An Inklings Bibliography (1)

Joe R. Christopher

Follow this and additional works at: https://dc.swosu.edu/mythlore

Part of the Children's and Young Adult Literature Commons

Recommended Citation

This Article is brought to you for free and open access by the Mythopoeic Society at SWOSU Digital Commons. It has been accepted for inclusion in Mythlore: A Journal of J.R.R. Tolkien, C.S. Lewis, Charles Williams, and Mythopoeic Literature by an authorized editor of SWOSU Digital Commons. An ADA compliant document is available upon request. For more information, please contact phillip.fitzsimmons@swosu.edu.

To join the Mythopoeic Society go to: http://www.mythsoc.org/join.htm
Mythcon 51: A VIRTUAL “HALFLING” MYTHCON  
July 31 - August 1, 2021 (Saturday and Sunday)  
http://www.mythsoc.org/mythcon/mythcon-51.htm

Mythcon 52: The Mythic, the Fantastic, and the Alien  
Albuquerque, New Mexico, July 29 - August 1, 2022  
http://www.mythsoc.org/mythcon/mythcon-52.htm

Abstract
A series of bibliographies of primary and secondary works concerning the Inklings.

This article is available in Mythlore: A Journal of J.R.R. Tolkien, C.S. Lewis, Charles Williams, and Mythopoeic Literature: https://dc.swosu.edu/mythlore/vol3/iss4/9
AN INKLINGS
BIBLIOGRAPHY
Compiled by Joe R. Christopher

"An Inklings Bibliography" is intended to be an annotated checklist appearing in each issue of the quarterly Mythlore, covering both primary and secondary materials on the Inklings, principally those on J.R.R. Tolkien, C.S. Lewis, and Charles Williams. Items on friends who did not attend meetings of the Inklings, such as Dorothy L. Sayers, and occasional guests at the meetings, such as W.H. Auden, will not be listed unless they contain specific references to the Inklings. An attempt will be made to list all essays in journals regularly on the Inklings within nine months of their publication. All books and other essays will have to be listed as they are discovered or obtained, but these items will be as current as possible. Although occasional earlier items will be listed in these bibliographies, these will be only ones of a fairly obscure nature—ones not likely to be included in the MLA Bibliography under the name of one of the Inklings and ones missed by the other bibliographies in this field; such items predating 1975 will not become a major emphasis here. Reviews will not be listed separately, except for special reasons, and only a selection will be mentioned (that is, no attempt will be made to complete lists). This first installment contains books and chapbooks from 1975 (these items should be completed in the next installment), and essays in the regular journals beginning with, approximately, the last quarter of that year. Authors and readers are encouraged to send offprints or bibliographic references to the compiler.

Dr. J.R. Christopher
English Department
Tarleton State University
Stephenville, TX 76402 USA.

For this first installment, items were provided by John Aquino, Gil Gaiser, Gerald N. Garmon, Dave Hulan, Kathryn Lindskoog, and Peter Schakel.) Fanzines which have material on the Inklings will be annotated as they are sent to the compiler, but no exchange of publications can be offered.


Allan begins with an example of how Tolkien recovers the wonder of common things—in this case, the elephant—and concludes that the "recovery of moral vision and aesthetic vision" in The Lord of the Rings may have had some influence on the growing emphasis on ecology and the "demand for quality of life to take precedence over production."


A heroic quatrain thanking Tolkien for The Lord of the Rings.


Aquino opens his essay with Lewis's references to reading Shaw in Surprised by Joy: he then quotes a reference to the Life Force and to "A modern writer [named] Pshaw" from The Screwtape Letters. (The major omission in this part of Aquino's essay is the direct reference to Shaw's Back to Methuselah in Lewis's essay "The Funeral of a Great Myth" [collected in Christian Reflections].) Having established Lewis's knowledge of Shavian works and ideas, Aquino turns to a comparison to Shaw's Back to Methuselah and the Ransom Trilogy. He shows several statements by Weston in Out of the Silent Planet which are parallel to Shavian ideas, but

his most telling point is that Weston's statement, "It is enough for me that there is a beyond" is a slightly egotistical echo of the last line of Back to Methuselah—Lilith's "It is enough that there is a beyond." In Perelandra, Aquino again shows parallels of ideas, although he misses the echo in Weston's "Pure Spirit: the vortex of self-thinking, self-originating activity" of the final stage of Shavian evolution, existence as (in Lilith's last speech) "the vortex freed from matter" (Aquino does quote Weston's statement). Finally, Aquino suggests one parallel of idea in That Hideous Strength and suggests several times throughout that Weston's egotism makes him a parody of Shaw.


Arlton discusses Christian faith, with many of her theses bolstered from, or based on, Lewis's works, especially "On Obstinance in Belief" (in The World's Last Night), "Religion: Reality or Substitute?" (in Christian Reflections), and "Faith" (two chapters in Mere Christianity). (A report of the discussion at the meeting at which her paper was read appears on pp. 5-6)


A biography written for children, not involving much original research. Chapters 1 through 12 are essentially a rewrite of Surprised by Joy (which oddly is not listed in the "Suggested Reading" on p. 125), with the addition of information about Mrs. Moore from W.H. Lewis's "Memoir" in Letters of C.S. Lewis. There is some slight fictionalizing—for example, the description of the miniature garden which gives Lewis his first taste of beauty contains this sentence (for which there is no counterpart in Surprised by Joy): "In imagination he shrank into a tiny size, and pictured himself wandering in it" (p. 14). Chapters 13 and 14 tell of the rest of Lewis's life; in a few cases Arnott guesses wrongly about details, as when she says "special permission had been obtained from those in authority in the Church of England [for the marriage of Lewis and Joy Davidson]" (p. 117). But there is nothing extremely erroneous about the book, and it gives the reader a good picture of Lewis's growing up, with emphasis on his religious beliefs, his writings for children, and his emotional problems (usually traced by Arnott to the early death of his mother—probably quite correctly). It is less prudish about Lewis's early sexual life than C.S. Lewis: A Biography, by Green and Hooper (which appeared to late to be of use to Arnott). A few of Arnott's comparisons of details of Lewis's childhood with details in the Narnia books seem new if fairly obvious (e.g., the cistern attic "Little Lea" with the attic in Polly's house in The Magician's Nephew [pp. 17, 21-22]). The only person thanked in the bibliography (p. 127), and thus presumably the only one giving any original information to the author, is Sister Penelope, C.S.M.V., of Wantage.


Athen includes these two stanzas in his chronicle of his poetic development:

"hair-raising things that Hitler and Stalin were doing forced me to think about God."

Why was I sure they were wrong?
Wild Kierkegaard, Williams and Lewis guided me back to belief.

Although the influence of Williams on Athen was acknowledged earlier, this seems to be the first such reference to Lewis.


After defining myth literally in his opening paragraphs, Basney first turns to "two related techniques for making this mythical world of [The Lord of the Rings] impress us with its sensuous solidity." The first technique is the "realising imagination" which C.S. Lewis attributes to Dante in The Discarded Image: "sharp visual, tactile, auditory, detail." Basney illustrates this from Pippin's experience with its sensuous solidity. The second technique is that of "realised" by the events of the story. "This archetypal event occurs in pure form at least fifteen times in the course of the trilogy."

Basney lists these and concludes the free peoples' "mythical knowledge of one another...represents the active caritas that holds them together."

Basney adds a brief section which explains the convergence of his two notes.


A reprint from The Tolkien Papers, ed. J.T. Hansen et al. (Mankato, Minnesota: Mankato State College Studies, 2:1 [February 1967], 1-7; also listed as Mankato Studies in English, No. 2); listed in Richard C. West's Tolkien Criticism: An Annotated Checklist as B14 (p. 12).


Much of this note is spent summarizing the position of the Vanir in Norse mythology. Bennett offers these parallels:

"the Elves of Alfhelm were vassals of the Vanir just as the Elves of Valinor were of the Valar. Just as the Elves of Middle-earth have the deities of Manwe and Elbereth, and presumably others, so the Elves of Alfhelm have Njord, Frey, Ullr and many others of the Vanir." (p. 3)

He compares both groups of elves as the artists and conveyors of culture in their societies. "Alfhelm is...in the West seg[a]lated from Milgard by the Uttermost Western Sea. The Lord of the Vanir [a]lrated from Valinor by the Sundering Sea." He implies a parallel between Orvandel the Star-hero of the Norse mythology and Elbereth of Tolkien's work. Further, both mythologies have a mysterious, little-discussed one (Tolkien's Eru, unnamed in Norse myth). Bennett's final point is that Valar is the plural of the Norse word for "see" or "prophecy," and hence appropriate for "the benevolent servants of the One."


Beginning with critics who attack The Lord of the Rings for not being "auratic," Biseneiks spends his first two pages on essentially just this point. Biseneiks sees the Lord of the Rings with its plot, its sources of guidance and moral clarity, to many modern novels with their rational explanations of life's problems, their formlessness, their antheroses.

At this point Biseneiks turns to a defense of fantasy which soothes turns into a defense of art. The hobbits essentially are occupying their minds as students, learning of Middle-earth. But their, and others', interest in poems and songs is part of the culture, and provides a means of bearing responsibilities with grace. Biseneiks concludes his essay with a consideration of the way the hobbits' songs reflect their growth, of Tom Bombadil as the pure artist, of the elves as slightly decadent in an art-for-art's-sake way, of Gandalf as deliberately suppressing his art of laughter because of his immediate task, and of Sam's comment about the folk in the old tales and songs—in short, the theme of artistry in The Lord of the Rings.


A reprint from the chapbook by Bradley, The Jewel of Arwen, published in Baltimore by T-K Graphics, n.d. [1974]. Only the brief story itself is reprinted in this anthology; omitted are the "Preface: Of Elves," "On the Source of This Tale," and "Translator's Notes" of the chapbook. Also omitted is one parenthetical "Translator's note" in the tale itself (pp. 16-18 of the chapbook), one footnote (p. 29 of the chapbook), and a few parenthetical references to The Lord of the Rings and to the omitted "Translator's Notes."


Biseneiks's notes from the sixth convention of the Mythopoeic Society; Pr. Walter Hooper was guest of honor, and he and Roger Lancelyn Green were awarded the Mythopoeic Scholarship Award for C.S. Lewis: A Biography. See also the photographs numbered 16, 21-23, and 25 on pp. 15-16 (with their key on page 10).


For a Tolkien pastiche...

Carter's introduction to his anthology discusses the death of Tolkien and the establishment of "a J.R.R. Tolkien Memorial Award for Achievement in Fantasy...popularity known as the 'Gandalf' [from the bronze statuette of Tolkien's beloved magician" (p. 9). The award is given in connection with the World Science Fiction Convention, and the statuette ritualizing it was created by D. Enneda.

Although he does not indicate it in this introduction, Carter himself is instrumental in setting up the award. He reports that the first presentation, at the 1974 convention, was a Grand Master award, given posthumously to Tolkien.

The Lord lists the previous year's reprints of Robert Postner's A Guide to Middle Earth as the only "Noteworthy Non-fiction" of 1974 (among other books ignored is C.S. Lewis: A Biography, by Roger Lancelyn Green and Walter Hooper).


A poem in alliterative verse, consisting of 121 lines in five verse-paragraphs; it describes Tolkien in the archetypal forest, and includes a name spelled in Graves' tree alphabet (perhaps in analogy to Cynwall's acrostic in runes).


A comparison of the order of the events in the latter part of Till We Have Faces with the same events in Apuleius' tale of Cupid and Psyche in The Golden Ass. Christopher considers both Lewis's plot and the sequence of moving pictures near the end of the fiction; he establishes some displacement of events from the sequence in Apuleius, and suggests a next step might be an aesthetic defense of Lewis's order. (Note: this is a slight revision and expansion of part of the chapter on Till We Have Faces in Christopher's 1968 dissertation, "The Romances of Clive Staples Lewis"; Christopher does not provide the aesthetic defense there, either.)
Christopher, Joe R. "Lazarus, Come Forth from That Tomb!" Riverside Quarterly, 6:3/23 (August 1975), 190-97 [194].

A review essay on Robert A. Heinlein's Time Enough for Love: The Lives of Lazarus Long. Christopher uses two comparisons involving the Inklings: "Lazarus' assumption that only bad genes make unions wrong seems to me a clearly utilitarian, humanistic belief. In Charles Williams' Arthurian poems, the incestuous King Arthur's marriage to his half-sister, Morgause (which produces Mordred) is taken as a symbol of the greatest of the Christian sins, pride: Arthur loves himself, and thus produces his own destruction. Heinlein, in his chapter title ['Narcissus'] and character references, also sees the episode [of Lazarus' intercourse with his cloned 'sisters'] as self-love...but his characters do not find it evil. This episode is thus an excellent example of the gap between the Christian worldview and the humanistic..."

(Christopher, Joe R. "Lazarus, Come Forth from That Tomb!" Riverside Quarterly, 6:3/23 (August 1975), 190-97 [194].)


A series of recommendations for religious readings. "Here Christianity is a perennally modern return to bedrock that makes you feel it sound again beneath your feet." (Dale, Alzina Stone. "The Art of Refreshment." The Living Church, 171:15 (12 October 1975), 14-15 [15].)


The prose is an appreciation for Tolkien's influence on modern publishing of fantasy: "Allusion of Wizards" is a sonnet with an English octave and an Italian sestet about the literary enchantments of visiting wizards.


A letter from Ellwood reports on the English funeral service of Tolkien at St. Anthony's Church, Headington, Oxford, on 6 September 1973; a second letter, dated 8 September 1973, includes a prayer for Tolkien by Ellwood. The latter includes a prayer for Tolkien by GoodKnight, using a number of Tolkien's terms from "On Fairy-stories."


"Residence for a few hours in Middle Earth brings a renewal, in a place where despair is countered by hope, and the commonplace by magic." (Fisher, Mrs. Jane [sic] B. [A four-paragraph, untitled note]. Mythlore: The J.R.R. Tolkien Memorial Issue, 3:2/10 (n.d. [May 1975]), 15.)


"Because his principles of linguistic creation were not yet fully developed, the Elvish and Orkish names in The Hobbit differ from, but the opposite of, CSL's usual method; yet thematically it is Lewis from beginning to end. The themes which CSL finds elsewhere in Lewis's works are these: divinity as more real, more concrete, than this world; the call of Sehnsucht; psychological possessiveness; the truthfulness of Myth; the barrenness of Reason without imagination and, ultimately, Faith; Sacramentalism and semantics; Grace; Membership; and the Law of Inattention. Echo's premise is about the form of the book; "whereas CSL's usual technique is to mythologize (or to re-mythologize), in this work he is doing the exact opposite; that is, de-mythologizing." After some structural analysis, Foster summarizes the theme of the book: "Orual's pride, and selfishness, and jealousy make her think too much of her own face—of which there is none until she looks away. Then she—and we—will have a face." (See also the discussion of the book at the meeting at which this paper was read, reported on pp. 10-11.)"
have a stronger Germanic component than those in LoTR, and the use of these forms is not limited to the non-Mannish languages; the invented forms in *The Hobbit* are at the same time less imaginative and more indiscriminate* (p. 3). For reactions to this essay, see the letters by Alexei Kondratiev and Jim Allan in *Mythprint*, 13:3 (March 1976), 12-13.


[Published in Britain by John Murray Ltd.; in the United States also distributed by the Episcopal Book Club.]

This volume is noted here only, and "Mailed Form", one of the Inklings (from 1939 to 1942). It is an anthology based on the Church Year, with seven short texts chosen for each week from Advent through the end of the Trinity season, plus three extra feast days; some of the texts are Biblical passages, some are poems or other secular works (hence the title); each seventh section is a meditation on the themes of the week written by Keenes. Sixty-three black-and-white pictures illustrate (from both sacred and secular sources) the themes. Nothing by George MacDonald, G.K. Chesterton, C.S. Lewis, Charles Williams, Dorothy L. Sayers, or J.R.R. Tolkien is included.

Gaier, Gil (ed.). [Untitled student materials and Gaier's comments.]

*Guying Gyre*, No. 4 (Fall 1975), 1-48 [14, 16, 20, 24, 25, 29, 31, 32, 35, 36, 37, 46].

*Guying Gyre* is a highly specialized fanzine, since it deals with its editor's teaching of secondary materials in a reading course at the high school level. This issue contains a long series of student evaluations of books read, including *The Hobbit*, *The Lord of the Rings*, and the *Narnia* series (pp. 13-34). On pp. 36-37, Gaier lists the student favorites: *The Hobbit* has been read ten or more times; *The Lord of the Rings*, between five and nine times; and *The Lion, the Witch and the Wardrobe* has been read three times, but with high scores by the students who read it. The final reference in the magazine is involved with the development of categories (the works of Lewis and Tolkien fall under 6-A, Fantasy/Myth).


Recipes from Ham Hash, White Beans, and Fruit Foldovers, for dwarves; some mention of Tolkien's description of dwarves in the introduction.

Garmon, Gerald E. (discussion leader). Seminar 44: J.R.R. Tolkien. University of New York at Stony Brook; "The Vision of Williams for dwarves; some mention of Tolkien's description of dwarves in the introduction, it is nearly so, and far better than any other list available. It subdivides Williams' books into six categories: poetry, novels, plays, criticism, theology, and biographies. Other primary listings are of "Poems and Stories," "Articles and Letters," and "Essays, Reviews, Articles, and Dissertations" (which also includes poems), "Reviews" (a very limited selection), and "Dissertations" (cross referenced back to the second division of secondary materials). The secondary materials are divided into "Books" (only two are listed), "Articles, Chapters, and Dissertations" (the list which does not appear, for example, in the one on C.S. Lewis from the same publisher) is a running listing of the section number—"1-A-v" for Williams' theological works, for example. This allows quick reference from the indices. The

items are briefly annotated when the content is not obvious from the title; "The annotations from secondary materials are guides for reading, not summaries" (p. viii). Although the introduction does not indicate the cut-off date for the volume, it seems to have been in 1973. Of items published before that date, several essays by Dorothy L. Sayers are missed in the secondary sources (although it lists three which have Williams' name in their title); for example, "The Cornice of Sloth" (in *Further Papers on Dante*, 1957) has a six page discussion of Descent into Hell. For that matter, it would not have been amiss to list Sayers' instructions and notes for translating Dante's *Purgatory* which contain a large number of references to Williams (the two volumes are dedicated to him). Other checking in Dantean criticism would have revealed other references: Thomas G. Bergin's *Dante* (Boston; Houghton Mifflin Company; *Riverside Studies in Literature*, 1965) has six, for instance of expanding the material would have to follow critical discussions of the late T. Auden's "New Year Letter," for Auden in the notes to the original edition said it was indebted to Williams' *The Descent of the Dove*; for example, George W. Bahike's *The Later Auden: From "New Year Letters" to "About the House* (New Brunswick, New Jersey: Rutgers University Press, 1970), has eleven mentions of Williams. (Auden has three items on Williams listed in the secondary sources, but the note mentioned here is missed.) However, for all the possible chasings of Williams' influences into other fields which have not been omitted (and the mentions of Williams in T.S. Eliot criticism have not been illustrated), still the one hundred eighty "Articles, Chapters, and Dissertations" contain the basic listing of materials directly on Williams, and will be essential as a preparation for future criticism of his writings.


One of the five papers was "Alchemical Motifs in *The Lord of the Rings*" by Richard Baum (Pembroke State University).


GoodKnight quotes the full text of a letter Tolkien wrote to Dr. Herbert Schiro on 17 November 1957, which concludes, after speaking of the applicability of *The Lord of the Rings* to modern times, "But I should say, if asked, the tale is not really about Power and Dominion: that only sets the wheels going; it is about Death and the desire for deathlessness. Which is hardly more than[,] to say it's a tale written by a Man!" GoodKnight goes on to consider the ways Tolkien may be considered deathless: in Christian belief, in his works, and in his readers.


A discussion of the via media of the Mythopoeic Society between being a general fantasy-literature study group on one hand and a Christian evangelism committee on the other. "No other group than the Inklings, certainly not in the last hundred years, has participated in the genre of myth and fantasy and in critical theory about it, than they have. They... were concerned with myth both as a work of art and as a conveyer of truth" (p. 11). Thus it is fitting to have a society dedicated to the study of what they call *via media* and what they meant by what they wrote; perhaps, as a by-product of the literary reading of *The Inklings*, members of this Society shall feel the joy of which they spoke, or experience what C.S. Lewis said was the goal of reading of literature: an enlarging of being.

Incidental information about The Silmarillion from Christopher Tolkien, about two forthcoming biographies of Tolkien, and about places seen and people met during a trip to England.


A description of the choice of "The Mythopoeic Society" instead of "The Tolkien, Lewis, and Williams Society" at the time of the Society's founding.


Additions to, and some corrections (mainly new prices) of the original list which appeared in Minas Tirith Evening-Star, 4:2. Sixteen items, some with brief annotations.


An account of one of the Hobbit archers who went to the aid of the King Arvedui in the period when Angmar the Witch-King attacked, based on a comment in The Lord of the Rings, Appendix A.1.(iii) (p. 322 in the Houghton Mifflin ed.).


A report of an investigation into the disappearance of the Entwives, with such witnesses as Fangorn, Mordoroso Gorbat (orc), T. Stone Trolloc (sic), and Marcon of Umbar (a human southeron). "The Entwives disappeared. However, there is evidence of marital difficulties... the commission can report no concrete findings at this time."


A feigned history of the Rohirrim a generation after they settled in Rohandos Scatha, a dragon, attacks their horses, and Fram, son of Framgar and their king meets the dragon in its lair; later Fram is killed by dwarves. The style is, in general, at the level of Tolkien's summaries, although there are occasional slips: kinged it instead of ruled (p. 6), for example.


The interview begins with a discussion of the Wade Collection, covers some items about C.S. Lewis (such as his bicycle riding and brief period of automobile driving), mentions Kilby's interview with J.R.R. Tolkien in 1966 and the manuscript Kilby has written about it, and includes mention of other writers.

Hoglund, Ken. "The Significance of Dwarf-Names in the Writings of J.R.R. Tolkien" [so the contents page; the title above the essay drops the first three words]. Myrdad, 1:1 (Winter 1975), 8-10.

Hoglund compares the dwarf names he finds in The Hobbit and The Lord of the Rings with those listed in Chester Nathan Gould's "Dwarf-names: A Study in Old Icelandic Religion" (PMLA, December 1929). Hoglund concludes: "Tolkien's extensive use of authentic dwarf-names and derivations of authentic names indicates in microcosm the care he took to maintain an aura of reality around the entire body of his works" (p. 9). "Tolkien apparently did not carry over the meanings of the authentic name to the entities of his various dwarf-characters, with one exception. Gould comments, '...great wisdom in the north was usually associated with the supernatural...the summit of wisdom is probably touched in the aforementioned Gandalf, 'elf of magic.' Certainly, Gandalf by the end of The Lord of the Rings has revealed himself to be the 'summit of wisdom' and no careful reader of the trilogy can doubt the supernatural sources of Gandalf's powers" (p. 10).

Hulan Dave, "I Remember Mythopoeia." [Part One.] The High Aesthetic Line, No. 10 (September 1975), [20-25].


A continuing series on the history of the Mythopoeic Society, based more on the personalities of the California members than the ideas behind it. Hulan says that the Inklings met during "the latter years of World War II" and that Dorothy L. Sayers was a "frequent" attendee (Part One, p. 20). Since the Inklings were established by 1939 and Sayers attended none of the meetings, these essays cannot be considered scholarly; but as part of the social history of the popularity and influence of the Inklings, the essays have some importance. Perhaps the most interesting passage in these first two installments is the description of the presentation at Mythcon 21 of a masque based on Charles Williams' The Greater Triumphs (Part Two, pp. 28-31).


See the individual items by James Allen, Paul Anderson, J.R. Christopher ("A Baroque Memorial"), Diana Paxson, DeCles, Jane Fisk, William Rust Norris, Nancy-Lou Patterson, Benjamin Urutia, and Jeanne Wardwell.


"For me the most absorbing thing about the novel is the process by which Psyche and Orual were transformed into new persons. ...eventually both women attained self-knowledge through directly apprehending divine majesty, authority, and compelling sweetness. These revelations, I am going to contend, can legitimately be described as mystical experiences" (p. 4). Keefe then takes the four marks of the mystical experience from William James: ineffability, noetic quality, transparency, and passivity. She finds that Psyche experiences all four, and Orual, all except the first.


A note on Sarehole Mill near Birmingham, reprinted from some magazine articles. Likewise, the anonymous "Notes" in CSL: 6:12/72 (October 1975), 7, for references to Lewis in Malcolm Muggeridge's Such a Strange Lady (1975), and some magazine articles.
was by exploiting this bitterness that Morgoth was able to

Unlike Galadriel he did not accept his exile on Middle-

earth, and allowed bitterness to grow in his heart, and it


corrupt Sauron" (p. 12).

Sauron was one of the free peoples who was in turn corrupted

by Morgoth; "the only race from which Sauron could have

practise of substituted love" (also called "co-inherence"

and "exchange" by Williams): as fiction, in Descent into

Hell; as verse, in "The Founding of the Company"; and as

religious exposition, in He Came Down from Heaven. She

traces the statements about it in the latter, and translates

then into late Jungian terms. "Only when the centre of our

feeling and action is rooted in the Self instead of the self

(ego) can our love and our goodness reach beyond this

panduum swing of opposites [in which 'good' feelings in the ego

create 'bad' feelings in the unconscious] as well as denial' as used by Williams means exactly this" (p. 1).

"Substitution is a fact of the psyche and will take place

either through the mechanism of projections, forcing others
to carry bits of ourselves, or by sucking strength from
down into the unconscious; or it can become a conscious

exchange of love in the way that Williams describes" (p. 2).

After discussing the dangers involved for the spiritually

immature in practising Exchange, Luke adds, "Surely 'Forgive

us our trespasses' may be said to apply with especial

intensity to this urge to solve the problems of others who

have not asked in any real way for help for whom, having

asked, are only looking for a bolstering up of the 'old self'" (p. 3). The novel and the poem are used briefly as illuminations and are not discussed as art.


Group Discussions, February 1968. A sixteen-page repro-
duced essay; limited circulation.

A study of the moral choices in Tolkien's work, varying

to a degree) from the usual discussion by the emphasis on

the common failure to consciously choose—when one "acqui-
ses [in a compulsive desire from the unconscious"

(1). Examples from The Lord of the Rings, usually given a para-

graphic reach, are the Ringwraiths and Gollum (pp. 3-4), Saru-

man (pp. 4-5), Sam, Merry, and Pippin (pp. 5-6), Boromir and

Galadriel (pp. 6-9), Beregond, Gandalf, and Aro-

gon (pp. 10-12), Théoden (pp. 12-13), and Frodo (pp.


is still human and choice remains. At the very last the

opportunity comes again. First Gandalf then Frodo offers it

to him. His refusal brings death at the hands of his own

slave and he is seen to dissolve into smoke, nothingness,
as did the Ringwraiths—very different symbol from Gol-

lum's death in the purging fire" (p. 5). Of Théoden, after

Gandalf has used "his own conscious power to break the spell

of Wormtongue": "Gandalf deliberately leads him to Saruman,
to Wormtongue's master, whose honeyed words can woo

the strongest, and there Gandalf stays completely silent, offers

no help at all in spite of the enormous issues at stake.

Théoden must meet his shadow, make his choice alone and

free. We may, indeed we often must, take responsibility for

breaking the spell of the unconscious for another, but never

may we force him to a choice" (p. 13). Of Frodo and Gollum:

"Almost very last, the crowning moment of the myth, at the

edge of fulfillment. Frodo succumbs to the Ring... 'I do

not choose now to do what I came to do.' Indeed he disqui-

sishes in that moment his power of choice. 'I do not

choose any longer. I abandon my will to the unconscious.'

Frodo would have become a Ringwraith... But it is now,
in the final weakness that is delivered from the power

not by his own strength of mind and purpose but by means of

him whom he himself had delivered in the deep compassion of his heart. We may think here of Charles Williams' doctrine of exchange and the mystery of the coinherence" (p. 16).


in Dante's "Divine Comedy." Pecos, New Mexico: Dove

Publications, 1975. Pp. vi + 162 [references to Lewis,
p. 86, 159, 160; to Tolkien, pp. 123, 147; to Wil-

liams, pp. 5, 6, 29, 123, 155, 159, 160].

A Jungian commentary on the titular subject, often based

on Dorothy L. Sayers' discussion in her translations and in

her essay, "... And Telling You a Story." Lewis's Till We

Have Faces is used to illuminate the meeting of Dante and

Beatrice (p. 86); Tolkien's The Lord of the Rings is used to

illustrate a brief illustration of kingship in the Sphere of Mars

(p. 123) and a comparison of angels and Owain the eagle in

the Primum Mobile (p. 147)—Williams' The Place of the Lion

is alluded to in this latter discussion.

Review: J.R. Christopher's "Jung's Journey through Hell,
Purgatory, and Heaven" in this issue of Mythlore.


Farm Paper, [1969]. A sixteen-page chapbook; limited

circulation. [References as to Tolkien, pp. 4-16; to Wil-

liams, p. 6.]

The author sets up the Jungian archetype of the king—"The
'blood royal'...in each of us is that which inherits the high responsibility of ruling in the psyche, of uniting the personality in the service of the 'best'" (p. 3)—and compare the archetype with Aragorn in The Lord of the Rings. Of the rewards the King receives, the leadership of the psyche either falls into the hands of self-seeking factions at war with each other, or a man may be ruled for a long time by the 'second-best'—by motives, ideas, feelings, fine and good in themselves and administered to a noble end by a guilty conscience. She is born into the world without a true king, "the white tree' in the psyche dies." Aragorn received the essential education of a true king, whereby he learned to accept the validity of both conscious [mankind, this world] and unconscious [elves, the imagination], of both spirit and blood" (p. 7). She is deprived of a broken sword at the passage from unconscious boyhood to conscious manhood: There may come a moment in the life of a man, often when he is quite young, in which he glimpses with a strange feeling of certainty that which will be the dominant task, the leading principle[s] of his whole life... Such a man [with a broken sword] may find himself mistaken as to the actual way in which he imagines himself living out this first sight of the meaning of his life.... [But] if at the root of his being the will has accepted the long years of preparation...then the king, the highest and noblest ruling principle of his life, may in his due course become the ruler of a great kingdom whose boundaries reach beyond earth and sky. [p. 8]

Of Aragorn's love for Arwen: "There is great danger for such a man, who has vividly experienced the anima in her elf nature, that she will remain of course, on this earth, that she will, as it were, choose immortality" (p. 9). Other topics include the wounds of the Lord of the Ring-wraiths as psychic wounds of the will (pp. 12-13), the differences between Aragorn and Gandalf as archetypes of the king and the sage (pp. 13-14), and the symbolic significance of Gandalf's and Frodo's parts in the crowning of Aragorn (pp. 15-16). In addition to The Lord of the Rings, the Gospels and the I Ching are cited in the discussion.


After a brief introduction which suggests that modern woman is out of touch with her archetypal self, that the current trend "to destroy differences, to reduce everything to a horrible sameness in the cause of so-called equality" (p. iv), almost inevitably puts the woman's animus in charge of her femininity. Luke turns to three modern myths which provide answers: "Eowyn" (Part I, pp. 1-18), "Till We Have Faces"—Orual (Part II, pp. 19-94), "Dindraene" (Part III, pp. 95-109). Each of these she approaches as a Jungian. Luke treats Eowyn as a "symbolic and moving picture of the dilemma of modern woman" (p. iii). Eowyn, raised without "feminine warmth at court" (p. 6), is split between the heroic which exists only in her fantasy—the tales of her family's past—and the betrayal and decay which surrounds her. Then, "like so many women of her type who have grown afraid of their femininity and are shut off from it, she projects her animus onto a man whom she unconsciously knows to be unattractive" (p. 7). In her role as a Rider, she enters the arena of the male-dominated femininity now begins to assert itself: she is filled with compassion for Merry—a "true feminine reaction" (p. 10)—and at the battle she finds she cannot kill for a cause but only "to save a person whom she loves" (p. 11). "The Nazgul is the image of the desire which has overwhelmed our culture—the mind of man turned daemonic in its intellectual pride, emptied of human compassion" (p. 8). When Aragorn "calls her back from the borders of despair and death...her devotion to the royal and the highest and noblest attitude she knew, now draws her back to this life" (p. 17). Her love for Faramir gives her at last her true role.

About the next work, Luke writes, "the central figure in the story is not Psyche, the archetypal feminine, but her sister, Arwen, a woman who loves a 'psyche,' her feminine soul, and must rediscover her through long, painful struggle in the masculine world of action. She succeeds only after she has brought to maturity both her own Logos powers of dis-

The second work which Luke writes of is 'Till We Have Faces' of C.S. Lewis. He cites Dindrane as one of the best in any terms. Of the central figure, a woman who has known intercourse with the god within" (p. 94), are a trinity which "exists, lived or un-lived, either positively or negatively" (p. 95), In all women. The poem goes on to meditate on the life-restoring, the regenerate, and then after menopause. In the second poem, when only Bors returns from the voyage to Sarras, "Galahad's intuition, Perceval's [sic] inner wisdom, and the Eros values of Dindrane are removed into the unconscious" (p. 105); and the practicality of Bors, distorted, gives rise to the Renaissance, the Enlightenment, the Industrial Revolution, and the Age of Technological Materialism. But the Medieval Period, also flawed, refused the values of the whole woman, the conscious woman—Dindrane—which was the cause of the Grail being withdrawn. This, and other details, may be read as a symbolic statement of the situation in the middle years of this century...as also of the inner quest of every conscious woman" (p. 108).

Martin, Walter. Screwtape Writes Again. Santa Ana, California: Vision House Publishers, 1975. Pp. 150. A series of twenty-three new letters from Screwtape to Wormwood, with a preface and epilogue, dedicated to C.S. Lewis. The preface speaks of "the greatly lamented passing of counter agent 't,' whose magnificent deciphering of the interferral code 666 was so instrumental in multiplying our knowledge of [the] department of [the evil n] intelligence." The content of the letters can be briefly suggested: I, the "now" generation; II, the modern, liberal, theosophist; III, local churches; IV, gossip; V, doubt; VI, liberal theology; VII, premarital sex; VIII, women's lib; IX, types of faith (four bogus, one real); X, anger, especially between Christians; XI, charismatic gifts; XII, worldly causes as religious substitutes; XIII, rationalizations in business; XIV, homosexuality, abortion, and gluttony; XV, death and fear of death; XVI, the occult; XVII, the moral neutrality of education; XVIII, limitations on God's actions; XIX, temptations on the domestic level; XX, procrastination, especially about tithing; XXI, envy, jealousy; XXII, love of wealth; XXIII, does the woman who pines after the 'patient' and his salvation. The epilogue is from Dragonslik (another demon) to Screwtape.

As suggested, the content is social satire, more like "Screwtape Proposes a Toast" than the moral emphases of The Letters. The book is dedicated to "non-Christians," but works in a number of specific Biblical references, usually having Screwtape cite "the Enemy's Training Manual" (but
three times simply footnoting the references). Martin's book is structurally poorer than Lewis's, for he does not have the consistent plot about the patient throughout. Another comparative failure is his style; for example, he tends to make points twice, sometimes from distrust of his reader's intelligence: "as a noted enemy of ours once put it, 'There can be no agreement between Athens and Jerusalem.' The former is symbolic of the virtual deification and worship of human wisdom, the latter of submission to the Enemy" (p. 10). Martin's one classical allusion unfortunately suggests that Agamemnon was the husband of Helen (p. 61). His section on race is, as in the use of hand symbols, almost entirely with a metaphoric cliché: "she literally threw the baby out with the bathwater and abandoned church altogether" (p. 50). There are minor inconsistencies, as in the indication that devils are forbidden the mention of Jesus' name (p. 72) after it had already been used on p. 17. The coinages of demon names are more curious than Lewis's—such as the leEllenbog (an expert in sex, p. 43), Sboschnivel (an expert in racism, p. 43), Rabbledib (in charge of mob activities, p. 73), for example. Martin is also more inclined to pass judgment on recent man that was Lewis; the most specific example is his allusion to Albert Schweitzer (p. 36).

None of these strictures should be taken as indicating that Martin's observations are not occasionally acute; and his book (taken as a whole) will be agreeable in content to many of Lewis's conservative readers. His style, however, suggests his book is very much a laboratory of a testing, volume. As an indication of Lewis's Christian prestige, of course, Martin's book is a valuable example.


MeSkys reports Tolkien's comments about the use of the duodecimal numerical system among elves; he then reports on some English fannish and German publishing activities.


A summary of the various pieces of information about the wizards in The Lord of the Rings and (via analogy) The Road Goes Ever On. Several paragraphs left to presume that the other two Istari would also have colors, red or green perhaps, and other specialized functions" (p. 9); "When Gandalf faces the Balrog, he says, 'I am a servant of the Secret Fire, wielder of the Flame of Anor.' It is not altogether clear what he means. Anor is Sinadrin for 'Sun'. It could be that the power he has is ultimately derived from the Sun, as perhaps are all the Istari, and may even the Valar. This is similar to how Bombadil derives his power 'from the earth itself'" (p. 10).


Miller's study is divided by Arabic numbers into three parts (pp. 5-30, 31-65, 66-82), one for each volume of The Lord of the Rings—which he persists in calling "the Trilogy" (e.g., p. 5). The form of his commentary is a running plot summary with its own subplots (though not summarized). His major concern is with the moral choices made by the characters, and this he illustrates at great length with usually adequate and sometimes good analyses. He has a number of subthemes and personal approaches. One of the latter is his strong emphasis on the reader's personal involvement in the story through identification with characters (cf. the use of empathy or empathize on pp. 9, 14, 24 [twice], and 56). The most obvious of the former—the subthemes—is Miller's insistence that the Valar are in personal control of the major events of the story. In the third volume the major contrast is between Aragorn's healing hands and Sauron's Black Hand; the destruction of Frodo's hand at the end of the quest indicates "that a man's power is in proportion to his service of others rather than self" (p. 55). "Hand imagery epitomizes Sam's selfless services" (p. 56). As Charles Williams observes in The Greater Trumps, hands are "spiritual instruments of intention," and Frodo's hand creeping toward the Ring in the latter part of the quest is indicative of this, as is his choice to put the Ring, finally, on his right hand, not his left. One hand in this latter part are cited by Perret, before turning to such other analyses as this: Saruman's small white hand in the center of a black field, "ironically suggest to us the limitation of his challenges to the Black Hand whose darkness encircles hand" (p. 59). After these analyses, Perret turns to a comparison and contrast of the similar events in the different ages, particularly that between Beren and Frodo; the contrasts between the repetitiveness of history allow some hops—this is symbolized particularly by Frodo's rescue of Sam from the river near Amon Hen, which contrasts with Isildur's death in the river. "One of Tolkien's critics complains that ' imagery [of spiritual power] sometimes substitutes for demonstrations of that power,' but in The Lord of the Rings that imagery of hands is most often the action of hands—description is demonstration" (p. 63). This use of actions—somewhat cinematic in practice—allows Tolkien "to substitute significant detail for elaboration of an emotional state" (p. 63). Readers sometimes miss the power of these actions, expecting poetic rather than pictorial evocations, but Tolkien prefers to suggest rather than spell out; he invites his readers to participate in the imaginative act of sub-creation by his use of representative actions as well as by his use of generalized language" (pp. 63-64).


The four papers discussed were "The Masculine God of C.S. Lewis," by Edward G. Zosoby, S.J. (Le Moyne College); "A Pre-face to Perelandra," by Margaret L. Hannay (The State University of New York, Albany); "From Mt. Olympus to Glome:
C.S. Lewis's Dislocation of Apuleius's 'Cupid and Psyche' in "Till We Have Faces," by Steve J. Van Der Weele (Calvin College); and "Eschatology in C.S. Lewis's The Last Battle," by Nathan C. Starr (The University of Florida).


A series of adventures by the narrator "not unlike Christian's in The Pilgrim [sic] Progress, Castaneda's in Inxlan, Cowey's in Loot Horizon, Strong's in Erewhon, Mathieu's in Roads to Freedom, Farnsby's in Island, Dorothy's in The Wizard of Oz" (p. 16). The narrator leaves Los Angeles for Santa Barbara, looking for MIDDLE-earth (which is printed in capitals throughout the book); from there to Old Town in the desert; then to Lorien Junction, a farming town in a green valley surrounded by forested hills; then, over a mountain to an unnamed farming village; next, back to the desert, to a town called Nishapur Springs; then to the northeast and the mountain retreat called Kan-Ying; and finally to the north, to end on the crest of a hill. Each place has its meeting with one person or several who help or hinder the quest. Galadriel—"a woman in white...a tiny creature and beautiful...two giant deerhounds...came racing to her side" (p. 33)—first appears near Lorien Junction and then reappears (and vanishes again) at the end of the book. "The final vision includes "Frodo waving at me from the window of his underground house" (p. 69). Tolkien is also quoted as the epigraph to the volume (p. 5); other inset quotations from Tolkien appear on p. 22 (above a photograph) and p. 58 (along with a quotation from Lao Tzu). A photograph of Galadriel appears on p. 36 (printed in yellow; most commonly of landscapes.)


A collection of thirty-some reminiscences of Auden. All references to Coghill are about his being tutor to Auden at Oxford (the first, a listing in a chronology of Auden's life; the other three, anecdotes); perhaps the funniest is the dialogue between Coghill and Auden when Auden, in response to a question, said he was going to be a poet after graduation (Geoffrey Grigson's "A meaning of Auden," p. 16). Gabriel Garratt, in "A friend of the family," refers to Lewis as his tutor, and draws a minor comparison of Auden and Lewis—"They both enjoyed going for walks in Oxford fog and declaiming poetry in a loud voice" (p. 48). Ursula Niebuhr, in "Memories of the 1940s," refers to Auden having read The Allegory of Love (p. 108). A photograph of Auden reading The Lord of the Rings for the first time appears (p. 84), and one of Auden in his "Tolkien sweater"—it has G роли on it—(p. 168; also see the photographs on the two previous pages where Auden is wearing a coat over the same sweater). The first reference to Charles Williams is in the chronology (compiled by Edward Mendelson), quoting Auden about his first meeting with Williams, c. April/May 1937 (p. 10). Anne Frementle, in "Reality and religion," also quotes Auden, indicating Williams was partly responsible for his return to Christianity, "though we never discussed it" (p. 89). Ursula Niebuhr writes of Auden's knowledge of Williams and quotes from Auden's introduction to the British paperback edition of The Descent of the Dove (p. 112). [Also see Anne Frementle on Auden's knowledge of George MacDonald's books, p. 90.] [Some items omitted for reasons of space this issue will appear in the next installment.]

St. George Book Service

The MELNIKERS
P. O. Box 225 M
Spring Valley, NY 10977

Send 50c for Catalogue and Premium (credited to First Order)

For ALL Your Book Needs***MYTHOPOEIC & OTHERWISE

A Small Selection from Our Large Stock:

OWEN BARFIELD AND THE INKLINGS


THE SILVER TRUMPET. By Owen Barfield. 147pp., Quarto, Cloth $5.50


IMAGINATION AND THE SPIRIT. A Collection of Essays Presented to C.S. Lewis, J.R.R. Tolkien and Ursula K. Le Guin. 111pp., 5-1/4x8-1/4", Paper $2.95 *** Cloth $6.95

STRUCTURAL FABULATION: An Essay on the Fiction of the Future by Robert Scholes. Among the authors whose works are treated in this critical and theoretical study of the field of science fiction are C.S. Lewis, J.R.R. Tolkien and Ursula K. Le Guin.

N E W!!!! AVAILABLE FOR THE FIRST TIME N E W!!!!


$3.95

(FREE: Catalogue & Premium with your order for any of the above-listed items. Orders under $8.50, please add 50c for postage & handling.}

38