

825

02:25:31.170 --> 02:25:32.690

The Mythopoeic Society: all right.

826

02:25:33.030 --> 02:25:38.771

The Mythopoeic Society: Oh, hey, hello! Good morning.

827

02:25:41.390 --> 02:25:43.910

The Mythopoeic Society: Yes. What did we tell you?

828

02:25:45.880 --> 02:25:48.409

The Mythopoeic Society: You'd buy 26, another

829

02:25:52.240 --> 02:25:55.070

The Mythopoeic Society: microphone noises. Okay, alright.

830

02:25:55.250 --> 02:26:01.300

The Mythopoeic Society: good morning, Brian, and make an attempt. We will make an attempt here.

831

02:26:01.330 --> 02:26:03.110

The Mythopoeic Society: Oh, okay.

832

02:26:03.400 --> 02:26:16.160

The Mythopoeic Society: So the niggling Banger snash Tolkien's revisionist tendencies in the canon of Middle Earth. So we want to talk today about Tolkien's habit of revisiting and revising his own work.

833

02:26:16.240 --> 02:26:23.780

The Mythopoeic Society: Cs. Lewis famously said of Tolkien in the 1959 letter. That you may might as well try to influence a Banger snatch

834

02:26:23.900 --> 02:26:49.080

The Mythopoeic Society: continued, by noting that Tolkien had only 2 reactions to criticism. It's pretty obvious. He had a similar reaction to his own self criticism to noticing a loose end, or something that didn't fit a changed cosmological theory or a new addition to the legendarium that required a revision to the back story.

835

02:26:50.600 --> 02:27:04.440

The Mythopoeic Society: his reaction would be to niggle away at a revision or recontextualization. We now call a retcon in an attempt to create retroactive continuity with the newer narrative concept.

836

02:27:04.510 --> 02:27:34.399

The Mythopoeic Society: sometimes successfully, perhaps far more often than not leading to cul de sac ends, that he never managed to write his way out of so building, in part on the pair of notes by Berlin, Flieger, and Chris Larsen in

Mythler, one for 43 respectively, a fearful weapon, and the Sun, the Sun and the silver alien Prince of Dulkan, and the Copernican Revolution of Morgos Ring. You can tell which title belongs to which person, if you know these authors, 1st tries to get the longest title she can.

837

02:27:34.840 --> 02:27:40.929

The Mythopoeic Society: But we'll look at Tolkien's tendency to niggle and revise and reconceive. And what an impact

838

02:27:40.950 --> 02:27:46.289

The Mythopoeic Society: our understanding of the sub-grade of prospects, and how we think about

839

02:27:46.480 --> 02:27:49.660

The Mythopoeic Society: canonicity in the lodgenger.

840

02:27:51.000 --> 02:27:56.990

The Mythopoeic Society: So unfortunately, Berlin's leader is not able to be around.

841

02:27:57.400 --> 02:28:07.410

The Mythopoeic Society: So you you may have noticed that you might be on this page, too, so we will carry on. I'm going to talk a little bit about.

842

02:28:07.420 --> 02:28:27.720

The Mythopoeic Society: This is the hobbit, David Bratman, who's done. He will talk about small collapses and deletions of utility, and Holkins, fraught relationship with creativity is going to talk on some of the psychological motivations for these recons. And now I will sit down to do my part.

843

02:28:28.840 --> 02:28:31.129

The Mythopoeic Society: I'm gonna make horrible microphone noises.

844

02:28:32.610 --> 02:28:35.259

The Mythopoeic Society: Sure. Yes, here you do that, you clever person.

845

02:28:36.870 --> 02:28:37.899

The Mythopoeic Society: There we go.

846

02:28:38.480 --> 02:28:40.040

The Mythopoeic Society: Alright then.

847

02:28:42.870 --> 02:28:53.470

The Mythopoeic Society: Okay, so I'm going to throw out with a history of Tolkien's revisions and attempted revisions to the hobbit, and this necessitates a very brief visit to Peter Jackson's film adaptations.

848

02:28:54.064 --> 02:29:14.780

The Mythopoeic Society: When Jackson was confirmed as director for the hobbit movies. This created an interesting dynamic between his earlier lord of the Rings films and the hobbit project. Another director, like the initially considered Guillermo de Toro, and a different creative team might have been able to go in new direction and do something entirely fresh with the adaptation. But with Jackson

849

02:29:14.860 --> 02:29:24.329

The Mythopoeic Society: the new contractor was almost inescapably locked into having to match his lord of the rings. Films not only in cast but in tone, look, occasions, and theme.

850

02:29:24.440 --> 02:29:29.710

The Mythopoeic Society: So Jackson faced an interesting challenge. How do you take a book that was originally

851

02:29:29.940 --> 02:29:40.729

The Mythopoeic Society: Prequel? Not really that, not really. It was a standalone novel and turn it into what is technically a sequel to a film series, but at the same time prequel to the action in that series.

852

02:29:40.860 --> 02:30:03.740

The Mythopoeic Society: So the problem with watching the hobbit after the lord of the rings. The viewers all know what the ring is, what it does, who survives the hobbit to return to action in the Lord of the Rings, and where they all end up 60 years later. We even know a good bit of what happens in the hobbit already through history and flashbacks in the earlier films. So a lot of the tension that would be part of a chronological sequel is dissipated.

853

02:30:03.850 --> 02:30:31.687

The Mythopoeic Society: So what we have here, then, is a situation where a great deal of a plot of the second series of films has been anticipated in the 1st series, in which the earlier source material has to be retrofitted in order to match the earlier adaptation of the chronologically later material, and yet maintain the illusion that the chronological later material does not yet exist. I have a chart, and I'm trying to do it with, you know. Wait, wait till I get to the other part. The chart is really complicated.

854

02:30:32.080 --> 02:30:44.269

The Mythopoeic Society: so the interesting thing here is that Tolkien tried to do the same thing at one time. 1st edition of the Hobbit was published in 1937. But as Tolkien worked on the Lord of the Rings through the

855

02:30:44.330 --> 02:30:46.350

The Mythopoeic Society: in the forties.

856

02:30:46.410 --> 02:30:56.430

The Mythopoeic Society: he began rewriting some elements of the earlier book, bring them in line with the plot and themes of the larger work, including material in the appendices, like the section on Durin, spoke

857

02:30:56.470 --> 02:31:18.929

The Mythopoeic Society: most notably. He revised Chapter 5 riddles in the dark, but turned Gollum's forfeit if he lost from giving Bilbo a present for showing the way out of the Goblin tunnels that play up the importance of the ring to Gollum. He also revised the introductory note to introduce the conceit that the 1st edition included Bilbo's original untruthful version of the story where the second edition now corrects.

858

02:31:19.100 --> 02:31:24.409

The Mythopoeic Society: So in 1,951, Allen Unwin published this revised version as the second edition of the hobbit.

859

02:31:24.730 --> 02:31:49.570

The Mythopoeic Society: The next piece of material related to these earlier events is the quest for Arab, or originally written to form part of Appendix a. In the Lord of the Rings, but appearing there only in a much shortened version, as part of Durin's folk tells of the unexpected party and the events leading up to it from Gandalf's point of view, very much to Bilbo's disadvantage that does not soften Theory's contemptuous attitude toward the hobbit.

860

02:31:49.590 --> 02:31:52.890

The Mythopoeic Society: It was later published in unfinished tales. Among other places.

861

02:31:53.170 --> 02:32:09.490

The Mythopoeic Society: Now we arrive at where Tolkien tries to do what Jackson attempts with his films. In 1,960 Tolkien set out to rewrite the entire hobbit and the style of the Lord of the Rings. But, as John Ratliff puts it, wisely abandoned this new draft at the start of Chapter 3.

862

02:32:10.070 --> 02:32:18.540

The Mythopoeic Society: These chapters are included in Volume 2. Well, it's actually one volume available in one. It's the second half of rentless history of Muhammad.

863

02:32:19.043 --> 02:32:31.640

The Mythopoeic Society: The fullest treatment is given to Chapter one which is here retitled a well planned party. Already we see the point of view shifting from Bilbo, from for whom the party was entirely unexpected. To Gandalf, who planned it.

864

02:32:32.020 --> 02:32:42.789

The Mythopoeic Society: The 1st major change comes at the end of the 3rd paragraph, where, instead of the familiar and cozy. He may have lost the neighbour's respect, but he gained well, you will see if he gained anything in the end.

865

02:32:42.980 --> 02:32:50.259

The Mythopoeic Society: Tolkien instead, wrote, he got caught up in great events which he never understood, and he became enormously important, though he never realized it.

866

02:32:50.340 --> 02:33:13.579

The Mythopoeic Society: Just a kind of odd reinterpretation since the Bilbo that we see at Elrond's Council. Very good understanding of Middle Earth history and current events is respected when he perfectly seriously offers to take the ring to Morgoth himself, and cuts right to the heart of what the Council needs to decide who exactly will take the ring to its destruction. This is not a guy who doesn't know about world events and everything.

867

02:33:14.330 --> 02:33:23.760

The Mythopoeic Society: So the revision continues in this somewhat more serious and realistic vein and fusticate, and be bother. These words, replaced with confound and bother!

868

02:33:23.840 --> 02:33:30.859

The Mythopoeic Society: Game of golf is left out of the bull. Roarer took stories. No, no! Where would that lead? I don't know

869

02:33:30.980 --> 02:33:39.560

The Mythopoeic Society: the line about the shields in the shire being used for cradles or dish covers, is replaced with one about bows being used for hunting small deer.

870

02:33:39.900 --> 02:33:52.559

The Mythopoeic Society: We find Thorin far more confrontational about Gandalf's possession of Thor's map. 91 years! Cried Thorin. 91 years you have kept my property where he hardly blinks an eye at it in the original hobbit.

871

02:33:53.130 --> 02:34:12.079

The Mythopoeic Society: Now, as Ratliff comments on this chapter, Gandalf is more remote, Thorn, already obsessed by his property and his grievances, and Bilbo is more foolish and naive. The evungular narrator and the gently humorous tone of the children's story have to be abandoned from the start. If high seriousness is the goal of the author.

872

02:34:12.170 --> 02:34:22.950

The Mythopoeic Society: But to the original novel's detriment, as the story's progression from light and charming to purposeful and emotionally serious was the ideal tone for the story of Bilbo's growth into heroism.

873

02:34:23.610 --> 02:34:31.909

The Mythopoeic Society: So 2 concepts that Tolkien mentions in his criticism of the unfilmed 1,957 Zimmerman script are anticipation and flattening

874

02:34:32.030 --> 02:34:46.560

The Mythopoeic Society: consent that Zimmerman had a tendency to anticipate scenes or devices used later, thereby flattening the tail out for example, Zimmerman has eagles arriving in the shire before the humbut's journey even begins, thus reducing their later surprise factor.

875

02:34:46.710 --> 02:34:56.560

The Mythopoeic Society: Flattening can also describe what happens to a character arc when a writer anticipates later development of the character in earlier scenes than in the source material.

876

02:34:56.670 --> 02:35:04.409

The Mythopoeic Society: In addition, dialogue can be flattened. The screenwriter might be tempted to make Tolkien's language more understandable for a wider audience.

877

02:35:04.450 --> 02:35:25.980

The Mythopoeic Society: So, in effect, like Jackson's films, Hogan's revisions would have anticipated the slowly revealed magnitude and importance of events of the hobbit to middle Earth, leaving the story and the characters far less room for development, would flattened the amiable and idiosyncratic tone of what was originally an adventure story for children. I think we can be glad that he abandoned the attempt.

878

02:35:26.280 --> 02:35:30.148

The Mythopoeic Society: and if you want to look at my chart, render, here's

879

02:35:31.520 --> 02:35:35.460

The Mythopoeic Society: but I am going to now turn it over to David Bradliff. Okay.

880

02:35:36.260 --> 02:35:37.090

The Mythopoeic Society: okay.

881

02:35:40.910 --> 02:35:51.289

The Mythopoeic Society: When I study Tolkien's drafts, the most striking feature for me is the tremendously expansive, even burgeoning quality of his creativity.

882

02:35:51.610 --> 02:36:02.840

The Mythopoeic Society: most obviously shown by the existence of the legendary name. In the 1st place, an entire mythology tell the tales and the languages they speak created by one man.

883

02:36:03.550 --> 02:36:08.000

The Mythopoeic Society: Your admiration of the Silmerilian may well depend on whether you find this fact impressive.

884

02:36:09.170 --> 02:36:12.339

The Mythopoeic Society: but it can also be seen on a smaller scale.

885

02:36:12.790 --> 02:36:17.839

The Mythopoeic Society: And when I talked about this at Albuquerque I identified some of Tolkien's creative techniques.

886

02:36:17.950 --> 02:36:30.050

The Mythopoeic Society: mighty tree of work from a tiny seed, vast expansion of scale, tacking new material on both chronologically and geographically and most significantly, by splitting off.

887

02:36:30.070 --> 02:36:32.730

The Mythopoeic Society: making an image that appeared in his mind.

888

02:36:32.750 --> 02:36:38.579

The Mythopoeic Society: and realizing that he had fixed it on the wrong character, a new one must be created instead.

889

02:36:39.010 --> 02:36:50.049

The Mythopoeic Society: The classic example of that is, from the beginning of the Lord of the rings, the image of Gandalf on a horse catching up with the hobbit travelers. Well, he started to write this, and then he stopped. No.

890

02:36:50.240 --> 02:36:51.550

The Mythopoeic Society: that's not Gandalf

891

02:36:51.710 --> 02:36:53.730

The Mythopoeic Society: must be something else.

892

02:36:54.370 --> 02:37:01.120

The Mythopoeic Society: Few wording changes produced almost word for word, the description of the Black Rider as he appeared in the Finnish text.

893

02:37:01.320 --> 02:37:09.229

The Mythopoeic Society: but it required much more effort on Tolkien's part to figure out who this writer was, where he came from and what he was doing.

894

02:37:09.470 --> 02:37:12.829

The Mythopoeic Society: Suddenly a whole new aspect opened up in this story.

895

02:37:12.850 --> 02:37:17.769

The Mythopoeic Society: There are many other examples of this splitting off, particularly later in the composition of the Lord of the Rings.

896

02:37:18.800 --> 02:37:20.500

The Mythopoeic Society: It's this burgeoning

897

02:37:20.790 --> 02:37:27.400

The Mythopoeic Society: which is responsible for a characteristic of Tolkien's work, which I think is essential to his appeal.

898

02:37:27.460 --> 02:37:31.889

The Mythopoeic Society: which is strangely neglected by adapters and even by some critics.

899

02:37:31.910 --> 02:37:42.629

The Mythopoeic Society: and that is the depth of his subcreation. The sense that there's far more to this world than ever is put down on the page. That there are mysteries will forever remain unsolved.

900

02:37:43.000 --> 02:37:50.949

The Mythopoeic Society: The classic example of that is on bomb the deal. You will never plumb the bottom of the mystery that has come, and even to try

901

02:37:50.990 --> 02:37:53.330

The Mythopoeic Society: single for me.

902

02:37:54.080 --> 02:37:54.870

The Mythopoeic Society: Hmm!

903

02:37:55.710 --> 02:38:21.520

The Mythopoeic Society: But there's much more, and this becomes apparent by its disappearance. When Tolkien took a reverse up, undertook a reverse procedure. Gradually over the years, he devoted more and more of his energy towards cleaning up his invented world, sorting it down into neat categories and thoroughly explained principles, putting the entire thing into a box that you could grasp as a whole. That's what I want to talk about for the remainder of my time here.

904

02:38:22.630 --> 02:38:26.630

The Mythopoeic Society: Possibly the earliest example of this tendency was Golem.

905

02:38:26.850 --> 02:38:29.650

The Mythopoeic Society: Let's look at how Gollum is introduced in the hobbit.

906

02:38:29.850 --> 02:38:39.219

The Mythopoeic Society: Deep down here by the dark water, lived old Gollum, which, in the 3rd edition, which was undertaken after the material Janet was talking about.

907

02:38:39.470 --> 02:38:44.029

The Mythopoeic Society: Tolkien added a description, a small, slimy creature.

908

02:38:44.070 --> 02:38:51.890

The Mythopoeic Society: probably because numerous illustrations and translated editions over the years, had depicted Gollum as an enormous troll like Blob.

909

02:38:52.670 --> 02:38:59.049

The Mythopoeic Society: Talking goes on. I don't know where he came from, nor who or what he was. He was Gollum!

910

02:38:59.160 --> 02:39:00.790

The Mythopoeic Society: It's dark, is darkness.

911

02:39:00.930 --> 02:39:04.130

The Mythopoeic Society: 2 big, round, pale eyes in his thin face.

912

02:39:04.810 --> 02:39:06.089

The Mythopoeic Society: Let's repeat that

913

02:39:06.130 --> 02:39:09.389

The Mythopoeic Society: I don't know where he came from.



914

02:39:09.490 --> 02:39:12.259

The Mythopoeic Society: or who or what he was.

915

02:39:13.170 --> 02:39:22.359

The Mythopoeic Society: What this reminds me of is a remark Gandalf made when explaining to the 3 hunters what happened after he'd fallen into the depths of Moria.

916

02:39:22.500 --> 02:39:23.700

The Mythopoeic Society: Randolph says.

917

02:39:23.840 --> 02:39:31.079

The Mythopoeic Society: far, far below the deepest delvings of the dwarves, the world is gnawed by nameless thing.

918

02:39:31.460 --> 02:39:36.969

The Mythopoeic Society: Even Sauron knows them not. They are older than he

919

02:39:37.610 --> 02:39:47.199

The Mythopoeic Society: now, perhaps this last bit is hyperbole of the kind Gandalf is prone to. Sauron is an Ainu, and there are no created beings older than that, but it's still evocative.

920

02:39:47.660 --> 02:39:55.289

The Mythopoeic Society: The reference to these nameless, gnawing things reminds the reader that there is more to Middle Earth than we know about.

921

02:39:55.440 --> 02:40:03.589

The Mythopoeic Society: And surely that small, slimy creature living deep down by the dark water. The mysterious old Golem is one of them.

922

02:40:03.830 --> 02:40:13.210

The Mythopoeic Society: I emphasize all this to convey just how shocking it is to a reader of the hobbit to learn in the second chapter of the Lord of the Rings, that Golem is

923

02:40:13.320 --> 02:40:14.450

The Mythopoeic Society: a hobbit.

924

02:40:14.470 --> 02:40:15.680

The Mythopoeic Society: Oh, what

925

02:40:16.010 --> 02:40:24.330

The Mythopoeic Society: hobbits from the bourgeois bucolic shire! What the small, slimy creature living down by the dark water, I'm sure.

926

02:40:24.400 --> 02:40:27.089

The Mythopoeic Society: and during his speech could say quite a lot about that.

927

02:40:27.180 --> 02:40:34.969

The Mythopoeic Society: I can't believe that Gollum was connected with Hobbits, however, distantly, said Frodo, with some heat. What an abominable notion!

928

02:40:35.980 --> 02:40:50.650

The Mythopoeic Society: But Gandalf says of Gollum's people. I guess they were of hop, but kind, and Tolkien says in a letter, that guest does not mean a random conjecture. Gandalf's phrasing is in accordance with his character and wisdom. In more modern language, he would have said, I deduce

929

02:40:51.050 --> 02:40:59.280

The Mythopoeic Society: to support his deduction, that Gollum was akin to Bilbo. Gandalf makes weak arguments like, think of the riddles they both knew. For one thing.

930

02:41:01.260 --> 02:41:06.499

The Mythopoeic Society: Tolkien gets away with repainting an Ngt nameless, gnawing thing

931

02:41:07.540 --> 02:41:19.209

The Mythopoeic Society: as a hobbit, because the back story he deduces for Gollum is so compelling, and makes for such a vivid and memorable character. Once Gollum reappears in the story.

932

02:41:19.720 --> 02:41:28.110

The Mythopoeic Society: but this marks, I think the 1st time that Tolkien takes an unknown thing and shoves it into a pre-existing category. Even implausibly.

933

02:41:28.170 --> 02:41:29.399

The Mythopoeic Society: there would be more.

934

02:41:30.280 --> 02:41:31.780

The Mythopoeic Society: There's sharky

935

02:41:32.150 --> 02:41:37.199

The Mythopoeic Society: in the original drafts of the scouring of the shire. Sharky is not sorrow, man. He's just a ruffian.

936

02:41:37.320 --> 02:41:46.929

The Mythopoeic Society: one whom Frodo kills in dramatic single combat. By the way, a notion dropped when he becomes the renegade wizard, and it would be just too ridiculous to have him killed this way.

937

02:41:47.150 --> 02:41:58.849

The Mythopoeic Society: This identification solved problems. Tolkien had been having figuring out just which of the ruffians he was, and it made sense as an answer to the question of So what did become a sorrow man after he was turned out of Isengard, anyway.

938

02:41:59.010 --> 02:42:05.850

The Mythopoeic Society: But there's something a little too neat about it. Joking hasn't split a character. He's combined them.

939

02:42:06.320 --> 02:42:13.560

The Mythopoeic Society: A sudden light broke on Frodo. When he realizes the identity. The text says, Yeah, I bet it did.

940

02:42:13.960 --> 02:42:18.320

The Mythopoeic Society: That's about as far as this tendency got in the text of the Lord of the Rings.

941

02:42:18.360 --> 02:42:20.100

The Mythopoeic Society: But there was much more to come.

942

02:42:20.560 --> 02:42:33.870

The Mythopoeic Society: The entire Round World version of the mythos chronicled and mistransformed in Morgos Ring became a kind of infectious disease. A fungus, perhaps, that grew over at the Legendarium was hard to exturbate.

943

02:42:34.150 --> 02:42:41.770

The Mythopoeic Society: The motivating force behind the Round World version was, I believe, not a simple desire to straighten up the Legendarium and put it into neat boxes.

944

02:42:41.790 --> 02:42:45.820

The Mythopoeic Society: but an unresolved conflict that had arisen in Tolkien's mind

945

02:42:45.860 --> 02:42:49.610

The Mythopoeic Society: between the mythology that he began writing in 1914

946

02:42:49.640 --> 02:42:51.470

The Mythopoeic Society: in the mock history

947

02:42:51.500 --> 02:42:54.360

The Mythopoeic Society: that it had turned to with the Lord of the Rings.

948

02:42:55.230 --> 02:43:06.220

The Mythopoeic Society: attempting to reconcile the mythological parts of the story with known scientific fact about the origin of the world, required a dismantling of the entire early parts of the Silmarillion.

949

02:43:06.280 --> 02:43:08.340

The Mythopoeic Society: It was a grisly sight.

950

02:43:13.190 --> 02:43:16.509

The Mythopoeic Society: but it had its effects not only in the substance of the myth.

951

02:43:16.760 --> 02:43:23.820

The Mythopoeic Society: but in Tolkien's attitude towards his creation, which ceased being so creative and imaginative, and became more analytical.

952

02:43:24.870 --> 02:43:44.689

The Mythopoeic Society: Christopher Tolkien ran up against this when editing laws and customs among the Eldar for Morgoth Springs, and came across a separate text where the valor debate the case of Finue and Muriel. I'm not going to take the time to explain that here, but it treats the valor as a kind of Supreme Court of Arda and the elves who record and remark on this story is something akin to law. Professors

953

02:43:45.110 --> 02:43:53.830

The Mythopoeic Society: Christopher brings the reader up short by pointing out the difference between this legal treatise and the lyrical creative work that his father had formerly done. He says.

954

02:43:53.840 --> 02:44:04.499

The Mythopoeic Society: how far away from these grave doctors seems the horned moon that rolled rode over Alpha Winna's ship off the coast of the lonely isle in the Book of Lost Ales.

955

02:44:05.690 --> 02:44:12.170

The Mythopoeic Society: Tolkien himself once said that he doubted that the tendency to treat this whole thing as a kind of vast game is really good.

956

02:44:12.470 --> 02:44:14.190

The Mythopoeic Society: He couldn't stop himself.

957

02:44:14.390 --> 02:44:19.039

The Mythopoeic Society: and the real evidence for it comes up in the more recently published Nature of Middle Earth.

958

02:44:19.510 --> 02:44:27.750

The Mythopoeic Society: where many of the earlier publisher, Tolkien's late writings were entirely consistent with the Lord of the rings, and hence canonical for those who care about such things

959

02:44:28.070 --> 02:44:32.290

The Mythopoeic Society: in the nature of middle earth he can't stop tinkering

960

02:44:32.760 --> 02:44:41.540

The Mythopoeic Society: while there are some great creative ideas in nature. The Numenoreans and their dancing bears is truly a highlight of the imagination.

961

02:44:41.860 --> 02:44:47.210

The Mythopoeic Society: Most of it consists of pulling at threads until the tapestry threatens to fall apart.

962

02:44:47.510 --> 02:44:58.320

The Mythopoeic Society: The entirety of part. One of the book consists of extensive arithmetical calculations, which would have been much easier at looking at a pocket calculator in the late 19 fifties, when he wrote most of this.

963

02:44:58.760 --> 02:45:12.320

The Mythopoeic Society: working out the chronology of Valerian years prior to the rising of the sun, and then of the rates of elven growth and aging in comparison to those of mortal humans comparable to the calculations one sees of dog years and cat years.

964

02:45:13.250 --> 02:45:24.119

The Mythopoeic Society: a discussion of body, mind, and spirit issues gets bogged down in consideration of death and reincarnation, where Tolkien abandons his own previous ideas, some of them already preserved in print.

965

02:45:24.200 --> 02:45:27.149

The Mythopoeic Society: Some of these abandonments are truly ghastly.

966

02:45:27.670 --> 02:45:30.959

The Mythopoeic Society: Appendix a of the Lord of the Rings says about the dwarves.

967

02:45:31.100 --> 02:45:36.560

The Mythopoeic Society: 5 times an heir was born in his house so like to his forefather that he received the name of Dorit.

968

02:45:37.160 --> 02:45:46.050

The Mythopoeic Society: He was indeed held by the Dwarves to be the death list that returned, but they have many strange tales and beliefs concerning themselves and their fate in the world.

969

02:45:46.440 --> 02:45:53.050

The Mythopoeic Society: In nature of middle earth. Tolkien takes the dwarf's belief as axiomatic, but then he refuses to accept it.

970

02:45:53.680 --> 02:46:05.029

The Mythopoeic Society: He then says that the idea quote is not, when examined, probably one of rebirth, but of the preservation of the body of a former King Durin, to which at intervals his spirit would return.

971

02:46:06.730 --> 02:46:15.129

The Mythopoeic Society: The idea that the line of succession of the kings would be interrupted every once in a while by a zombie like Durin. The 1st

972

02:46:15.200 --> 02:46:19.849

The Mythopoeic Society: knocking on the lid of his coffin, and demanding to be let out for a while

973

02:46:19.890 --> 02:46:22.309

The Mythopoeic Society: does not seem to be well thought through.

974

02:46:23.150 --> 02:46:26.570

The Mythopoeic Society: and is not necessary to fix any problems with. Appendix. A,

975

02:46:28.140 --> 02:46:31.970

The Mythopoeic Society: then Tolkien writes of the fall of numenor and the consequent

976

02:46:33.030 --> 02:46:36.260

The Mythopoeic Society: disappearance of the undying lands from the circles of the world.

977

02:46:36.320 --> 02:46:59.220

The Mythopoeic Society: Being physical, he says, the land quote would not be removed without remaining visible as part of Arda, or as a new satellite, it must either remain as a landmass, bereft of its former inhabitants, or be destroyed. I think now it is best that it should remain a physical landmass Africa, it would just become an ordinary land.

978

02:47:00.030 --> 02:47:19.399

The Mythopoeic Society: Oh, oh, no, Professor, please don't ruin your own mythology. The rising of the Elven ships away from the surface of the ocean as they depart on a straight road for a destination that cannot be detected by mortal eyes, is the most beautiful image Tolkien ever created

979

02:47:20.530 --> 02:47:35.010

The Mythopoeic Society: the removal of the undying lands from the circles of the world. So, says Appendix A, which thus contradicts the above was done by Heru, and not the valor. Surely he had the power to override mere physicality.

980

02:47:35.180 --> 02:47:44.130

The Mythopoeic Society: Besides, if it's only America, where, then, is the far green country under a swift sunrise to which Frodo sails New Jersey, the Garden State.

981

02:47:45.830 --> 02:48:02.669

The Mythopoeic Society: Let's just try and forget all of this, even if the author faltered. I have faith in the Legendarium, and so did Christopher Tolkien, who solved the conflict with a new procedure of letting the mythology be mythology, and letting the history be history.

982

02:48:02.950 --> 02:48:03.800

The Mythopoeic Society: Thank you.

983

02:48:08.360 --> 02:48:09.419

The Mythopoeic Society: And you've closed.

984

02:48:09.870 --> 02:48:10.580

The Mythopoeic Society: which

985

02:48:11.260 --> 02:48:13.269

The Mythopoeic Society: she doesn't block your face. Okay.

986

02:48:15.440 --> 02:48:29.030

The Mythopoeic Society: all right. I'm going to talk about what I think changed in Tolkien's experience of himself that led him to restrict his creativity in the ways that Janet and David had just described so well.

987

02:48:30.770 --> 02:48:33.839

The Mythopoeic Society: There once was a Rabbi who taught the following.

988

02:48:34.500 --> 02:48:38.599

The Mythopoeic Society: everyone must have 2 pockets, the note in each pocket.

989

02:48:38.620 --> 02:48:43.360

The Mythopoeic Society: so that he or she can reach into the one or the other, depending on the need.

990

02:48:43.650 --> 02:48:50.100

The Mythopoeic Society: when, feeling lonely and depressed, discouraged or disconsolate, one should reach into the right pocket.

991

02:48:51.940 --> 02:48:55.159

The Mythopoeic Society: and there and there find the words.

992

02:48:55.550 --> 02:48:58.600

The Mythopoeic Society: For my sake, was the world created.

993

02:48:59.820 --> 02:49:00.690

The Mythopoeic Society: but

994

02:49:00.990 --> 02:49:02.730

The Mythopoeic Society: when feeling high and mighty.

995

02:49:03.260 --> 02:49:05.459

The Mythopoeic Society: one should reach into the left pocket

996

02:49:08.770 --> 02:49:10.219

The Mythopoeic Society: and find the words.

997

02:49:10.530 --> 02:49:12.320

The Mythopoeic Society: I am but dust

998

02:49:12.430 --> 02:49:14.480

The Mythopoeic Society: and ashes.

999

02:49:15.800 --> 02:49:24.200

The Mythopoeic Society: Now those are extreme examples, but the words in the right pocket create a state of consciousness called subjective self-awareness.

1000

02:49:24.490 --> 02:49:28.649

The Mythopoeic Society: a state in which we are totally into ourselves and our feelings.

1001

02:49:28.920 --> 02:49:31.340

The Mythopoeic Society: while the rest of the world is in the background.

1002

02:49:32.210 --> 02:49:40.320

The Mythopoeic Society: The words in the left pocket create objective self-awareness wherein one views oneself from the outside as if looking at another person.

1003

02:49:40.580 --> 02:49:44.239

The Mythopoeic Society: feeling oneself to be just one thing, among others

1004

02:49:44.290 --> 02:49:48.970

The Mythopoeic Society: nothing special, and therefore prone to criticism and shame.

1005

02:49:50.270 --> 02:50:00.969

The Mythopoeic Society: I've written before that Tolkien's creativity took place in a transitional state of mind where one does not concern oneself with whether one's experience is realistic or not.

1006

02:50:01.460 --> 02:50:09.849

The Mythopoeic Society: Objective. Self-awareness in a stream form is anathema to this state of mind, because it is all about seeing oneself realistically.

1007

02:50:11.570 --> 02:50:18.829

The Mythopoeic Society: Here's Tolkien writing in a state of subjective self-awareness. This is from his 1915 essay on Colervo Quote.

1008

02:50:19.500 --> 02:50:25.310

The Mythopoeic Society: We are taking a holiday from the whole course of European progress. Of the last 3



millenniums.

1009

02:50:25.340 --> 02:50:29.590

The Mythopoeic Society: I'm going to be wildly unhellenic and barbarous for a time.

1010

02:50:29.680 --> 02:50:38.380

The Mythopoeic Society: like the boy who hoped that the future life would provide for half holidays in hell, far away from eating collars and hymns.

1011

02:50:39.880 --> 02:50:43.440

The Mythopoeic Society: Compare that with these statements from the late 1950 s.

1012

02:50:43.750 --> 02:50:45.890

The Mythopoeic Society: First, st about the sun.

1013

02:50:46.580 --> 02:50:53.799

The Mythopoeic Society: you can make up stories of that kind. He's referring to as flat Earth cosmology. You can make up stories of that kind

1014

02:50:53.940 --> 02:50:58.950

The Mythopoeic Society: when you live among people who have the same general background of imagination.

1015

02:50:59.490 --> 02:51:04.550

The Mythopoeic Society: When the sun in their minds, really rises in the east and goes down in the west, etc.

1016

02:51:04.590 --> 02:51:16.920

The Mythopoeic Society: When, however, no matter how little most people know or think about astronomy. This is a general belief that we live on a spherical island in space. You cannot do this anymore.

1017

02:51:18.090 --> 02:51:20.939

The Mythopoeic Society: or from his pondering about the origin of the Orcs.

1018

02:51:21.080 --> 02:51:27.230

The Mythopoeic Society: It is not possible to contemplate Melcor's absolute perversion of a whole people

1019

02:51:27.270 --> 02:51:30.709

The Mythopoeic Society: or group of peoples, and is making that state heritable.

1020

02:51:31.030 --> 02:51:38.940

The Mythopoeic Society: I shake my finger on purpose, because I think that's the tone poking is scolding himself or his past self.

1021

02:51:39.540 --> 02:51:45.699

The Mythopoeic Society: So he says it's not possible to do these things now. But of course he had contemplated these very things before.

1022

02:51:46.060 --> 02:51:47.310

The Mythopoeic Society: What changed?

1023

02:51:48.360 --> 02:51:55.500

The Mythopoeic Society: Well, actually, Verlin pointed out in her recent paper fearful weapon.

1024

02:51:55.600 --> 02:51:58.490

The Mythopoeic Society: that writing the Lord of the rings is what changed.

1025

02:51:58.860 --> 02:52:00.483

The Mythopoeic Society: I agree with this.

1026

02:52:01.460 --> 02:52:08.750

The Mythopoeic Society: She discussed how audience response led to Tolkien, lacking into his logical self as opposed to his imaginative self.

1027

02:52:09.080 --> 02:52:14.320

The Mythopoeic Society: I want to add something about his state of mind and emotions that went into this process.

1028

02:52:15.340 --> 02:52:17.760

The Mythopoeic Society: So it began, even before publication.

1029

02:52:18.000 --> 02:52:22.640

The Mythopoeic Society: Tolkien 1st wrote about the round world in early 1946.

1030

02:52:22.880 --> 02:52:28.989

The Mythopoeic Society: This was during a more than year long period, when he was stuck in writing Lord of the rings he was.

1031

02:52:29.040 --> 02:52:34.719

The Mythopoeic Society: He had pretty much finished a draft of the 2 towers, and he was stuck in getting going. On the return of the king

1032

02:52:35.330 --> 02:52:40.679

The Mythopoeic Society: in Tolkien's own words from a letter. During this time he was near a real nervous breakdown.

1033

02:52:41.780 --> 02:52:48.210

The Mythopoeic Society: Instead of working on the Lord of the Rings, he wrote versions of the Downfall downfall of numenor

1034

02:52:49.890 --> 02:52:59.473

The Mythopoeic Society: one of which the Notion Club papers, by the way, contains, a long dialogue between members about whether scientific kinds of

1035

02:53:00.030 --> 02:53:01.190

The Mythopoeic Society: writings

1036

02:53:01.210 --> 02:53:05.579

The Mythopoeic Society: should have a place in fantasy. Do they help? Do they hurt it? And so on.

1037

02:53:06.420 --> 02:53:14.610

The Mythopoeic Society: So Tolkien wrote these versions of the downfall of numenor, and he later said they released him from a complex and enabled him to write again.

1038

02:53:15.080 --> 02:53:20.790

The Mythopoeic Society: The complex was his Atlantis complex, based on his terrible recurring dream

1039

02:53:20.870 --> 02:53:24.640

The Mythopoeic Society: that, he says always ended with him. Gasping in surrender.

1040

02:53:25.360 --> 02:53:26.360

The Mythopoeic Society: he gave

1041

02:53:26.500 --> 02:53:28.379

The Mythopoeic Society: the dream to Faramir.

1042

02:53:28.400 --> 02:53:30.550

The Mythopoeic Society: and this enabled him to begin.

1043

02:53:30.680 --> 02:53:32.710

The Mythopoeic Society: Resume the Lord of the rings.

1044

02:53:33.010 --> 02:53:38.270

The Mythopoeic Society: Well, it makes sense that Tolkien 1st toyed with retreating from his flat world creativity

1045

02:53:38.300 --> 02:53:44.110

The Mythopoeic Society: in an effort to escape from the emotional turmoil I think that he experienced as he approached the inn.

1046

02:53:44.654 --> 02:53:46.599

The Mythopoeic Society: Of the Lord of the Rings.

1047

02:53:47.450 --> 02:53:52.760

The Mythopoeic Society: After publication, the large readership and their many questions

1048

02:53:52.810 --> 02:54:01.229

The Mythopoeic Society: put Tolkien into a state of objective self-awareness about his work. And, as I said, that is anathema to the way he created.

1049

02:54:02.250 --> 02:54:08.850

The Mythopoeic Society: we can actually see an intermediate moment in letter 153. It's a draft of a letter to Peter Hastings, who

1050

02:54:08.870 --> 02:54:12.580

The Mythopoeic Society: had raised questions about the metaphysics.

1051

02:54:12.830 --> 02:54:33.340

The Mythopoeic Society: Cocaine responds at length to several points, but he chooses not to send the draft, and he wrote on it. It seemed to me it seemed to be taking myself too importantly. So there! He's stepping away from this objectivity and saying, You know I don't have to. I don't have to engage in it like that.

1052

02:54:34.230 --> 02:54:39.870

The Mythopoeic Society: But afterwards, in many letters which Tolkien explicated his work and its meaning.

1053

02:54:40.170 --> 02:54:43.629

The Mythopoeic Society: He's not creating, but describing from the outside.

1054

02:54:43.820 --> 02:54:49.860

The Mythopoeic Society: as he says in the letter from 1955 to Auden, quoting from the letter.

1055

02:54:50.030 --> 02:54:56.840

The Mythopoeic Society: The Lord of the Rings as a story was finished so long ago, now that I can take a largely impersonal view of it

1056

02:54:56.870 --> 02:54:59.330

The Mythopoeic Society: and find interpretations quite amusing.

1057

02:54:59.520 --> 02:55:05.879

The Mythopoeic Society: even those that I might make myself, which are mostly postscriptive, and I had very little particular conscious

1058

02:55:05.920 --> 02:55:09.030

The Mythopoeic Society: intellectual intention in mind at any point.

1059

02:55:10.190 --> 02:55:20.229

The Mythopoeic Society: But the Silmarillion was too close to Tolkien's heart to stand up to this state of objective self-awareness. He had written it with very little consideration of any audience.

1060

02:55:20.410 --> 02:55:22.100

The Mythopoeic Society: The fall of Gondolin

1061

02:55:22.230 --> 02:55:25.369

The Mythopoeic Society: deeply resonates with this World war. One experience.

1062

02:55:25.980 --> 02:55:27.490

The Mythopoeic Society: Baron and Luthian

1063

02:55:27.500 --> 02:55:30.350

The Mythopoeic Society: resonates with his early love for his wife. Edith

1064

02:55:31.550 --> 02:55:35.320

The Mythopoeic Society: harkens back to Colervo in those half holidays in hell.

1065

02:55:35.790 --> 02:55:39.860

The Mythopoeic Society: All of it resonates with his secret vice of language invention.

1066

02:55:40.010 --> 02:55:46.830

The Mythopoeic Society: and although it was playful with that phrase, nevertheless notice the shame in the phrase, secret vice.

1067

02:55:48.110 --> 02:55:59.456

The Mythopoeic Society: After he had received a mixed review of the quintessil Merillion and the guest of Barrett and Luthian, he had submitted them in 1,937 to his publishers, when they were asking for a new habit.

1068

02:55:59.880 --> 02:56:02.389

The Mythopoeic Society: got a mixed review, and Tolkien responded.

1069

02:56:02.770 --> 02:56:07.960

The Mythopoeic Society: my chief joy comes from learning that the Silmarillion is not rejected with scorn.

1070

02:56:08.260 --> 02:56:11.510

The Mythopoeic Society: I have suffered a sense of fear and bereavement

1071

02:56:11.610 --> 02:56:15.970

The Mythopoeic Society: quite ridiculous since I let this private and beloved nonsense out.

1072

02:56:16.210 --> 02:56:21.350

The Mythopoeic Society: and I think if it had seemed to you to be nonsense, I should have felt really crushed.

1073

02:56:22.700 --> 02:56:28.620

The Mythopoeic Society: I think that, having exposed his legendary in the form of the Lord of the rings to public scrutiny.

1074

02:56:28.780 --> 02:56:36.259

The Mythopoeic Society: Tolkien felt ashamed of his wishes to do anything like, take a half holiday in hell without all those people

1075

02:56:36.320 --> 02:56:37.370

The Mythopoeic Society: we're watching.

1076

02:56:37.650 --> 02:56:40.759

The Mythopoeic Society: He needed to be seen in his eaten collar instead.

1077

02:56:41.540 --> 02:56:54.540

The Mythopoeic Society: It makes sense, then, that his single lovely fairy tale, published after the Lord of the Rings. Smith of Wotton Major was not only about saying goodbye to Fairy, but also was completely disconnected from the silmarillion.

1078

02:56:54.890 --> 02:56:58.439

The Mythopoeic Society: and that's not potentially the target of so much.

1079

02:56:58.830 --> 02:56:59.999

The Mythopoeic Society: So much shame.

1080

02:57:01.160 --> 02:57:01.890

The Mythopoeic Society: Okay.

1081

02:57:02.730 --> 02:57:03.590

The Mythopoeic Society: I'm thinking.

1082

02:57:10.830 --> 02:57:11.490

The Mythopoeic Society: it's that

1083

02:57:12.090 --> 02:57:13.706

The Mythopoeic Society: right? Yeah, I'm gonna

1084

02:57:14.190 --> 02:57:31.049

The Mythopoeic Society: alright. Okay, I'm gonna start us off with one question here, and then we can open it up further. So both Owen Barfield and Northrop Fry. Note that sufficiently sufficiently advanced and theoretical science

1085

02:57:31.160 --> 02:57:51.289

The Mythopoeic Society: cross necessity starts coming back around to our earliest form of language, the metaphoric, because there's just no other way to comprehend and express its out of reaches. You think, if given the time and energy, the token might have come back around to his earlier mythic mythic cosmology

1086

02:57:51.380 --> 02:57:53.689

The Mythopoeic Society: and abandoned this scientific thing.

1087

02:57:54.390 --> 02:57:56.189

The Mythopoeic Society: it's pants, but I can speak

1088

02:57:59.109 --> 02:58:21.720

The Mythopoeic Society: I think that a lot of problem was due to the fact that Tolkien didn't have time. He was aware that he was getting older. The time was running out at some point a little bit later than the stuff that I was talking about. He realized that he realized what should have been obvious to just about anybody else for a long time before that he would never finish the summer illion.

1089

02:58:22.370 --> 02:58:24.940

The Mythopoeic Society: So mortality.

1090

02:58:25.050 --> 02:58:29.630

The Mythopoeic Society: which is a major theme of the Lord of the rings itself and of the silver Atlantic.

1091

02:58:29.980 --> 02:58:33.020

The Mythopoeic Society: became a major theme of Tolkien's life as well.

1092

02:58:35.700 --> 02:58:42.870

The Mythopoeic Society: Yeah, I don't think he was, would have been able to do that. I mean, if I understand that right. That would mean looking at science

1093

02:58:43.310 --> 02:58:47.290

The Mythopoeic Society: like when people start talking about string theory and 7 dimensions, and

1094

02:58:47.300 --> 02:58:49.110

The Mythopoeic Society: and so on, and realizing

1095  
02:58:49.540 --> 02:58:53.299  
The Mythopoeic Society: this is so incomprehensible that it becomes fantastic.

1096  
02:58:53.380 --> 02:58:54.865  
The Mythopoeic Society: But I think

1097  
02:58:55.380 --> 02:58:57.108  
The Mythopoeic Society: no, he was too

1098  
02:58:58.910 --> 02:59:03.359  
The Mythopoeic Society: lax into protecting his inner world.

1099  
02:59:03.650 --> 02:59:05.320  
The Mythopoeic Society: and I think that that was

1100  
02:59:05.490 --> 02:59:09.280  
The Mythopoeic Society: even increasing. As David points out, he was getting older

1101  
02:59:09.764 --> 02:59:21.740  
The Mythopoeic Society: his wife died and he had been, you know, very sensitive to loss all his life. So life circumstances were, I think, putting him even further in this direction. So yeah.

1102  
02:59:22.380 --> 02:59:23.080  
The Mythopoeic Society: yeah.

1103  
02:59:24.160 --> 02:59:30.559  
The Mythopoeic Society: yeah, that's very interesting. Yeah, I think that makes a lot of sense that that was running out of time and

1104  
02:59:30.800 --> 02:59:40.530  
The Mythopoeic Society: had to like another question I had noted down here as a possible question, is something that's always fascinated me, was the the

1105  
02:59:40.930 --> 02:59:45.599  
The Mythopoeic Society: the dichotomy of subcreation between the story of Ollie, breeding the dwarfs

1106  
02:59:45.710 --> 02:59:47.409  
The Mythopoeic Society: and letting them go.

1107  
02:59:47.480 --> 03:00:01.549  
The Mythopoeic Society: and theore creating the jewels, and being like unable to. And there's this odd combination



there with the mortality of. He's being kind of forced into letting it go and stop

1108

03:00:01.710 --> 03:00:10.210

The Mythopoeic Society: holding on to it. Stop niggling, and with it I don't know. It's it's tough tough situation to be facing the end. And there's so much more you want to do. And

1109

03:00:11.090 --> 03:00:15.459

The Mythopoeic Society: alright on that depressing note questions. Okay.

1110

03:00:20.160 --> 03:00:23.710

The Mythopoeic Society: my question is about talking's academic career.

1111

03:00:24.170 --> 03:00:29.870

The Mythopoeic Society: They do the same thing with his academic studies and consistently revises views.

1112

03:00:30.170 --> 03:00:31.230

The Mythopoeic Society: Finally.

1113

03:00:32.590 --> 03:00:34.559

The Mythopoeic Society: in the areas he was studying.

1114

03:00:37.990 --> 03:00:44.240

The Mythopoeic Society: And maybe you're looking at his translations. So any, yeah, yeah, I don't.

1115

03:00:45.030 --> 03:00:50.035

The Mythopoeic Society: I don't see, you know, talking to most of his really creative work.

1116

03:00:50.570 --> 03:00:51.790

The Mythopoeic Society: in.

1117

03:00:52.410 --> 03:00:54.919

The Mythopoeic Society: they say the 1920 S. And thirties.

1118

03:00:54.980 --> 03:00:56.140

The Mythopoeic Society: He didn't

1119

03:00:56.300 --> 03:00:58.650

The Mythopoeic Society: really continue on with it, and to

1120

03:00:58.660 --> 03:01:11.749

The Mythopoeic Society: became a sense of quite guilt that he'd been spending all his time working on the Lord of the

rings to the civilian instead. But I don't recall anything in his later publications or his later comments that claimed that he was

1121

03:01:11.820 --> 03:01:20.840

The Mythopoeic Society: disavowing things is one most difficult matter was this question, of what good were translations

1122

03:01:20.930 --> 03:01:30.549

The Mythopoeic Society: of the Anglo Saxon materials that he was working on at various times? He would say, no, they're no good at all. Anybody can learn to read Anglo Saxon. It's no trouble.

1123

03:01:30.790 --> 03:01:51.770

The Mythopoeic Society: And at other times he said, no, they're that. They're only good as a as a grip for remembering what words mean. But he wrote translations himself, including translation of Beowulf, and wrote a long essay about how to write translations of of that. So he was conflicted on that. But I don't

1124

03:01:51.870 --> 03:01:54.479

The Mythopoeic Society: really get the sense that there was a change

1125

03:01:54.941 --> 03:01:59.550

The Mythopoeic Society: from one view to the other in that I think it was conflicted all the way along.

1126

03:02:01.040 --> 03:02:06.770

The Mythopoeic Society: It's it's helpful that you bring up his writings, because it reminds us.

1127

03:02:06.870 --> 03:02:15.350

The Mythopoeic Society: You know he had a hard time printing those, and even before he his creativity.

1128

03:02:15.940 --> 03:02:17.340

The Mythopoeic Society: kind of froze up.

1129

03:02:17.679 --> 03:02:22.800

The Mythopoeic Society: You know, we know that there was this other factor going on with him, which is just that he

1130

03:02:23.030 --> 03:02:25.280

The Mythopoeic Society: he was a perfectionist and a niggler.

1131

03:02:25.990 --> 03:02:29.150

The Mythopoeic Society: He wrote many versions of all the great tales

1132

03:02:29.170 --> 03:02:40.140

The Mythopoeic Society: and all those versions are wonderfully creative. But they never came to an end before the Lord

of the Rings. So so he had this other thing going on. That just made it hard for him to finish things, too.

1133

03:02:43.470 --> 03:02:44.719

The Mythopoeic Society: I think. Don't

1134

03:02:44.960 --> 03:02:45.750

The Mythopoeic Society: fast.

1135

03:02:46.780 --> 03:02:48.119

The Mythopoeic Society: That's 5. And second.

1136

03:02:50.921 --> 03:02:55.479

The Mythopoeic Society: we're getting real things on the next.

1137

03:02:55.590 --> 03:02:56.939

The Mythopoeic Society: No conception.

1138

03:02:57.580 --> 03:03:00.580

The Mythopoeic Society: It's it's so disgusting

1139

03:03:00.750 --> 03:03:03.089

The Mythopoeic Society: angry with you that's not saying

1140

03:03:08.160 --> 03:03:09.160

The Mythopoeic Society: good afternoon.

1141

03:03:09.900 --> 03:03:13.590

The Mythopoeic Society: Responsive.

1142

03:03:14.290 --> 03:03:17.799

The Mythopoeic Society: We have scramble, too.

1143

03:03:20.030 --> 03:03:22.930

The Mythopoeic Society: might be 18 person.

1144

03:03:25.620 --> 03:03:32.230

The Mythopoeic Society: I want to fix the dichotomy between engagement and analysis.

1145

03:03:32.660 --> 03:03:35.650

The Mythopoeic Society: There's a maybe a little bit too neat.

1146

03:03:35.870 --> 03:03:36.990

The Mythopoeic Society: because

1147

03:03:37.190 --> 03:03:40.619

The Mythopoeic Society: Toky's concept of subcreation always

1148

03:03:40.830 --> 03:03:46.670

The Mythopoeic Society: contained a desire to respect the creative world, to make it consistent

1149

03:03:46.970 --> 03:03:49.980

The Mythopoeic Society: with itself to make it believable.

1150

03:03:50.610 --> 03:03:53.840

The Mythopoeic Society: and it seems inevitable that

1151

03:03:54.730 --> 03:04:01.999

The Mythopoeic Society: in the the course of doing that at a certain point, from making up new stuff

1152

03:04:02.180 --> 03:04:03.690

The Mythopoeic Society: to try and to

1153

03:04:04.800 --> 03:04:06.610

The Mythopoeic Society: get all the old stuff

1154

03:04:06.640 --> 03:04:07.750

The Mythopoeic Society: fit.

1155

03:04:07.930 --> 03:04:13.289

The Mythopoeic Society: And it's not shocking that this was a goal. Gonna be quite cheap.

1156

03:04:13.530 --> 03:04:16.760

The Mythopoeic Society: but doesn't. Doesn't the impulse

1157

03:04:16.990 --> 03:04:18.080

The Mythopoeic Society: to

1158

03:04:19.030 --> 03:04:22.810

The Mythopoeic Society: make things that go

1159

03:04:22.900 --> 03:04:24.919

The Mythopoeic Society: all the way back to the beginning?

1160

03:04:28.000 --> 03:04:33.250

The Mythopoeic Society: let's I wanna throw in something here. But if you guys have something to say first.st

1161

03:04:33.790 --> 03:05:01.120

The Mythopoeic Society: Well, yes. Okay. Well, I'm thinking of the way Terry Pratchett work. He would. He would find something. Oh, I invented these columns. Now I have to figure out how they work in this world. Yeah. So that I can see that as one of the major impulses of the writer fantastic. And I had written down something here.

1162

03:05:01.390 --> 03:05:05.231

The Mythopoeic Society: That's 1 of my potential discussion. Starters.

1163

03:05:05.980 --> 03:05:11.969

The Mythopoeic Society: that. Yeah. Once you start applying that math and science and engineering to. Precisely.

1164

03:05:12.110 --> 03:05:39.179

The Mythopoeic Society: I think Patrick gets around a little bit because there's more magic in his world. But the magic of story is at risk. But then reconciling that with Tolkien's own statement, in our very stories about the elvish craft of creating a belief in the world, he says, right there, fantasy does not destroy or even insult reason, and it does not either blunt the appetite for, nor the perception of scientific veracity.

1165

03:05:39.180 --> 03:05:44.250

The Mythopoeic Society: So I'm very trying to go back. And you know I can see getting there. Yeah.

1166

03:05:45.120 --> 03:05:50.910

The Mythopoeic Society: I tried to say that the impulse to come up with a

1167

03:05:51.580 --> 03:05:57.716

The Mythopoeic Society: comprehensive understanding of the universe was present in Tolkien's

1168

03:05:58.460 --> 03:06:13.730

The Mythopoeic Society: creative work from the beginning, when I said that the silver only was an entire mythology with the peoples and the languages, and of course he went into great detail even in the early days. If you look at, say, the Gwentya nomish lexicons

1169

03:06:14.292 --> 03:06:18.089

The Mythopoeic Society: into what the details of that involved

1170

03:06:18.640 --> 03:06:34.070

The Mythopoeic Society: and also he remained creative. To the end of his days. I mentioned the new minorities of the dancing bears, for instance. But what was different was a desire to simplify, to cut down to.

1171

03:06:34.950 --> 03:06:49.880

The Mythopoeic Society: but to not only control the riot of invention, but to make it into a more systematized fashion, and that, I think, was what was new.

1172

03:06:52.010 --> 03:06:57.519

The Mythopoeic Society: Yeah, I mean, you're right now, and you know the the examples I gave.

1173

03:06:57.800 --> 03:07:20.740

The Mythopoeic Society: pulling the notes out of my pocket like a dream. Move changes. Most of us don't go to either of those extremes, at least very often, hopefully, and there's usually throughout the day a back and forth between subject and stays. Similarly, creativity always involves attention to reality. Otherwise you have something that is just too crazy for people to appreciate.

1174

03:07:21.092 --> 03:07:38.370

The Mythopoeic Society: That's right. Keep both notes and be able to use both of them. And when you're creating, you know, it's a kind of a back and forth process between thinking of something and then thinking of all. If there's always an internal audience, how will this sound?

1175

03:07:39.000 --> 03:08:01.370

The Mythopoeic Society: But I do think that there's nevertheless, there was an enormous shift in the balance of these for talking, and David is describing the effect of it so well, so that he was much more shifted to away from the inspiration side of creativity and towards the making it fit side of creativity.

1176

03:08:07.380 --> 03:08:20.709

The Mythopoeic Society: I'm thinking, but I'm quilting. I have discrete expression. Then it's the the actual work. With doing it. You got to bring down the reality. Can you actually do this? How long is it going to take.

1177

03:08:21.750 --> 03:08:29.100

The Mythopoeic Society: So I think we can talk about talking big one, not it's the

1178

03:08:29.860 --> 03:08:37.113

The Mythopoeic Society: the 7 Rivers of Gonghorn Swamplateet. And then

1179

03:08:38.110 --> 03:08:43.250

The Mythopoeic Society: he realized he has just named these 7 rivers for them. He has to go back

1180

03:08:43.420 --> 03:08:52.320

The Mythopoeic Society: and figure out why they were doing that. So he does that. And those people believe it there, but he does. Team invents more simple people there.

1181

03:08:52.700 --> 03:08:59.670

The Mythopoeic Society: complained 3 with the interpretations. He has invented

1182

03:09:00.880 --> 03:09:07.490

The Mythopoeic Society: names, and these are kind of scholars that want to not say that those names are really what they're thinking.

1183

03:09:07.700 --> 03:09:10.039

The Mythopoeic Society: and most of us would just be happy

1184

03:09:10.330 --> 03:09:18.370

The Mythopoeic Society: to just come up with the names. But he does. You know. He goes through linguistically. Why.

1185

03:09:19.100 --> 03:09:28.780

The Mythopoeic Society: the fact that he's willing to not just find something, but have somebody to argue against his own explanation.

1186

03:09:37.520 --> 03:09:43.650

The Mythopoeic Society: Yeah, I I would. I would say that one thing that delights me about so much of toll keynes writing

1187

03:09:44.353 --> 03:09:45.660

The Mythopoeic Society: is that

1188

03:09:45.720 --> 03:10:07.340

The Mythopoeic Society: he has honest arguments between characters that both of the characters can the story about earlier and horrendous. For instance, both of them have legitimate points about their view of how luminor should be, and you can't say, as in so many Science Fiction stories, you know, one character is completely right and the other one could just. But

1189

03:10:07.550 --> 03:10:15.640

The Mythopoeic Society: of doesn't work like that, and also the undercutting things. A essay like the drowning of Anna Dune, which is

1190

03:10:15.750 --> 03:10:22.469

The Mythopoeic Society: within the fictive universe, a mannish misunderstanding of what the elves had told them.

1191

03:10:23.000 --> 03:10:36.140

The Mythopoeic Society: And so it's the creation of a erroneous myth within the mythic world. And how many layers can you get? That's an astonishing creation.

1192

03:10:39.770 --> 03:10:44.469

The Mythopoeic Society: Oh, my goodness, I gotta see who is first.st Okay.

1193

03:10:54.870 --> 03:11:06.989

The Mythopoeic Society: So if if we were to play like a role playing game in the middle and so on, and so forth.

1194

03:11:07.420 --> 03:11:19.139

The Mythopoeic Society: But given that we don't, we aren't necessarily playing a role I gain in the middle. Then why look for the why? There are 2 serious reasons.

1195

03:11:19.590 --> 03:11:21.080

The Mythopoeic Society: It's not to do that.

1196

03:11:21.150 --> 03:11:33.999

The Mythopoeic Society: And one is that normally people don't know how you do that right one.

1197

03:11:34.030 --> 03:11:42.329

The Mythopoeic Society: The professor would have to answer, well, that's not how individual works. There's no right in action judges, versions, and you can reach whichever one you like

1198

03:11:43.109 --> 03:11:45.509

The Mythopoeic Society: and the the other reason.

1199

03:11:45.630 --> 03:11:54.100

The Mythopoeic Society: But when we look for those interactions which don't belong in.

1200

03:12:00.780 --> 03:12:05.369

The Mythopoeic Society: but there are so many things which are not consistent with.

1201

03:12:05.470 --> 03:12:11.750

The Mythopoeic Society: But I think that's 1 of the most interesting things in talking, the inconsistencies, the risk inconsistencies.

1202

03:12:11.850 --> 03:12:29.630

The Mythopoeic Society: the ethical inconsistencies, were quite ontological inconsistencies. So the the way in which different universes and different parts of the same universe are completely kind of lose it.

1203

03:12:30.205 --> 03:12:33.140

The Mythopoeic Society: I'm wondering what what do you think about that?

1204

03:12:35.220 --> 03:12:46.850

The Mythopoeic Society: You said? Send well, said heminicity, or something. Yes. Well, I said, yes, I I wrote. I said that the you know much of the material

1205

03:12:47.343 --> 03:12:52.150

The Mythopoeic Society: host dating the Lord of the rings was consistent with it, and is thus



1206

03:12:52.450 --> 03:13:01.099

The Mythopoeic Society: canonical for those who care about such things, and I think that that was essentially a sufficient answer to your question.

1207

03:13:02.380 --> 03:13:21.769

The Mythopoeic Society: I just ended the 1st thing you said that you don't think this concept is applied so much to other places. I think it's applied all over Star Wars. World of Warcraft. Any standard fantasy thing you get a cadre of our core fans who say, this is Kenny. This is it. They're mostly on ready.

1208

03:13:23.179 --> 03:13:29.110

The Mythopoeic Society: yes, it's Tim is an expert in that. That's another session.

1209

03:13:31.460 --> 03:13:32.200

The Mythopoeic Society: Next.

1210

03:13:36.171 --> 03:13:41.100

The Mythopoeic Society: because nobody is creating, because we're

1211

03:13:41.430 --> 03:13:48.389

The Mythopoeic Society: because Virginia Woolf's created world is highly congruent with our world, and thus does not have

1212

03:13:48.440 --> 03:13:55.500

The Mythopoeic Society: the appeal for those who, like a more created fictional.

1213

03:13:55.550 --> 03:13:57.210

The Mythopoeic Society: imaginary world.

1214

03:13:57.852 --> 03:14:01.149

The Mythopoeic Society: It appeals to a different type of reapership.

1215

03:14:01.490 --> 03:14:19.760

The Mythopoeic Society: and, in fact, come to my paper on John Wayne the on Monday, and I will be talking about question of what is the good of fantasy. What is the good of reality? Because that was the main dispute between Wayne and the English?

1216

03:14:21.860 --> 03:14:29.530

The Mythopoeic Society: Okay? Interesting. Yeah. Yeah. And and you know you're bringing up these certain places where canonicity is so important.

1217

03:14:29.710 --> 03:14:30.870

The Mythopoeic Society: These are

1218

03:14:31.390 --> 03:14:45.320

The Mythopoeic Society: you. You think the real world isn't like this. Nobody. People don't agree on things. Look at them and touch them. So yeah, okay, Megan, anxious. And she's being pointed at.

1219

03:14:47.000 --> 03:14:55.450

The Mythopoeic Society: Keep keeps coming up ancillary. So my favorite part of the song really is like the fact that it contradicted.

1220

03:14:55.570 --> 03:15:14.879

The Mythopoeic Society: and a lot of that Tolkien was, or attempting to write it like into the conceit of the world to the historians right like this is from a certain perspective, certain biases. So do you think there's any extent to which Tolkien was maybe in some of these changes

1221

03:15:15.380 --> 03:15:24.960

The Mythopoeic Society: on purpose, with the conceit in mind that like, Oh, this is from a tolerity, perspective, or whatever. And I need to make this change

1222

03:15:25.100 --> 03:15:33.520

The Mythopoeic Society: because it's this guy writing it as opposed to. I need to. I need to make this fit in a big sense, and then just giving an excuse.

1223

03:15:35.970 --> 03:15:40.170

The Mythopoeic Society: It's turtles all the way down.

1224

03:15:41.320 --> 03:16:01.820

The Mythopoeic Society: Yeah. Well, he did do that. In some of the writings I mentioned the drowning. I don't see a sense of that in the round World version this is the author coming in and correcting the whole thing. He is even telling Erluvatar which way is up.

1225

03:16:02.480 --> 03:16:16.270

The Mythopoeic Society: Yeah, the classic Arab that that's the author putting words in the retrofit. Real conversations. Yes.

1226

03:16:16.610 --> 03:16:17.340

The Mythopoeic Society: hmm!

1227

03:16:22.230 --> 03:16:39.380

The Mythopoeic Society: There was a long way which you say that inconsistencies. It's the the variations that add to the richness of the overall legendary. Otherwise you end up with like a squeaky, clean star. Trek universe right?

1228

03:16:39.650 --> 03:16:40.740

The Mythopoeic Society: Oh.

1229

03:16:43.056 --> 03:17:03.110

The Mythopoeic Society: fans in the audience think of that comment. But no, yes, it would be possible for that to go too far, and you know we can imagine inconsistencies that

1230

03:17:03.190 --> 03:17:05.430

The Mythopoeic Society: throw us so that we don't enjoy it.

1231

03:17:05.480 --> 03:17:09.900

The Mythopoeic Society: But I'm not thinking of anything off the top of my head like that

1232

03:17:10.310 --> 03:17:13.080

The Mythopoeic Society: isn't Queen Ruthie, or one? They're talking

1233

03:17:13.430 --> 03:17:27.299

The Mythopoeic Society: always loved. Not always the difference. The the thing is, is, the Queen Guru feel was the one thing that came up off the top of Tolkien's head without his having already an idea of

1234

03:17:27.450 --> 03:17:30.390

The Mythopoeic Society: who she was, but he later decided.

1235

03:17:31.035 --> 03:17:34.330

The Mythopoeic Society: put found a place to put her. She was an early queen of Gondor

1236

03:17:34.978 --> 03:17:39.659

The Mythopoeic Society: for my heart I would say that the different

1237

03:17:39.830 --> 03:18:02.720

The Mythopoeic Society: that when Tolkien was actually trying to make these complexities, the types, especially the types that Megan was talking about, that that does create a kind, a great richness. And in fact, you've mentioned Star Wars. I would like to see more of that in Star Wars. It is my firm belief that absolutely nothing that happens in the 1st 2 Star Wars movies

1238

03:18:02.770 --> 03:18:22.956

The Mythopoeic Society: prior to Darth Vader, saying that he's Luke's father is consistent with his being Luke's father. I think they came up with that at that point, and made a retroactive change in the entire previous story without bothering to make any of the changes that would be contingent upon this.

1239

03:18:23.380 --> 03:18:30.200

The Mythopoeic Society: this different view. And so I see that there are 2 different mythologies. 2 different stories

1240

03:18:30.400 --> 03:18:43.480

The Mythopoeic Society: munched together without any attempt to explain what they're both doing there. A thing that Tolkien was a master at see? The 2 different stories of Bilbo's acquiring the red.

1241

03:18:43.810 --> 03:18:46.320

The Mythopoeic Society: Okay and real quickly, I'll

1242

03:18:46.440 --> 03:19:10.030

The Mythopoeic Society: inconsistencies can be good. But more important. David talked about. This is things pointed to, but not explicated, the sense of distant vistas, both in space and in time, which I'm going to be talking about, Central. To what are we allowed to go. One more question to have Luke back here. He's been wanting to speak

1243

03:19:10.120 --> 03:19:12.419

The Mythopoeic Society: one chairs per audio. Okay?

1244

03:19:12.480 --> 03:19:16.030

The Mythopoeic Society: Good touch.

1245

03:19:17.616 --> 03:19:18.970

The Mythopoeic Society: It's more.

1246

03:19:19.460 --> 03:19:20.530

The Mythopoeic Society: Okay.

1247

03:19:22.990 --> 03:19:30.369

The Mythopoeic Society: Go ahead. Comments. I would welcome John's question. Earlier

1248

03:19:31.650 --> 03:19:48.710

The Mythopoeic Society: people who study competition, composition researchers and scholars. So it's constantly we should be thinking of composition more as a process writing than a product. I'm thinking about hiring people who have more often than not

1249

03:19:48.800 --> 03:19:57.410

The Mythopoeic Society: books. Writers are the people who can set their editor aside until they agree with something, and then they can back their editor from momentum and read it.

1250

03:19:57.690 --> 03:20:07.679

The Mythopoeic Society: And what you guys been talking about with this kind of life, long process of token. And so my question really is.

1251

03:20:08.650 --> 03:20:10.030

The Mythopoeic Society: how does this

1252

03:20:10.080 --> 03:20:17.609

The Mythopoeic Society: major shift where you have to create an impetus early night, and then a very severe editor later.

1253

03:20:17.640 --> 03:20:20.249

The Mythopoeic Society: Do you see foreshadowing of that

1254

03:20:20.330 --> 03:20:22.940

The Mythopoeic Society: kind of in miniature? Early on? Does he have

1255

03:20:23.210 --> 03:20:35.259

The Mythopoeic Society: burst some energy, and then just have complete editorial over takeover, and then you make, and then native energy, and then editorial kind of shorter and shorter bursts of what's big separation.

1256

03:20:37.616 --> 03:20:47.089

The Mythopoeic Society: Like earlier. You said that it's so. It's blue. And now you said I'm wrapped that oil. Okay.

1257

03:20:47.180 --> 03:21:02.320

The Mythopoeic Society: an example of that actually mentioned where he was stuck writing the Lord of the Rings, and he wrote notion club papers and England doing that period, and that helped him. There were 2 earlier versions of motion club papers, and I can't.

1258

03:21:02.330 --> 03:21:19.900

The Mythopoeic Society: I wrote this about this in my book, and I can't pull it all together right here. But both of them happened at times when he was feeling especially exposed with either the habit just being published, or having sent the silver silver into publisher. So, and John Mccarth, talks about another period.

1259

03:21:20.050 --> 03:21:33.140

The Mythopoeic Society: 1,944, maybe, where he was stuck for a little while, and think to get himself out of it by contacting Christopher with his letters. So so that's not so early. That's during the Lord of the rings. But yeah, there was some of that.

1260

03:21:33.390 --> 03:21:38.969

The Mythopoeic Society: Yeah, I think what John is talking about here is more a recharging of the greed of batteries.

1261

03:21:39.584 --> 03:21:47.275

The Mythopoeic Society: That Tolkien had run out of inspiration, and he had a tendency of. We talked a lot about how?

1262

03:21:48.140 --> 03:21:51.420

The Mythopoeic Society: he! The story seems to write itself.

1263

03:21:51.500 --> 03:22:18.200

The Mythopoeic Society: and what he means is that his unconscious would be coming up with things, and he would. They would then go up into his conscious and consciousness, and then he would write them down. But sometimes he got ahead of himself, and he started writing the wrong thing. This is where many of these splits in character come from. He has a sense that somebody is going to meet the Hobbits. He says. Well, it ought to be Gandalf. So it is, Gandalf. And then he realizes that it's wrong.

1264

03:22:18.730 --> 03:22:35.650

The Mythopoeic Society: But that is a different thing than what you're talking about. The the creative, the editorial. I think that for most of the time, and talking these were running in parallel during this creative period, that he would work on both at the same time.

1265

03:22:36.627 --> 03:22:51.482

The Mythopoeic Society: That. Then he could do that. He had a sense of how to balance them. So it worked out pretty well most of these things. There were times where he allowed himself to get away from himself. An example of this is

1266

03:22:53.140 --> 03:22:54.470

The Mythopoeic Society: When

1267

03:22:55.170 --> 03:23:07.509

The Mythopoeic Society: Theoden meets Marian Pippin at Isengard, very Theoden's curious about their shouting smoke from their mouths. And so Mary starts relating the history of her her Blore.

1268

03:23:07.600 --> 03:23:11.880

The Mythopoeic Society: and he goes on and on and on about this until Gandalf has to cut him off.

1269

03:23:12.386 --> 03:23:29.849

The Mythopoeic Society: Gandalf was actually cutting off Tolkien because Tolkien had written so much about this that he realized that it was completely irrelevant, and he wound up, moving most of it over to a section of the prologue. That's actually Mary talking at Isengar before.

1270

03:23:30.080 --> 03:23:36.859

The Mythopoeic Society: And so he did have a tendency to go overboard off one things or another. But he could correct himself.

1271

03:23:39.690 --> 03:23:59.370

The Mythopoeic Society: All right, we're we're gonna have to stop. This has been a very fun panel, and we could go on. And I'm like 4 h. So great! Well, thank you, that will conclude well, inconclusively what we're talking about here. So

1272

03:24:02.380 --> 03:24:04.210

The Mythopoeic Society: you hear it.