

MYTHPRINT

The Monthly Bulletin of The Mythopoeic Society

Volume 15

APRIL 1977

Number 4

REVIEW

LETTER

Clyde S. Kilby, *Tolkien and the Silmarillion*
(Wheaton, Ill., 1976, 89 pp., \$3.95)

Tolkien and the Silmarillion is a most absorbing book. All Tolkien admirers hunger for more tales from his special genius and the discussion of various unpublished works awakens our thirst anew. Here Clyde S. Kilby, Curator of the Marion E. Wade Collection at Wheaton College, brings together many observations which have up till now not been available in print anywhere.

Kilby so unpretentiously and matter-of-factly shares some intimate glimpses of Tolkien the man, including his histrionic gusto, daily habits, and deep devotion to his family as well as his lack of self-confidence and "contrasistency". It seemed to me, reading this up-close account of the creator of Middle Earth, that his genius was both fostered by the British educational system and also thwarted by it. Who knows what other riches he might have left us had it not been for the extreme combativeness and cutting criticism one must deal with in that tradition. Or perhaps the rigors of the system were used to sharpen such a special imagination.

Tolkien seems to have been almost pathologically the perfectionist. As a student of 20th century literature who has read more than my share of drivel, I ardently wish for more unperfected work from Tolkien -- his juvenilia might well be better than other authors' touted best. I also detect from Kilby's account that Tolkien's age (74 in the summer Kilby worked with him) was perhaps the other chief impediment to his finishing the *Silmarillion* and other work. So many who approach man's "three score and ten" begin to draw the circle of life smaller and smaller so they can finally let go of it. It is a rare genius who completes big projects in his 70's and 80's.

To call the reading fascinating is not blurb-talk in this case. We naturally respond to new insights about writers as many-sided as Tolkien, C.S. Lewis, and Charles Williams (Kilby comments on them all in this book because of their great friendship). We also find some compelling analysis of Tolkien as a Christian artist and of the nature of mythic literature. My only complaint is that the book ended too soon, though it ended where it had to, for Clyde Kilby does not grand-stand; he writes because something needs to be said and when he has been as faithful to his subject as he can, he ends the discussion, though here poising certain points so that we are invited to wonder, to rejoice, and to delve into the larger mysteries of art and faith. — reviewed by Corbin S. Carnell

Christopher Gilson

Lafayette, Ca.

Jessica Kemball-Cook offered an intriguing note in the February *Mythprint* on the name BELERIAND. Her preliminary answers to her own rhetorical question, "Where was Belerian? Somewhere in the West", together with some vague geographic conclusions from various mentions in the text, however, seem an inadequate appraisal of the evidence. "We shall know for sure when *The Silmarillion* comes out" is by now a common rejoinder to musings about the First Age, and there is little doubt that the lands of that epoch lost in the Third Age will be mapped out for us; but as Clyde Kilby has succinctly noticed (in *Tolkien and The Silmarillion*, p. 45), much knowledge of the Elder Days is already available in the hints from *The Lord of the Rings* and *The Hobbit*, and he seems to suggest that some matters will become no clearer than they already are. So it is worthwhile to carefully assess the facts at hand in preparation for the revelations to come.

As Ms. Kemball-Cook points out, Belerian touched the coast somewhere, for in App. F, RK:406, we are told the Sindar, "coming to the shores of Middle-earth, had not passed over the Sea but had lingered on the coasts in the country of Belerian." But we have other geographic touch-stones. As a sidelight on the antiquity of the Barrow-downs (App. A, RK:231) we learn of their association with the forefathers of the Edain, before they crossed the Blue Mountains into Belerian of which Lindon is all that now remains." This migration is again mentioned (App. F, RK:406): The Edain "came west into Belerian in the First Age, and aided the Eldar in the War of the Great Jewels." So we know that Belerian reached from the western marches of the Ered Luin, Third Age Lindon, to some point on the shore line. And it is significant, I think, that the Edain are twice stated to have passed into Belerian, rather than to have passed through it to found a realm somewhere beyond its borders. For there is reason to associate the Edain with each of the Elvish realms of the West of Middle-earth in that era that we know of

The hidden city of Gondolin is perhaps the most evocative of the lost localities. Of its king, Turgon, we know little more than his name, and that of his daughter, Idril Celebrindal. But we find an interesting hint of his history in *The Hobbit* (p. 62, Ballan. 61). There Elrond is discussing the swords found by Thorin and Company, of which he says:

They are old swords, very old swords of the High Elves of the West, my kin. They were made in Gondolin for the Goblin-wars. They must have come



© 1977, The Mythopoeic Society

Mythprint, published monthly, is the
Bulletin of The Mythopoeic Society.

Second Class Postage Paid
at [redacted]

Return Postage Guaranteed

from a dragon's hoard or goblin plunder, for dragons and goblins destroyed that city many ages ago. This, Thorin, the runes name Orcrist, the Goblin-cleaver in the ancient tongue of Gondolin; it was a famous blade. This, Gandalf, was Glamdring the foe-hammer that the king of Gondolin once wore.

Elrond specifies that Orcrist is Elvish. That it were an archaic Sindarin form would be consonant with our knowledge of that tongue: older orc would give Third Age orch and -rist 'cleave' appears watered down in Imladris 'glen of the cleft.' He does not say the same of the other sword name. And in fact, as Paula Marmor pointed out to me long ago, Glamdring appears to be Germanic not Elvish. Old English dreng and Old Icelandic drengr mean 'youth, warrior', and there is a Middle English word glam, related to modern glaum and clam, the plural of which glammis means 'the iron jaw of a vice'. Thus a Proto-Germanic name like Glamb-drengan '(metal) pressing against a warrior' might render an Adannic name meaning 'Foe-hammer'. (Recall that in translating the Red Book Tolkien uses Old English to render the language of Rohan and Old Icelandic to render the language of Dale, seen in the outer names of the Dwarves; and that of Men of both these regions were distantly related to the Edain.) Glamdring probably translates the Westron form of the sword-name, since that would be the result of the Proto-Germanic name developing into English.

It may be that Elrond, upon reading the runic name on the sword, immediately translated it from Elvish into its contemporary Mannish form. The sword of Turgon was probably remembered in the song and lore of his Dunedain relatives. But the Dunedain could still use the Sindarin tongue and seem to have preserved the names of their Elvish heritage as well as their Adannic. Turgon as well as Hador, Dior as well as Barahir have their name-sakes among the Stewards. That Elrond used a Mannish name for this sword suggests that its original name was Adannic. Perhaps it was commissioned by Huor as a gift of friendship and alliance for Turgon, an alliance later realized for all time in the marriage of their children. Or perhaps it was a gift from Tuor at the time of his marriage to Idril. Surely some group of the Edain arrived at the realm of King Turgon, if not actually finding its hidden capitol.

Earendil the Mariner, son of Tuor, was born in Gondolin. Within its environs we can possibly locate Arvernien where he "tarried" before his wanderings, and the forest of Nimbrethil, 'White-birch', where the timber for his boat was "felled," may have lain near to Gondolin. The name of Turgon's realm may have been Gondobar. This occurs in a poem by Tolkien published in 1927 in a verse anthology, Realities, edited by G.S. Tancred. The poem is called "The Nameless Land" and contains the following lines:

I dream I see a wayward star,
Than beacon towers in Gondobar
More fair, where faint upon the sky
On hills imagineless and far
The lights of longing flare and die.

Gondobar is clearly Sindarin. Gondo- appears in Gondolin itself, while bar corresponds to Quenya mar 'dwelling' in Valimar and Eldamar (much as Sindarin dor corresponds to Quenya nor.) "The Fall of Gondolin," one of Tolkien's earliest compositions was apparently completed by 1921. For Nevil Coghill's first meeting with Tolkien at Oxford was to ask him to deliver a paper to his college essay club, and Tolkien offered to read "The Fall of Gondolin" (see Daniel Grotta-Kruska, Tolkien, Architect of Middle Earth, p. 54-5). Tolkien left Oxford to take up his Readership at Leeds in 1921. So the timing is consistent with our postulated context for the name Gondobar.

Of the other recorded city of the High Elves, Nargothrond, its contact with the Edain is more firmly established. Finrod Felagund, Friend of Men, was King of Nargothrond. He is said to have given a ring to Barahir, which "Beren recovered at great peril," (RK:322 n.) And the friendship it symbolized was so keen that he "gave his life to save

Beren son of Barahir" (RK:368), perhaps the immediate prequel to Beren's flight into Doriath from "mountains cold."

Felagund may be the Germanic translation of an Adannic cognomen approximating 'Friend of Men.' The first part of the name resembles Old Icelandic felag, which means 'partnership' in the sense of laying together property (Old Icel. fé = Old Engl. feoh = Latin pecu 'cattle'; Gothic lagjan 'lay', Old Engl. lagu 'law, i. e. thing laid down'.) Félag is cognate with English fellow. The suffix -nd is the form of the present participle in Germanic. So Felagund could mean something like 'aying down property (in friendship)' or '(living) property being laid or offered' in the sense that Finrod is willing, and proves his willingness, to lay down his life in friendship. Whether we are correct in this etymology, there is little doubt that the Edain arrived at Nargothrond.

Of the geography of Nargothrond we know less than that of Gondolin. But we can perhaps provide one descriptive tidbit, as an aside. Morgoth is described as the "Dark Power" (RK:406, 409). If this is a literal translation of his name, and goth means 'power', then Nargothrond would be 'Hall of the Power of the Sun'. The High Elves as a whole revered Telperion the White and its fruit Galathilion, 'Tree of moons', emblazoned by Celebrimbor on the West-gate of Moria as though bearing crescent moons. The white light of the Eldest of trees, it seems, is thus associated with moonlight. May not the blonde house of Finarphir have had a similar special affinity to the younger Golden Laurelin, whose light is to be associated with the warmth of the Sun? Certainly Finrod's sister, Galadriel, took pains to surround herself with golden trees, though regrettably "no likeness remained in Middle-earth of Laurelin." (RK:314 n.) Perhaps a descendent of the Golden Tree imbued the court of Nargothrond with its warmth before the city fell.

In the appendices the king of the Sindar dwelling in Beleriand is thrice referred to as "Thingol of Doriath" (RK:314, 397, 406), so surely this region was part of Beleriand. Elrond call his great-grandmother "Lúthien of Doriath" (FR:256). About this land we are told that Beren fought spiders "in the Mountains of Terror in Doriath, and so came to Luthien" (TT:332), and on the same theme, that "Beren escaping through great peril came over the Mountains of Terror into the hidden Kingdom of Thingol in the forest of Neldoreth. There he beheld Lúthien... beside the enchanted river Esgalduin" (FR:206). Treebeard mentions this forest, calling it also Taur-na-neldor 'forest in the three (or third ?) land(s)', perhaps a reference to the lands of the Grey-elves, the Exiles, and the Edain, or else of the Three Kindreds of the Eldar in the beginning. The remnants of each of the Three Kindreds together formed the Sindar, who alone of the Eldar remained before the return of the Exiles. Doriath itself probably means 'the lands' (collectively) in the sense that Thingol was the only Grey-elf of his time whose lands were his own without recognizing any other overlord.

So we see that the Edain came over the Blue Mountains into Beleriand and there came upon Gondolin (in Gondobar ?), Nargothrond, and Doriath in Neldoreth. And Elrond speaks of the grand alliance which defeated Morgoth, composed of the crucial "Host of Valinor" (App. B, RK:363) come in answer to the envoy of Earendil, together with the armies of the Noldor, the Sindar, and the Atani. He calls this alliance the "hosts of Beleriand" (FR:256). In the total the various mentions of BELERIAND seem then to best fit the interpretation that this was the name of the whole great peninsula of First Age Middle-earth extending westward from Third Age Lindon. This is by far the most usual reading of Tolkien by commentators, at least in my experience. Glen GoodKnight, who was shown a map of the First Age lands west of the Blue Mountains by Christopher Tolkien, called it a "map of Beleriand" (Mythprint, Dec. '75, p. 7). Whether this is actually independent evidence for the interpretation outlined here, Glen can best say.

(I called it a "map of Beleriand" because that was indeed how it was described to me by Christopher Tolkien. Beler-

land is a very large peninsula laying west of the Blue Mountains. — G. G.)

Besides Diodorus of Sicily, Belerion is mentioned by one other ancient writer, Ptolemy, in his Geography, written (also in Greek) in the 2nd century. His spelling is a more corrupt Bolerion. His information, at a further remove, is also derived ultimately from Pytheas of Massilia.

As for the formal relationship between Beleriand and Belerion, I think that the informed reader is intended to view the name Belerion (whose history can be traced to the 3rd century B.C., but beyond that is obscure) as a distant folk-memory of the Elvish name Beleriand. This parallels other such memories in Britain: Manwe and his wife Varda/Elbereth 'the Exalted Star-queen' are apparently seen in the Welsh Manawydan and his wife Rhiannon 'Great/Divine Queen'. Orome/Araw, Huntsman of the Valar is remembered as the Welsh Arawn, seen hunting in the beginning of the First Branch of the Mabinogi. These lords of the West (in Sindarin Annûn) are connected with the Celtic Otherworld, Annwfn. (These correspondences are mentioned by Sandra Miesel in Myth Symbol and Religion in the Lord of the Rings.) The name of Aule the Smith may be distantly echoed in Wayland, Old English Welund, Norse Volund, Valent. This underlying system is more than the "scholarly in-joke" that Ms. Kembball-Cook suggests.

Finally I would note that, however intriguing her comments on Beleriand, her discussion of the name Moria is hopelessly inadequate. Exemplary of this is her statement that "Tolkien avoids latinized words like the plague." This is apparently an oversimplification of a statement of Tolkien's, taken entirely out of context. In Appendix F II "On Translation", where Tolkien is discussing Hobbit-names, he tells us that in some old families such as the Tooks and Bolgers they chose "high-sounding first-names" whose meanings they did not remember and which turn out to resemble Mannish names of the Wilderland area. To convey the feel of these names to the reader Tolkien "translates" them into high-sounding names of English usage or history which are yet akin to the Germanic origins of our tongue, specifically Frankish and Gothic names. (These can be found in the family tree of the Tooks.) Tolkien then says that "Names of classical origin have rarely been used; for the nearest equivalents to Latin and Greek in Shire-lore were Elvish tongues, and these the Hobbits seldom used in nomenclature." But the exclusion is not total. In fact the most familiar to us of the Tooks, Peregrin, bears a latinized name (from Lat. peregrinus 'stranger, foreigner', related to peregrinari 'to travel in foreign countries' and the source of English pilgrim as well as peregrine falcon.)

This has only to do with translated Hobbit-names. Not having used Latin for the linguistic sphere of Northern Middle-earth, Tolkien was free to translate a name from some unidentified language of the South into Latin, specifically Incanus, Gandalf's name "in the South", which means 'quite grey' in Latin (as mentioned before in Mythprint.) It was probably from this same southern language or a related one that the North derived its word rendered as Oliphant. This is Middle English from Old French olifant from popular Latin olifantum from Classic elephantum from Greek elephanton, of unknown origin.

All of this has little or nothing to do with Elvish, which has been left untranslated in its original forms. But similarities in both form and meaning between various Elvish words and those of languages of this era have been observed long ago, and Latin is no exception. Some examples are: Quenya aure 'day', Lat. aurora 'dawn'; Qu. cala 'light', Lat. calor 'heat'; Sindarin cel 'running' (Celduin), Lat. caler 'swift'; Qu. cor 'circle' (coranar 'sun-round', corma 'ring'), Lat. corona 'crown, circlet'; Sindarin fen 'door', Lat. fenestra 'window, opening'; Qu. lambe 'tongue', Lat. lambere 'to lick'; Qu. macar 'swordsman' (Menelmacar), Lat. machaera 'sword'; Qu. nainie 'lament', Lat. naenia 'dirge, 3

mournful song'; Qu. râma 'wing', Lat. râmus 'branch'; Qu. vala 'angelic power', Lat. valere 'to be powerful'; Qu. van- 'pass away' (avânier 'have passed away', vanwa 'lost', vanimelda 'absent friend'), Lat. vānescere 'to pass away'. These similarities were compiled by Paula Marmor (and a few have been rediscovered in the pages of Mythprint) and she has equally numerous examples for most major European languages of the past. I would cavil at designating any Latin word to be the "source" of any particular Elvish word or name. But in the light of so many resemblances I would be unwilling to categorically deny this in any particular case. And that goes for the name Moria as well.

((I might say on behalf of Jessica Kembball-Cook that she has been receiving Mythprint for less than two years. She has ordered back issues, but may have not yet been able to review all of them to obtain the information you cite. —G.G.))

8th annual Mythopoeic Conference

The tentative date is August 26 to 29. The location will probably be in Southern California. More details will be given in the next issue.

The Theme: The Other (than The Hobbit and The Lord of the Rings) Works of J. R. R. Tolkien. These works include, among others, The Adventures of Tom Bombadil; Beowulf — The Monsters and the Critics; Farmer Giles of Ham; "Imram"; "Lay of Aotrou and Itroun"; "Leaf by Niggle"; "On Fairy-stories"; The Road Goes Ever On; Songs for the Philologists; and Smith of Wootton Major.

You may give your paper in person, or have it read for you. Papers related to the theme are particularly encouraged, but other papers related to the Society's interests are by no means discouraged. Papers may be prepared of various lengths, but should be ordered to permit not more than 22 pages of manuscript actually to be read, so as to fit in with time schedules. It is important that you inform Gracia Fay Ellwood, the Papers Coordinator, as soon as possible of your desire to write a paper and what it plans to cover. Her address is: [REDACTED]

BALLOT

Because of the as yet light vote on the Bylaw amendment given in the January 1977 Mythprint, the Council of Stewards has voted to extend the deadline from January 31 to April 30, 1977 for post marked ballots to be accepted.

CONSIDER THE ISSUE, AND THEN MAIL YOUR VOTE. See the January 1977 issue of Mythprint for statement of possible compromise. In summary, those in favor of the amendment would like to see Mythlore enlarged from 40 to 48 pages an issue, and see Mythprint published 8 instead of 12 times a year — with 4 of the 8 issues included in Mythlore — and the other 4 issues published between issues of Mythlore, but enlarged from 4 to 6 or 8 pages. Those not in favor of the compromise amendment basically do not wish to see Activity Calendar information published less frequently than 12 times a year. DECIDE AND VOTE. Please send a hand written or typed facsimile or xeroxed copy of the ballot, along with your name on the outside of the envelope (so your current membership can be verified):

BALLOT

I favor the proposed change as described in the January 1977 Mythprint regarding Mythlore and Mythprint, and thus the removal of the word "monthly" from Article VIII, Section 2, sentence 1 of the Bylaws of the Mythopoeic Society.

YES NO

Send your ballot to the Society's Recording Secretary, George Colvin, [REDACTED].

Activity Calendar

Discussion Group Meetings

AVALON

Info: Kim Bulot

*April 16, Sat., 7pm

"Sex and Perversion in LotR" at Pam Quiring's home,

Northern Cal. groups interested in a Spring Picnic please contact Kim Bulot.

DESOLATION OF SMAUG

Info: Meg Garrett

*April 2, Sat., 8pm

"Hell Twice Warmed Over: Dante's Inferno and Niven and Pournelle's Inferno at the McMenemy's,

SUTTON HOO

Info: Dolores Espinosa

*April 10, Sunday, 2:30pm

Excalibur by Sanders Anne Laubenthal at the home of Gracia Fay Ellwood,

LOTHLORIEN

Info: Anne Wilson

*April 16, Sat. 8pm

"Works of Lord Dunsany" at Pat Lammerts,

CHAPTER OF THE ELFIN MARCHES

Info: Antoinette Brenion

*April 23, Sat. (time not given)

Lest Darkness Fall by L. Sprague DeCamp at the home of Mike Urban,

GALADHREMMIN ENNORATH

Info: Grace or Dave Lovelace

*April 16, Sat. 7:30pm

The Horse and His Boy by C.S. Lewis at the Lovelace's (see Above)

FORNOST

Info: Marci Helms

*April 24, Sunday, 7:30pm For other info contact

*May 29, Sunday, 7:30pm Marci Helms

CRICKHOLLOW

Info: Joanne Burnett

*April 17, Sunday, 2pm

The Lion, the Witch and the Wardrobe by C.S. Lewis Contact Joanne for place

PRANCING PONY

Info: Eileen Ribbler

April — Knee Deep in Thunder by Sheila Moon

May — Lilith and Phantastes by George MacDonald

Contact Eileen for dates, times, and locations

BRIDGE OF KHAZAD-DUM

Info: Willi Spice

*April 22, Friday, 7:30pm, contact Willi for topic. Meeting on the bridge of South Campus

Welcome to our Newest Group

RHOSGOBEL

Info: Charles R. Butler III

Contact Charles for meeting info

New Groups Forming

Info: Ellie Farrell

Info: Greg Everitt

Info: Mark Newbold

Info: Kevin Keach (?)

Anyone interested in Lewis oriented correspondence, contact Margaret L. Carter,

Special Event

The Tenth Annual Southern California Spring Picnic will be held at 2pm, Sunday, April 17, at the top of the hill of [redacted], on half block west of the intersection of [redacted] and [redacted]. Plan to come for a festive time. For further information, contact Meg Garrett [redacted]

A Call for Papers

There have been sessions for Lewis and Sayers for several years at the Conference of the Modern Language Assoc. One is being planned for Charles Williams for 1977. Under new procedure names of participants in the sessions (those giving papers) must be submitted by May 1. Those wishing to submit a paper, therefore, should send the paper, or a detailed abstract of it to the appropriate discussion leader by April 1, 1977 (for Williams — April 10th). Papers on Lewis should focus on his fiction; papers on Williams and Sayers may be on any aspect of their writing. For Lewis write to Peter J. Schakel, Dept. of English, [redacted] for Williams to Glen H. GoodKnight, [redacted]; for Sayers to Margaret Hamay, [redacted]

IMPORTANT PLEASE READ

Please check your label to find the expiration date. It is usually on the top line after your name. If it says 5/77(15) it means you will get next month's Mythprint (May '77) as your last issue unless you renew. The (15) part means you have already been sent your last issue of Mythlore (#15). If your label does say 5/77 (15), please renew as soon as possible. If it says 8/77(16) please plan to renew now.

This issue of Mythprint is brought to you for free and open access by the [Mythopoeic Society](#) at the [SWOSU Digital Commons](#).

For more issues of Mythprint go to https://dc.swosu.edu/mythprint/all_issues.html

To join the Mythopoeic Society, go to: <http://www.mythsoc.org/join.htm>

Authors and artists of items in this issue may request to have their materials removed from the digital repository. To do so, contact the platform administrator at archives@mythsoc.org or the *Mythprint* editor at mythprint@mythsoc.org.

