally missed it as well. And I was, I had this weird theory in my head that.

00:47:49.000 --> 00:47:50.000



Hmm.

00:47:50.000 --> 00:47:51.000

Hmm. I remember that.

00:47:51.000 --> 00:48:01.000

The stranger was Gandalf's or was, was Sauron's, his body and that his, was, possessing, Basically, at some point when the stranger made it to, the 2 would meet back up and they would become re embodied sour on but that was obviously I was just frigging crackers.

00:48:01.000 --> 00:48:05.000

I was so confident that Hallbrand was going to turn out to be the Witch King of

00:48:05.000 --> 00:48:06.000

Yeah.

00:48:06.000 --> 00:48:09.000

Like I was super into that idea.

00:48:09.000 --> 00:48:10.000

Yeah.

00:48:10.000 --> 00:48:11.000

Yeah, I was on that. I was on that one too.

00:48:11.000 --> 00:48:12.000

And.

00:48:12.000 --> 00:48:16.000

Yeah, yeah, me too. You too. And I think that blinded me to the actual signs because I was like, okay, this seems like a witch king.

00:48:16.000 --> 00:48:17.000

Yeah.

00:48:17.000 --> 00:48:18.000

Rule this out. And so I'm gonna go to be a little bit critical a little bit salty here.

00:48:18.000 --> 00:48:33.000

Just really quick. For the most part, and upon all of my rewatches, they, they pack that mystery box real well and they, when you unpack it again, it works.

00:48:33.000 --> 00:48:49.000

Pretty well. But there is one moment in. Episode 3 or 4, the narration right at the end where there is one moment where the show overtly lies in the juxtaposition of image and voice over that.

00:48:49.000 --> 00:48:56.000

Hmm.

00:48:56.000 --> 00:48:57.000

Hmm.

00:48:57.000 --> 00:49:06.000

States that essentially states that the Hallbrand character is a valor returning to Numanor. And that's part of why I had ruled it out because they lied and you never want to like production, wise you never want to lie to your audience when you pack a mystery box.

00:49:06.000 --> 00:49:11.000

You only want to mislead them. You don't want to actually overtly lie. So they did there was one goof up there.

00:49:11.000 --> 00:49:24.000

Why is that? Why not?

00:49:24.000 --> 00:49:25.000

I don't really watch things.

00:49:25.000 --> 00:49:26.000

Because it doesn't stand up to interrogation on the back end like once you've unpacked the mystery box you can't really rewatch it again because you just it's just like the form of writing that's a no-no.

00:49:26.000 --> 00:49:31.000

Yeah.

00:49:31.000 --> 00:49:32.000

Okay.

00:49:32.000 --> 00:49:42.000

Also, production wise, ideally it's a great idea to tell your your actors who they are playing.

00:49:42.000 --> 00:49:43.000

Okay.

00:49:43.000 --> 00:49:50.000

Before they begin shooting for the role. Typically that is regarded as the. Best standard best practice within the industry and that is not how they chose to do this.

00:49:50.000 --> 00:49:51.000

Okay.

00:49:51.000 --> 00:49:57.000

Hello, why would something have tried to be great? Just stick to the established. That's the data.

00:49:57.000 --> 00:50:08.000

Yeah, we have to think outside the box and Charlie Vickers did a great job with that. He was not told until the filming of episode 3 that he was going to be playing Sauron.

00:50:08.000 --> 00:50:16.000

They at least give him a little bit of time to adjust to that knowledge, but. You know there are some choices that were made on the production side that.

00:50:16.000 --> 00:50:20.000

Did I think in can be pretty readily critiqued?

00:50:20.000 --> 00:50:29.000

Yeah, I really, I kind of like that's one of the big ones for me where I'm like, I feel like.

00:50:29.000 --> 00:50:35.000

To some degree, it kind of feels a little bit like you're not trusting the actor enough.

00:50:35.000 --> 00:50:52.000

And that's a big problem because I think it's clearly he knows. He knows how to convey quite a lot and he makes a lot of really great and interesting choices when he has all the information available to him.

00:50:52.000 --> 00:51:08.000

So I kind of feel I really feel like it gave. I gave him and it kind of gave the audience a big, it was a big disservice to all of us not to have him fully, fully in the know for those both of those 2 episodes so that we could go back and.

00:51:08.000 --> 00:51:18.000

See all the layers of nuance that he put into his performance and and really bring that character to life in a way.

00:51:18.000 --> 00:51:37.000

That you know he was aware that he was deceiving. Everybody like right from the get go like yeah, that's one of my, what's one of my biggest speaks is it just, feels like a massive betrayal of trust in, in your, actor, you know?

00:51:37.000 --> 00:51:43.000

Yeah, but in the character, that's exactly what they were going for. So I mean, it's like.

00:51:43.000 --> 00:51:47.000

Are, are you watching the actors and their performance or are you watching? The story and what's going on in the story.

00:51:47.000 --> 00:51:58.000

And you know, I mean, I agree with what you're saying, but. But to me it's almost like the reverse that.

00:51:58.000 --> 00:51:59.000

Method.

00:51:59.000 --> 00:52:02.000

I want to be completely I want to be completely absorbed into the story and not have any awareness that I'm being manipulated when I am being manipulated.

00:52:02.000 --> 00:52:09.000

That's what I go.

00:52:09.000 --> 00:52:13.000

Yeah, and I feel the same way. I feel like I feel like Charlie Vickers did a really excellent job of doing that in the rest of the episodes.

00:52:13.000 --> 00:52:23.000

I kind I just wish I wish that he had been able to. To do that for the first 2 episodes.

00:52:23.000 --> 00:52:32.000

Yeah, he might have done it even. I'm sure he would have done even better job if he would have been, you know, You know, and it's almost like if there thinking, well, he's, they're, somebody's gonna give way the secret to somebody else.

00:52:32.000 --> 00:52:35.000

I mean, it's, yeah, you're not trusting your actors at all.

00:52:35.000 --> 00:52:36.000

Yeah. That's my beef really. So.

00:52:36.000 --> 00:52:47.000

I mean, But part of the idea may have been that song was reawakening into his selfhood as as the story is going on.

00:52:47.000 --> 00:52:58.000

I mean, I mean, he's lost at sea. This is a Mayar who is lost at sea, there must be some limitations to his self knowledge.

00:52:58.000 --> 00:53:06.000

I'm very interested to see if they will go back and tell us how he ended up where he was and if it was of his own volition or not.

00:53:06.000 --> 00:53:07.000

Yeah.

00:53:07.000 --> 00:53:13.000

If he was there as a machination or if he was there because he screwed up or something.

00:53:13.000 --> 00:53:21.000

Yeah, I mean, I think he was aware of his own attempt. To deceive, from the beginning, but that's different from.

00:53:21.000 --> 00:53:38.000

You know, his sort of knowing. You know, his whole history and I mean, we get the same thing with the with the stranger where he doesn't seem to know completely what he's what he's doing there and I think that there is a little bit of that insan as well that.

00:53:38.000 --> 00:53:45.000

But you know, that's, I guess that's a little bit of. Trying to explain things after the fact.

00:53:45.000 --> 00:53:49.000

Yeah.

00:53:49.000 --> 00:53:59.000

Anybody else that hasn't chimed in yet that would like to contribute? Still got about 10 min left before you need to wrap things up.

00:53:59.000 --> 00:54:01.000

You too short a time.

00:54:01.000 --> 00:54:08.000

It is we we could go on and on for sure. We did have, some discussions. We had like live discussion.

00:54:08.000 --> 00:54:16.000

After each episode aired. So if. We could potentially do that again for Season 2.

00:54:16.000 --> 00:54:21.000

And so everybody can kind of air their first.

00:54:21.000 --> 00:54:22.000

Did you?

00:54:22.000 --> 00:54:29.000

I would be so down for that. Because it deep in my understanding of kind of every moment of what was.

00:54:29.000 --> 00:54:43.000

Good or changing or concerning about each episode. It made me a lot more. Like a lot more aware of everything.

00:54:43.000 --> 00:54:58.000

If we just have a little bit of time, I really feel like Ad in particular was quite possibly one of the best characters.

00:54:58.000 --> 00:54:59.000

Hmm.

00:54:59.000 --> 00:55:04.000

Definitely in the show and maybe in all of the adaptations of Tolkien. He's such a complex, well acted character.

00:55:04.000 --> 00:55:17.000

And it's really one of the things that stands out and the show to me as getting to the heart of what Tolkien was battling with while he was writing in terms specifically of his late writings that they don't even have.



00:55:17.000 --> 00:55:26.000

Access to. When he was grappling with the nature of works, the nature of evil, the nature of being able to be redeemed or not.

00:55:26.000 --> 00:55:30.000

And I think that is wonderful to tackle.

00:55:30.000 --> 00:55:31.000

Agreed. Agreed, absolutely.

00:55:31.000 --> 00:55:46.000

Yeah. I think my favorite episode of all of season one was episode 6 because I thought the way that it was structured, placed expectations, subverted them and then did it 3 times throughout the episode was phenomenal.

00:55:46.000 --> 00:55:48.000

Hmm.

00:55:48.000 --> 00:56:00.000

And part of that is all of the different nuance of adders, performance, the performance of add are in that particular episode that everyone else was then able to build off of.

00:56:00.000 --> 00:56:03.000

It was it was very well structured.

00:56:03.000 --> 00:56:18.000

And then in the character design, there was so much saying this could be sour on, right? So you have the gauntlet, the black gauntlet on one hand, you look like kind of like a an elven my Irish kind of character that had been corrupted or infected by something.

00:56:18.000 --> 00:56:27.000

So that was where I was getting all of my like. Maybe this is, that's embodying whoever the body belongs to.

00:56:27.000 --> 00:56:28.000

Hmm.

00:56:28.000 --> 00:56:29.000

Yeah.

00:56:29.000 --> 00:56:32.000

But I love the way that they finished it up to.

00:56:32.000 --> 00:56:33.000

I loved

00:56:33.000 --> 00:57:00.000

I would have loved him to be sour on. Like, having add or be sour on would have been, it would have hit like better for me because it is showing It would be showing a side of Sauron that we never really get to see like that like paternalistic kind of side that I think is interesting to delve into as a character because like Sauron often gets really flattened as an evil character and I

00:57:00.000 --> 00:57:13.000

don't think he's like that in Tolkien's actual writings.

00:57:13.000 --> 00:57:14.000

Hmm.

00:57:14.000 --> 00:57:18.000

I like how It's becomes it becomes clear that these are L's that have been corrupted that they've been enslaved, They've been bred to create more.

00:57:18.000 --> 00:57:27.000

And. And I agree that it would have been interesting if that was Salo, but the fact that it's somebody else. Who?

00:57:27.000 --> 00:57:35.000

Is sort of implicitly there. I mean, there must have been people. Who were there from the beginning.

00:57:35.000 --> 00:57:47.000

That you know that that that tried to become you know you know the leaders of these enslaved. Corrupted L's that become work.

00:57:47.000 --> 00:57:56.000

So it. You know, I kind of, I kind of agree with the idea that making him a potential S is an interesting.

00:57:56.000 --> 00:58:08.000

Suggestion. But it but it's an interesting character independently. The idea that he is a sort of who has become the father of the orcs.

00:58:08.000 --> 00:58:38.000

I think the portrayal of Adar, the writing and the portrayal of Adar did so much that was needed to problematize the idea of how we have viewed orcs like as general audiences how we how we have gotten accustomed to seeing things.

00:58:41.000 --> 00:58:42.000

Way.

00:58:42.000 --> 00:58:51.000

From the Peter Jackson adaptation, but even before that, you know, the, you know, Rink and Bass, that my, friend at Romeo wrote and everything and I quote all the time that where there's a whip there's a way song but the way that this is put together is problematic.

00:58:51.000 --> 00:59:06.000

I just have to. I did legitimately want Voltron on there for a bit because now in my head I have Sour on assembling from multiple pieces in a big flashy anime like Voltron, Sailor Moon.

00:59:06.000 --> 00:59:07.000

Sequencing. Yeah.

00:59:07.000 --> 00:59:16.000

Yeah, that's gonna say I need a transformation sequence. So. Oh boy, of a how brand going in just full, now.

00:59:16.000 --> 00:59:17.000

Yes, magical curls out on exactly.

00:59:17.000 --> 00:59:18.000

One of the things.

00:59:18.000 --> 00:59:20.000

Mercury, magical girl, Sarah.

00:59:20.000 --> 00:59:21.000

Exactly.

00:59:21.000 --> 00:59:27.000

One of the things that I am hopeful about is that there were the we almost never talk about them, but those 3 like.

00:59:27.000 --> 00:59:37.000

Accolades or priestesses or whatever looking for sauron to worship. No, no one ever actually talks about them now that the show has ended.

00:59:37.000 --> 00:59:51.000

But one of the things that their existence in the show did was show how. Like, you know, IS, like, MYR, and, can change form.

00:59:51.000 --> 01:00:04.000

Can, you know, in here they like dissolve into moths and then reform or whatever, which gives us an idea of what Sauron capabilities should be and what we should be.

01:00:04.000 --> 01:00:11.000

Seeing as a possibility and hopefully the show runners and writers see that too. Hopefully they don't they don't forget.

01:00:11.000 --> 01:00:18.000

Right.

01:00:18.000 --> 01:00:19.000

Oh yeah.

01:00:19.000 --> 01:00:23.000

If you want to talk to the, yeah, if you want to talk about the cultists and queer coated villains, like there was some severe gender ambiguity in multiple of the cultists.

01:00:23.000 --> 01:00:29.000

They were so hot. Sorry. Hey, for so hot.

01:00:29.000 --> 01:00:34.000

Yeah, I've been low key wanting to cost one of the call too because I think it would be a good comfy cost for.

01:00:34.000 --> 01:00:35.000

Okay.

01:00:35.000 --> 01:00:36.000

Shut. You should.

01:00:36.000 --> 01:00:38.000

Like I need to be the dweller now. I'd be just like. Yes, please.

01:00:38.000 --> 01:00:44.000

Alicia, I need to see that cosplay and I need to see your, magic together in Goldberry.

01:00:44.000 --> 01:00:46.000

Yes.

01:00:46.000 --> 01:00:50.000

Maybe soon. I should get my selling machine back tomorrow.

01:00:50.000 --> 01:00:52.000

Yeah.

01:00:52.000 --> 01:00:58.000

Maybe you can make me a dweller costume. So I can be like, wow, look at me.

01:00:58.000 --> 01:00:59.000

Yeah.

01:00:59.000 --> 01:01:00.000

I'm so hot. Okay.

01:01:00.000 --> 01:01:12.000

Yeah, I really wish they would have done more with them because like, out of all of the costumes in the show is they were the most compelling ones.

01:01:12.000 --> 01:01:13.000

Yeah.

01:01:13.000 --> 01:01:21.000

Like they were doing something different and they were very other worldly. They hit like all the all the things they needed to hit and then they were on screen for.

01:01:21.000 --> 01:01:24.000

Glass than 5 min, I feel like.

01:01:24.000 --> 01:01:25.000

Yeah, yeah.

01:01:25.000 --> 01:01:26.000

And they had at least 95%.

01:01:26.000 --> 01:01:32.000

Take a little bit away from, and give it to these cultists. Yeah.

01:01:32.000 --> 01:01:37.000

We want the hot. Colt is brave. People.

01:01:37.000 --> 01:01:45.000

And they are added most of the depth to. The stranger canned off character for most of the season.

01:01:45.000 --> 01:01:50.000

That They were why he was compelling.

01:01:50.000 --> 01:01:51.000

Hello.

01:01:51.000 --> 01:01:52.000

Hmm. Hmm.

01:01:52.000 --> 01:02:02.000

I know we're very short on time. But something we're in the chat reminded me, Can we just take a moment to appreciate D and D and like L.

01:02:02.000 --> 01:02:05.000

Ron coming back to Kazakh like that entire every time they came on screen it was utterly compelling to me.

01:02:05.000 --> 01:02:20.000

I was constantly fascinated and honestly trying to pull screenshots for this presentation. I kept getting distracted by like,'s conversation with Al Ron when she's like, I forgot, Deary.

01:02:20.000 --> 01:02:27.000

He was mining courts, chasm today. Fantastic. I love it.

01:02:27.000 --> 01:02:31.000

That there's a reason I put a whole just a whole bunch of hearts around them because I just love them.

01:02:31.000 --> 01:02:33.000



Yeah.

01:02:33.000 --> 01:02:43.000

I love them so much. Yeah, I like I said, like I said in your presentation. Like I feel like that relationship just like.

01:02:43.000 --> 01:02:52.000

You know, like blue everybody out of out of the water basically with how like warm and wonderful and.

01:02:52.000 --> 01:02:54.000

So like so familiar it was for everybody. Like everybody was just like, oh yeah, all of, all of these people love each other.

01:02:54.000 --> 01:03:04.000

Just deeply. They're all smitten with each other. Absolutely.

01:03:04.000 --> 01:03:12.000

So many different types of love and there's a line in there about there's no lack of love and like just I love that.

01:03:12.000 --> 01:03:13.000

That was great. That was phenomenal.

01:03:13.000 --> 01:03:16.000

Me too. Me too.

01:03:16.000 --> 01:03:17.000

Yeah.

01:03:17.000 --> 01:03:18.000

Alright.

01:03:18.000 --> 01:03:24.000

Okay. Like I say, I know we're coming up short on time. If folks want to keep chatting about this, we do have the discord channel.

01:03:24.000 --> 01:03:25.000

Good go in the voice channel too if we want to talk.

01:03:25.000 --> 01:03:29.000

And I know there's also Yeah, I was gonna say there's also the OMS chat voice channel.

01:03:29.000 --> 01:03:39.000

Which I am happy to hang out in if folks wanna. I'm talking about, come talk to me about the things that they loved hated or were curious about.

01:03:39.000 --> 01:03:40.000

Thanks, everyone. This has been a good discussion.

01:03:40.000 --> 01:03:50.000

Yeah. Yeah, thank you all for coming and for listening to us. And despite your varying opinions about the show.

01:03:50.000 --> 01:03:54.000

Thank you all so much for. Or to we're talking with us.

01:03:54.000 --> 01:03:55.000

Yeah.

01:03:55.000 --> 01:03:59.000

It was interesting to hear everybody's opinions.

01:03:59.000 --> 01:04:00.000

Thanks for having me.

01:04:00.000 --> 01:04:01.000

I'm glad. I'm glad.

01:04:01.000 --> 01:04:06.000

Excellent. Cut the fandom right down the middle, but there's a way to have respectful discussion about it.

01:04:06.000 --> 01:04:10.000

And I think we just demonstrated it.

01:04:10.000 --> 01:04:11.000

Cool.

01:04:11.000 --> 01:04:18.000

I think one thing to highlight too is like you know, all of the hosts of queer lodgings, the total podcast happen to be in this room right now.

01:04:18.000 --> 01:04:19.000

Hi.

01:04:19.000 --> 01:04:37.000

And we did not all agree. What our favorite parts were, the things that we didn't like in our full reception of the show and we're still friends so And I actually delight in hearing the viewpoints that differ from mine because I know that they're genuinely held and constructively talked about.

01:04:37.000 --> 01:04:38.000

So I love that.

01:04:38.000 --> 01:04:42.000

Same, same.

01:04:42.000 --> 01:04:43.000

That's right.

01:04:43.000 --> 01:04:46.000

Yeah, shout out to that episode if you want to hear me go on at length about how horrible it was to have the Black Elphin chain.

01:04:46.000 --> 01:04:53.000

Editing Tim had to make that a 2 part episode because we had so much to say on it. Yeah.

01:04:53.000 --> 01:04:54.000

We did.

01:04:54.000 --> 01:04:55.000

We talked a lot on that episode. So yeah. Cool. Well, thanks everybody.

01:04:55.000 --> 01:04:59.000

Alright. So much everyone. It's been great.

01:04:59.000 --> 01:05:00.000

Thanks a lot.

01:05:00.000 --> 01:05:03.000

Hi.

01:05:03.000 --> 01:05:04.000

Bye.

01:05:04.000 --> 01:05:05.000

Bye.