An Inklings Bibliography (13)

Joe R. Christopher
(emeritus) Tarleton State University, Stephenville, TX

Follow this and additional works at: https://dc.swosu.edu/mythlore

Part of the Children's and Young Adult Literature Commons

Recommended Citation
Available at: https://dc.swosu.edu/mythlore/vol7/iss2/18

This Article is brought to you for free and open access by the Mythopoeic Society at SWOSU Digital Commons. It has been accepted for inclusion in Mythlore: A Journal of J.R.R. Tolkien, C.S. Lewis, Charles Williams, and Mythopoeic Literature by an authorized editor of SWOSU Digital Commons. An ADA compliant document is available upon request. For more information, please contact phillip.fitzsimmons@swosu.edu.

To join the Mythopoeic Society go to: http://www.mythsoc.org/join.htm
Abstract
A series of bibliographies of primary and secondary works concerning the Inklings.

Additional Keywords
M.J. Johnson; Andy E. McIlbain
AN INKLINGS BIBLIOGRAPHY (13)

COMPILED BY JOE R. CHRISTOPHER


Nicholls explains in his "Introduction" that these essays were read at an Institute of Contemporary Arts in London, between January and March, 1975 (with one exception, when the speaker became ill and could not deliver the paper). There are eleven essays, seven by science-fiction (or fantasy) writers, four by respectable names in other fields (such as Altvon Toffler, author of Future Shock). Three of the essays mention Lewis or Tolkien:

(a) Ursula K. Le Guin, "Science Fiction and Mrs Brown", pp. 13-53 [Tolkien, 20-21]. Le Guin writes one of the better essays, discussing characterization in science fiction and using Virginia Woolf's "Mr Bennett and Mrs Brown" as her starting point. She uses The Lord of the Rings as her example of characterization in fantasy... as traditional myths and folktales break the complex conscious daylit personality down into its archetypal unconscious dreaming components... so Tolkien... broke Frodo into four: Frodo, Sam, Smeagol, and Gollum; perhaps five, counting Bilbo. Gollum is probably the best character in the book because he got two of the components, Smeagol and Gollum. Frodo himself is only a quarter or a fifth of himself. Yet even so he is something new to fantasy: a vulnerable, limited, rather unpredictable hero, who finally fails at his own quest... and has to have it accomplished for him by his mortal Enemy, Gollum, who is, however, his kinman, his brother, in fact himself. [Moreover, Frodo] has to go on, leave home, make the voyage out, in fact die—something fantasy heroes never do, and allegories are incapable of doing" (p. 21).

(b) Alan Garner, "Inner Time", pp. 119-138 [Lewis, 132]. Garner writes a very personal essay, about his nervous problems and their solutions. He describes the relief and new energy gained from the removal of a psychological blockage in these terms, in addition to the more personal ones: "The involvement of an academically-trained Western mind with a primitive catastrophic process (that is, the waking experience of Algurs, Dream-time, the Illud Tempus of anthropology) is not always pleasant, but it is never far from what C. S. Lewis calls 'Joy', and I would have it no other way" (p. 132).

(c) Peter Nicholls, "Science Fiction: The Monsters and the Critics", pp. 157-183 [Tolkien, 159-160]. Nicholls points out his own adaptation of the title of Tolkien's essay "Beowulf: The Monsters and the Critics", but the rest of Nicholls' essay does not make a point analogous to Tolkien's—the monsters are not the bug-eyed monsters and other aliens of science fiction but bothersome aspects of the SF field itself: The Sentimental Stylist, The Blurb Writer, The Insufficiently Monstrous Alien, The Monster of Anarchy (actually a discussion of the methods of depicting anarchy), and The Monster of Fulfilled Promise (the writer who repeats himself). The types of critics receive equally cute titles.

After Tolkien, Lewis, and Williams, Owen Barfield is the fourth best known member of the Inklings. He was a life-long best friend of C.S. Lewis, who waged "the Great War" with him on philosophical matters. This is covered by Humphrey Carpenter's book The Inklings. Admirers of C.S. Lewis might make the mistake of viewing Barfield's importance primarily as Lewis' friend and not considering his importance in his own right—as writer and philosopher. A very good introduction can be found in Romantic Religion: A Study of Barfield, Lewis, Williams, and Tolkien by R.J. Reilly.
Scott, Wm. C. L. "A Visit with Tolkien." *The Living Church*, 1976 (5 February 1976), 11-12 [Lewis and Williams, 12].

Scott tells of two visits to Tolkien in 1956, and quotes five comments from him and paraphrases others. There is nothing startling in her material, but she includes a satisfactory, brief introduction to Tolkien's writings and Carpenter's biography, with emphasis on *The Lord of the Rings*, *The Silmarillion*, and "On Fairy-Stories." She is good on the differences in genre between the two Middle-earth narratives: "To criticize The Silmarillion for failing at what it does not seek to do is, it seems to me, to blame a perfectly good cat for not being a dog or horse. The Lord of the Rings is not the usual statement against Lewis' nature as religious allegory.


Published monthly, free in exchange for a self-addressed, stamped envelope (1865 Bundy Street, Scranton, Pennsylvania 18508).

This fanzine is supposed to be a two-page production, but this issue is reproduced on one side of a sheet of white paper the size of ordinary typing paper; it contains a list of sixteen Valar, with the meanings of their names, epithets, etc., and twelve Maiar, with little information (the latter list includes Oldrin, Sauron, and Radagast).


[Williams, 12-13, 133, 337, 341.]

Williams' significance in this volume is minor but interesting. In the editorial introduction to selections from W. H. Auden's *For the Time Being*, Williams is described as the man "who, as an editor of Oxford University Press, was instrumental in introducing the Danish existentialist [Søren Kierkegaard] to the English-speaking world" (p. 133). Spanos, in his introduction, "Abraham, Slayagh, and the Furies: Some Introductory Notes on Existentialism," makes the common distinction between Christian and atheistic existentialism (Jean-Paul Sartre, in "Existentialism Is a Humanism," also made the distinction); Spanos uses the Skeleton figure in Williams' *Thomas G ragger of Canterbury* as an example of the Furies in the Judeo-Christian world, mentions that Seed of Adam, Judgement at Chalcedon, and *The House of the Octopus* also use this archetype, as well as such non-Christian works as Camus' *The Fall*, and even such modern works as Graham Greene's *The Power and the Glory* (p. 13). In the appendix, the list of the author's titles suggests a study of the Furies figures in, among other works, *Thomas Cranmer of Canterbury* (p. 337), and he lists two of the Williams' plays mentioned above in his "Selected Bibliography" (p. 341).


This volume of critical views of Chesterton, published on the centenary of his birth, contains fourteen essays, all by different authors, of which five refer to the Ingolds, usually in passing. (a) Kingsley Amis, "Four Fluent Fellows: An Essay on Chesterton's Fiction", pp. 28-39 [Lewis, p. 28], uses a phrase from Lewis' science-fiction theorizing in a discussion of The Napoleon of Notting Hill. (b) Ian Boyd, "Philosophy in Fiction" pp. 40-57 [Lewis, pp. 40-41, 238n], quotes a paragraph from Lewis' (uncollected) essay on Chesterton in *Time and Tide*, 9 November 1946, but does not use Lewis' distinction between two ways in which an author can long to own the rest of the essay. (c) W. H. Hope-Ellis, "Father Brown and Others", pp. 58-72 [Williams, p. 71], comments that both Chesterton and Williams have been charged with ruining their moral and religious themes with fantasy; he answers the charge for Chesterton, but the story, "The Dagger with Wings." (d) Stephen Metcalf, "The Achievement of G. K. Chesterton", pp. 81-121 [Lewis and Tolkien, p. 114; Williams, pp. 93, 116, 241n, 242n], at one point traces the defense of fairy tales from George MacDonald (and, behind him, Coleridge) through Chesterton to Lewis and Tolkien; also, Metcalf cites Williams' *Poetry at Present* and *The English Poetic Mind*, saying in his footnote on the former that its essay "Gilbert Keith Chesterton", is, "along with [Jorge Luis] Borges' essay, the best criticism of Chesterton known to me" (p. 241n). (e) John Sullivan, "A Liberal Education", pp. 171-181 [Lewis, pp. 172-173], mentions Lewis, along with William Empson, as being among the very small number of "don's" who have recognized Chesterton's sheer existence.


This is a small pamphlet produced by Houghton Mifflin for booksellers and other interested parties shortly before the publication of The Silmarillion. Christopher Tolkien offers a short history of the writing of the Silmarillion and of the content of the book; the material which does not duplicate Humphrey Carpenter's biography, Christopher Tolkien's introduction to The Silmarillion, or The Silmarillion itself, is a brief discussion of Christopher Tolkien's process of editing The Silmarillion "Here and there I had to develop the narraive out of notes and rough drafts; I had to make many choices between competing versions and to make many changes of detail; and in the last few chapters (which had been left almost untouched for many years) I had in places to modify the narrative to make it coherent [with the earlier chapters]." (p. [6]).

Tolkien, J. R. R. *Bilbo's Last Song*. New York: International Polydorics, 1976. Illustrated by Pauline Baynes. This is a boxed jigsaw puzzle (No. 1128); and, according to the material on the face of the box, it is the first American publication of the British "edition" of the poem. This edition was the poster released in Great Britain by George Allen and Unwin in 1974. (The American edition of the poem had a photographic background to the poster rather than the British drawing.) Baynes' drawing consists of the backs of three hobbits in the lower left foreground, a small harbor city before them with a river extending up the drawing; a ship is in the upper center; the drawing is framed on the left by a tree extending from bottom to top. The text of Tolkien's poem is on the right side, covering approximately the lower two-thirds. The puzzle has over 500 pieces, and the finished puzzle measures 15 by 21 inches.


Contemporary(a) K. J. Garlick, "Foreword," p. [5]. Garlick notes the Department of Western Art (presumably at The Ashmolean Museum) has been given custody of Tolkien's art; he gives
Baillie Tolkien discusses her father-in-law's art, particularly with praise for his painting of trees. (c) Humphrey Carpenter, "Biographical Note", pp. [8-10]. A sketch of Tolkien's life.

(d) "Catalogue", p. [10]. Details on the giving of measurements and the arrangement of material in the catalogue. (e) "I. The Hobbit", pp. [11-21]. A listing, with annotations, of the first thirty-five art works on display. Of the works listed, fifteen have not been published; these are often preliminary sketches of items published in The Hobbit. The introductory note to this section (p. [11]) has two errors in the list of black and white drawings in the first edition of The Hobbit. Item 29 should be 19; in the list of color plates in The American edition, Item 26 should have been included.

(f) "II. The Father Christmas Letters", pp. [22-30]. Items 36 through 50. The relationship of these catalogue items to those in the hardcover book is more difficult to note than with The Hobbit; for example, Item 36 is a brown envelope for the 1920 letter; from the annotation, it is evident that the "2 kisse" stamp on p. [7] of the book was reproduced from this envelope, but the envelope as a whole was not reproduced in the book. Likewise, the 1923 and 1924 envelopes (Items 39 and 40) show up in the book only as the center stamp and right stamp on p. [7], next to the 1922 stamp just mentioned. The second 1924 envelope (Item 41) has its stamp reproduced on p. [11] of the book. In the exhibit (Item 42) while again only the stamp is reproduced in the book (p. [8]); the catalogue notes the letter begins "My dear boys" (Item 43) while the printed text in the book dryps the salutation (p. [8]); the drawing on p. [9] of the book is done in black and white (Item 44), but the catalogue notes that the reverse side is inscribed "To John and Michael Tolkien from Father Christmas 1925". The catalogue does not indicate the origin of the holly spring drawing on a yellow field which the book puts into this section (p. [8]), looking left. A complete list of the items in the catalogue and the book in these terms is possible, but this is too small to suggest the complexity. (g) "III. The Lord of the Rings", pp. [31-35]. Items 69 through 82. Most of these items have been published in book covers or in calendars; two have not been published.


Tolkien, J. R. R., and Pauline Baynes. The Hobbit: A Two-Sided Jigsaw Puzzle. New York: International Polygraphics, 1977. One side of the boxed puzzle (No. 9. T200) consists of Tolkien's colored drawing from The Hobbit of "Bilbo comes to the Huts of the Raftelves" (copyright 1966), with the lower portion, bearing the title, omitted from this version; the other side of the puzzle has a reproduction of a black-and-white version illustrating The Hobbit, "There and Back Again: A Map of Bilbo's Journey through Eriador and Rhovanion" (1971). The jigsaw puzzle consists of over 500 pieces; the complete puzzle measures 15 by 21 inches.


With minor modifications, this volume collects the art which was printed in the various calendars of Tolkien's art, 1973, 1974, 1975, 1976, and 1977 (and also in a catalogue introduction that this does not exhaust his father's art work; presumably, however, it includes almost all of the art related to The Hobbit, The Lord of the Rings, and The Silmarillion. The general format is this: a color photograph of Tolkien as a frontispiece opposite the title page; the title page with triangular designs by Tolkien above and below the title (the same designs are printed above and below the title on the box); copyright page; "Foreword" by Christopher Tolkien (2 pp.); a page bearing a J.R.T. monogram (the same monogram is printed on the front cover of The Book of Tolkien and Forde, a volume which contains Christopher Tolkien's commentary on the left-hand page and a color print on the right. In nineteen cases, there is a related black-and-white drawing or other graphic material on the left-hand page with the commentary.

The reference is to J.R.T. here where the designs first appeared—in various books or in the calendars—since this information is part of the substance of Christopher Tolkien's notes and the volume may be consulted for it. Christopher Tolkien also states where the former reproductions have trimmed the work, or where the work has been reproduced in color at the face of the painting; notes the painting of each work, when the information is available.

The following numbered plates appear: (a) 1. The Hill: Hobbiton-across-the-Water. On the left-hand page appears a drawing, perhaps in pencil, which was used as the frontispiece of the original impression of The Hobbit; it has only minor variations from Tolkien's painting. (b) 2. The Trolls. Tolkien's black-and-white drawing on the left; H. E. Riddett's colored version on the right. (c) 3. The Three Trolls are Turned to Stone. Tolkien's black-and-white drawing on the left; H. E. Riddett's colored version on the right. (d) 4. Rivendell looking West. (e) 5. Rivendell looking East. (f) 6. Rivendell. (g) 7. The Mountain-path. Tolkien's black-and-white drawing on the left; Riddett's colored version on the right. (h) 8. The Misty Mountains looking West. From the Byrnie the Filipal Gate. Tolkien's black-and-white drawing on the left; Riddett's colored version on the right. (i) 9. Bilbo woke with the early sun in his eyes. Christopher Tolkien notes the model (in a painting) for the eagle. (j) 10. Beorn's Hall. Tolkien's black-and-white drawing on the left; Riddett's colored version on the right. (k) 11. The Elvenking's Gate (I). (l) 12. The Elvenking's Gate (II). Tolkien's black-and-white drawing on the left; Riddett's colored version on the right. (m) 13. Bilbo comes to the Huts of the Raft-elves (I). Christopher Tolkien notes that this version correctly shows the hobbits arriving by night, unlike the more formal painting (next) which appears in the second impression of the first British edition of The Hobbit. (n) 14. Bilbo comes to the Huts of the Raft-elves (II). (o) 15. Lake Town. Tolkien's black-and-white drawing on the left; Riddett's colored version on the right. (p) 16. The Front of Moria Gate. Tolkien's black-and-white drawing on the left; Riddett's colored version on the right. (q) 17. The Huts of the Raft-elves. (r) 18. Smaug flies around the Mountain. (s) 19. Death of Smaug. (t) 20. The Hall at Bag End, Residence of B. Baggins, Esquire. Tolkien's black-and-white drawing on the left; Riddett's colored version on the right. This concludes the sequence from The Hobbit.

(u) 21. Old Man Willow. (v) 22. Doors of Durin and Moria Gate. "Moria Gate" is the colored drawing by Tolkien; "Doors of Durin" (on the left-hand page) is the black-and-white drawing which appears in The Fellowship of the Ring. (w) 23. Leaves from the Book of Mazarbul. Christopher Tolkien's elaborate note, translating the fragmentary pages, is reprnted from The Lord of the Rings Calendar 1977. (x) 24. Moria Gate (The Steps to the East Gate). (y) 25. The Forest of Lothlórien in Spring. (z) 26. Helm's Deep and the Hornburg. (aa) 27. Orthanc and Minas Tirith. "Orthanc" (aa) shows the tower from the left; Christopher Tolkien mentions it is one of several different drawings by his father of the tower of Isengard; "Minas Tirith" is in color. (bb) 28. Shelob's Lair. One page of an early manuscript of The Two Towers. (cc) 29. Dunharrow. (dd) 30. Orthanc and Barad-dûr. Tolkien's colored drawing of Barad-dûr is in black and white, has a red tongue of flame at the top of the mountain in the original, and as it was reproduced in The Lord of the Rings Calendar 1977; "Barad-dûr" is in color. This concludes the sequence related to The Lord of the Rings.
Three Amalior. (pp. 42. Flowing Tree with Frizees. The tree is with varied flowers) on the right. The tree which shows combination of leaves or of flowers are versions of "The Tree of Amalior". (pp. 42). Flowering Tree with Frizes. The tree is another version of the Tree of Amalior. Two frises and two separate flowers complete the page. (pp. 43). Patterns (I). Nine drawings, two of them clearly of plants, done on newspaper pages. (pp. 44. Patterns (II). Twelve drawings, two of them crossing, (ss) 45. Floral designs. Five plants with a border around them; the one in the center is labeled pilinethar. Christopher Tolkien's note mentions others (not reproduced) like the center plant of a grass- or reed-like nature bearing Elvish names. (tt) 46. Númenorean Tile and Textiles. One tile; two textile patterns to the left and like some Oriental rugs). Christopher Tolkien notes the appropriate reference in The Silmarillion. Probably the title of this plate should have a second accent mark, over the o. (uu) 47. Heraldic Devices. Sixteen devices with a chart for their identification, all related to characters or objects in The Silmarillion. Christopher Tolkien explains some aspects of some of them and mentions that variant forms of two of them, printed in the J. R. R. Tolkien Calendar 1974, are not reproduced here. (vv) 48. Elvish Script. Three pages of script, all printed on the right-hand pages. In a printed in a decorated style. They are the beginnings of two of Tolkien's poems, "Errantry" and "The Adventures of Tom Bombadil".

Tolkien, J. R. R. The Silmarillion, ed. Christopher Tolkien. Boston Houghton Mifflin Company, 1977. 366 pp. + map attached to the inside of the back free endpaper. Index. The works of J. R. R. Tolkien are these: "Ainulindalë The Music of the Ainur" (pp. 15-42), "Valaquenta: Account of the Valar and Maiar according to the Elda" (pp. 25-32), "Quenta Silmarillion The History of the Silmarils" (pp. 35-255), "Akallabêth: The Downfall of Númenor" (pp. 259-282), and "Of the Rings of Power and the Third Age, in which these tales come to their end" (pp. 283-304). The works of Christopher Tolkien include "The Book of Eldar and Aredhel" (pp. 7-9), "The History of the Noldor and the Sindar" (map, pp. 120 and 121), "The House of Finwë and the Noldorin descent of Elrond and Elros", "The descendants of Olwë and Elwë", "The House of Elbros and the mortal descent of Elciron and Elros", "The House of Hador of Derai-Lómin" (genealogy charts, pp. 123-129), "The Eldar, the Elven and the Principles of the Eldar, daughter of the Elves and some names given to their divisions" (chart, p. 309), "Note on the Pronunciation" (pp. 310-311), "Index of Names" (pp. 313-344), "Appendix: Elements in Querya and Sindarin Names" (pp. 355-356), "Map of Beleriand and the Lands to the North" (attached to the back free endpaper). The materials by Christopher Tolkien, although valuable—especially the linguistic information—have not been discussed in the following paragraphs.

"Ainulindalë" opens before the creation of the universe, with Ere and the Ainur together, and Melkor tries to hear the singing of the Ainur. Later Ere projects the images of the song as a universe (called by Tolkien, in his old-fashionined diction, a "World"), and afterwards some of the Ainur enter that portion of the Void where the universe is to be built and help its development. It is connected with the Earth proper. "Valaquenta" is an expository section setting out the names, interests, and attributes of the Valar, of the Maiar, and of their enemies, Melkor and Sauron. Of "Quenta Silmarillion" the much substance to adequately be indicated in an annotation. It takes the form of a history, and some of the twenty-four chapters are mainly geographic descriptions—Chapter 14, "Of Beleriand and its Realms"—or have biographical passages, such as pp. 60-61 of Chapter 15, "The House of Hador of Derai-Lómin." This portion of the book is also historical in the more limited tradition of Numbers 21:14-15, Joshua 10:11; and 2 Samuel 11:18—that is, it has references to "lost" (at least, un-published) books: pp. 76, 87, 99, 162ff., 198, 209, 212, 216, 299. But the basic history of this section tells of the making of the three Silmarils by Fëanor, capturing in an бложества (p. 67, in Ch. 7); the theft of the Silmarils by Melkor, thereafter known as Morgoth, who killed Finwë in the theft (p. 79, in Ch. 9); the oat of Fëanor and his seven sons for vengeance on whomever kept a Silmaril from them (pp. 80-81); the taking of one of the Silmarils from Morgoth's crown by Beren and Lúthien (p. 181, in Ch. 18), and the giving of it to Thingol (p. 186); the killing of Thingol by dwarves of the Blue Mountains for the Silmaril, now set in the Nauglamir (p. 233, in Ch. 22); the gaining of the necklace of the Silmaril by Beren from Lord of Norgor (p. 235); the coming of the Silmaril to Dior after the deaths of Beren and Lúthien, and its passing to Elwing on her father's death at the hands of the sons of Fëanor (p. 237); the wearing of the Silmaril on his forehead as Elwing's husband, Elrond, sought Aman (p. 247, in Ch. 24) and later when he sailed the heavens in Vinyiglot (p. 250); the capture of the other two Silmarils with the capture of Morgoth by the host of the Valar (p. 252); the taking of these two Silmarils, with the killing of the guards, by the last two sons of Fëanor (p. 253), and the ultimate disposal of the one kept by Fëanor (pp. 253-254). But this is not something that is evident in the history, even if its titular emphasis suggests it is the most important.

The "Quenta Silmarillion" no doubt will have non-narrative study. Hobbits, as had been reported earlier, do not appear; Ots, as "Shepherds of the Trees", are mentioned twice (pp. 146, 220). As is not surprising, the next two aspects of the singletome remind the inscription on the gravestone of Tolkien and his wife, Chapter 19, "Of Beren and Lúthien", is the longest of the twenty-four (pp. 162-187). It also, in its heavy use of vamps and wolves, probably represents an early aspect of Tolkien's imagination in the Middle-earth. Other brief touches suggest other influences on the names: "Artadh and Urthel" (p. 155) perhaps derive from (King) Arthur and Uther (Pendragon); the company going on the wolf hunt on p. 185 perhaps is influenced by the lists of men in "Ulfwach and Oxwen"; the death of Niscorn, (293, as Carpenter suggested in his biography of Tolkien, is based on the death of Kullervo's sister in Runo 35 of the Kalevala, and the death of Turin, with his speaking sword (pp. 225), on that of Kullervo, with his likewise speaking sword, in Runo 36. Tolkien clearly leaves open the possibility of using the second chapter of Genesis with the appearance of mankind in Middle-earth (pp. 103, 111).

"Akallabêth" is also historical, beginning (or nearly so) with the raising of the island Andor, or Númenóre, from the sea for the Edain, or Dúnedain (p. 260). The main country is given over to the raising of the Dúnedain with the bow of their journeying westward to Eressëa (p. 264 ff.); more specifically, it tells of Sauron's causing of Ar-Pharazon the Golden to try to capture Eressëa (p. 270 ff.) and its consequences. Tolkien clearly places the origins of the lands of Avalon (or Avalinx) and Atlantica in use of Avalinx, the port city on Eressëa closest to the dwellings of men (p. 260), which is sometimes visible from Númenóre (pp. 262-263), and in Númenóre being called Atalantë in Eldarin speech (p. 281). A second conclusion to this history (or so it seems) is printed in smaller type, indented, after the first conclusion (pp. 281-282); presumably Christopher Tolkien, in his editorial work, could not decide between their merits.

The final section by J. R. R. Tolkien, "Of the Rings of Power and the Third Age", actually spends about one-third of its length summarizing the Second Age (pp. 285-289), and then traces the general history of the Third Age (pp. 294-304). There is a small amount of dialogue, but little of normal fictional shaping; essentially Tolkien is offering the historical background to The Hobbit and The Lord of the Rings.

(1964) is mentioned in the biographical headnote, but the fantasy and science-fiction verses are not noted (one of the latter first appeared in *The Magazine of Fantasy and Science Fiction*). Of Other Worlds is annotated, but primarily for its fiction; the comments on the essays do not indicate that all deal largely with fantasy-fiction or fantasy ("On Stories" is on the prose romance genre, which is usually fantasy-oriented). The Pilgrim's Progress is listed, but only one edition (not the first), is given; no annotation. The one sentence summaries of the Narnian books are sometimes distorted, but most bothersome are the two passages on Christianity in the summaries of the Random trilogies: That of Out of the Silent Planet ends with "a plea for Christianity"; Perelandra, with "admirable as Christian propaganda, but with a weak plot"; That Hideous Strength, with "More Christian propaganda, and the latter annotation with no indication of plot. The first book actually has almost no explicit Christianity, and (in this context) should be seen mainly as an anti-Wellsian work. Perelandra is legitimately seen as a Christian work (Lewis says, in "A Reply to Professor Haldane", that it was written for his "co-religionists") -- but if it was written primarily for Christians, it can hardly be called propaganda. That Hideous Strength should have its fantasy element noted (the revival of Merlin) and the fact that it was simply, when published, set slightly in the future. Unlike the practice with some of the other authors, no secondary materials are mentioned; certainly Walter Hooper's *Middle-earth* (1978). Tyler is writing short essays on his subjects, and they agree on almost none of them.

At least one chart in the 1976 edition, "The Quendi" (p. 382), is omitted (cf. pp. 288 in 1976, 371 in 1979) — although Tolkien is mentioned (p. 347). In the account of men in both editions, the Fall is omitted. Such an inaccuracy in the first edition as "most unique" (of Lothlórien) is changed to "most singular" (p. 272 vs. p. 347). In the account of men in both editions, the Fall is omitted (cf. pp. 288 in 1976, 371 in 1979) — although Tolkien suggests it is likely that Tolkien was the translator of some of the original manuscripts. The drawings at the ends of the alphabetical sections are reproduced from the original edition. As well as several examples of Tolkien's scripts, the following charts and maps appear:

- "A Battle of Annoney" (p. 62; 1976, p. 52).
- "High Kings of the Noldor" (p. 287; new).
- "The Eldain and their Descendants" (pp. 336-337; cf. 1976, p. 265).
- "The Eldar and their Descendants" (pp. 338-339; cf. 1976, p. 266).

Gondor at three different times (p. 485; 1976, p. 391).

"Spoken Tongues ... during the Third Age" (p. 540; new).

"The Two Trees: showing descent" (p. 595; new).

At least one chart in the 1976 edition, "The Quendi" (p. 382), is omitted. Such an inaccuracy in the first edition as "most unique" (of Lothlórien) is changed to "most singular" (p. 272 vs. p. 347). In the account of men in both editions, the Fall is omitted (cf. pp. 288 in 1976, 371 in 1979) — although Tolkien suggests it is likely that Tolkien was the translator of some of the original manuscripts. From the *Silmarillion* can be found in the listing for Turgon: "It seems not unlikely that Turgon was the lord of Numynion"; "King Turgon is unlikely to have deserted his city in its last need" (thus 1976, p. 428; cf. 1979, pp. 584-591).

An interesting comparison can be made between this volume and its major competitor, Robert Foster's *The Complete Guide to Middle-earth* (1976). Tyler is writing short essays on his subjects while Foster presents his information briefly, with page references. But the difficulty in checking the dates in the *Silmarillion* is shown by their chronologies of the First Age (Tyler, under "First Age", pp. 217-222; Foster, Appendix A, pp. 557-564). Although their dates are usually fairly close, they agree on almost none of them.


Wain, at one point comparing the modern developments in theatrical drama with what preceded them, writes, "Twenty years ago it seemed that the salvation of the English drama might come from scholarly-minded men of letters like T. S. Eliot and Charles Williams. Now, suddenly, the actors have taken over." That is, the new playwrights — John Osborne, Harold Pinter, John Whiting, Alun Olden, and others — began their careers as actors.

Wain, John. "John Wain Reads Contemporary English Poetry" (cassette No. 23228) and "The Poetry of John Wain" (cassette no. 23229). In "The YW-YMHA Poetry Center Series on Modern Poets, Writers, and Critics". New York: Jeffrey Morton Publishers/Audio Division, 1969 and 1965 [thus the dates in the catalogue and on the cassette covers; actually both tapes were recorded at the same March 1965 session]. 27 and 29 minutes respectively.

On the first tape ("Contemporary English Poetry"), Wain is briefly introduced by Harvey Bright. Wain reads and comments on five poems by Philip Larkin, an excerpt from Esra Pound, and a poem by A. E. Houseman. Larkin's "Days", a short, free-verse poem, is read twice, as an example of pure poetry. Then Wain introduces his long Wild Track. On the second tape ("The Poetry of John Wain"), Wain reads several excerpts from Wild Track (without ever mentioning its name) and comments on the thematic significance of many of the materials. His selections also include some of the humorous passages. He concludes by reading a villanelle which came to him after he had finished *Wild Track* in Sweden (it includes the repeated line, "Time rules I should lay down the heavy lyre"); he had first thought to include it in the *Wild Track* volume as a coda, but later decided not to. (Both cassettes are recorded on one side only.)

Wain, John (interviewee). "Kaleidoscope" radio program, with Paul Vaughan, interviewer. B.B.C. Radio 4, 23 October 1978, 9:30-10:00 p.m.

An oral review of Humphrey Carpenter's *The Inklings*. (The program opened with Gregory de Poligny reading most of the first paragraph of *Perelandra*.) Wain found Carpenter's recreation of an Inklings' meeting painful, partly because the characters talked like their writings. He also disagreed with Carpenter's emphasis on Lewis's centrality in the Inklings — certainly he was important as the host and stimulator of the group, but Tolkien and Williams were beyond his range in ways, and Lewis usually lost his arguments at the meetings. He agreed with Carpenter on Tolkien's and Williams' influence on Lewis, and not vice versa, except for encouragement. He spoke of Hugo Dyson's veto power over Tolkien's reading of newly composed parts of *The Lord of the Rings* — with agreement, since

The first part of this column, with a subtitle "Dream World," indicates that Stephen R. Donaldson admired Lewis' Narnian series, Frank Herbert's Dune series, and (most of all) Tolkien's Middle-earth. When he wrote The Chronicles of Thomas Covenant, the Unbeliever.


Walters, in a discussion of Christmas publishing, mentions the sale of boxed sets of related books. "In 1977, for example, Ballantine Books sold nearly 300,000 sets of J. R. R. Tolkien's Middle-earth Fable" (p. 107). He suggests that the Tolkien calendar was inspired by the success of the Sierra Club Wilderness Calendar (p. 107), both of which are still among the popular calendars (p. 108).


Shaw wrote The Intelligent Woman's Guide to Socialism and Capitalism; Watson's title is an echo of that. Her book is a study of Shaw's treatment of feminine characters in his plays and his comments about Women's Rights. Lewis gets in only for his odd statement in Surprised by Joy that "You may add that in the hive and the ant hill we see fully realized the two things that some of us most dread for our own species—the dominance of the female and the dominance of the collective." Watson comments that since Lewis is "normally a precisionist," his reaction against "the vital genius of the female" (she is writing in the context of Shaw and Ernest Jones saying women have a "vitality which (at least of men) may show that that vitality is "strong enough to thread the essential power of clever men". She is also using Lewis's statement as an example of the vagueness of most hostile comments.


This first issue was produced while Westmarch was the Southern California branch of the American Tolkien Society; subsequently, it became independent. This issue is concerned mainly with meeting and membership information; it does mention the attendance at a meeting of "Moody and Martha Tolkien... California cousins of J. R. R. Tolkien."


The first page has a meeting report and plans; the second page is a letter from Zuber explaining the decision to separate from the American Tolkien Society.


The issue is mainly concerned with meetings of the discussion group, but on p. 2 are two Great Mallorn medallions which Tolkien designed for Luthien Tinuviel. Zuber suggests the significance of the Beren and Luthien love story for Tolkien, and finds the emblem appropriate. (b) A drawing of Tom Bombadil.

Yates, Jessica. "Tolkien in Oxford: The Tolkien Society Guide". Littlehampton, West Sussex: SoNF Enterprises, for the Tolkien Society, 1978. One page, miswritten on both sides. The examined copy was on blue paper. [Lewis, 1-2; Williams, 1.]

A brief guide to points of interest for fans of Tolkien and Lewis in Oxford—homes, colleges, cemeteries (that of Williams is also mentioned), eating places, places of worship. Central Oxford is described first (in terms of a walking tour), then south Oxford, and finally north Oxford.