

00:04:52.000 --> 00:04:58.000

Okay, we are on the hour, so I am going to get us started. Hello everyone, welcome to session 5.

00:04:58.000 --> 00:05:04.000

You're not here to hear me talk, so I'll get through the usual subject very quickly.

00:05:04.000 --> 00:05:07.000

I have just put the guidelines in the chat. Please use the Zoom chat to ask your questions during the presentation.

00:05:07.000 --> 00:05:27.000

Please remember that the Zoom chat will not be archived, so please copy and paste or take any resources or conversation you want to continue or any questions we can't get to after the presentation over to Discord where you can find the thread for this presentation, read the full bio, interact with each other, have a great time.

00:05:27.000 --> 00:05:30.000

Quick reminder to follow those community guidelines. I will not hesitate to kick you out if I have to.

00:05:30.000 --> 00:05:40.000

And that this is being recorded. Now we have I'm sure what we'll be a great presentation for our own Tim Lens.

00:05:40.000 --> 00:05:50.000

I'll give you his bio now. Tim Kehim is the Stewart for the Mithopaic conferences of the Mithopaic Society, producer of queer logins, a talking podcast, and a lifelong geek.

00:05:50.000 --> 00:06:02.000

He has been involved with the Mithopaic Society since 2,018 at HAS. Contributed to Panels at Society Events for the on the Amazon Rings of Power Streaming Series and Toxic Corners of Tolkien Sandom.

00:06:02.000 --> 00:06:05.000

10 has a PhD in biochemistry but also dabbles in media studies. These undergraduate thesis at McMaster University.

00:06:05.000 --> 00:06:17.000

Explored Cold War science fiction as reflection of the public consciousness. He is also co-host of a Jeopardy famous annual Middle Earth movie marathon.

00:06:17.000 --> 00:06:18.000

Well, take it away, Tim.

00:06:18.000 --> 00:06:24.000

Alright, thank you, Mercury. So title of my presentation is The Gay Bad of Gotham.

00:06:24.000 --> 00:06:29.000

Depictions of common queer stereotypes and tropes in DC Comics's Bat Woman.

00:06:29.000 --> 00:06:45.000

Please mind the content warnings there Batman Bat Woman was introduced by DC Comics in 2,006 and widely publicized as the first major queer superhero from the big 2 comic book publishers, Marvel and DC.

00:06:45.000 --> 00:07:00.000

The character whose secret identity is Kate Kane, a wealthy heiress with US military training, was launched as an out of the closet lesbian who was inspired by Gotham City's original hero Batman to become a vigilante and combat crime and injustice.

00:07:00.000 --> 00:07:18.000

In this paper I will examine the Bat Woman Kate Kane character as she has been portrayed in the DC Comics primary shared universe continuity over the past 15 plus years and interrogate the characters representation as it relates to a number of common queer storytelling tropes and stereotypes.

00:07:18.000 --> 00:07:31.000

These tropes will include themes of gender presentation, religion, family, and romantic relationships. But first I would like to preface with some relevant real world and in-universe background of the Batwoman character.

00:07:31.000 --> 00:07:41.000

The version of the Batoon character introduced in 2,006 is not the first to bear this name and the original namesake also has a significant link to queerness.

00:07:41.000 --> 00:07:57.000

In the now infamous infamous book, Seduction of the Innocent. Written by, psychiatrist Frederick Wortham in 1954, a number of claims were made about the supposed negative impact of comic books on the youth of America.

00:07:57.000 --> 00:08:07.000

Taken seriously by the public at the time that the book included allegations of an implied homosexual relationship between Batman and his young male ward and sidekick Robin.

00:08:07.000 --> 00:08:19.000

And looking at that picture may be fair. At the time homosexuality was still considered a mental illness in the diagnostic and statistical manual of mental disorders.

00:08:19.000 --> 00:08:32.000

Wortham's other notable conjectures include wonder, included Wonder Woman being a lesbian with bondage tendencies and that violent imagery and comic books was a direct cause of Juvenile delinquency.

00:08:32.000 --> 00:08:48.000

Seduction of the innocent led directly to the creation of the Comics Code Authority also in 1,954 a list of self-imposed restrictions by which comic book publishers would censor their publications, including banning depictions of explicitly homosexual characters and acts.

00:08:48.000 --> 00:08:57.000

In response to the allegations of a homosexual relationship between Batman and Robin in 1956 DC introduced the first character to bear the name Bat Woman.

00:08:57.000 --> 00:09:05.000

Alias Kathy Kane created by writer Edmund Hamilton and artist Sheldon Moldoff at the instruction of editor Jack Schiff.

00:09:05.000 --> 00:09:17.000

That woman was essentially a heterosexual hyperfeminine love interest for Batman designed to combat any accusations of homoerotic, unquote, impropriety between Batman and Robin.

00:09:17.000 --> 00:09:27.000

Bat woman's primary motivations seemed to be to convince Batman to marry her. Robin even received a similar love interest the first bat girl.

00:09:27.000 --> 00:09:52.000

Garrett Beatty wrote, quote, Although the original Batwoman disappeared into obscurity relatively soon after her introduction, DC's decision exactly 50 years after her first appearance to reintroduce and reimagine the character who was originally meant to play the role of Batman's beard as a lesbian is one of the most absurd, ironic, and utterly necessary moments in comic book

00:09:52.000 --> 00:10:04.000

history. End quote. In essence, these female characters were introduced to give the impression that Batman and Robin were definitively heterosexual and to divert any accusations of queerness between them.

00:10:04.000 --> 00:10:09.000

Both characters fell into disuse by the mid sixties.

00:10:09.000 --> 00:10:13.000

Jumping forward to 2006 exactly 50 years after the introduction of the Kathy Kane Bat woman DC launched a queer version of Bat Woman.

00:10:13.000 --> 00:10:31.000

Now with the alias Kate Kane, who is a lesbian of Jewish faith. That woman is commonly cited as DC's first mainstream gay superhero character, though other supporting queer characters existed previously.

00:10:31.000 --> 00:10:43.000

The creation of the KK Batwoman is co-credited to well-known comic book writers, Jeff Johns, Grant Morrison, Greg Rocka, and Mark Wade and superstar comic book artist Alex Ross.

00:10:43.000 --> 00:10:55.000

At the time these 4 writers were writing a We're co-writing a weekly published comic called 52, which followed a cast of characters and events over the course of a year, roughly in real time.

00:10:55.000 --> 00:11:05.000

Ra'ava, a straight sustained man, already had a reputation at the time as a proponent of gender equality and comic books and for writing strong female characters.

00:11:05.000 --> 00:11:14.000

He had also previously introduced queer supporting characters into the DC canon, including police officer Renee Montoya, also a lesbian who we will discuss later.

00:11:14.000 --> 00:11:23.000

DC purposely bound Bat woman to one of their tent pole characters, Batman, even going so far as to make them familiar relations.

00:11:23.000 --> 00:11:34.000

Kate is the niece of Batman's deceased mother, Martha Wayne, maiden name Kane, though this was not explicitly revealed to the readers until 6 years after Kate Kane's introduction.

00:11:34.000 --> 00:11:46.000

Connecting this lesbian character directly to Batman was a bold move at the time by the publisher as it would be more difficult for the relaunched Batwoman character to be ignored or marginalized in future stories since Batman is one of DC's most popular characters.

00:11:46.000 --> 00:12:05.000

Featured in continuous monthly publications since 1,939. The announcement that DC would be introducing a major lesbian character received international news coverage, including from the BBC New York Times and CBS News.

00:12:05.000 --> 00:12:15.000

Fan response range from praise and excitement to outrage. Certain contingents of fans complain endlessly if a character is refreshed in some way.

00:12:15.000 --> 00:12:21.000

For example, Ray swapped gender swapped or a change made to their established sexuality. Excuse me.

00:12:21.000 --> 00:12:26.000

A common refrain is that instead of changing an established character, original characters should be created instead to integrate more diverse identities and representations into Main Street.

00:12:26.000 --> 00:12:51.000

Comes mainstream comic book lines. But even when an original character is created or in the case of Batwoman reimagined after decades of obscurity, extreme fan elements still generate blowback whenever a character is introduced that does not fully align with the quote unquote traditional superhero archetype.

00:12:51.000 --> 00:13:12.000

White, straight, and with generally Christian values. Since Kate Kane's introduction in 2,006 there have been 2 ongoing Batwoman monthly series one lasting 40 issues the other 18 Batman also had her bats sorry bad woman also had a 10 issue stint as the lead character of DC Comics namesake title, Detective Comics.

00:13:12.000 --> 00:13:32.000

During a period where Batman was presumed dead. She has been featured in several of DC's Pride and Holiday anthology collections, which specifically highlight her queer and Jewish identities, as well as dozens of minor and supporting appearances in Batman related titles and other stories across the DC universe.

00:13:32.000 --> 00:13:46.000

That women's origin story begins in a military family. Both of Kate Kane's parents are career soldiers in the US Army and Kate and her twin sister Beth are moved around the world as their parents are deployed to different locations.

00:13:46.000 --> 00:13:51.000

On their twelfth birthday, Kate, Beth and their mother Gabrielle are taken hostage.

00:13:51.000 --> 00:14:02.000

During the rescue operation led by her father Jacob, Kate's mother is killed and seemingly her sister as well, causing Kate a deep and lasting trauma racked by survivors guilt.

00:14:02.000 --> 00:14:12.000

She is motivated by the loss of her mother and sister to serve her nation as her parents have and enrolls in the United States Military Academy at West Point.

00:14:12.000 --> 00:14:23.000

Where she excels in all aspects of her training. Kate engages in a lesbian relationship with her roommate, which is anonymously reported by her superior or to her superiors.

00:14:23.000 --> 00:14:35.000

Under the real world don't ask don't tell statute which was in place from 1993 to 2,011 homosexual activities were punishable by discharge from the Academy or the military.

00:14:35.000 --> 00:14:46.000

When confronted by an officer about her activities she is encouraged to lie about her sexuality in order to remain on track to graduate from West Point.

00:14:46.000 --> 00:14:55.000

Instead, Kate recites part of the Academy's code of conduct. Quote. A cadet shall not lie cheat or steal nor suffer others to do so.

00:14:55.000 --> 00:14:59.000

I'm sorry, sir. I can't. I'm gay.

00:14:59.000 --> 00:15:05.000

End quote. BD describes this event as another trauma in Kate's life being refused the opportunity to serve her country due to her sexuality.

00:15:05.000 --> 00:15:18.000

And an example of government interference in the private lives of queer people. She's asked to deny one core aspect of her identity to fulfill another service to country.

00:15:18.000 --> 00:15:23.000

Upon reporting her separation from the army to her father.

00:15:23.000 --> 00:15:30.000

He asks her why she refused to tell the officer what he wanted to hear. Kate responds, I'd have been lying.

00:15:30.000 --> 00:15:39.000

Represent representing her coming out to her father. Jacob ponders briefly, then responds with pride and his daughter's actions and acceptance of her queer identity.

00:15:39.000 --> 00:15:49.000

After her discharge from West Point, Kate experiences a period of rebellion and aimlessness, including a bout of alcoholism with no clear purpose in her life.



00:15:49.000 --> 00:16:06.000

She has several short term romantic relationships during this period, including with a bar owner on an island nation named Sophia who regularly associates with pirates and warlords and Gotham City police officer Renee Montoya who pulls over Kate over for speeding as you see here.

00:16:06.000 --> 00:16:18.000

Kate is ultimately inspired to become a massed crime fighter during a brief encounter with Batman after she handily disposes of a would-be mugger wielding her military combat training.

00:16:18.000 --> 00:16:25.000

She experiences a moment of epiphany, a parent through the artwork in the middle there.

00:16:25.000 --> 00:16:35.000

Realizing that her urge to serve her community can be fulfilled by applying her military training to vigilantism, allowing her to reclaim her both soldier identity.

00:16:35.000 --> 00:16:42.000

By re forging herself as a soldier in the war against crime that Batman has initiated in Gotham City.

00:16:42.000 --> 00:16:55.000

This can be read as an example of queer theorist, Eve Kosowski Sedgwick's concept of rapper's reading in which the characters fragmented identities are reintegrated into a unified persona within the story.

00:16:55.000 --> 00:17:12.000

Kate operates as a vigilante in Gotham City for a period without any costumer persona until her father discovers her activities and insists on facilitating full black ops training for Kate while she travels the world for over 2 years.

00:17:12.000 --> 00:17:23.000

While she is gone, Jacob Kane converts a part of her penthouse to a base of operations from which he can provide her with guidance in support as her quote unquote man in the chair and also has an armored costume made for her.

00:17:23.000 --> 00:17:37.000

He refers it to her, he refers to it as her uniform. This moment represents Kate's full adoption of the Batwoman identity.

00:17:37.000 --> 00:17:47.000

Paul Petrovic in a 2011 article highlights the necessity of Kate's earlier prioritization of her sexual identity to her back one woman persona.

00:17:47.000 --> 00:18:04.000

Quote, the key motivation for Kate's adoption of her Batwoman Persona is predicate on the military's opposition and dismissal of her due to Article 125 sodomy of the US military regulation when they learn of her transgressive queer sexuality.

00:18:04.000 --> 00:18:17.000

End quote. BD builds on this idea, adding the Kate's assumption of the Bat Woman mantle presents a manner of assuming control over her life as part of the healing process from the trauma of losing her mother and sister.

00:18:17.000 --> 00:18:29.000

Since Bat Woman was the first mainstream gay comic character, it is worth interrogating the character's representation to analyze how well the character functions as a representative of queer identity.

00:18:29.000 --> 00:18:35.000

In this particular approach, I will be assessing the character's representation as it pertains to queer.

00:18:35.000 --> 00:18:46.000

Common queer storytelling and character tropes. The concept of a trope and fictional stories refers to a narrative cliché or shorthand, which could be a written or visual device.

00:18:46.000 --> 00:19:00.000

The well-known trope cataloging. Yeah, show cataloging website, TV tropes defines a storytelling trope as a quote conceptual figure of speech, a storytelling shorthand for a concept that the audience will recognize and understand.

00:19:00.000 --> 00:19:10.000

Which may include a plot trick, a setup, a narrative structure, a character type, a linguistic.

00:19:10.000 --> 00:19:25.000

End quote. I do want to stress that the use of an established trope in a story is not inherently negative or lazy on behalf of the writer, an off-use story trope when deployed with nuance and sensitivity can still be used to strong narrative effect.

00:19:25.000 --> 00:19:32.000

While there has been considerable scholarly work examining both the successful application and abuse of queer story tropes in fiction.

00:19:32.000 --> 00:19:39.000

To my knowledge, there has been no academic treatise that has tackled a comprehensive inventory of queer tropes.

00:19:39.000 --> 00:19:54.000

Therefore in the Mythopaic Society's tradition of bridging academic and Spanish discourse, it is to the extensive community generated index that is the TV tropes website that I will turn to here for classification and examples.

00:19:54.000 --> 00:20:01.000

TV tropes will sell. 20 years of their ever expanding cross-reference database of story tropes this coming April.

00:20:01.000 --> 00:20:14.000

But before we start discussing these tropes, I do want to preface that the storytelling involved with this version of the Bat One character is dominated by examples of affluent white queerness.

00:20:14.000 --> 00:20:33.000

Kate Kane is extremely rich and extremely white. This paper deals only with the comic book version of Bat Woman, not the screen adapted version of the character that was introduced to the Airverse shared television comic universe in 2,018 and later had a 2 season series of her own from 2019 to 2021.

00:20:33.000 --> 00:20:37.000

A black lesbian from an economically disadvantaged background assumed of the Batwoman Mantle in the second season of that series.

00:20:37.000 --> 00:20:49.000

After the original actress stepped down from the part, it in this race swap and drastic contrast in socioeconomic class.

00:20:49.000 --> 00:20:58.000

Certainly opens this version of the character to more intersectional black queer representation. And also to associated stereotypes and tropes.

00:20:58.000 --> 00:21:06.000

However, that version of Bat Woman lies outside of the scope of this paper. I feel like that could have been a bingo square.

00:21:06.000 --> 00:21:19.000

The first story trope we will examine is gender presentation of lesbian characters. There is an infamous psychotic stereotype that often generalizes lesbian women into one of 2 character tropes.

00:21:19.000 --> 00:21:23.000

The, quote, lipstick, lesbian, or the quote unquote, which lesbian.

00:21:23.000 --> 00:21:31.000

The lipstick lesbian typically presents in a traditionally femme manner, makeup long hair, dresses and other quote unquote, girly interests.

00:21:31.000 --> 00:21:43.000

And is often written as exclusive, interested exclusively in other femme women. Lipstick lesbians in their flatest depictions are often written explicitly for the male gaze.

00:21:43.000 --> 00:22:03.000

Examples of characters that can be read as lipstick lesbians include the title character of the 1872 gothic vampire novel *Carmela* Theo from the 1963 film *The Haunting* and were recently queen made from the Amazon streaming series *The Boys* often placed as the opposite to the elliptic lesbian.

00:22:03.000 --> 00:22:11.000

The butch lesbian character stereotype is usually depicted as repressing their feminine femininity through clothing that would typically be considered unfeminine.

00:22:11.000 --> 00:22:23.000

Short hair and masculine leaning interests are sports, etc. Which lesbian characters are often written as childhood tomboys and treated insensitively for cheap comedy.

00:22:23.000 --> 00:22:30.000

Examples of characters that fit into the butch lesbian trope include Big Boo from the streaming series *Orange is the New Black*.

00:22:30.000 --> 00:22:38.000

Ace, a companion of the seventh doctor who in the late 19 eighties and mama Morton of the stage musical *Chicago*.

00:22:38.000 --> 00:22:48.000

The initial depictions of Kate Kane in the picture pages of 52 from 2,000 to 2,007 lean heavily towards the lipstick lesbian trope.

00:22:48.000 --> 00:22:55.000

She has long bright red hair, wears tight fitting dresses, pearls, and appears to live the life of a rich socialite.

00:22:55.000 --> 00:23:02.000

An internal narration, Renee Montoya describes her as a drop dead quote unquote drop dead knockout.

00:23:02.000 --> 00:23:15.000

Jonathan Risner noted of this depiction in a 2010 book chapter that quote Kate's elegant red dress, jewelry, and makeup speak to cliched categorizations of lesbian style and fashion.

00:23:15.000 --> 00:23:24.000

End quote. And argues that the choice to introduce a lesbian character with this appearance may have made Kate more palatable to mainstream audiences.

00:23:24.000 --> 00:23:25.000

This high fem depiction carries over to Kate's newly adopted Batwoman persona as well.

00:23:25.000 --> 00:23:37.000

The Batwoman costume is skin tight with bright red block heeled boots and her long red hair is exposed in the costume.

00:23:37.000 --> 00:23:43.000

Batman even that woman even appears to appears to wear red lipstick most of the time.

00:23:43.000 --> 00:23:51.000

It likely goes without saying that in over 15 years of stories featuring the character, Bat Woman is almost exclusively drawn by male artists.

00:23:51.000 --> 00:24:06.000

But when Batman, Bat Woman became the lead character in Detective Comics in 2,009 in a storyline titled elegy writer gregg raka and artist JH Williams the third began to play with and subvert this binary mode of lesbian gender representation.

00:24:06.000 --> 00:24:14.000

Petrovic notes that Kate is given shorter hair and the opportunity to display as more masculine in the allergy storyline.

00:24:14.000 --> 00:24:22.000

While the more femme bat woman costume, which now includes a long red wig attached to the cowl, demonstrates gender fluidity.

00:24:22.000 --> 00:24:32.000

Well, that woman's high heels shift to heal boots and the long flowing hair becomes a theatrical prop rather than a self-identification with hyper feminine hairstyles.

00:24:32.000 --> 00:24:42.000

Meanwhile, Kate's clothing draws from a queer aesthetic, if not a gender neutral one, wearing grungy sweats or full body tuxedos rather than 50 two's pencil thin drink.

00:24:42.000 --> 00:24:50.000

Pentel thin dresses, end quote. That woman becomes a performance of gender rather than an extension of Kate Kane's gender identity.

00:24:50.000 --> 00:25:00.000

Valentino Zulu applies Judith Butler's theory of gender performativity to Kate Kane in a 2,014 article focused on Williams Batwoman art.

00:25:00.000 --> 00:25:13.000

That women's wig, that woman's wig is suggested to be an expression of her femininity and essential part of her being a woman, however the reader learns with the removal of the wig that this performance of identity is simply a fabricated act.

00:25:13.000 --> 00:25:25.000

End quote. I would argue, however, that Kate Kane seems to have brought and body a broad spectrum of gender fluidity in her fashion and appearance even when we disregard the Batwoman uniform.

00:25:25.000 --> 00:25:30.000

One of Kate's love interest specifically notes that she does not dress like a stereotypical lesbian.

00:25:30.000 --> 00:25:35.000

Quote, you don't think fabrics begin and end with flannel, end quote.

00:25:35.000 --> 00:25:42.000

When Kate first meets one of her main love interests, Maggie Sawyer, they are both wearing fitted tuxedos to a police charity ball.

00:25:42.000 --> 00:25:57.000

Despite the protestations of her stepmother who accuses her of trying to draw attention to herself. But even in the situation, Kate is still wearing smoky eye makeup and bright red lipstick, combining elements of femme and mask presentation.

00:25:57.000 --> 00:26:04.000

This trend of gender fluidity continues forward through her solo series and guest appearances up to the present day present day.

00:26:04.000 --> 00:26:11.000

Kate Kane is seen to shift between and blend, I'm sorry, cake can is seen to shift between and blend hyperfeminine and moderately masculine gender presentations and fashion depending on the situational context.

00:26:11.000 --> 00:26:23.000

Escaping the tropes of lipstick and butch lesbians.



00:26:23.000 --> 00:26:36.000

Let us now turn to Kate Kane's family relationships. One of the most common story tropes related to family relations of queer characters is family members expressing a negative response to their coming out.

00:26:36.000 --> 00:26:54.000

The degree of which can range up to extreme disappointment or even parents completely disowning their children. TV tropes indexes this as a subtype of the I have no son trope in which parents have a specific vision of their child's future and learning about their queerness disrupts that vision.

00:26:54.000 --> 00:27:06.000

Examples of disownment or disappointment in a queer child in fiction include the television series Pose in which the character Damon is disowned and condemned by both of his parents for being gay.

00:27:06.000 --> 00:27:18.000

And Vivisector, a character in X-Statics, a Marvel Comic series from the early 2,000, s whose father states that whether or not the sector is his son is quote unquote a matter of opinion.

00:27:18.000 --> 00:27:30.000

Due to the sector's queer. Kate's coming out moment with her father completely subverts this trope while also avoiding the other extreme the quote unquote I've always known Trobe.

00:27:30.000 --> 00:27:46.000

Jacob Kane had long envisioned that Kate would follow in his military footsteps. After Kate is discharged from West Point Military Academy under the Don't Ask Don't Tell policy, Kate visits her father and tells her, that she has been separated from the army for violating Article.

00:27:46.000 --> 00:27:58.000

125 and refusing to lie about it. Jacob calmly notes that Article 125 is homosexual conduct and ask Kate why she could not tell the officer what he needed, what he needed to hear.

00:27:58.000 --> 00:28:04.000

Kate states plainly, I'd have been lying. Jacob is silent for a moment and then responds thoughtfully.

00:28:04.000 --> 00:28:09.000

Then you kept your honor and your integrity. I'm proud of you. Your mother would have been too.

00:28:09.000 --> 00:28:20.000

End quote. Jacob immediately accepts Kate's sexuality as well as the unplanned shift in her life's path away from the military service that both Jakob and Kate value very strongly.

00:28:20.000 --> 00:28:25.000

And on top of that, he reinforced it, reinforces that her decision was morally correct.

00:28:25.000 --> 00:28:38.000

In line with the military values of honor and integrity. In a later issue, Kate is experiencing hallucinations representing her insecurities and fears after being drugged by a villain.

00:28:38.000 --> 00:28:52.000

And she experiences a skewed version of these events in which military officers shouted her, quote, UN Clean, UN-American, disgusting excuse for a soldier, and quote, as well as the hallucinated version of Jakob Kane.

00:28:52.000 --> 00:29:06.000

Expressing disappointment with her discharge. Kate's subconscious mind harbors a worst case scenario of how these events could have played out even many years later, demonstrating the looming fear of acceptance of queer identity.

00:29:06.000 --> 00:29:13.000

There is one notable example of a parents disappointment in their queer child within Batwoman Sphere.

00:29:13.000 --> 00:29:23.000

In a story focused on Detective Maggie Sawyer, she reminisces about her abusive father locking her in his tool shed on a hot day at 12 years old.

00:29:23.000 --> 00:29:29.000

In response to Sawyer exhibiting masculine gender expression. Wearing combat boots, cutting her hair short.

00:29:29.000 --> 00:29:36.000

And telling her to teach herself how to use tools since since she wants, quote, to act like a boy, end quote.

00:29:36.000 --> 00:29:44.000

Upon freeing herself from the shed, her mother justifies her father's actions. Quote, he's just afraid you're going to hell.

00:29:44.000 --> 00:29:53.000

He loves you so much. End quote. This stands in stark contrast to Kate's family exhibiting no noticeable disappointment in her sexuality.

00:29:53.000 --> 00:30:00.000

Well, Cape Canes coming out narrative has a decidedly positive outcome. Her family life is certainly not without trauma.

00:30:00.000 --> 00:30:09.000

Her mother's murder in front of her eyes, believing her sister to also be dead for 20 years, only to return as a homicidal cult leader with severe mental health issues.

00:30:09.000 --> 00:30:24.000

Her cousin Betty badly injured by a deeply misogynistic fill in after Kate denies Betty's request to train her and even Jacob eventually betraying Kate by attacking members of the Bat family via a robe black ops military division.

00:30:24.000 --> 00:30:40.000

He had been developing in secret. We are discussing complex here. However, it is noticeable notable that none of us none of this trauma in any is in any way related to Kate's identity as a lesbian or even to her romantic relationships.

00:30:40.000 --> 00:30:47.000

Comment books, superheroes and family trauma tend to be inextricably linked. Batman and Superman are both orphaned.

00:30:47.000 --> 00:30:55.000

Spider-man loses his parents in childhood and later his uncle, not to mention the countless immediate relatives of superheroes that have taken villainous turns.

00:30:55.000 --> 00:31:02.000

Family drama can make for compelling reading due to the emotional connections involved and Batwoman is no exception.

00:31:02.000 --> 00:31:13.000

Looking outside of Kate's blood relatives the queer trope of found family sometimes referred to as family of choice also features in Batwoman's narrative.

00:31:13.000 --> 00:31:19.000

Batman request that Kate assist him by training some of the less experienced vigilantes of Gotham City.

00:31:19.000 --> 00:31:33.000

Knowing that her military background makes her better suited to this task than himself. Kate Bonds with several members, of several of the members of the Bat family feeling welcomed and embraced by them and identifying with their ideology of justice and service.

00:31:33.000 --> 00:31:45.000

So much so that when she is forced by her father to choose between joining him to lead the aforementioned rogue black ops group and defending Batman and the other vigilantes.

00:31:45.000 --> 00:31:54.000

She does not hesitate to choose her found family. Over her blood relative. This storyline was written by James Tinney in the fourth, an openly gay man.

00:31:54.000 --> 00:32:03.000

Before leaving the topic of family, I want to highlight another story by Tinian the fourth written for DC's first pride anthology in 2,021.

00:32:03.000 --> 00:32:16.000

In which Kate recalls playing the quote unquote looking last game with her sister Beth as children. Beth and Kate would dress up in girly clothes and even makeup, engaging in high femme gender performance even at this young age.

00:32:16.000 --> 00:32:28.000

And then Kate would mirror Bats move movements. But after Beth's apparent death, Kate tries to play the game on her own in a mirror and becomes frustrated when she is unsatisfied with her performance.

00:32:28.000 --> 00:32:33.000

Quote, I could only see all the ways I was doing this wrong. I wasn't a little dull.

00:32:33.000 --> 00:32:44.000

I was this bad thing from the wrong side of the mirror. Actually grows older, she becomes more of a tomboy and also starts to experience attraction to female classmates.

00:32:44.000 --> 00:32:53.000

Quote, all the other girls were talking about how the boys made them feel. But at night, I think about what it would be like for a couple of them to talk about me that way.

00:32:53.000 --> 00:33:04.000

And it made me feel special. And then it made me feel sick. End quote. Kate finally talks about coming to terms and becoming comfortable with her sexuality.

00:33:04.000 --> 00:33:12.000

Quote, it's scary not fitting in. It makes you feel like you have to. Conform to what the world wants you to be because the rules that work for the other children.

00:33:12.000 --> 00:33:16.000

They don't work for you. You feel like you're living on the other side of the looking glass.

00:33:16.000 --> 00:33:24.000

That you're backwards and wrong and looking at all the other people who fit like you don't.

00:33:24.000 --> 00:33:33.000

And you lash out and you try to control yourself and control the world but you can't do either and sometimes it feels like that's going to break you.

00:33:33.000 --> 00:33:42.000

But then you find the other people on the wrong side of the looking glass and you find yourself in them and there's so damn many of them out there and you learn that there's no reason to feel alone.

00:33:42.000 --> 00:33:49.000

You can find them and you can find yourself. And in time, you learn to love the part of yourself that made you feel so wrong.

00:33:49.000 --> 00:33:56.000

And then you find the power in that part and you learn to feel proud of who you are. End quote.

00:33:56.000 --> 00:34:04.000

Even Kate's journey to realizing her own queerness has its origins in her familiar relationship with her twin sister.

00:34:04.000 --> 00:34:19.000

We now shift focus to a topic that is often directly related to family, religion. Princess and religion have a long history involving systematic persecution of queer groups and individuals by religious sex with conservative values regarding sexuality and gender.

00:34:19.000 --> 00:34:26.000

In the West, the most prominent attacks against queer people typically originate from fundamentalist Christian religious groups.

00:34:26.000 --> 00:34:32.000

TV tropes indexes a few different story modes in which Christianity and queerness overlap.

00:34:32.000 --> 00:34:43.000

The pastors queer kid trope includes a religious leader or otherwise religious character with a child that identifies on some part of the LGBTQIA plus spectrum and this tension is played for drama.

00:34:43.000 --> 00:34:53.000

This could lead to exploration of the carrier gaze trope, specifically the Christian concept of praying the gay away in order to suppress the character's queer identity.

00:34:53.000 --> 00:35:08.000

There's also a significant component of religious fundamentalism in the heteronormative crusader character trope, an individual who believes, often for religious reasons, that any non heteronormative person is by default lesser and unnatural.

00:35:08.000 --> 00:35:26.000

These individuals unfortunately do not exist only in fiction. A combination of these tropes is parodied in the 2,004 comedy film Saved the close friend of A, dev, evangelical Christian thinks he might be gay and his religious parents send him to a Christian treatment center.

00:35:26.000 --> 00:35:42.000

Kate Kane is explicitly depicted as Jewish. Shone celebrating Hanukkah in an early appearance, and therefore is not subject to any of these family related tropes involving Christian persecution as part of her upbringing in self-discovery of her same-sex attraction.

00:35:42.000 --> 00:35:50.000

Again, the bat woman character subverts and mostly avoids the most common tropes intersectioning religion and queerness.

00:35:50.000 --> 00:36:00.000

The extent of Kate's Jewish Jewishness varies somewhat from one writer to another, but generally the Kane family appears to be of the Reform Judaism, denomination.

00:36:00.000 --> 00:36:08.000

This also makes Bruce Wayne half Jewish as Kate and Bruce Wayne are cousins. They do not keep kosher and there is no mention of Kate being bought.

00:36:08.000 --> 00:36:15.000

Though they do celebrate some Jewish holidays. If the canes were instead part of an orthodox Jewish tradition, conflict would be more likely between Kate's faith and queer identity as the Torah prohibit sexual relationships.

00:36:15.000 --> 00:36:31.000

Between individuals of the same gender and basis gender roles on biological traits at birth. Though it is my understanding that these stances are beginning to soften in the West.

00:36:31.000 --> 00:36:45.000

I'm happy to be educated and corrected on that. By the multiple Jewish people. Hey, a summary of Kate Kane's relationship to the Jewish faith is provided in Jonathan Sexton's article, Bots and Mizzas, Bats and Mitzvahs.

00:36:45.000 --> 00:36:57.000

Sorry, I guess either way. Judaism and modern, modern Batman comics, which appears in the 2022 book, Jews and Popular Science Fiction edited by Valerie Estelle Frankel.



00:36:57.000 --> 00:36:59.000

Both Sexton and Virginia P Weaver in her 2,022 thesis drawer.

00:36:59.000 --> 00:37:09.000

Both Sexton and Virginia P Weaver in her 2,022 thesis draw specific attention to Kate's knowledge of the Jewish sephara named Gavura and a motive aspect of the tree of life in the Jewish mystic tradition of Kabala.

00:37:09.000 --> 00:37:15.000

Kate Kane remarks on the colors of the costume her father has prepared for her. Quote, red and black.

00:37:15.000 --> 00:37:25.000

Divora, the pillar of severity, the colors of war, end quote. Sex to notes that Gavura is the Safira of strength associated with judgment, might or power.

00:37:25.000 --> 00:37:35.000

Justin and restraint. Perfect for a vigilante hero. Kate Kane exhibits no visible internal tension between her queerness and her Jewish faith.

00:37:35.000 --> 00:37:45.000

While TV tropes has cataloged many tropes involving characters of Jewish culture and or faith, there are notably none that intersect with queerness.

00:37:45.000 --> 00:37:58.000

Christian religion, however, is very present in the Batwoman narrative. The first group of villains the Batwoman encounters represent a perverted form of Christianity, the religion of crime, a cult that encourages sin instead of virtue.

00:37:58.000 --> 00:38:09.000

Through the teachings of their holy book, The Crime Bible. One coven of the religion of crime takes a specific interest in Kate Kane, believing her to be referenced in one of their prophecies.

00:38:09.000 --> 00:38:24.000

The twice named daughter of Kane. Kane in this case being the biblical cane, son of Adam and Eve, the first murderer in Christian teachings, and a central figure of worship in the religion of crime.

00:38:24.000 --> 00:38:34.000

Excuse me. Multiple of Batwoman's conflicts with the religion of crime take place in churches or church like settings.

00:38:34.000 --> 00:38:47.000

After surviving Several encounters with the cult, Kate is stabbed through the heart by the leader of this coven in an attempted ritual sacrifice which is meant to release a world of crime and sin.

00:38:47.000 --> 00:38:50.000

But ultimately saved by her ex-girlfriend Renee Montoya. A lesbian woman is the victim of attempted murder at the hands of A.

00:38:50.000 --> 00:39:03.000

Religious cult derived from Christianity. Her queer Jewish body is prophesied, prophecy to be the gateway to evil.

00:39:03.000 --> 00:39:10.000

And her life is saved by her former lover. Comic books often lack so subtlety in their messaging.

00:39:10.000 --> 00:39:23.000

This narrative can easily be read as a commentary on the persecution of queer people in the primary world by sex of fundamentalist Christianity that have been hijacked by extremist conservative ideology.

00:39:23.000 --> 00:39:33.000

Alternatively, it could be read as Batwoman representing a symbol of justice and goodness that must be extinguished for crime and send to thrive.

00:39:33.000 --> 00:39:50.000

Sexton examines the cult in contrast to, Kate's Jewish Jewish faith. Quote, the religion of crime reads not as a thoughtless attempt at satire of August organized religion, but as a dramatic extension of Christianity in its rejection of Jewish tradition, end quote.

00:39:50.000 --> 00:39:58.000

After defeating one leader of the religion of crime, a successor arises who refers to herself as Alice.

00:39:58.000 --> 00:40:12.000

Believing herself to be the title character from Lewis Carroll's famous stories. Alice turns out to be Kate's sister Beth who her father told her was dead, but instead has been missing for 20 years and at some point suffered a psychotic break causing the emergence of a villainous alter ego.

00:40:12.000 --> 00:40:19.000

Even Alice, wears a long white veil that Sexton notes, quote, suggests Catholic depictions of the Virgin Mary.

00:40:19.000 --> 00:40:27.000

End quote. Kate's twin having been corrupted by religion has herself become a symbol of Christian queer oppression.

00:40:27.000 --> 00:40:38.000

That one is tension with religion appears to be entirely external to her own Jewish faith. Kate has faced off against Covenants of the religion of crime more times than any other enemy of or group.

00:40:38.000 --> 00:40:47.000

And for a while actively tracks their activity. Aiming to shut them down entirely, having developed a personal vendetta against the cult.

00:40:47.000 --> 00:40:57.000

Having just touched on one of Kate Kane's ex-girlfriends, I will lastly examine Kate's romantic relationships as they pertain to off to use tropes of queer romance.

00:40:57.000 --> 00:41:01.000

Lesbians are offering stereotyped in real life as being serial monogamists.

00:41:01.000 --> 00:41:11.000

That is that they transition relatively quickly from one monogamous relationship to the next. There is also the stereotype of the quote unquote, U-haul lesbian, implying that lesbian women in the absence of commitment fearing men will often move in together.

00:41:11.000 --> 00:41:27.000

Early in the relationship. While TV tropes does not specifically index these stereotypes as character tropes, U-haul lesbians are mentioned on the page of the fourth date marriage trope.

00:41:27.000 --> 00:41:35.000

In which fictional relationships progress surprisingly quickly. Early Disney Princess films for example which often end in a wedding.

00:41:35.000 --> 00:41:49.000

Where's in our early earlier examples, Batw's writers generally avoided stereotypical lesbian depictions and queer depictions when it comes to romance, Kate Kane is portrayed as a serial monogamist and some of her relations are quite toxic.

00:41:49.000 --> 00:41:58.000

Mark and Draco and openly comic, gay male comic book writer, even wrote a scene where a gay male friend of Kate specifically calls around on it.

00:41:58.000 --> 00:42:04.000

This practice of drawing attention to a stereotypical depiction is known as hanging a lampshade on the trope.

00:42:04.000 --> 00:42:11.000

Where the characters acknowledged the trope in universe, often in an effort to encourage the reader to overlook its use.

00:42:11.000 --> 00:42:19.000

At West Point, Kane became romantically involved with Sophie Moore, her roommate, and it is implied that this relation ends when Kate is just charged.

00:42:19.000 --> 00:42:31.000

Shortly after while traveling the world aimlessly, she becomes romantically entangled with the criminal Sophia So Hale who regularly associates with pirates and warlords and is emotionally manipulative of Kate.

00:42:31.000 --> 00:42:45.000

Upon returning to Gotham City, Kate becomes involved with police officer Renee Montoya and based on their dynamic, it appears that their relationship did not end amicably these 2 characters have a slick local on again off again relationship.

00:42:45.000 --> 00:42:54.000

After becoming Batwoman, Kate quickly falls for Detective Maggie Sawyer, a supporting character from Superman Comics of the ninetys was just moved to Gotham City.

00:42:54.000 --> 00:43:03.000

They buy a condominium together after what seems to be a few months time. Kate Rafael reveals her secret identity to Sawyer and for a period the 2 were engaged.

00:43:03.000 --> 00:43:21.000

Immediately after the end of the engagement, she becomes involved with a vampiric villain named Nocturna who also abuses and arguably rapes Kate, this entire relationship is dubiously consensual as ana, nocturna admits to controlling Kate using a form of hypnotic suggestion.

00:43:21.000 --> 00:43:37.000

Kate has been also been shown dating several other civilian characters over the years. While the time span encompassing these relationships is not stated explicitly, time compression is common in serialized comics these relationships seem to take place in the span of about 10 years in total.

00:43:37.000 --> 00:43:38.000

3 min.

00:43:38.000 --> 00:43:58.000

Right, thanks. Raiders, writers, JH. Williams, the third and WA Hayden Blackman actually intended to have Kate Sawyer marry in 2,013, but executives at DC ended up imposing an editorial decision that the wedding would not happen, rationalizing that superheroes should not have happy personal lives.

00:43:58.000 --> 00:44:05.000

Williams and Blackman left DC Comics entirely because of this decision, frustrated that a queer marriage was suppressed by the publisher.

00:44:05.000 --> 00:44:18.000

There are quite a few heterosexual DC. Comics couples with long happy relationships, including quite famously Clark Kent and Lois Lane, who have been married in the comic book continuity since, 1,996.

00:44:18.000 --> 00:44:28.000

The implication then is that queer superheroes in particular should not have happy personal lives and that reinforcement of the serial monogamous, lesbian, trope, originates above the decision level.

00:44:28.000 --> 00:44:36.000

Of the creatives who work directly on these narratives. It should be noted, however, that most of the heroes of Gotham City do not have stable romantic relationships.

00:44:36.000 --> 00:44:45.000

Largely owing to the vigilante lifestyle. Out all night on patrol, often injured or in grave peril, etc.

00:44:45.000 --> 00:44:53.000

Batman himself has had many romantic partners over the years, including many breakups and reconciliation with Catwoman, Selina Kyle.

00:44:53.000 --> 00:44:58.000

At least among her vigilante peers, Batman's relationship habits are not unusual.

00:44:58.000 --> 00:45:09.000

Bat woman has yet to find a lasting romance in the character repeatedly does fall into several stereotypes of lesbian relationships as a result.

00:45:09.000 --> 00:45:23.000

Overall Batman's about women's queer identity is largely treated with maturity and nuance in most of the aspects described above K coins Kate Kanes queer identity as it interacts with her gender identity, family relations and religious experiences.

00:45:23.000 --> 00:45:30.000

Tired story tropes are avoided and subverted in favor of more nuanced depictions of lesbian women.

00:45:30.000 --> 00:45:40.000

But when considering Kate Kane's romantic relationships, the trope of the serial monogamous lesbian, rushing to connect emotionally and physically with one partner after the next creeps in and recurs.

00:45:40.000 --> 00:45:45.000

Any one of these topics could fill a paper on their own. I absolutely bit off more than I could chew.

00:45:45.000 --> 00:45:54.000

Bat women's depiction is notable for common and particularly problematic queer tropes that it avoids completely, including the controversial barrier gaze.

00:45:54.000 --> 00:46:04.000

Gay characters, meeting gruesome ends, often to advance the arc of another character and queer people are funny where queer characters are played primarily for comedic effect.

00:46:04.000 --> 00:46:18.000

Also, DC could have decided that their first major LGBTQ plus character would encapsulate neoliberal ideas of homoeroticity, long-term monogamy, child rearing, and other hetero normative aspects projected onto a homosexual character.

00:46:18.000 --> 00:46:24.000

But to the publishers credit, they presented Batwoman as somewhat of a quote unquote bad gay.

00:46:24.000 --> 00:46:33.000

Operating in grayer areas of morality than Batman and his other colleagues, possibly because she is already on the fringes of society as a queer person.

00:46:33.000 --> 00:46:47.000

That woman as a bad gay is another avenue that warrants further explanation. Rock a praise DC for querying Bat Woman when they brought the character back in 2,006 in doing so without problematizing her as a lesbian.

00:46:47.000 --> 00:47:01.000

Kate Kane's queerness has been integrated fully into her identity since her launch and Batwoman is, in the end, a dimensional and multifaceted queer character with considerable depth and psychology to explore.

00:47:01.000 --> 00:47:03.000

Thank you, Tim. That was awesome. You've reminded me why I divorced from Marvel because they do this shit all the time.

00:47:03.000 --> 00:47:13.000

I will get to your question in a moment, Jonathan, but someone did ask a question in the chat.



00:47:13.000 --> 00:47:19.000

Madeline asked, do you see the lipstick and butch lesbian tropes as inherently negative?

00:47:19.000 --> 00:47:27.000

I know a lot of real-life lesbians who identify as either lipstick slash fem lesbian as she does or a butch lesbian.

00:47:27.000 --> 00:47:33.000

And I think these are also important identities for, represent as all our gender presentation.

00:47:33.000 --> 00:47:38.000

Absolutely, I agree. 100%. I don't think I don't think they're exclusively.

00:47:38.000 --> 00:47:56.000

Negative. I think. Where the negativity creeps in in those is when they are just, you know, very one dimensional depictions when you have, like said, especially lipstick lesbian characters being written for the male gaze, you know, 2 pretty lesbians making out or whatever, that kind of thing.

00:47:56.000 --> 00:48:01.000

That's where I start finding problem, ization in it. But yeah, I don't I don't have any.

00:48:01.000 --> 00:48:08.000

I mean, yeah, any expression of gender is valid, I think.

00:48:08.000 --> 00:48:09.000

Sure.

00:48:09.000 --> 00:48:21.000

Yeah, I ask a quick follow up question. How do you decide like when you know Fem lesbians or lipstick lesbians, how do you decide when that is written for the male gaze.

00:48:21.000 --> 00:48:27.000

Like, I think there's There can be a fine line. I don't know. I, I get like, I talk a lot about the straight male gaze in my own work.

00:48:27.000 --> 00:48:39.000

So I'm not like discounting that as an important thing. To consider or discuss. But I also see a lot of when fem lesbians appear in media, the automatic assumption is, oh, they're there for the straight male gaze.

00:48:39.000 --> 00:49:05.000

So how do you like Does it come down to this like whether or not they're one dimensional or how do you decide like what counts as good females being representation versus bad, I guess is what I'm trying to say.

00:49:05.000 --> 00:49:06.000

Okay.

00:49:06.000 --> 00:49:12.000

I'm just gonna say I don't know. It's it's a that is a very difficult question, I think, and probably something that I imagine there's been a ton written on, but.

00:49:12.000 --> 00:49:22.000

Yeah, it's hard to say, you know, and there's there's probably even within the queer community would look at one depiction of a femme lesbian and say, that is offensive to me.

00:49:22.000 --> 00:49:24.000

I don't like it and other people would look at one depiction of a femme lesbian and say that is offensive to me.

00:49:24.000 --> 00:49:30.000

I don't like it and other people would say, no, I love that. I love that celebration of lesbian femininity.

00:49:30.000 --> 00:49:38.000

And it very to a large extent comes down to personal preference and and your how you're projecting your own.

00:49:38.000 --> 00:49:44.000

Gender identity and ideas of gender identity onto the page and onto the character.

00:49:44.000 --> 00:49:45.000

Alright, thanks.

00:49:45.000 --> 00:49:50.000

It's very, celluloid closet. Harvey, Harvey Fire Steve going.

00:49:50.000 --> 00:49:55.000

I, I like the, the sissy, you know, it's personal preference.

00:49:55.000 --> 00:49:57.000

Yes.

00:49:57.000 --> 00:50:01.000

So thank you. Jonathan, your question?

00:50:01.000 --> 00:50:10.000

Yeah, I wish I could just sit in. I mean, we can sit in the discord afterwards and talk to everyone about this because I have so many thoughts about.

00:50:10.000 --> 00:50:15.000

Like you said, divorcing from Marvel and, some lesbians in the male gaze.

00:50:15.000 --> 00:50:27.000

But one thing that I would bring up in regards to Batwoman specifically is The question of,

00:50:27.000 --> 00:50:38.000

Queer character and gentler presentation. And queer female characters and gender presentation versus the question of Jewish characters and gender presentation.

00:50:38.000 --> 00:50:50.000

And stereotypes and tropes such as the portrayal most commonly of heterosexual Jewish women, but also of Jewish women in general and of Jews in general.

00:50:50.000 --> 00:51:00.000

As sort of trading. Gender roles, the very masculine overbearing Jewish woman, very feminine simpering.

00:51:00.000 --> 00:51:04.000

And that this goes back all the way to the medieval period, the very feminine simpering.

00:51:04.000 --> 00:51:24.000

On Jewish man. And the question of how does one balance that out when writing a Jewish lesbian is I don't want to you know create a fem lesbian just because I think that's more acceptable to strike people, but I also don't want to create a butch due just because I think that's more acceptable.

00:51:24.000 --> 00:51:34.000

To white people, it's Gentiles. And I think that that woman is sort of a character that I've really struggled with.

00:51:34.000 --> 00:51:46.000

Watching her evolve from this place a very extreme femininity. Almost to the point. Of almost to the point of that kind.

00:51:46.000 --> 00:52:03.000

This other kind of caricature of the Jewish woman who's trying to hard to be feminine all the way to this very naturally butch character that almost doesn't read as Kate to me because I'm so you see older depictions.

00:52:03.000 --> 00:52:13.000

And watching that. Change as her Judaism has fallen into the background.

00:52:13.000 --> 00:52:17.000

Yeah, that you certainly, bring up a good point and I I am admittedly not as familiar with.

00:52:17.000 --> 00:52:47.000

Jewish gender roles and gender gender stereotypes. So I appreciate that perspective. But yeah, I mean a lot of it comes and I absolutely and and you mentioned this in your paper as well Jonathan was that some of the writers just absolutely ignore the Jewishness of Kate Kane's character and It is to the point where it makes it glaring sometimes when it is brought up even in a passing way sort of thing.

00:52:51.000 --> 00:53:01.000

Especially when you look at it in comparison and I didn't, wasn't able to focus as much here as I would have liked to on like some of the DC Comics holiday special.

00:53:01.000 --> 00:53:05.000

Like anthologies which specifically focus on Kate as a Jewish woman even over being a lesbian.

00:53:05.000 --> 00:53:22.000

Being even over being Bat woman. And in there you start to get some of those insights, but then you go to like the ongoing series and there's none of that there, none of that reflected.

00:53:22.000 --> 00:53:27.000

So it is, I mean, ultimately, I guess ultimately in that case, it comes down to an editorial issue.

00:53:27.000 --> 00:53:36.000

Right, where you have the editors that just are not enforcing any sort of real character continuity on these characters or saying Well, it's not the holiday special.

00:53:36.000 --> 00:53:44.000

We don't have to like, you know, bring up or Jewishness even if it might be relevant in the context of what's going on in this.

00:53:44.000 --> 00:53:50.000

Particular story line or whatever. Yeah.

00:53:50.000 --> 00:53:57.000

We have time for one more quick question if anyone has any, but has to be quick.

00:53:57.000 --> 00:54:04.000

Nope. Okay, well that was excellent Tim. Thank you for that. You've done a lot of work.

00:54:04.000 --> 00:54:05.000

Thank you.

00:54:05.000 --> 00:54:10.000

So thank you for everyone. If you want to keep having the conversation, go over to the Discord.

00:54:10.000 --> 00:54:17.000

Yeah, we have a break until the half hour. So we'll see you back then.

00:54:17.000 --> 00:54:19.000

Bye, everyone.

00:54:19.000 --> 00:54:20.000

Thank you.

00:54:20.000 --> 00:54:50.000

Alright, thanks.