An Inklings' Bibliography (23)

Joe R. Christopher  
(emeritus) Tarleton State University, Stephenville, TX

Follow this and additional works at: https://dc.swosu.edu/mythlore

Part of the Children's and Young Adult Literature Commons

Recommended Citation

This Article is brought to you for free and open access by the Mythopoeic Society at SWOSU Digital Commons. It has been accepted for inclusion in Mythlore: A Journal of J.R.R. Tolkien, C.S. Lewis, Charles Williams, and Mythopoeic Literature by an authorized editor of SWOSU Digital Commons. An ADA compliant document is available upon request. For more information, please contact philip.fitzsimmons@swosu.edu.

To join the Mythopoeic Society go to: http://www.mythsoc.org/join.htm
Abstract
This Bibliography is an annotated checklist covering both primary and secondary materials on J. R. R. Tolkien, C.S. Lewis, Charles Williams, and the other Inklings.
de Camp, L. Sprague. "Merlin on the Queens [sic]
Express," pp. xii-xv [Tolkien, p. xiv]. An
introduction to Dreams from R'yeh, by Lin
Carter, Sauk City, Wisconsin: Arkham House,
1975. xii, 76 pp.
In his introduction to this collection of Carter's
Gothic poetry, de Camp mentions in one sentence
Carter's "scholarly study of J. R. R. Tolkien's
'Ring' trilogy, published as Tolkien: A Look
Behind 'The Lord of the Rings'" (p. xiv). Tolkien
disliked the term 'trilogy,' and Carter's book is
not completely accurate in its scholarship, but
this is near enough for a popular book.

Note: the dust-jacket flap also mentions
Carter's book on Tolkien: Carter's "first venture
in this area [of fantasy scholarship] . . . has
sold steadily through four large printings and
elicited the admiration of W. H. Auden" (front
flap).

Giddings, Robert, and Elizabeth Holland. J. R. R.
Tolkien: The Shores of Middle-earth. Frederick,
Maryland: Athelhea Books (University Publications
of America), 1982. (Published in Great Britain in
1981.) Index, x + 289 pp. Ebarfield, 19, 21-
23, 28, 25, 29, 60, 60, 142, 143, 152,
169, 206, 228, 258-261n, 264n; W. H. Lewis,
te. J. R. Christopher, Tolkiens, pp. 21, 22, 23,
Williams, p. 96, p. 142, 225, 258n, 260n, 267n;
Wrenn, 151, 273n, 275n; "Inklings generally (but
omitting references to the title of Carpenter's
not in the index to Lewis' book.

In the index for p. 29 seems to be a misprint for p. 39.3
This book by Giddings and Holland created some con-
tradory in Tolkien circles when it was first pub-
lished in Great Britain. It is poorly written and
claims too much for itself, but it has some inter-
esting material, as well as some nonsense. Part 1
(the first two chapters) is a survey of Tolkien's
reputation and the criticism written on him; accord-
ing to the Prologue, it was written by Giddings (p.
x). Part 2 (seven chapters) is a running com-
mentary on The Lord of the Rings, primarily con-
cerned with nineteenth and twentieth century popular
sources. Part 3 (two chapters) is a linguistic
study, primarily of sources of the names. And Part
4 (two chapters) is a religious interpretation and
an epilogue. The controversy obviously was not cre-
ated by the organization but by the claims and in-
tentions put forward by the authors. Another
point is that Tolkien was conscious of all these echoes
the authors find in his book (pp. 31, 99; including
all linguistic relationships, p. 161), although they
do admit he may have missed the significance of all his
reference to Frodo (p. 232). Since Lewis's work is
sometimes used as a foil to sell off Tolkien in the
book, it is not surprising that a borrowing of his for
Out of the Silent Planet was, the authors de-
clare, subconscious (p. 23). Clearly, Tolkien's
consciousness of these borrowings (even if they all
are true) cannot be proved; further, they claim he
wanted people to follow his sources (p. 99), but in
real life Tolkien seems to have spent some time de-
nying early influences (e.g., George MacDonald) when
he had changed his mind about their merits. *25

The basic thesis of Part 2 is that the Aragorn
plot is based on Rider Haggard's King Solomon's
Mines and the Frodo plot is based on John Buchan's
The Thirty-Nine Steps and, occasionally, R. B.
Blackmore's Lorna Doone. Other borrowings
of plot or atmosphere are indebted to Haggard's Allan
Quatermain, Ernest Thompson Seton's "Krag the Koot-
ney Ram" (in Lives of the Hunted), Shakespeare's
Henry V, Milton's Paradise Lost, Tennyson's Idylls
of the King, George MacDonald's "The Golden
Key," Kenneth Grahame's The Wind in the Willows, J.
A. Miller's Lost Horizon, Chaucer's "The Squire's Tale,"
Sir John Davies' "Orchestra," Spenser's The Faerie
Queene, MacDonald's The Princess and Curdie, Pavine's
The Queen of the Mab and Holman's "Sir Gibble"--as well as Greek, Hindu, and other myths.
Some of these seem fairly convincing, such as the
use of "The Passing of Arthur" for Frodo after the

This Bibliography is an annotated checklist covering both
primary and secondary materials on J. R. R. Tolkien, C. S.
Lewis, Charles Williams, and the other Inklings. Authors
and readers are encouraged to send off-prints or bibli-
ographic references to the compiler:
Dr. J. R. Christopher
English Department
Tarleton State University
Stephenville, Texas 76402 USA

Auden, W. H. "Lyrics for Man of La Mancha.
Anteaus. 40/41 (Winter-Spring 1981),
10-30.
A collection of all of Auden's lyrics commis-
sioned for Man of La Mancha in 1963; they were
not romantic enough for the producer, and
another lyricist was found for the musical. The
first of these is "Highway to Glory Song" (pp.
12-14) which may echo some of Tolkien's triple
rhymes (in Auden, rhymeless) in the opening of
the first stanza (sung by Don Quixote):
Out of a dream of ease and indolence
Woken at last, I hear the call
Of the road to adventure, awaiting me,
beckoning
Beyond the gate in my garden wall.
See, how it runs, now straight, now
sinuous,
Up hill and down! The world is wide . . .

When Frodo and Peregrin leave Bag End, they
"jumped over a hedge at the bottom
and took to the fields" (Bk. I, Ch. 3) -
which is something like leaving by a garden gate.
On the other hand, "The Old Walking Song"
certainly has a road and a door, if not a gate:
The Road goes ever on and on/down from the
door where it began" (Bk. I, Ch. 1, Ch. 3; with
variants, Bk. VI, Ch. 6). In its last appearance,
this walking song does include a gate:
"Still round the corner there may wait/A new
road or a secret passage (Bk. VI, Ch. 9). If
Auden's interest in The Lord of the Rings were
not well known, these possible uses would be
doubtful.

Another possible allusion appears in a later
lyric, "Song of the Quest" (p. 20), in which
Auden lists some questers:
One to seek the Healing Waters, one
the Dark Tower to assail,
One to find the lost princess, one
to find the Grail.

The Dark Tower may be an allusion to Barad-dur
("tower-dark"), but the reference may equally
well be to Robert Browning's "Childe Roland to
the Dark Tower Came"; probably, since Auden is
generalizing, it is to both.

This page was compiled by Joe R. Christopher.
loss of the Ring into Mount Doom and again as he leaves from the Grey Havens. But what is clear is that each of these is a separate matter, and the authors' mingling of them in the seven chapters does not help the argument. They have the material for a number of source studies (or possibly just studies of parallels) which are not treated clearly. One example will help. The authors argue that the Dead Marshes in Tolkien are indebted to a marsh with dead soldiers in it in Lorna Doone (pp. 105-112). They cite the similar general descriptions, the similar plot patterns, and similar tones of language. It sounds convincing—if there are no other particular or generic parallels; but, in this case, there is another work which the authors do not mention. marsh. This refers to a marsh appeared in Lorna Doone—as in Lorna Doone—and can be found in Jordanes' Origin and Deeds of the Goths. Oddly enough, in this particular case, the authors should have known of this parallel, for it is cited in footnote 2 of Sandra L. Comley, Carl H. Klaus, and Michael Silverman (New York: Oxford University Press, 1982). xxviii + 1280.

In the section on fiction, edited by Robert Scholes, appears a subsection on early forms of fiction, including myths, fables, and parables, tales, and character sketches. The section on myths includes the very plain retelling of the Orpheus legend by C. S. Lewis (p. 23) and Ovid's very elaborate and rhetorical version (in a prose translation). Lewis's version is reprinted from An Experiment in Criticism, Ch. V, "On Myth" (p. 40).


In the section on fiction, edited by Robert Scholes, appears a subsection on early forms of fiction, including myths, fables, and parables, tales, and character sketches. The section on myths includes the very plain retelling of the Orpheus legend by C. S. Lewis (p. 23) and Ovid's very elaborate and rhetorical version (in a prose translation). Lewis's version is reprinted from An Experiment in Criticism, Ch. V, "On Myth" (p. 40).


In the section on fiction, edited by Robert Scholes, appears a subsection on early forms of fiction, including myths, fables, and parables, tales, and character sketches. The section on myths includes the very plain retelling of the Orpheus legend by C. S. Lewis (p. 23) and Ovid's very elaborate and rhetorical version (in a prose translation). Lewis's version is reprinted from An Experiment in Criticism, Ch. V, "On Myth" (p. 40).


In the section on fiction, edited by Robert Scholes, appears a subsection on early forms of fiction, including myths, fables, and parables, tales, and character sketches. The section on myths includes the very plain retelling of the Orpheus legend by C. S. Lewis (p. 23) and Ovid's very elaborate and rhetorical version (in a prose translation). Lewis's version is reprinted from An Experiment in Criticism, Ch. V, "On Myth" (p. 40).


In the section on fiction, edited by Robert Scholes, appears a subsection on early forms of fiction, including myths, fables, and parables, tales, and character sketches. The section on myths includes the very plain retelling of the Orpheus legend by C. S. Lewis (p. 23) and Ovid's very elaborate and rhetorical version (in a prose translation). Lewis's version is reprinted from An Experiment in Criticism, Ch. V, "On Myth" (p. 40).


In the section on fiction, edited by Robert Scholes, appears a subsection on early forms of fiction, including myths, fables, and parables, tales, and character sketches. The section on myths includes the very plain retelling of the Orpheus legend by C. S. Lewis (p. 23) and Ovid's very elaborate and rhetorical version (in a prose translation). Lewis's version is reprinted from An Experiment in Criticism, Ch. V, "On Myth" (p. 40).


In the section on fiction, edited by Robert Scholes, appears a subsection on early forms of fiction, including myths, fables, and parables, tales, and character sketches. The section on myths includes the very plain retelling of the Orpheus legend by C. S. Lewis (p. 23) and Ovid's very elaborate and rhetorical version (in a prose translation). Lewis's version is reprinted from An Experiment in Criticism, Ch. V, "On Myth" (p. 40).
draws up a chronology of the First Age, years 464 through 501, and in doing so corrects the five chronologies previously published. His chronology appears on pp. 22-23; his discussion of it, pp. 23-24. He offers a substantial defense of a year beginning in January, not in the spring (in fictive terms, rather than in terms of Tolkien as the author, but the references are still valid).


(2) Elizabeth Tomkins, "Aragorn and Arwen at Rivendell," p. 28. A full-page drawing, with much stippling, of the two figures facing the camera (so to speak). (m) Jessica Yates, "Tolkien's Influence on the Chronicles of Narnia", pp. 31-33. Yates, like the note by Ley Holloway above (3), reacts to the essay in Mallorn, No. 17; but she adds parallels between Tolkien and Lewis. Her introduction says it shows that Tolkien was aware of Lewis's borrowings from him for the Chronicles, but all it actually proves is that Tolkien disliked the Chronicles. In her first section, she points out the similarity of Tolkien's "Ettenmoors" (The Fellowship of the Ring and maps) and Lewis's "Black Emperor" (The Last Battle); the use of riddling prose by both authors (an additional example to those in the original article); the use of voyages to the spiritual realm (the end of The Return of the King; The Voyage of the "Dawn Treader"); a land voyage to a mountainous spiritual realm (Leaf by Niggle; the end of The Last Battle). A number of Yate's parallels have been given elsewhere, but this is a useful compilation.

(o) Sara Fletcher, "Ar-Feinel", p. 34. A nineteen line, free-verse poem following the dying thoughts of Aredhel.


Osborne's life of Auden is that of a friend and fellow writer, rather than a scholar, and one who does not share all of his friend's tastes - his liking for Tolkien's work and his Christian faith, for example (p. 318). But it describes Auden's homosexuality (active, before and after his return to Christianity) and other aspects of his life openly and directly. Perhaps the clearest statement about Auden's personality is a statement in an Auden letter to Stephen Spender (probably autumn 1940): "my dominant faculties are intellect and intuition, my weak faculties are emotion and sensation." I must have known a great deal of it before I can feel anything" (p. 204). Osborne does not identify the terminology as that of Jungian psychology; perhaps he felt it was obvious. But the statement does explain the tone of much of Auden's verse.

Coghill appears in the book because he was Auden's tutor at Oxford. Some of Coghill's reminiscences are repeated or reprinted - Auden announcing he was going to be a great poet, Auden convincing Coghill to read T. E. Eliot, Auden reading Coghill's mail without permission (pp. 39). Coghill's friendship with Tolkien, growing out of those days, is also reprinted (p. 54). Osborne does not note that Auden dedicated his lectures as Professor of Poetry at Oxford - The Dyer's Hand (1962) - to Coghill.
There is no reference to Tolkien during Osbourne's account of Auden's student days at Oxford, but he does quote Auden's comment to a New York meeting of the Tolkien Society of America in January 1966 about hearing Tolkien lecture in 1926 and being convinced by it that Anglo-Saxon was interesting (p. 285). (Osborne also has the passage Osbourne was about the hole and Tolkien's home where it is not clear that he did not indicate that connection.) Other indicators of Auden's enthusiasm for Tolkien's work are a photograph of him in his "Gimli" sweater (p. 257) and the reference to fans of Tolkien and Williams in "On the Circuit" (quoted on p. 274). Osbourne says later Auden "seemed to have gotten bored with Tolkien" (p. 316), although he offers no evidence.

Charles Williams and Auden met in the summer of 1937 to discuss Auden editing an anthology for Oxford University Press; Osborne is not perfectly clear, but Williams seems to have offered several choices and Auden chose to do the Oxford Book of Light Verse (pp. 141-142). Later he wrote that in Williams' presence - they "never discussed anything but literary business" - he "felt transformed into a person who was incapable of doing or thinking or understanding anything." (p. 202). Osborne does not give Williams full credit for Auden's return to Christianity, and he does not mention Lewis at all, whom Auden named in a poem as influencing his decision along with Williams and Kierkegaard (presumably the writings of Lewis and Kierkegaard). Williams' photograph appears on p. 258.

The final reference to Williams is in connection with one of Auden's uncollected poems, "The Platonic Blow," which is a pornographic homosocial verse; the first stanza is quoted on p. 284. Auden, in private, admitted the poem was his "and even wittily acknowledged the stylistic influence of Charles Williams" (p. 283). The one stanza quoted is a quatrains ABAB, with accentual pentameter lines and a number of irregular internal rhymes.

There are no references to Lewis in this book, but a few details tie to the background of his life. For example, John Betjeman knew Auden in their undergraduate days at Oxford, and is quoted as commenting that Auden "really admired the boring Anglo-Saxon poets like Beowulf" (p. 33). Of course, this reflects Tolkien's influence on Auden, but Lewis tutored Betjeman in Old English, and so it reflects Lewis's failure to influence him. (Beowulf is a poem, not a poet, or Beowulf is a warrior, not a poet - the Poet Laureate's diction is here imprecise, if he is quoted correctly.) Later it is noted that Auden's predecessor as Professor of Poetry at Oxford was his friend C. Day Lewis (p. 244). It was Day Lewis who defeated C. S. Lewis in an election for the five-year position. In the final chapter, "Obiter dicta," a collection of Auden's sayings, appears a statement which problematises the socialists is that they always manage to exclude themselves from their theories. If all our acts are conditioned behaviour, surely our theories are, too" (p. 329). Since Auden admitted an influence from Lewis, this position - which is the same as Lewis argued more elaborately in several works of apologetics - may be due to Lewis. (Bibliographic note: Auden tended to repeat himself very precisely in interviews, and presumably "Obiter dicta" is a collection of these sayings. Some statements in the same words, appears in Auden's interview by Michael Newman in The Paris Review; see its republication as "W. H. Auden", Writers at Work: The "Paris Review" Interviews, Fourth Series, ed. George Plimpton, New York: The Viking Press, 1976; paperbound version as Penguin Books, 1977), interview no. 10, pp. 243-269 [with the above statement on p. 255].


A novel about a bank robbery and the aftermath. One of the characters, Alan Groombridge, a clerk in charge of a subbranch bank, is a romantic. The third chapter opens this way, with an omission of a list of his acquaintances:

Fiction had taught Alan Groombridge that there is such a thing as being in love. Some say that this indirectly, is how everyone gets to know about it. Alan had read this, but he was sure that if it was a change in human nature their lives would have been changed by it. And they had not been. They were all dull as he and as unredempted. [p. 23]

The dual reference to Christien and a change in human nature shows that Groombridge (or his creatrix) has been reading The Allegory of Love or some other work depend upon it.


A collection of poems by Robert Herrick. Smith discusses "Upon Julia's Clothes", suggesting the first tercet describes her dressed and the second, naked (p. 22). The majority of critics in the past have assumed she was dressed in both tercets, but Smith's reading is possible. He writes:

... a good deal of nonsense has been written about Julia's extraordinary physical features accentuated by the glittering of overlaid silk. In The Personal Heresy: A Controversy, Dr. Tillyard and Mr. C. S. Lewis argue for pagan or the subject. Mr. Lewis holds that what the poem tells him about is silk; the experience the poet is communicating is one the poet had regarding silk. Dr. Tillyard contends that Ms. Julia's extraordinary physical features are connected only with things, and that it is the state of the poet's mind that is communicated, "the qualities of unaffected sensuality, keen observation, sophistication, and sense of decorum." While the critics keep bickering, not unlike two women over a bolt of silk at a counter, Julia in all her unadorned splendor has passed through by. And Herrick continues to smile from between the lines. [p. 24]

The Personal Heresy is not listed in the bibliography (pp. 27-28), presumably because it is not useful on Herrick.

The currently standard biography, with critical evaluations of Waugh's books. (The volume received two negative reviews in the Evelyn Waugh Newsletter at the time of its publication.) The index is poor: several Waugh works are not in it, for example—and, more to the point here, neither Lewis nor Wain is listed in it.

Lewis is mentioned in passing in connection with an encyclical letter by Pius XII, saying the Assumption is a doctrine and is to be believed "irrespective of the claims of reason". Waugh "was delighted that the letter, by the literalism of its interpretation, put to flight many Catholic clergymen who, after relying on the arguments of the eminent Anglican theologian C. S. Lewis, had conceded worried parishioners with assurances that the terms of the definition would not put any insufferable burden on the mind" (p. 316). Probably the description of Lewis should include such a word as amateur between eminent and Anglican. The context is also odd, since Lewis's religious writings are obviously seen as at least doctrinally moderate. Perhaps the reference is to Broadcast Talks in the preface of which Lewis admits the Roman Catholic who read the scriptures thought he went too far about the comparative unimportance of theories of the 'Attenement'.

John Wain is mentioned for an essay by Waugh replying to Wain's review of P. G. Wodehouse; the exact details are not given.

And Cecil is mentioned for various minor reasons. Waugh once retained Rachael McCarthy (now Lady David Cecil) to act as his secretary (p. 117). Cecil recommended Waugh's Edmund Campion for the Hawthornden prize, despite the fact that Waugh exaggerated the lowness of Cecil's family's pre-Elizabethan social position (p. 152). In 1939, Cecil was one of the persons Waugh approached about starting a monthly magazine (p. 197). Cecil writing on Dickens' sentimentality is paraphrase of Waugh's (p. 225). And Cecil's admiration for Howard Ovington Sturgis's novel Bedchamber is mentioned in connection with Waugh's liking for that novel (p. 416).


Watson reviews Lewis's Of This and Other Worlds (1982). He calls Hooper's preface "embarrassingly hero-worshipping" but praises most of Lewis's essays and Lewis generally. "Along with George Orwell, whom he never knew and did not always approve, Lewis now looks like the finest British polemist of the mid-century." Watson finds many modern critics and educationalists returning to positions Lewis defended as a conservative. (Williams is mentioned once in passing, Tolkien or his works, four times.)

Norse Mythological Elements Continued from page 50 session: raging, furious, intoxicated, (sic) and can be used to signify poetic genius and inspiration."

10 Ibid., p. 156. Offerings of milk for the elves have been poured into cups at toasts by Swedish country folk up to our own day.

11 Ibid., p. 28.

12 Ibid., p. 42. Tolkien's inspiration for the "One Ring to bind them all" seems plain.

13 Ibid., p. 43.

14 Ibid., pp. 76-7.


SUBMISSIONS

Mythlore welcomes submissions of articles, art, reviews, poetry, and other material. See page 2 for the address of the appropriate Editor. Contributors of articles, cover and back cover art, should also submit a short biographical paragraph for publication in the Contributors' section.

The preferred style for articles is the MLA Handbook. To save space, please restrict the use of footnotes by incorporating "ibid." and "op. cit." citations in your text in parenthesis. Please submit two copies.

Full page art should have an image area of 7 1/2" x 10". Art for a single column should be 4 1/2" wide. Art for double column width should be 9 1/2" wide.

2276-7: "Ancient in years, he mounts guard over the heathen gold yet he is not one whit the better for it." Also cf. Beowulf 2312-22: "Then did the valiant spit forth ember, then burn up the bright dwellings; the flaming ray wrought mishap to men, for the enemy flying through the air would leave nothing alive... He encompassed the people of the land with burning, with fire and flame."

17 Tolkien Reader, p. 45.