An Inklings Bibliography (13)

Joe R. Christopher
(emeritus) Tarleton State University, Stephenville, TX

Follow this and additional works at: https://dc.swosu.edu/mythlore
Part of the Children's and Young Adult Literature Commons

Recommended Citation
Available at: https://dc.swosu.edu/mythlore/vol7/iss2/18

To join the Mythopoeic Society go to: http://www.mythsoc.org/join.htm
An Inklings Bibliography (13)

Abstract
A series of bibliographies of primary and secondary works concerning the Inklings.

Additional Keywords
M.J. Johnson; Andy E. McIlbain
AN INKLINGS BIBLIOGRAPHY (13)

Compiled by Joe R. Christopher


Nicholls explains in his "Introduction" that these essays were read at an Institute of Contemporary Arts in London, between January and March, 1975 (with one exception, when the speaker became ill and could not deliver the paper). There are eleven essays, seven by science-fiction (or fantasy) writers, four by respectable names in other fields (such as Alton Toffler, author of *Future Shock*). Three of the essays mention Lewis or Tolkien:

(a) Ursula K. Le Guin, "Science Fiction and Mrs Brown", pp. 13-15. [Tolkien, 20-21]. Le Guin writes one of the better essays, discussing characterization in science fiction and using Virginia Woolf's "Mrs Bennett and Mrs Brown" as her starting point. She uses *The Lord of the Rings* as her example of characterization in *Fantasy*. . . . as traditional myths and folktales break the complex conscious daylight personality down into its archetypal unconscious dreaming components . . . so Tolkien . . . broke Frodo into four: Frodo, Sam, Smeagol, and Gollum; perhaps five, counting Bilbo. Gollum is probably the best character in the book because he got two of the components, Smeagol and Gollum. Frodo himself is only a quarter or a fifth of himself. Yet even so he is something new to *Fantasy*: a vulnerable, limited, rather unpredictable hero, who finally fails at his own quest . . . and has to have it accomplished for him by his mortal Enemy, Gollum, who is, however, his kinsman, his brother, in fact himself. [Moreover, Frodo] has to go on, leave home, make the voyager out, in fact die—something *Fantasy* heroes never do, and allegories are incapable of doing" (p. 21).

(b) Alan Garner, "Inner Time", pp. 119-138 [Lewis, 132]. Garner writes a very personal essay, about his nervous problems and their solutions. He describes the relief and new energy gained from the removal of a psychological blockage in these terms, in addition to the more personal ones: "The involvement of an academically-trained Western mind with a primitive catastraphic process (that is, the waking experience of *Alitra*: Dream-time, the *Illud Tempus* of anthropology) is not always pleasant, but it is never far from what C. S. Lewis calls 'Joy', and I would have it no other way" (p. 132).

(c) Peter Nicholls, "Science Fiction: The Monsters and The Critics", pp. 157-183 [Tolkien, 159-160]. Nicholls points out his adaptation of the title of Tolkien's essay "Beowulf: The Monsters and The Critics", but the rest of Nicholls' essay does not make a point analogous to Tolkien's—the monsters are not the bug-eyed monsters and other aliens of science fiction but bothersome aspects of the SF field itself: The Sentimental Stylist, The Blurb Writer, The Insufficiently Monstrous Alien, The Monster of Anarchy (actually a discussion of the methods of depicting anarchy), and The Monster of Fulfilled Promise (the writer who repeats himself). The types of critics receive equally cute titles.
Scott, Wm C. L. "A Visit with Tolkien." The Living Church, 17961 (5 February 1978), 11-12 [Lewis and Williams, 12].

(With a photograph of Tolkien in Tolkien's library. Scott tells of two visits to Tolkien in 1965, and quotes five comments from him and paraphrases others. There is nothing startling in her material, but she includes a satisfactory, brief introduction to Tolkien's writings and Carpenter's biography, with emphasis on The Lord of the Rings, The Silmarillion, and "On Fairy-Stories." She is good on the differences in genre between the two Middle-earth narratives: "To criticize The Silmarillion for failing at what it does not seek to do is, it seems to me, to blame a perfectly good cat for not being a dog or horse. The Lord of the Rings, however, is not subject to the parable of heroic romance in the clothing of a modern novel. The Silmarillion keeps company with myth, legend, epic, and scripture." [p. 11]. The most interesting of the new comments are Tolkien's comparison of himself to Bilbo, his exclamation over how "dreadful" Williams' books are, and his depreciation of a comparison of Sauron and Hitler. His paraphrased comment of dislikes of the Narnian books is not the usual statement against Lewis's sentimentalized mythology but specifically because of their nature as religious allegory.


Published monthly, free in exchange for a self-addressed, stamped envelope (1865 Bundy Street, Scranton, Pennsylvania 18509).

This fascimile is supposed to be a two-page production, but this issue is reproduced on one side of a sheet of white paper the size of ordinary typing paper; it contains a list of sixteen valar, with the meanings of their names, epithets, etc., and twelve kaiar, with list information (the latter list includes oldin, sauron, and radagast). Spanos, Williams V. (ed.). A Casebook on Existentialism. New York: Thomas Y. Crowell Company, 1966. viii + 344 pp. [Williams, 12-13, 133, 327, 341.]

William's significance in this volume is minor but interesting. In the editorial introduction to selections from W. H. Auden's For the Time Being, Williams is described as the man "who, as an editor of Oxford University Press, was instrumental in introducing the Danish existentialist [Søren Kierkegaard] to the English-speaking world." [p. 133]. Spanos, in his introduction, "Abraham, Sloghnu, and the Furries: Some Introductory Notes on Existentialism," makes the common distinction between Christian and atheistic existentialism (Jean-Paul Sartre, in "Existentialism Is a Humanism," also made the distinction); Spanos uses the Skeleton figure in Williams's Thomas Cranmer of Canterbury as an example of the Furries. In a different work, he mentions that Seed of Adam, Judgement at Chalcedon, and The House of the Octopus also use this archetype, as well as such non-Christian works as Camus' The Fall and such Christian works as Graham Greene's The Power and the Glory (p. 13). In the appendices of the book in the same year, Spanos suggests a study of the Furries figures in, among other works, Thomas Cranmer of Canterbury (p. 337), and he lists two of the Williams' plays mentioned above in his "Selected Bibliography" (p. 341).


This volume of critical views of Chesterton, published on the centennial of his birth, contains fourteen essays, all by different authors, of which five refer to the Ingolds, usually in passing. (a) Kingsley Amis, "Four Fluent Fellows: An Essay on Chesterton's Fiction," pp. 28-39 [Lewis, p. 28], uses a phrase from Lewis' science-fiction theorizing in a discussion of The Napoleon of Notting Hill. (b) Ian Boyd, "Philosophy in Fiction" pp. 40-57 [Lewis, pp. 40-41, 383n], quotes a paragraph from Lewis' (uncollected) essay on Chesterton in Time and Tide, 9 November 1946, but does not use Lewis' distinction between two ways in which an author can come to own the rest of the essay. (c) W. H. Everest, "Father Brown and Others," pp. 58-72 [Williams, p. 71], comments that both Chesterton and Williams have been charged with ruining their moral and religious themes with fantasy; he answers the charge for Chesterton in the essay, "The Dagger with Wings." (d) Stephen Metcalf, "The Achievement of G. K. Chesterton," pp. 81-121 [Lewis and Tolkien, p. 114; Williams, pp. 93, 116, 241n, 242n], at one point traces the defense of fairy tales from George MacDonald (and, behind him, Coleridge) through Chesterton to Lewis and Tolkien; also, Metcalf cites Williams' "Poetry at Present and The English Poetic Mind," saying in his footnote on the former that its essay "Gilbert Keith Chesterton", is, "Along with [Jorge Luis] Borges' essay, the best criticism of Chesterton known to me" (p. 241n). (e) John Sullivan, "A Liberal Education," pp. 171-181 [Lewis, pp. 172-173], mentions Lewis, along with William Empson, as being among the very small number of "dons" who have recognized Chesterton's sheer existence.


This is a small pamphlet produced by Houghton Mifflin for booksellers and other interested parties shortly before the publication of The Silmarillion. Christopher Tolkien offers a short essay, "Christopher Tolkien's introduction to The Silmarillion, or The Silmarillion itself," is a brief discussion of Christopher Tolkien's process of editing The Silmarillion. "Here and there I had to develop the narrative out of notes and rough drafts; I had to make many choices between competing versions and to make many changes of detail; and in the last few chapters (which had been left almost untouched for many years) I had in places to modify the narrative to make it coherent [with the earlier chapters]." (p. [6]).

Tolkien, J. R. R. Bilbo's Last Song. New York: International Polylogics, 1976. Illustrated by Pauline Baynes. This is a boxed jigsaw puzzle (No. T128); and, according to the material on the face of the box, it is the first American publication of the British "edition" of the poem. This edition was the poster released in Great Britain by George Allen and Unwin in 1974. (The American edition of the poem had a photographic background to the poster rather than the British drawing.) Baynes' drawing consists of the backs of three hobbits in the lower left foreground, a small harbor city before them with a river extending up the drawing; a ship is in the upper center; the drawing is framed on the left by a tree extending from bottom to top. The text of Tolkien's poem is on the right side, covering approximately the lower two-thirds. The puzzle has over 500 pieces, and the finished puzzle measures 15 by 21 inches.


Contemporary (a) K. J. Garlick, "Foreword," p. [5]. Garlick notes the Department of Western Art (presumably at The Ashmolean Museum) has been given custody of Tolkien's art; he gives
one of the details of the organizing of the exhibition. (b) Baillie Tolkien, “Introduction”, pp. [6-7]. Baillie Tolkien discusses her father-in-law’s art, particularly with praise for his painting of trees. (c) Humphrey Carpenter, “Biographical Note”, pp. [8-10]. A sketch of Tolkien’s life. (d) “Catalogue”, p. [10]. Details on the giving of measurements and the arrangement of material in the catalogue. (e) “I. The Hobbit”, pp. [11-21]. A listing, with annotations, of the first thirty-five art works on display. Of the works listed, fifteen have not been published; these are often preliminary sketches of items published in The Hobbit. The introductory note to this section (p. [11]) has two errors in the list of black and white drawings in the first edition of The Hobbit. Item 29 should be 19; in the list of color plates in the American edition, Item 26 should have been included. (f) “II. The Father Christmas Letters”, pp. [22-30]. Items 36 through 44. The relationship of these catalogue items to those in the hardcover book is more difficult to note than with The Hobbit; for example, Item 36 is a brown envelope for the 1920 letter; from the annotation, it is evident that the “2 kisses” stamp on p. [7] of the book was reproduced from this envelope, but the envelope as a whole was not reproduced in the book. Likewise, the 1923 and 1924 envelopes (Items 39 and 40) show up in the book only as the center stamp and right stamp on p. [7], next to the 1922 stamp just mentioned. The second 1924 envelope (Item 41) has its stamp reproduced on p. [8], of the book. In 1925, an envelope (Item 42) was in the exhibit (Item 42) while only again the stamp is reproduced in the book (p. [8]); the catalogue notes the letter begins “My dear boys” (Item 43) while the printed text in the book dryes the salutation (p. [8]); the drawing on p. [9] of the book is done in ink (Item 44), but the catalogue notes that the reverse side is inscribed “To John and Michael Tolkien from Father Christmas 1925.” The catalogue does not indicate the origin of the holly spring drawing on a yellow field which the book puts into this section (p. [8], looking right). A complete examination of the catalogue and the book in these terms is possible, but this is enough to suggest the complexity. (g) “III. The Lord of the Rings”, pp. [31-35]. Items 69 through 82. Most of these items have been published on book covers or in calendars; two have not been published. (b) “J. R. R. Tolkien’s Books”, pp. [36-37]. A list of current British editions. The following drawings by Tolkien are reproduced in this catalogue: “The Green Dragon” (cover, in color); a monogram of J. R. R. T. (p. [1]); a drawing of a dragon (p. [11]); “Dwarves Marching” (p. [13]); “Dragon and Warrior” (p. [17]); “Smaug” (p. [19]); “Feast of the Lord of the Rings” (orange and yellow over Oxford) (p. [22]; book, p. [9]); a North Pole stamp (p. [26]; book, p. [7]); two North Pole stamps (p. [27]; book, pp. [4] and [16]); “By Elf Messenger” (p. [30]; book, p. [4]); two circular patterns (p. [31]); design for the dust jacket of The Fellowship of the Ring (back cover, in color; published on dust jackets of reproductions of Tolkien’s The Hobbit and The Lord of the Rings and on The Lord of the Rings 1977 Calendar [George Allen and Unwin]).

Tolkien, J. R. R., and Pauline Baynes. The Hobbit: A Two-sided Jigsaw Puzzle. New York: International Polygrams, Inc., 1967. One side of the boxed puzzle (No. 91200) consists of Tolkien’s colored drawing from The Hobbit of “Bilbo comes to the Huts of the Raftelves” (copyright 1966), with the lower portion, bearing the title, omitted from this version; the other side of the puzzle has an engraving by Baillie Tolkien, illustrating The Hobbit, “There and Back Again: A Map of Bilbo’s Journey through Eriador and Rohanovian” (1971). The jigsaw puzzle consists of over 300 pieces; the completed puzzle measures 15 by 21 inches.

Tolkien, J. R. R. Pictures by J. R. R. Tolkien. Foreword and notes by Christopher Tolkien. London: George Allen and Unwin, 1969. Boxed. No page numbers [106 pp.]. Pages measure 12 inches vertically and 11 horizontally. With minor modifications, this volume collects the art which was printed in the various calendars of Tolkien’s art, 1973, 1974, 1975, and 1976. The foreword and notes by Christopher Tolkien suggest that this does not exhaust his father’s art work; presumably, however, it includes almost all of the art related to The Hobbit, The Lord of the Rings, and The Silmarillion. The general format is this a color photograph of Tolkien as a frontispiece opposite the title page: the title page with triangular designs by Tolkien above and below the title (the same designs are printed above and below the title on the box); copyright page; “Foreword” by Christopher Tolkien (2 pp.); a page bearing a J.R.R. Tolkien’s monogram (the same monogram is printed on the front cover of the box and the bottom right of the box); a reproduction of Christopher Tolkien’s commentary on the left-hand page and a color print on the right. In nineteen cases, there is a related black-and-white drawing or other graphic material on the left-hand page with the commentary.

The reverse is a word here where the designs first appeared—in various books or in the calendars—since this information is part of the substance of Christopher Tolkien’s notes and the volume may be consulted for it. Christopher Tolkien also states when the former reproductions have trimmed the work, and when it has been reproduced in a size other than that of the painting of each work, when the information is available. The following numbered plates appear: (1) The Hill: Hobbiton-across-the-Mere. On the left-hand page appears a drawing, perhaps in pencil, which was used as the frontispiece of the original impression of The Hobbit; it has only minor variations from Tolkien’s painting. (2) The Trolls. Tolkien’s black-and-white drawing on the left; H. E. Riddett’s colored version on the right. (3) The Three Trolls are Turned to Stone. Tolkien’s black-and-white drawing on the left (this is first published); Riddett’s colored version on the right. (4) Rivendell looking West. (a) 5. Rivendell looking East. (b) 6. Rivendell. (7) The Mountain-path. Tolkien’s black-and-white drawing on the left; Riddett’s colored version on the right. (8) The Misty Mountains looking West from the Byrnie to the Glen Gate. Tolkien’s black-and-white drawing on the left; Riddett’s colored version on the right. (9) Bilbo woke with the early sun in his eyes. Christopher Tolkien notes the model (in a painting) for the eagle. (10) Beorn’s Hall. Tolkien’s black-and-white drawing on the left; Riddett’s colored version on the right. (11) The Elvenking’s Gate (I). (12) The Elvenking’s Gate (II). Tolkien’s black-and-white drawing on the left; Riddett’s colored version on the right. (13) Bilbo comes to the Huts of the Raft-elves (I). Christopher Tolkien notes that this version correctly shows the hobbits arriving by night, unlike the more formal painting next, which appeared in the second impression of the First British edition of The Hobbit. (14) Bilbo comes to the Huts of the Raft-elves (II). (15) Lake Town. Tolkien’s black-and-white drawing on the left; Riddett’s colored version on the right. (16) The Front Gate. Tolkien’s black-and-white drawing on the left; Riddett’s colored version on the right. (17) Confrontation with Smaug. (18) Smaug flies around the Mountain. (19) Death of Smaug. (20) The Hall at Bag-End, Residence of B. Baggins, Esquire. Tolkien’s black-and-white drawing on the left; Riddett’s colored version on the right. This concludes the sequence from The Hobbit.

(u) 21. Old Man Willow. (v) 22. Doors of Durin and Moria Gate. “Moria Gate” is the colored drawing by Tolkien; “Doors of Durin” (on the left-hand page) is the black-and-white drawing which appears in The Fellowship of the Ring. (w) 23. Leaves from the Book of Mazarbul. Christopher Tolkien’s elaborated note, translating the fragmentary pages, is reprinted from The Lord of the Rings Calendar 1977. (x) 24. Moria Gate (The Steps to the East Gate). (y) 25. The Forest of Lothlórien in Spring. (z) 26. Helb’s Deep and the Hornburg. (a) 27. Orthanc and Minas Tirith. “Orthanc and Minas Tirith” (Christopher Tolkien mentions it is one of several different drawings by his father of the tower of Isengard); “Minas Tirith” is in color. (b) 28. Shelob’s Lair. One page of an early manuscript of The Two Towers. (cc) 29. Dunharrow. (dd) 30. Odin’s horse, Bifröst, and Asgard. (ee) 31. Barad-dûr and the Vale of Tunladen. Tolkien’s black-and-white drawing, on the right, has a red tongue of flame at the top of the mountain in the original, and as it was reproduced in The Lord of the Rings Calendar 1977; “Barad-dûr” is in color. This concludes the sequence related to The Lord of the Rings.


is a black-and-white reproduction (the original, given to a friend and now lost, is never have been in color); "Beleg finds Grímnoth in Taur-nu-Fuin" is in color. Christopher Tolkien's note explains the dual title of the latter, and the relationship of "Birdwood" to "Beleg finds Grímnoth in Taur-nu-Fuin". (11) 36; Glaumeg sets forth the title in square. This con- ceives the "The Silmarillion" (wm) 39. Polar Bear has fallen from top to bottom onto his nose. A painting from The Father Christmas Letters which was repro- duced in the J. R. R. Tolkien Calendar 1977 and so reappear- es in this book, which illustrates the Silmarillion of the 1920's since it was done in 1928. (wm) 40. Three dragons. One of the three seems to be an illustration based on Beowulf. (oo) 41. Trees. A black-and-white tree (with varied leaves) appears on the left; three colored trees (two with varie- ty of flowers) on the right. The three white combinations of leaves or of flowers are versions of "The Tree of Amal rampant.") (pp) 42. Flowering Tree with Frisies. The tree is another version of the Tree of Amaliant. Two frises and two separate flowers complete the page. (qu) 43. Patterns (I). Nine drawings, two of them clearly of plants, done on newspaper pages. (rr) 44. Patterns (II). Twelve drawings, two of them crossing around them; the one in the center is labeled pillariner. Christopher Tolkien's note mentions others (not reproduced) like the center plant of a grass- or reed-like nature bearing Elvish names. (tt) 45. Nāmāyorėan Text and Textiles. One tile; two textile patterns is a madder red and one in sombre rugs). Christopher Tolkien notes the appropriate reference in The Silmarillion. Probably the title of this plate should have a second accent mark, over the "u". (uu) 47. Heraldic De- signs. Sixteen devices with a chart for their identification, all related to the chart on to which they are grouped. One object to the Sil- marillion. Christopher Tolkien explains some aspects of some of them and mentions that variant forms of two of them, printed in the J. R. R. Tolkien Calendar 1974, are not reproduced here. (vv) 48. Elvish Script. Three pages of script, all printed on the right-hand pages. In a page, the names of objects in a decorated style. They are the beginnings of two of Tolkien's poems, "Errantry" and "The Adventures of Tom Bombadil".

Tolkien, J. R. R. The Silmarillion, ed. Christopher Tolkien. Boston Houghton Mifflin Company, 1977. 366 pp. + map attached to the inside of the back free endpaper. Index. The works of J. R. R. Tolkien are these: "Ainulindalë: The Music of the Ainur" (pp. 15-42), "Valaquenta: Account of the Valar and Maiar according to the "Edda" (pp. 25-32), "Quenta Silmarillion: The History of the Silmarils" (pp. 35-255), "Akallabêth: The Downfall of Nûnmon" (pp. 259-282), and "Of the Rings of Power and the Third Age, in which these tales come to their end" (pp. 289-304). The works of Christopher Tolkien are these: "Foreword" (pp. 7-9), "Of the Noldor and the Sindar" (map, pp. 100 and 121), "The House of Finwë and the Noldorin descent of Eldor and Elros", "The descendants of Olwë and Elwë", "The House of Eldor and the mortal descent of Eldor and Elros", "The House of Hador of Dor-Lómin" (genealogy charts, pp. 222-241), "Avalon (or Avalon) and Atalan's in his use of Avalon as the port city on Eressëa closest to the dwellings of men (p. 260), which is sometimes visible from Númenor (pp. 262-263), and in Númenor being called Atalantë in Eldarin speech (p. 281). A second conclusion to this history (or so it seems) is printed in smaller type, indented, after the first conclusion (pp. 281-282); presumably Christopher Tolkien, in his editorial work, could not decide between their merits.

The Akallabêth is also historical, beginning (or nearly so) with the raising of the island Andor, or Númenôre, from the sea for the Edain, or Dûnedain (p. 250). It may be seen as an ac- count of the beginning of the Númenórean line with the design of their journey westward to Eressëa (p. 261 ff.); more specifically, it tells of Sauron's causing of Ar-pharazon the Golden to try to capture Eressëa (p. 270 ff.) and its con- sequences. Tolkien clearly sees "his world" as that of the Lords of the Council of the Elders, or Avalon (or Avalon) and Atalan's in his use of Avalon as the port city on Eressëa closest to the dwellings of men (p. 260), which is sometimes visible from Númenor (pp. 262-263), and in Númenor being called Atalantë in Eldarin speech (p. 281). A second conclusion to this history (or so it seems) is printed in smaller type, indented, after the first conclusion (pp. 281-282); presumably Christopher Tolkien, in his editorial work, could not decide between their merits.

The final section by J. R. R. Tolkien, "Of the Rings of Power and the Third Age", actually spends about a third of its length summarizing the Second Age (pp. 285-294), and then traces the general history of the Third Age (pp. 294-304). There is a small amount of dialogue, but little of normal fictional shaping essentially Tolkien is offering the historical background to The Hobbit and The Lord of the Rings.


A valuable listing of the science-fictional and fantasy books (pp. 272-273) — valuable particularly for the foreign editions (no doubt incomplete), which not previous- ly had any listing. For example, listed for Out of the Silent Planet are translations into German, French, Spanish, Swedish, Japanese, and Dutch. A number of omisions and distortions in other matters follow.
(1964) is mentioned in the biographical headnote, but the fantasy and science-fiction verses are not noted (one of the latter first appeared in The Magazine of Fantasy and Science Fiction). Of Other Worlds is annotated, but primarily for its fiction; the comments on the essays do not indicate that all deal largely with fantasy-fiction or fantasy ("On Stories" is on the prose romance genre, which is usually fantasy-oriented). The Pilgrim's Regress is listed, but only one edition (not the first), is given; no annotation. The one sentence summaries of the Narnian books are sometimes distorted, but most bothersome are the emphases on Christianity in the summaries of the Random trilogy: That of Out of the Silent Planet ends with "a plea for Christianity"; Perelandra, with "admirable as Christian propaganda, but with a weak plot"; That Hideous Strength, with "More Christian propaganda"--the latter annotation with no indication of plot. The first book actually has almost no explicit Christianity, and (in this context) should be seen mainly as an anti-Wellsian work. Perelandra is legitimately seen as a Christian work (Lewis says, in "A Reply to Professor Haldane", that it was written for his "co-religionists")—but if it was written primarily for Christians, it can hardly be called propaganda. 

That Hideous Strength should have its fantasy element noted (the revival of Merlin) and the fact that it was, when published, set slightly in the future. Unlike the practice with some of the other authors, no secondary materials are mentioned; certainly Walter Hooper's primary biography (1966, in Joycelyn Gigin's Light on C. S. Lewis) should be mentioned. On 101 an essay by Lewis ("God in Space") is mentioned as appearing in an Arthur C. Clarke anthology, and on p. 58 two short stories ("The Shoddy Lands" and "Ministering Angels") in two of Anthony Soucner's anthologies based on The Magazine of Fantasy and Science Fiction. No doubt some other anthology appearances are recorded elsewhere in the volume.


An updating of Tyler's The Tolkien Companion (1976) to include material from The Silmarillion. According to the "Foreword to the Second Edition", Tyler has added over 1800 items to his annotated, alphabetical listing of Tolkien's names, as well as revising some items in light of The Silmarillion. Certainly the new book is 121 pages longer than the first edition. Tyler continues his practice in the Foreword that we are simply the translator of ancient manuscripts. The drawings at the ends of the alphabetical sections are reproduced from the original edition. As well as several examples of Tolkien's scripts, the following charts and maps appear:

- "The Battle of the Middle Furrow" (p. 62; 1976, p. 52).
- "High Kings of the Noldor" (p. 287; new).
- "The Elda and their Descendants" (pp. 336-337; cf. 1976, p. 265).
- "The Elda and their Descendants" (pp. 338-339; cf. 1976, p. 266).
- Gondar at three different times (p. 485; 1976, p. 391).
- "Spoken Tongues . . . during the Third Age" (p. 540; new).
- "The Two Trees: showing descent" (p. 595; new).

At least one chart in the 1976 edition, "The Quendi" (p. 382), is omitted. Such a complete failure in the first edition is called "unique" (of Lothlorien) is changed to "most singular" (p. 272). In the account of men in both editions, the Fall is omitted (cf. pp. 285 in 1976, 371 in 1979)—although Tolkien suggests it clearly enough. Although the descriptions of the first edition being replaced with information from The Silmarillion can be found in the listing for Turgon: "It seems unlikely that Turgon was the heir of Fëanor"; "King Turgon is unlikely to have deserted his city in its last need" (thus 1976, p. 487; cf. 1979, pp. 589-591).

An interesting comparison can be made between this volume and its major competitor, Robert Foster's The Complete Guide to Middle-earth (1976). Tyler is writing short essays on his topics while Foster presents his information briefly, with page references. But the difficulty in checking the dates in The Silmarillion is shown by their chronologies of the First Age (Tyler, under "First Age", pp. 217-222; Foster, Appendix A, pp. 557-564). Although their dates are usually fairly close, they agree on almost none of them.


Wain, at one point comparing the modern developments in theatrical drama with what preceded them, writes, "Twenty years ago it seemed that the salvation of the English drama might come from scholarly-minded men of letters like T. S. Eliot and Charles Williams. Now, suddenly, the actors have taken over." That is, the new playwrights—John Osborne, Harold Pinter, John Whiting, Alun Olden, and others—began their careers as actors.

Wain, John. "John Wain Reads Contemporary English Poetry" (cassette No. 23228) and "The Poetry of John Wain" (cassette no. 23229). In "The W-MBA Poetry Center Series on Modern Poets, Writers, and Critics", New York: Jeffrey Norton Publishers/Audio Division, 1969 and 1965 [thus the dates in the catalogue and on the cassette covers; actually both tapes were recorded at the same March 1965 session].

On the first tape ("Contemporary English Poetry"), Wain is briefly introduced by Harvey Bright. Wain reads and comments on five poems by Philip Larkin, an excerpt from Esra Pound, and a poem by A. E. Housman. Larkin's "Days", a short, verse poem, is read twice, as an example of pure poetry. Then Wain introduces his long Wild Track. On the second tape ("The Poetry of John Wain"), Wain reads several excerpts from Wild Track (without ever mentioning its name) and comments on the thematic significance of many of the materials. His selections also include some of the humorous passages. He concludes by reading a villanelle which came to him after he had finished Wild Track in Sweden (it includes the repeated line, "Time rules I should lay down the heavy lyre"); he had first thought to include it in the Wild Track volume as a coda, but later decided not to. (Both cassettes are recorded on one side only.)

Wain, John (interviewed). "Kaleidoscope" radio program, with Paul Vaughan, interviewer. B.B.C. Radio 4, 23 October 1978, 9:30-10:00 p.m.

An oral review of Humphrey Carpenter's The Inklings. (The program opened with Gregory de Polnay reading most of the first paragraph of Perelandra.) Wain found Carpenter's recreation of an Inklings' meeting painful, partly because the characters talked like their writings. He also disagreed with Carpenter's emphasis on Lewis's centrality in the Inklings—certainly he was important as the host and stimulator of the group; but Tolkien and Williams were beyond his range in ways, and Lewis usually lost his arguments at the meetings. He agreed with Carpenter on Tolkien's and Williams' influence on Lewis, and not vice versa, except for encouragement. He spoke of Hugo Dyson's veto power over Tolkien's reading of newly composed parts of The Lord of the Rings—with agreement, since
Main said he also was bored by Tolkien's work. He said that there was little Chestertonian Christianity (used as a negative term) to the group—Lewis, some, although balanced by his generosity and wit; but Tolkien was, instead, rather fey, and Williams did not give that oppressive effect. He concluded that Lewis, if looking at the situation—the sales—today, would feel that the Inklings had essentially won their battle. [Thanks to Charles Boad, Jessica Yates, and the Tolkien Society for their help on this item.]


The first part of this column, with a subtitle "Dream World", indicates that Stephen R. Donaldson admired Lewis' Narnian series, Frank Herbert's Dune series, and (most of all) Tolkien's Middle-earth, when he wrote The Chronicles of Thomas Covenant, the Unbeliever.


Walters, in a discussion of Christmas publishing, mentions the sale of boxed sets of related books. "In 1977, for example, Ballantine Books sold nearly 300,000 sets of J. R. R. Tolkien's Middle-earth Fable" (p. 107). He suggests that the Tolkien calendar was inspired by the success of the Sierra Club Wilderness Calendar (p. 107), both of which are still among the popular calendars (p. 108).


Shaw wrote The Intelligent Woman's Guide to Socialism and Capitalism; Watson's title is an echo of that. Her book is a study of Shaw's treatment of feminine characters in his plays and his comments about Women's Rights. Lewis gets in only for his odd statement in Surprised by Joy that "You may add that in the hive and the anthill we see fully realized the two things that some of us most dread for our own species—the dominance of the male and the dominance of the collective." Watson comments that since Lewis "is normally a precisionist", his reaction against "the vital genius of the female" (she is writing in the context of Shaw and Ernest Jones saying women have a "vitality" but "at least of men) may show that that vitality is "strong enough to threaten the enforced power of clever men". She is also using Lewis's statement as an example of the vagueness of most hostile comments.


The Westmarch Chronicle. 1:3 (June 1977), 1-5. Edited by Bernie Zuber.


The issue contains information about the formation of a second discussion group, with notices of forthcoming Tolkien material, including (a) "The Rankin/Bass-Xerox-Abrams Hobbit" (p. 2), which has some evaluation of the stills which had been released—"there is too much tendency towards the grotesque in a style that is imitative of Arthur Rackham"; (b) "The 1978 Tolkien Calendar from Ballantine" (p. 2), which has some brief comments on the different pictures—some positive, some negative.


Ian Ballantine is quoted on how he acquired the paperback rights to The Lord of the Rings (p. 33, col. 1); The Silmarillion is mentioned (col. 3).


Thirty paintings by Yates, an English artist, one to each double spread of pages, with a paragraph on each by Yates; they follow the general movement of The Lord of the Rings, beginning with "A meal with Tom Bombadil and Goldberry" (pp. 4-5) and ending with "Sam says farewell" to Frodo, leaving on the ship (p. 63). Thirteen of the paintings cover one leaf; the rest cover part of both facing leaves. There is no need to comment at length about the accuracy of the paintings, for they are generally accurate (and quite detailed). Yates in her commentary points out such artistic licenses as occur—for example, the bringing of larger distances into one view, in "Amon Hen" (pp. 22-23) and "The Forbidden Pool" (pp. 38-39), or the depiction of a scene which was actually in darkness, in "Gondolin" (pp. 42-43).

In general, Weyer is more successful with peaceful landscapes and elaborate architecture than with characters (who often look like cartoons) or action. For her better work, see "Rivendell" (p. 11), "The Hall of Edoras" (pp. 30-31), and "Sam says farewell" (p. 65); (at almost the same level are "The Fellowship ascends in too much tendency towards the grotesque in a style that is imitative of Arthur Rackham"; (b) "The 1978 Tolkien Calendar from Ballantine" (p. 2), which has some brief comments on the different pictures—some positive, some negative.

In general, Weyer is more successful with peaceful landscapes and elaborate architecture than with characters (who often look like cartoons) or action. For her better work, see "Krivendell" (p. 11), "The Hall of Edoras" (pp. 30-31), and "Sam says farewell" (p. 65); (at almost the same level are "The Fellowship ascends in too much tendency towards the grotesque in a style that is imitative of Arthur Rackham"; (b) "The 1978 Tolkien Calendar from Ballantine" (p. 2), which has some brief comments on the different pictures—some positive, some negative.

Yates, Jessica. "Tolkien in Oxford: The Tolkien Society Guide". Littlehampton, West Sussex: SONW Enterprises, for the Tolkien Society, 1978. One page, minographed on both sides. The examined copy was on blue paper. [Lewis, 1-2; Williams, 1.] A brief guide to points of interest for fans of Tolkien and Lewis in Oxford—homes, colleges, cemeteries (that of Williams is also mentioned), eating places, places of worship. Central Oxford is described first (in terms of a walking tour), then south Oxford, and finally north Oxford.