



Mythopoeic Society

mythLORE

A Journal of J.R.R. Tolkien, C.S. Lewis,  
Charles Williams, and Mythopoeic Literature

---

Volume 9 | Number 4 | Issue 34, Winter

Article 18

---

12-15-1983

## An Inklings' Bibliography (23)

Joe R. Christopher

(emeritus) Tarleton State University, Stephenville, TX

Follow this and additional works at: <https://dc.swosu.edu/mythlore>



Part of the [Children's and Young Adult Literature Commons](#)

---

### Recommended Citation

Christopher, Joe R. (1983) "An Inklings' Bibliography (23)," *Mythlore: A Journal of J.R.R. Tolkien, C.S. Lewis, Charles Williams, and Mythopoeic Literature*: Vol. 9 : No. 4 , Article 18.

Available at: <https://dc.swosu.edu/mythlore/vol9/iss4/18>

This Article is brought to you for free and open access by SWOSU Digital Commons. It has been accepted for inclusion in Mythlore: A Journal of J.R.R. Tolkien, C.S. Lewis, Charles Williams, and Mythopoeic Literature by an authorized editor of SWOSU Digital Commons. An ADA compliant document is available upon request. For more information, please contact [phillip.fitzsimmons@swosu.edu](mailto:phillip.fitzsimmons@swosu.edu).

To join the Mythopoeic Society go to: <http://www.mythsoc.org/join.htm>



## Mythcon 50

Looking Back, Moving Forward

San Diego, California

August 2-5, 2019

### An Inklings' Bibliography (23)

**Abstract**

This Bibliography is an annotated checklist covering both primary and secondary materials on J. R. R. Tolkien, C.S. Lewis, Charles Williams, and the other Inklings.

# AN INKLINGS' BIBLIOGRAPHY

(23) Compiled by Joe R. Christopher

This Bibliography is an annotated checklist covering both primary and secondary materials on J. R. R. Tolkien, C. S. Lewis, Charles Williams, and the other Inklings. Authors and readers are encouraged to send off-prints or bibliographic references to the compiler:

Dr. J. R. Christopher  
English Department  
Tarleton State University  
Stephenville, Texas 76402 USA

Auden, W. H. "Lyrics for Man of La Mancha."  
Anteaus. 40/41 (Winter-Spring 1981),  
10-30.

A collection of all of Auden's lyrics commissioned for Man of La Mancha in 1963; they were not romantic enough for the producer, and another lyricist was found for the musical. The first of these is "Highway to Glory Song" (pp. 12-14) which may echo some of Tolkien's triple rhymes (in Auden, rhymeless) in the opening of the first stanza (sung by Don Quixote):

Out of a dream of ease and indolence  
Woken at last, I hear the call  
Of the road to adventure, awaiting me,  
beckoning  
Beyond the gate in my garden wall.  
See, how it runs, now straight, now  
sinuous,  
Up hill and down! The world is wide . . .

When Frodo and Peregrin leave Bag End, they "jumped over a low place in the hedge at the bottom and took to the fields" (Bk. I, Ch. 3) - which is something like leaving by a garden gate. On the other hand, "The Old Walking Song" certainly has a road and a door, if not a gate: "The Road goes ever on and on/Down from the door where it began" (Bk. I, Ch. 1, Ch. 3; with variants, Bk. VI, Ch. 6). In its last appearance, this walking song does include a gate: "Still round the corner there may wait/A new road or a secret gate" (Bk. VI, Ch. 9). If Auden's interest in The Lord of the Rings were not well known, these possible uses would be doubtful.

Another possible allusion appears in a later lyric, "Song of the Quest" (p. 20), in which Auden lists some questers:

One to seek the Healing Waters, one  
the Dark Tower to assail,  
One to find the lost princess, one  
to find the Grail.

The Dark Tower may be an allusion to Barad-dûr ("tower-dark"), but the reference may equally well be to Robert Browning's "Childe Roland to the Dark Tower Came"; probably, since Auden is generalizing, it is to both.

de Camp, L. Sprague. "Merlin on the Queens [sic] Express," pp. xii-xv [Tolkien, p. xiv]. An introduction to Dreams from R'lyeh, by Lin Carter. Sauk City, Wisconsin: Arkham House, 1975. xviii + 76 pp.

In his introduction to this collection of Carter's Gothic poetry, de Camp mentions in one sentence Carter's "scholarly study of J. R. R. Tolkien's 'Ring' trilogy, published as Tolkien: A Look Behind 'The Lord of the Rings'" (p. xiv). Tolkien disliked the term trilogy, and Carter's book is not completely accurate in its scholarship, but this is near enough for a popular book.

Note: the dust-jacket flap also mentions Carter's book on Tolkien: Carter's "first venture in this area [of fantasy scholarship] . . . has sold steadily through four large printings and elicited the admiration of W. H. Auden" (front flap).

Giddings, Robert, and Elizabeth Holland. J. R. R. Tolkien: The Shores of Middle-earth. Frederick, Maryland: Aethel Books (University Publications of America), 1982. (Published in Great Britain in 1981.) Index. x + 289 pp. [Barfield, 15; \*Dyson, \*25; C. S. Lewis, 5-6, 10, 14-17, \*19, 21-23, \*24, 25, \*39, \*60, \*80, 142, \*143, \*152, \*169, \*206, 228, \*258-261nn, \*264n; \*W. H. Lewis, \*15; Christopher Tolkien, 165, 212, \*260n; \*Williams, \*96, \*142, \*225, \*258n, \*260n, \*267n; Wrenn, 151, \*273n, \*275n; \*Inklings generally (but omitting references to the title of Carpenter's book), \*19, \*21, \*23-25, \*39. Starred items are not in the index. A reference to Lewis in the index for p. 29 seems to be a misprint for p. 39.]

This book by Giddings and Holland created some controversy in Tolkien circles when it was first published in Great Britain. It is poorly written and claims too much for itself; but it has some interesting material, as well as some nonsense. Part 1 (the first two chapters) is a survey of Tolkien's reputation and the criticism written on him; according to the Prologue, it was written by Giddings (p. x), who is also credited as editor of the whole work (p. ix). Part 2 (seven chapters) is a running commentary on The Lord of the Rings, primarily concerned with nineteenth and twentieth century popular sources. Part 3 (two chapters) is a linguistic study, primarily of sources of the names. And Part 4 (two chapters) is a religious interpretation and an epilogue. The controversy obviously was not created by the organization but by the claims and interpretations put forward. One of the most bothersome is that Tolkien was conscious of all the echoes the authors find in his book (pp. 31, 99; including all linguistic relationships, p. 161), although they do admit he may have missed the significance of all his references to fire (p. 232). Since Lewis is sometimes used as a foil to set off Tolkien in the book, it is not surprising that a borrowing of his for Out of the Silent Planet was, the authors declare, subconscious (p. 23). Clearly, Tolkien's consciousness of these borrowings (even if they all are true) cannot be proved; further, they claim he wanted people to follow his sources (p. 99), but in real life Tolkien seems to have spent some time denying early influences (e.g., George MacDonald) when he had changed his mind about their merits.

The basic thesis of Part 2 is that the Aragorn plot is based on Rider Haggard's King Solomon's Mines and the Frodo plot is based on John Buchan's The Thirty-Nine Steps and, occasionally, R. D. Blackmore's Lorna Doone (p. 128). Other touches of plot or atmosphere are indebted to Haggard's Allan Quatermain, Ernest Thompson Seton's "Krag the Kootney Ram" (in Lives of the Hunted), Shakespeare's Henry V, Milton's Paradise Lost, Tennyson's Idylls of the King, George MacDonald's "The Golden Key", Kenneth Grahame's The Wind in the Willows, James Hilton's Lost Horizon, Chaucer's "The Squire's Tale", Sir John Davies' Orchestra, Spenser's The Faerie Queene, MacDonald's The Princess and Curdie, Favine's Theatre of Honour and Knighthood, and MacDonald's Sir Gibbie--as well as Greek, Hindu, and other myths. Some of these seem fairly convincing, such as the use of "The Passing of Arthur" for Frodo after the

loss of the Ring into Mount Doom and again as he leaves from the Grey Havens. But what is clear is that each of these is a separate matter, and the authors' mingling of them in the seven chapters does not help the argument. They have the material for a number of source studies (or possibly just studies of parallels) which are not treated clearly. One example will help. The authors argue that the Dead Marshes in Tolkien are indebted to a marsh with dead soldiers in it in Lorna Doone (pp. 108-112). They cite the similar general descriptions, the similar plot patterns, and similar tones of language. It sounds convincing--if there are no other particular or generic parallels; but, in this case, there is another work which the authors do not mention. A marsh with dead corpses in it--and not recent dead, as in Lorna Doone--can be found in Jordanes' Origin and Deeds of the Goths. Oddly enough, in this particular case, the authors should have known of this parallel, for it is cited in footnote 2 of Sandra L. Miesel's "Some Sources and Motifs for The Lord of the Rings" (1968), and that work, in turn, is cited in footnote 34 of Giddings' second chapter (p. 258). In like manner, some of the parallels the authors argue to Haggard and Buchan are simply commonplaces of adventure fiction, and may be found in Sir Walter Scott's novels and elsewhere; their theses rest on the accumulation of parallels, and this sort of argument would have been better judged in separate essays.

Part 3, on the linguistic bases of The Lord of the Rings, has some intelligent comments, but it seems to have a higher proportion of far-fetched material than the previous part. Here is an entire paragraph:

Smeagol [the word] is also humorous. It means My Balls, based on Sanskrit. Gola, ball, Sanskrit. Me--gola--s. [Presumably an anagram.] Gollum is also related to gola. [p. 181]

This sort of unprovable assertion, based on unlikely relationships--as well as the telegraphic style--is typical of Giddings and Holland. It is also unfortunate that the authors seem to have not seen An Introduction to Elvish, ed. Jim Allan (1978), for it would have clarified a few points on the relationship of Finnish to Quenya for them (cf. Giddings and Holland, pp. 170-171)--and it would have suggested, still more, that for Tolkien the invention of languages involved more consistent language patterns than odd combinations of language parts, combined by pun and/or anagram.

Part 4 contains an interesting archetypal reading of The Lord of the Rings largely in terms of Mithra, with Christ substituted for Mithra near the end of the work. If the authors did not assume that Tolkien intended these patterns, it could be at least shaped into a valid study of that type. (Some comments on Mithra appear in Part 2, where the authors are certain that Buchan's book reflects Mithraism.) Part 4 also argues that the "setting" of The Lord of the Rings is superimposed over the Near East, not north-west Europe as most students have assumed. The Shire is on the edge of Thrace or Bulgaria, for example. The authors' assumptions here, backed up with their usual combination of possible and extremely unlikely arguments, put Gondor in the place of Israel and Mordor in Babylon's location. Obviously, these identifications are attractive for symbolic reasons, although for other reasons--not considered by Giddings and Holland--they cannot displace the traditional location, only supplement it, if accepted.

In sum, the book is not acceptable scholarship as it stands, but some of its arguments have some validity. Most of them will have to be re-argued in terms of Tolkien's actual interests or knowledge, or in terms of possibly unconscious patterns in his work. Note: Giddings and Holland edit the New Tolkien Newsletter (1980- ) which presumably furthers their positions; this bibliographer has not seen any copies.

Locus: The Newspaper of the Science Fiction Field,

13:6/234 (June 1980), 1-20. Edited by Charles N. Brown.

The main reference to Inklings in this issue is in Norman Spinrad's "Stayin' Alive" (a regular unnumbered column), pp. 5, 7 [Tolkien, p. 5, col. 3]. Spinrad writes of the 1980 American Book Awards, where The Book of the Dun Cow, by Walter Wangerin, Jr., won the science-fiction award. The point is that The Book of the Dun Cow is a religious animal fable and has nothing to do with science fiction per se. Originally, Spinrad says, there was little publishing of fantasy. "Then came the vastly successful publication of the Tolkien books, first by Ace and Don Wollheim [then the SF editor at Ace], and then by the Ballantines [the husband-and-wife editors of Ballantine Books], houses and editors heavily identified with science fiction. They were marketed under a kind of shoe-horned expansion of the 'sf' genre category and burst through the top of the 'sf' sales pattern." Spinrad mentions Lin Carter's editing of fantasy books for Ballantine, the Conan books' popularity, and the growth of the sworde-and-sorcery genre--all tied to the SF market; presently, fantasy outsells science fiction as a class by ten percent (p. 7). Spinrad does not attempt any explanation of the social or psychological causes of this development, being content with sketching its history from Tolkien on as a comment on the ABA prize going to Wangerin; but since SF has been for some time the best selling of the paperback genres, this indicates a probable continuing emphasis on fantasy.

Lewis, C. S. "Orpheus". In Elements of Literature: 3, rev. ed., ed. Robert Scholes, Nancy R. Comley, and Carl H. Klaus. New York: Oxford University Press, 1982. xxviii + 1280.

In the section on fiction, edited by Robert Scholes, appears a subsection on early forms of fiction, including myths, fables and parables, tales, and character sketches. The section on myths includes the very plain retelling of the Orpheus legend by C. S. Lewis (p. 23) and Ovid's very elaborate and rhetorical version (in a prose translation). Lewis's version is reprinted from An Experiment in Criticism, Ch. V, "On Myth" (p. 40).

In the teachers' guide, Some Suggestions for Using "Elements of Literature": Fiction, Poetry, Drama, Essays, Film, rev. ed., by Robert Scholes, Nancy R. Comley, Carl H. Klaus, and Michael Silverman (New York: Oxford University Press, 1982), pp. xvi + 144, although Lewis's name is not mentioned, the editors say that either version of the myth may be preferred and suggest the bases for such preferences should be discussed (pp. 1-2).

McGraw, David John. "Through the Land of the Seven Dimensions: A Philosophical Examination of Lilith". Philosophical Speculations in Science Fiction and Fantasy, No. 2 (Summer 1981), 81-90. [Lewis, 89.]

A discussion of the type of spiritual reality established in the dream world of George MacDonald's Lilith. Lewis is mentioned only in a minor way: he is cited in the first footnote on MacDonald's Universalism being based on a belief in universal repentance, and his edition of excerpts from MacDonald is one of the six works listed in the bibliography.

The Magazine of Fantasy and Science Fiction, 61:3/364 (September 1981), 1-162.

Edited by Edward L. Ferman.

Minor reference to Tolkien: (a) Baird Searles, "Comexcalibur" (in his "Films" column), 103-105. Negative review of John Boorman's Excalibur. Searles begins with a comparison of the fantasy available a generation, which included The Hobbit, and the situation today--"Nowadays fantasy-pure fantasy, heroic fantasy--is BIG. Credit for this can be laid to the Great Kindler, Tolkien" (p. 103).

The Magazine of Fantasy and Science Fiction, 64:1/380 (January 1983), 164 pp. Edited by Edward L. Ferman. [Tolkien, 157.]  
In the report of the thirty-first F&SF Competition, in which mock academic book titles were submitted ("evocative title: descriptive title"), in the runner-up category, R. G. Duling submits Frodo Finnish: Northern European Translations of "The Ring" (p. 157).

Mallorn: The Journal of the Tolkien Society, No. 18 (June 1982), 1-36 pp. Edited by Jenny Curtis. Tolkien-related material: (a) Cover by Pauline Baynes, p. 1. The illustration of a mallorn which has been used for some years as this journal's cover. (b) Karen Goodwin, "A Phytogeography of Middle-earth", pp. 5-9. A survey of the vegetation of Middle-earth so far as Tolkien records it. A fairly typical paragraph, although it has more non-vegetation than most, is this:

Mirkwood is probably chiefly composed of oak, with beech on the eastern border, and a dark variety of (tightly packed) fir in the south. The outermost trees bear ivy and lichen growths, but inside the dense canopy excludes sunlight and the forest floor bears only fungi and pale unpleasantly scented (and therefore probably fly-pollinated) herbs. The fauna includes melanistic forms of moths, bats and squirrels; albino deer; whilst Black Emperor butterflies and small spiders are abundant in the sunlit upper tree canopy. [p. 6]

Goodwin finds that the vegetation shifts from northern European to southern European as one moves south in Middle-earth.

(c) Geraint Rees, "The Making of Arda", p. 10. A full-page drawing with the text, ". . . And From The Thought of Illúvatar Came Ea, The World That Is"; the drawing shows a man's bearded head above, a sun/star below. (d) Charles Noad, "Tolkien Criticism: An Annotated Checklist", pp. 11, 16. Noad reviews Richard C. West's book titled as the review is; Noad compares the 1970 and 1981 editions, and comments of the secondary material, "I cannot at present see any notable omissions" (p. 16). (e) Ley Holloway, "Tolkien's Influence on C. S. Lewis" (in the "Follow-On" section), p. 12. A reply to "Tolkien's Influence on C. S. Lewis" by Pilar San José and Gregory Starkey in Mallorn, No. 17; Holloway points to four weaknesses in their arguments, and suggests most of their influences are simply parallels due to Lewis and Tolkien having the same interests.

(f) Joe Christopher, "J. R. R. Tolkien, Translator", pp. 13-16. Christopher discusses Tolkien's translation of Sir Gawain and the Green Knight, with comparisons to other translators. He comments on Tolkien's old-fashioned diction and inversions, and then goes on to discuss a few passages as translated, and finds Tolkien sometimes translates accurately, sometimes in a way which disagrees with the word meanings as given in the Tolkien and Gordon notes in their edition. (g) Steve Pillinger, "Green", p. 17. A sixteen-line free-verse poem describing a brief glimpse of Eldamar suggested by a flash of sunlight on raindrops on a window-pane. (h) Ley Holloway, "Cuivienen", p. 17. A half-page drawing of the awakening of two elves--they seem to be male and female. (i) Janet Gibbs, "Wordhoard", pp. 18-19, 33. A Tolkien-based crossword puzzle, with the answers on the later page listed.

(j) David Doughan, "Orthanc and the Onodium in Late Mannish Tradition: some West Saxon vestigia", p. 20. A piece of mock-scholarship, explaining the probable origin of the two references to Ents in Anglo-Saxon (usually translated giants). (k) Donald O'Brien, "A Chronology of the Careers of Turin and Tuor", pp. 21-24. O'Brien, using Unfinished Tales to supplement The Silmarillion,

draws up a chronology of the First Age, years 464 through 501, and in doing so corrects the five chronologies previously published on some details. His chronology appears on pp. 22-23; his discussion of it, pp. 23-24. He offers a substantial defense of a year beginning in January, not in the spring (in fictive terms, rather than in terms of Tolkien as the author, but the references are still valid).

(l) Marjorie R. Willets, "Arnor: The Numenorean Inheritance", pp. 25-28, 29-30. A fictive chronicle which is meant to answer some questions about the Rangers of the North and related matters.

(m) Elizabeth Tomkins, "Aragorn and Arwen at Rivendell", p. 28. A full-page drawing, with much stippling, of the two figures facing the camera (so to speak). (n) Jessica Yates, "Tolkien's Influence on the Chronicles of Narnia", pp. 31-33. Yates, like the note by Ley Holloway above (3), reacts to the essay in Mallorn, No. 17; but she adds parallels between Tolkien and Lewis. Her introduction says it shows that Tolkien was aware of Lewis's borrowings from him for the Chronicles, but all it actually proves is that Tolkien disliked the Chronicles. In her first section, she points out the similarity of Tolkien's "Ettenmoors" (The Fellowship of the Ring and maps) and Lewis's "Ettinmoor" (The Silver Chair). In her second section, on ideas, the parallels are necessarily less certain: the creation of a secondary world based on the British Isles; the cutting down of the Ents' trees by orcs and the death of a dryad (The Last Battle); the use of riddling prophecies by both authors (an additional example to those in the original article); the use of voyages to the spiritual realm (the end of The Return of the King; The Voyage of the "Dawn Treader"); a land voyage to a mountainous spiritual realm (Leaf by Niggle; the end of The Last Battle). A number of Yates' parallels have been given elsewhere, but this is a useful compilation.

(o) Sara Fletcher, "Ar-Feinel", p. 34. A nineteen line, free-verse poem following the dying thoughts of Aredhel.

Osborne, Charles. W. H. Auden: The Life of a Poet. New York: Harcourt Brace Jovanovich, 1979. 336 pp. Index. [Coghill, 39-40, 54; Tolkien (not in the index), 257, 274, 285, 316, 318; Williams, 141-142, 202-203, 258, 274, 283.]

Osborne's life of Auden is that of a friend and fellow writer, rather than a scholar, and one who does not share all of his friend's tastes - his liking for Tolkien's works and his Christian faith, for example (p. 318). But it describes Auden's homosexuality (active, before and after his return to Christianity) and other aspects of his life openly and directly. Perhaps the clearest statement about Auden's personality is a statement in an Auden letter to Stephen Spender (probably autumn 1940): "my dominant faculties are intellect and intuition, my weak ones are feeling and sensation. . . . I must have knowledge and a great deal of it before I can feel anything" (p. 204). Osborne does not identify the terminology as that of Jungian psychology; perhaps he felt it was obvious. But the statement does explain the tone of much of Auden's verse.

Coghill appears in the book because he was Auden's tutor at Oxford. Some of his reminiscences are repeated or reprinted - Auden announcing he was going to be a great poet, Auden convincing Coghill to read T. E. Eliot, Auden reading Coghill's mail without permission (pp. 39-40); Auden's comment on his life-long friendship with Coghill, growing out of those days, is also reprinted (p. 54). Osborne does not note that Auden dedicated his lectures as Professor of Poetry at Oxford - The Dyer's Hand (1962) - to Coghill.

There is no reference to Tolkien during Osborne's account of Auden's student days at Oxford, but he does quote Auden's comment to a New York meeting of the Tolkien Society of America in January 1966 about hearing Tolkien lecture in 1926 and being convinced by it that Anglo-Saxon was interesting (p. 285). (Osborne also has the passage about the hideousness of Tolkien's home here which upset Edith Tolkien at the time; he does not indicate that connection.) Other indications of Auden's enthusiasm for Tolkien's works are a photograph of him in his "Gimli" sweater (p. 257) and the reference to fans of Tolkien and Williams in "On the Circuit" (quoted on p. 274). Osborne says later Auden "seemed to have gotten bored with Tolkien" (p. 316), although he offers no evidence.

Charles Williams and Auden met in the summer of 1937 to discuss Auden editing an anthology for Oxford University Press; Osborne is not perfectly clear, but Williams seems to have offered several choices and Auden chose to do the *Oxford Book of Light Verse* (pp. 141-142). Later he wrote that in Williams' presence - they "never discussed anything but literary business" - he "felt transformed into a person who was incapable of doing or thinking anything base or unloving" (p. 202). Osborne does not give Williams full credit for Auden's return to Christianity, and he does not mention Lewis at all, whom Auden named in a poem as influencing his decision along with Williams and Kierkegaard (presumably the writings of Lewis and Kierkegaard). Williams' photograph appears on p. 258. The final reference to Williams is in connection with one of Auden's uncollected poems, "The Platonic Blow," which is a pornographic homosexual verse; the first stanza is quoted on p. 284. Auden, in private, admitted the poem was his "and even wittily acknowledged the stylistic influence of Charles Williams" (p. 283). The one stanza quoted is a quatrain ABAB, with accentual pentameter lines and a number of irregular internal rhymes.

There are no references to Lewis in this book, but a few details tie to the background of his life. For example, John Betjeman knew Auden in their undergraduate days at Oxford, and is quoted as commenting that Auden "really admired the boring Anglo-Saxon poets like Beowulf" (p. 33). Of course, this reflects Tolkien's influence on Auden, but Lewis tutored Betjeman in Old English - and so it reflects Lewis's failure to influence him. (*Beowulf* is a poem, not a poet, or Beowulf is a warrior, not a poet - the Poet Laureate's diction is here imprecise, if he is quoted correctly.) Later it is noted that Auden's predecessor as Professor of Poetry at Oxford was his friend C. Day Lewis (p. 244). It was Day Lewis who defeated C. S. Lewis in an election for the five-year position. In the final chapter, "Obiter dicta", a collection of Auden's sayings, appears this statement: "The problem with the behaviouralists is that they always manage to exclude themselves from their theories. If all our acts are conditioned behaviour, surely our theories are, too" (p. 329). Since Auden admitted an influence from Lewis, this position - which is the same as Lewis argued more elaborately in several works of apologetics - may be due to Lewis. (Bibliographic note: Auden tended to repeat himself very precisely in interviews, and presumably "Obiter dicta" is a collection of these sayings. Certainly the same statement, in the same words, appears in Auden's interview by Michael Newman in *The Paris Review*; see its republication as "W. H. Auden", *Writers at Work: The "Paris Review" Interviews*, Fourth Series, ed. George Plimpton, intro. Wilford Sheed [New York: The Viking Press, 1976; paperback version as Penguin Books, 1977], interview no. 10, pp. 243-269 [with the above statement on

p. 255].)

NOTE: for students of the Inklings, a better biography of Auden is Humphrey Carpenter's *W. H. Auden: A Biography* (1981).

Rendell, Ruth. *Make Death Love Me*. Garden City, New York: Doubleday, 1979. [xii]+ 246 pp. [Lewis, 23.]

A novel about a bank robbery and the aftermath. One of the characters, Alan Groombridge, a clerk in charge of a subbranch bank, is a romantic. The third chapter opens this way, with an omission of a list of his acquaintances:

Fiction had taught Alan Groombridge that there is such a thing as being in love. Some say that this, indirectly, is how everyone gets to know about it. Alan had read that it had been invented in the Middle Ages by someone called Chrétien de Troyes, and that this constituted a change in human nature.

He had never experienced it himself. And when he considered it, he didn't know anyone else who had either. ... He knew that because he was sure that if it was a change in human nature their natures would have been changed by it. And they had not been. They were as dull as he and as unredeemed. [p. 23]

The dual reference to Chrétien and a change in human nature shows that Groombridge (or his creatrix) has been reading *The Allegory of Love* or some later work dependent upon it.

Smith, William Jay. "Introduction", pp. 13-28 [Lewis, 24]. In Herrick, ed. William Jay Smith. *The Laurel Poetry Series*, gen. ed. Richard Wilbur. New York: Dell Publishing Company, 1962. 160 pp.

A collection of poems by Robert Herrick. Smith discusses "Upon Julia's Clothes", suggesting the first tercet describes her dressed and the second, naked (p. 22). The majority of critics in the past have assumed she was dressed in both tercets, but Smith's reading is possible. He writes:

. . . a good deal of nonsense has been written about Julia's extraordinary physical features accentuated by the glittering of overlaid silk. In *The Personal Heresy: A Controversy*, Dr. Tillyard and Mr. C. S. Lewis argue for pages on the subject. Mr. Lewis holds that what the poem tells him about is silk; the experience the poet is communicating is one the poet had regarding silk. Dr. Tillyard contends that Mr. Lewis is concerned only with things, and that it is the state of the poet's mind that is communicated, "the qualities of unaffected sensuality, keen observation, sophistication, and sense of decorum." While the critics keep bickering, not unlike two women over a bolt of silk at a counter, Julia in all her unadorned splendor has passed them by. And Herrick continues to smile from between the lines. [p. 24]

*The Personal Heresy* is not listed in the bibliography (pp. 27-28), presumably because it is not useful on Herrick.

Sykes, Christopher. *Evelyn Waugh: A Biography*. Boston: Little, Brown, 1975. xii + 462 pp. Index. [Cecil, 117, 152, 197, 225, 416; Lewis, 336; Wain, 379.]

The currently standard biography, with critical evaluations of Waugh's books. (The volume received two negative reviews in the Evelyn Waugh Newsletter at the time of its publication.) The index is poor: several Waugh works mentioned in the text are not in it, for example--and, more to the point here, neither Lewis nor Wain is listed in it.

Lewis is mentioned in passing in connection with an encyclical letter by Pius XII, saying the Assumption is a doctrine and is to be believed "irrespective of the claims of reason". Waugh "was delighted that the letter, by the literalism of its interpretation, put to flight many Catholic clergymen who, after relying on the arguments of the eminent Anglican theologian C. S. Lewis, had consoled worried parishioners with assurances that the terms of the definition would not put any insufferable burden on the mind" (p. 336). Probably the description of Lewis should include such a word as amateur between eminent and Anglican. The context is also odd, since Lewis's religious writings are obviously seen as at least doctrinally moderate. Perhaps the reference is to Broadcast Talks in the preface of which Lewis admits the Roman Catholic who read the scripts thought he "went too far about the comparative unimportance of theories of the 'Atonement'".

John Wain is mentioned for an essay by Waugh replying to Wain's review of P. G. Wodehouse; the exact details of Wain's review are not given.

And Cecil is mentioned for various minor reasons. Waugh once retained Rachael MacCarthy "(now Lady David Cecil) to act as his secretary" (p. 117). Cecil recommended Waugh's Edmund Campion for the Hawthornden prize, despite the fact that Waugh exaggerated the lowness of Cecil's family's pre-Elizabethan social position (p. 152). In 1939, Cecil was one of the persons Waugh approached about starting a monthly magazine (p. 197). Cecil writing on Dickens' sentimentality is paraphrased on Waugh's (p. 225). And Cecil's admiration for Howard Overing Sturgis's novel Bedchamber is mentioned in connection with Waugh's liking for that novel (p. 416).

Watson, George. "From fiction to faith". TLS: The Times Literary Supplement, No. 4147 (24 September 1982), 1024.

Watson reviews Lewis's Of This and Other Worlds (1982). He calls Hooper's preface "embarrassingly hero-worshipping" but praises most of Lewis's essays and Lewis generally. "Along with George Orwell, whom he never knew and did not always approve, Lewis now looks like the finest British polemicist of the mid-century." Watson finds many modern critics and educationalists returning to positions Lewis defended as a conservative. (Williams is mentioned once in passing, Tolkien or his works, four times.)

Norse Mythological Elements Continued from page 50

session): raging, furious, intoxicated', (sic) and can be used to signify poetic genius and inspiration."

<sup>10</sup>Ibid., p. 156. Offerings of milk for the elves have been poured into cups at tombs by Swedish country folk up to our own day.

<sup>11</sup>Ibid., p. 28.

<sup>12</sup>Ibid., p. 42. Tolkien's inspiration for the "One Ring to bind them all" seems plain.

<sup>13</sup>Ibid., p. 43.

<sup>14</sup>Ibid., pp. 76-7.

<sup>15</sup>H. R. E. Davidson, The Sword in Anglo-Saxon England (Oxford: Oxford University Press, 1962), p. 212.

<sup>16</sup>Gods and Myths of Northern Europe, p. 159. Cf. Beowulf

## CONTRIBUTORS

We are pleased to further introduce the writers of articles and cover artists.

Rhone Beare

Dr. Beare teaches in the Classics Department of the University of Newcastle in New South Wales, Australia. She has probed deeply into little-known details of Tolkien's works. Three responses to her letters are printed in The Letters of J. R. R. Tolkien.

Joe R. Christopher

B.A., M.A., and Ph.D. from the University of Oklahoma. His dissertation on Lewis led to the enumerative bibliographies he has published since, including C.S. Lewis: An Annotated Checklist. He teaches at Tarleton State College in Austin, Texas.

Nancy C. Hanger

She is currently in her Senior year at Gordon College in Massachusetts, and plans continued graduate work in Early Medieval History, Languages, and Literature. Her infrequent spare hours are spent in reading and Nature appreciation, including hiking.

Tisa Ho (Nga)

She has taught for a number of years in the Department of English of the University of Hong Kong, and is currently in the business world. She attended the 1981 Mythopoeic Conference at Mills College in Oakland, California.

Diana Paxson

B.A. Mills College, M.A.. She is the Founder of the Society for Creative Anachronism, and has taught courses on Myth at Mills College. She has recently published her first novel, Lady of Light and lives in a large home called Greyhavens in Berkeley, California.

Peter J. Schakel

He teaches in the Department of English at Hope College in Holland, Michigan. He is particularly adept in Lewis scholarship, and has edited L longing for a Form: Essays on the Fiction of C.S. Lewis.

Patrick Wynne

He is a Dental Lab Technician in Fosston, Minnesota in addition to the great deal of drawing which he does. Besides his strong interest in Tolkien, he enjoys writing poetry and reading historical novels.

Manfred Zimmermann

Ph.D. the University of Marburg, West Germany. He also has studied at Pembroke College Cambridge, where he first read The Lord of the Rings in 1973-74. He now teaches at Marburg University.

## Submissions

Mythlore welcomes submissions of articles, art, reviews, poetry, and other material. See page 2 for the address of the appropriate Editor. Contributors of articles, cover and back cover art, should also submit a short biographical paragraph for publication in the Contributors' section.

The preferred style for articles is the MLA Handbook. To save space, please restrict the use of footnotes by incorporating "ibid." and "op. cit." citations in your text in parenthesis. Please submit two copies.

Full page art should have an image area of 7 1/2" x 10". Art for a single column should be 4 1/2" wide. Art for double column width should be 9 1/2" wide.

2276-7: "Ancient in years, he mounts guard over the heathen gold; yet he is not one whit the better for it." Also cf. Beowulf 2312-22: "Then did the visitant spit forth embers, and burn up the bright dwellings; the flaming ray wrought mischief to men, for the enemy flying through the air would leave nothing alive . . . He encompassed the people of the land with burning, with fire and flame."

<sup>17</sup>Tolkien Reader, p. 45.