Letters: Stalin's Orcs

Robert T. Tally Jr.
Texas State University

Follow this and additional works at: https://dc.swosu.edu/mythlore

Part of the Children's and Young Adult Literature Commons

Recommended Citation
Available at: https://dc.swosu.edu/mythlore/vol29/iss3/12

This Letter is brought to you for free and open access by SWOSU Digital Commons. It has been accepted for inclusion in Mythlore: A Journal of J.R.R. Tolkien, C.S. Lewis, Charles Williams, and Mythopoeic Literature by an authorized editor of SWOSU Digital Commons. An ADA compliant document is available upon request. For more information, please contact phillip.fitzsimmons@swosu.edu.
Abstract
Following up on his article in *Mythlore* 29.1/2, the author summarizes a recent discovery that Josef Stalin once attempted to create a superior species of warrior by cross-breeding humans and apes.

Additional Keywords
Eugenics; Tolkien, J.R.R.—Characters—Orcs
Stalin's Orcs
Robert T. Tally Jr.

In "Let Us Now Praise Famous Orcs" (Mythlore 29.1/2 [Fall/Winter 2010]), I discussed some of the ethical problems raised by Tolkien's characterization and use of Orcs, and I argued—a bit tongue-in-cheekily—that the Orcs of Middle-earth deserve some respect and sympathy. Not long after the publication of this piece, I came across an article confirming the existence of at least one other notable Orc-enthusiast: Josef Stalin. It seems that the Soviet leader was attempting to breed an army of Orcs in the 1920s.

The story is that Stalin—encouraged or perhaps dazzled by revolutionary advances in genetics and in the sciences more generally—ordered Russia’s leading researcher in animal husbandry, Ilya Ivanov, to investigate the possibility of creating a super-warrior out of human and ape hybrids. According to reports, Stalin told Ivanov: “I want a new invincible human being, insensitive to pain, resistant and indifferent about the quality of food they eat.” (Here is the point at which a World War II veteran would insert a joke about C-rations, perhaps.) Ivanov, who had pioneered techniques of artificial insemination in racehorses, set about attempting to inseminate chimpanzees with human sperm, only to achieve the sort of results we know today would have been inevitable. More appalling, this program also used human “volunteers” inseminated with ape sperm. Ivanov’s failure in this project, undoubtedly combined with other disappointments and consistent with Stalin’s treatment of others, must have led to his imprisonment and exile; he died in Kazakhstan around 1932. An account is available here: http://news.scotsman.com/world/Stalins-halfman-halfape-superwarriors.2688011.jp.

Of course, Stalin and Ivanov weren’t thinking of Orcs exactly, but given the value placed upon Orcs by Melkor, Sauron, and Saruman, one can easily imagine that this interbreeding of man and ape had similar aims. As noted in my article, there are different theories as to the origins of Orcs in Tolkien’s world, but the most likely explanation is that they are bred (and “corrupted”) from Elves or Men. Also, we know of interbreeding among the races, with the Silmarillion and The Lord of the Rings recounting at least one Maia-Elf marriage (Melian and
Thingol), three Man-Elf unions (Beren/Luthian, Tuor/Idril, and Aragorn/Arwen),
and most notoriously, the interbreeding by Saruman of Orcs and humans. As
Gamling notes just before the Battle of Helm’s Deep in The Two Towers, “these
creatures of Isengard, these half-orcs and goblin-men that the foul craft of
Saruman has bred, they will not quail at the sun” (III.vii.536). The point is not
just that Saruman has created a hybrid of Man and Orc, but that such a being is
more capable of fighting (among other things, through not being daunted by
sunlight) than the normal adversary. Saruman has accomplished what Stalin had
futilely dared: to create a class of super-warriors through interbreeding.

In his preface to The Lord of the Rings, Tolkien definitively rejected any
allegorical reading of the work, arguing that, had he meant for the War of the
Rings to represent the Second World War, then “Saruman, failing to get
possession of the Ring, would in the confusion and treacheries of the time have
found in Mordor the missing links in his own researches into Ring-lore, and
before long he would have made a Great Ring of his own” (Prologue.xxiv).
Tolkien here mildly rebukes those readers who would associate Sauron with
Hitler, Saruman with Stalin, and the Ring with the atomic bomb, or who would
invoke such similarly “topical” interpretation of the work. I certainly do not wish
to reassert any crudely allegorical meaning for Tolkien’s masterpiece, but the
story of Stalin’s Orc-breeding dream (if I may term it such) shows once more the
degree to which Tolkien’s world is not quite so far from our own.

In his wartime letters to his son Christopher, then fighting the Germans
as a member of the R.A.F., Tolkien compared the enemy to Orcs, but he also
noted that the result of “attempting to conquer Sauron with the Ring” was “to
breed new Saurons, and slowly turn Men and Elves into Orcs,” although he
added that things are not so clear cut, “and we started out with a great many
Orcs on our side” (L 78). Indeed, in a letter sent just three weeks later, Tolkien
averts: “I think the orcs are as real a creation as anything in ‘realistic’ fiction: [...]’
only in real life they are on both sides, of course” (82). These metaphorical
references only show that Tolkien was well aware of the significance of Orcs in
our understanding of the real world, even if Orcs are not actual beings of the sort
Stalin hope to unleash upon the enemies of the U.S.S.R.

At the risk of seeming churlish once more, I would say that the story of
Stalin’s plan to breed a race of super-warriors presents another occasion for
sympathizing with Tolkien’s Orcs, who—like all of us—did not ask to be born
and who are doing their best to make their way in this world not of their
choosing.