



Mythopoeic Society

mythLORE

A Journal of J.R.R. Tolkien, C.S. Lewis,
Charles Williams, and Mythopoeic Literature

Volume 4
Number 2

Article 7

12-15-1976

An Inklings Bibliography (3)

Joe R. Christopher

Follow this and additional works at: <https://dc.swosu.edu/mythlore>



Part of the [Children's and Young Adult Literature Commons](#)

Recommended Citation

Christopher, Joe R. (1976) "An Inklings Bibliography (3)," *Mythlore: A Journal of J.R.R. Tolkien, C.S. Lewis, Charles Williams, and Mythopoeic Literature*: Vol. 4: No. 2, Article 7.

Available at: <https://dc.swosu.edu/mythlore/vol4/iss2/7>

This Article is brought to you for free and open access by the Mythopoeic Society at SWOSU Digital Commons. It has been accepted for inclusion in Mythlore: A Journal of J.R.R. Tolkien, C.S. Lewis, Charles Williams, and Mythopoeic Literature by an authorized editor of SWOSU Digital Commons. An ADA compliant document is available upon request. For more information, please contact phillip.fitzsimmons@swosu.edu.

To join the Mythopoeic Society go to:
<http://www.mythsoc.org/join.htm>

SWOSUTM

Online Summer Seminar 2023

August 5-6, 2023: Fantasy Goes to Hell: Depictions of Hell in Modern Fantasy Texts

<https://mythsoc.org/oms/oms-2023.htm>



An Inklings Bibliography (3)

Abstract

A series of bibliographies of primary and secondary works concerning the Inklings.

AN INKLINGS BIBLIOGRAPHY

(3)

Compiled by Joe R. Christopher

"An Inklings Bibliography" is an annotated checklist appearing in each issue of *Mythlore* and covering both primary and secondary materials on J. R. R. Tolkien, C. S. Lewis, Charles Williams, and Owen Barfield. This listing contains articles from journals regularly appearing on the *Inklings* from April to June 1976, with a substantial selection of other materials. The question raised in the introduction of the previous installment about how many *Inklings* to cover has not had time to generate much response, but of the two members of the publishing process who saw it early and responded, neither wished John Wain's works to be listed here (one, on the basis that Wain said that he was out of sympathy with the goals of the *Inklings* while he was meeting with them); one wished Owen Barfield's works to be included, the other did not. (The reason for Barfield's name being listed above is not to decide the argument, but to indicate that a book of essays about him is part of this installment—see Sugarman's *Evolution of Consciousness*.) Perhaps the introduction to the next installment can end this discussion. In the meantime, authors and readers are encouraged to send off-prints or bibliographic references to the compiler,

Dr. J. R. Christopher
English Department
Tarleton State University
Stephenville, TX 76402 USA

(For this third installment, information or items were provided by Jim Allan, Clyde S. Kilby, Barbara Griffin, David Hulan, Kay Lindskoog, and Bernard Zuber.)

Allan, Jim. "The Hobbit Writing on the Wall." *Minas Tirith Evening-Star: Journal of the American Tolkien Society*, 5:3 (April 1976), 23-36. [A page of renditions of a specimen passage which is poorly reproduced here—p. 36—is reprinted in the next issue, 5:4 (July 1976), 36.]

A substantial discussion of the ways of writing English in tengwar. Three charts appear: (1) the tengwar as in the Houghton Mifflin ed., Appendix E.II, p. 396, but with their values added (p. 25); (2) the vowel signs and symbols (p. 29); (3) other symbols (p. 31). Allan covers the various modes invented by Tolkien, the details of the Westron mode, and the differences between writing phonetic and orthographic English. Several of his examples of Tolkien's use come from an unpublished letter in the Marquette University papers.

Arman, Jesse B. "Living Middle Earth in the Early Years." *Appendix I* [monthly bulletin of the American Tolkien Society], June 1976, pp. [2-4].
Reprinted from *Amon Din*, 2:1 (21 January 1973) and 2:2 (n.d. given in this reprint)—a fanzine. Arman tells of his early isolation as a Tolkien fan.

Basney, Lionel. "What about Fantasy?" (in "The Refiner's Fire" column). *Christianity Today: A Fortnightly Magazine of Evangelical Conviction*, 20:17 (21 May 1976), 18.
Basney, writing for the audience indicated by the magazine's subtitle, warns of two dangers in an emphasis on Tolkien, Lewis, and Chesterton: "First, we can forget that [fantasy]

is a coterie-taste. (This is not altered by the coterie's being large, as in this case it appears to be.) ...modern literary culture looks to Pound, Joyce, and Beckett as its masters, and not to Tolkien. If we wish to understand modern letters, it is with Pound, Joyce, and Beckett that we must start. ... Second, I'm afraid we can exaggerate the inherent value of fantasy as a companion to theology, or as an avenue into it. Lewis's fantasies are undeniably useful as Christian witness. Lewis intended this. Tolkien's 'joy beyond the walls of the world' is vaguer. ...thousands of devoted secularists like Frodo without theological results." Basney suggests that myth criticism is not necessarily Christian, and that Christianity is larger than fantasy can indicate.

Note: as a continuation of this column, Cheryl Forbes reviews C. N. Manlove's *Modern Fantasy: Five Studies* (Cambridge University Press, 1975), pp. 18-19. She finds Manlove wrong in most of his evaluations, and suggests that his modern viewpoint (given in his conclusion) has blinded him to what Tolkien, in particular, is doing.

Berman, Ruth. "Tolkien's Verse." *Mythprint: The Monthly Bulletin of The Mythopoeic Society*, 13:5 (May 1976), 2.
[The cover illustration, "Eärendil was a Mariner," by John Uhrmacher, accompanies this essay.]

A five-paragraph note on the verse in *The Hobbit* and *The Lord of the Rings*. "most of the poems in *The Hobbit* share a common set of images: the absence of the king, barrenness; mountains, stars, and journeying; the return of the king and fertility." "The two most ambitious poems of *TLotR*, Bilbo's song of Eärendil and Strider's translation of the lay of Beren and Tinúviel, are so rich in sound and so flaccid in meaning as to come near boring the reader." Examples are given to back up the view of these two poems; better lyrics are also cited.

For a reply, see the letter by Mike Bazinet, *Mythlore* 4:1/13 (September 1976), 29.

Brown, Carol Ann. "The Three Roads: A Comment on 'The Queen of Drum.'" *CSL: The Bulletin of the New York C. S. Lewis Society*, 7:6/79 (April 1976), 14.

Brown indicates that the structure of "The Queen of Drum" is based on the three roads on the Scottish ballad, "Thomas the Rhymer": the roads to Heaven, Hell, and Elfland. In "The Queen of Drum," the King and Chancellor, descending into the dungeon of the castle, are symbolically (at least) going down into Hell; the Archbishop is a martyr to his faith and achieves Heaven; the Queen flees to Elfland. "This is the substance of the poem, but the three ways are a reality in our lives. ...Elfland is a present danger. The popularity of transcendental meditation, the urge to increase Alpha Waves, and even the nightmare of LSD are examples of the uncontrolled hunger for what Aldous Huxley called 'the doors of perception.'"

Burke, Robert. "Beorn." *Amon Hen: The Bulletin of the [British] Tolkien Society*, No. 20 (June 1976), 7.
A note on Beorn's background and character.

Chapman, Ed. "Toward a Sacramental Ecology: Technology, Nature, and Transcendence in C. S. Lewis's Ransom Trilogy." *Mythlore*, 3:4/12 (June 1976), 10-17. (Illustrated by Bonnie GoodKnight, p. 10; by Taral Wayne MacDonald, pp. 13-15.)

A valuable article which offers an original approach to the Ransom Trilogy. Chapman begins with a brief summary of the critics' attitudes towards Lewis's comments on science (see particularly footnote 1, on p. 11, for the science-fiction critics). His treatment of *Out of the Silent Planet* (pp. 12-13) is in terms of its balanced ecosystem, its rational races living in peace with nature and each other. Weston and Devine, the misguided technocrat and the greedy, sum up the forces which have hurt the ecology of earth. In *Perelandra* (pp. 13-14) is depicted the pastoral world in which "man" and nature are not divided; the Un-man, torturing animals in his free moments, tempts the Green Lady to an alienation from the natural world. Weston, when his personality surfaces, can see no goodness in nature—"perhaps the logical extension of his ecological blindness." The Great Dance symbolizes the harmony between man and nature which will rule on Venus. (In an interesting footnote—no. 27, on p. 14—Chapman comments, "It may be a blemish on the novel that Lewis uses a physical fight between Ransom and the Un-man, instead of resolving the plot with an exorcism.") The discussion of *That Hideous Strength* (pp. 14-16) finds the novel the most complex of Lewis's ecological fictions: the dead-but-living head, for example, is a symbol of "sterile rationalism, divorced from the richnesses of organic being." The physical and psychological sterility of the leaders of N.I.C.E.—particularly Filostrato who praises the barren-moon-landscape—reflect the destructiveness of the organization, its desire to level woods and sanitize rural villages; Chapman discusses Mark Studdock's visit to Cure Hardy in this later connection. "Ecological sanity is embodied in St. Anne's," for gardening is "a metaphor for the proper treatment of nature." Merlin's background as a man from an era closer to nature ties him to the ecological theme, and the conclusion of the book—"The Descent of the Gods"—returns transcendence to nature briefly: "Nature and grace are not inseparably divided for Lewis as they seem to be for some Christian thinkers." Finally, Chapman gives a brief summary of Lewis's expository treatment of some of these themes in *The Abolition of Man* and cites five modern writers—two ecologists, two cultural historians, and an anthropologist, not theologians nor Christian apologists—who agree generally with Lewis's ecological position (pp. 16-17).

Chennell, Virginia Vernon. "Till We Have Faces, by C. S. Lewis" (in "A Novel [Poem, Story, Essay] to Teach," compiled by Susan Koch). *English Journal*, 65:1 (January 1976), 67-68.

"Mythology deserves a better name than it usually has in high school and junior high, where students seem to equate it with dull lists of Greek and Roman gods. One book I use on the 10th-12th grade level to revive interest in the glories and grandeurs of the classical tales is a little-known novel by C. S. Lewis, *Till We Have Faces*. ... Students see the original myth as just another fairy tale, but in Lewis' excellent portrayal of Queen Orual of Glome, they see themselves—and the relevance of mythology today. ...the book is considerably more difficult than the Narnia series. (Incidentally, it is better reading than Lewis's popular but rather static *Perelandra* and *Out of the Silent Planet*)."

Christopher, J. R. "Comment on Conservatism." *Egladil: Fantasy Magazine* [fanzine], No. 4 (Trinity Term, 1976), 13.

A limerick on C. S. Lewis's religious conservatism.

Christopher, J. R. "The Deep Space Trilogy of C. S. Lewis." *Egladil: Fantasy Magazine* [fanzine], No. 4 (Trinity Term, 1976), 13.

A heroic quatrain celebrating the content of the Ransom Trilogy.

Christopher, Joe R. "An Inkling Bibliography (1)." *Mythlore*, 3:4/12 (June 1976), 30-38.

Seventy-three annotated items, all but five from 1975.

Errata have been provided by three letter-writers. Marci Helms corrects the first names of two of the authors listed: they should be *Louis* Cook instead of *Lewis*, and *Paul* Lacy instead of *Phil*. She also notes that the source of *Phil*

Helms' story, "The Teeth of Scatha," is to be found in Appendix A.II of *The Lord of the Rings* (Houghton Mifflin ed., p. 345). Jessica Kemball-Cook notes that the "Oxonmoot 2: Report" assigned in brackets to Stuart and Rosie Clark (as the editors of that issue of *Amon Hen*) was written by herself instead. Nancy-Lou Patterson writes that, despite the attribution of an item to her in *Mythlore*, No. 10, she is not its author; see the correction in the second installment under Wardwell.

Christopher, J. R. "J. R. R. vs. The Faerie Queene." *Egladil: Fantasy Magazine* [fanzine], No. 4 (Trinity Term, 1976), 13.

A limerick—not, as the title would suggest, on Tolkien's dislike of allegory, but on the different connotations of elf and fairy.

Clark, Zoie. "Notes on 'The Seeing Eye.'" *The Chronicle of the Portland C. S. Lewis Society*, 5:2 (April-June 1976), 2.

A half-page series of notes on convenient grace, as an approach to Lewis's essay "The Seeing Eye" (in *Christian Reflections*).

Colson, Charles W. *Born Again*. Old Tappan, New Jersey: Chosen Books, 1976. [References to Lewis, pp. 112-14, 120-27, 172, 211, 221, 284.]

The first passage indicates the influence of the chapter on *Pride in Mere Christianity* on Colson's conversion; the second (pp. 120-27, 129) describes his reading the book through; the later references are primarily echoes of Lewis's statement that an individual soul is more important than a political state, as Colson re-evaluates Watergate.

Danner, Constance. "Memories of a January Term Abroad." *CSL: The Bulletin of the New York C. S. Lewis Society*, 7:7/79 (May 1976), 1-3.

An account of the author's experiences in Hamline University's "Mere C. S. Lewis" (a 28-day visit to England and Ireland): brief vignettes of Oxford (Magdalen College, Fr. Gervase Mathew, Walter Hooper, Headington Quarry); of Wroxton, Malvern (George Sayer), and Cambridge; of some safe parts of Ireland (near Dundalk "where we could at least see Narnia [Carlingford]"); and of London (Christopher Derrick, Professor Sharrock, Owen Barfield).

Forbes, Cheryl. "Frodo Decides—Or Does He?" *Christianity Today: A Fortnightly Magazine of Evangelical Conviction*, 20:5 (19 December 1975), 10-13.

A discussion of "one of the most compelling themes of [*The Lord of the Rings*], that of free will and Providence." Forbes offers a well-written survey of these matters, with a number of illustrations, but she adds little to what Paul H. Kocher's *Master of Middle-earth* has in Chapter III. She concludes, "In Tolkien's heavy use of vision, prophecy, call, order, and plan we find a full, rich interpretation of God's promise to those who are called according to his purpose. God's plans, just as those of the One, ultimately do not fail. ... Tolkien makes us feel the force of Providence, the love and concern of God active in human events." (Lewis is quoted at the beginning of the essay, from *Arthurian Torso*, on the expectation of wisdom in a great poem.)

Note: the review section of this same issue contains Forbes' review of Randell Helms' *Tolkien's World* (Houghton Mifflin, 1974) and *A Tolkien Compass*, ed. Jared Lobdell (Open Court, 1975) under the title "Guides to Middle Earth"; she finds much to praise in both volumes, and gives one cross reference to her own essay.

Forbes, Cheryl. "Narnia: Fantasy, But..." *Christianity Today: A Fortnightly Magazine of Evangelical Conviction*, 20:15 (23 April 1976), 6-10. (Four illustrations by Pauline Baynes reprinted with the article, with an additional one on p. 13.)

A good introduction to the Narnian Chronicles for a general, Christian audience. Most of what is said is not new (nor is it intended to be), a brief summary of the series is included, and Walter Hooper and Katherine Raine are cited. The most valuable part is probably a discussion of the type of thing which Lewis teaches, such as "the peace which passes understanding." and the way in which he presents it (pp. 9-10).

Gardiner, Margaret. "Auden: A Memoir." *The New Review*, 3: 28 (July 1976), 9-19 [reference to Tolkien, p. 17].

"Once, when Martin [Gardiner's son] was in a phase of

enthusiasm about *The Lord of the Rings* and I told Wystan, he said: 'Good. I don't think anything of the literary judgment of people who don't care for Tolkien.' I shrivelled, cast out. However, a year or so later Wystan had changed his mind and when Tolkien was mentioned, dismissed him as of no great account."

Givón, T. "Some Notes on Entish Dialect Phonology." *Time* [published by The Society for Elvish Studies], No. 3 (1 February 1976), loose sheet [p. 3?].

A differentiation between northern and southern Entish for "one," "two," and "three."

Hardie, Colin. "Two Descents into the Underworld." In *Evolution of Consciousness: Studies in Polarity*, ed. Shirley Sugerman, pp. 136-48 [reference to Barfield, p. 136; to Hardie, p. 147n]. Middletown, Connecticut: Wesleyan University Press, 1976. xvi + 240 pp.

This essay by an Inklings discusses the "Nekyia" in the *Odyssey* (Book 10) and the visit to Hades in the *Aeneid* (Book 6). In the first case, Hardie elaborately compares the poem to the pre-poem myth of Odysseus in order to establish what materials the poet is reshaping into the epic; in the second case, he finds few actual sources and decides the material is literary.

Harwood, Cecil. "Owen Barfield." In *Evolution of Consciousness: Studies in Polarity*, ed. Shirley Sugerman, pp. 31-33 [Reference to Lewis, p. 32]. Middletown, Connecticut: Wesleyan University Press, 1976. xvi + 240 pp.

A personality sketch of Barfield by an early friend (a man mentioned by Lewis in *Surprised by Joy*). Harwood briefly sketches Barfield's career at Highgate School, at Oxford, and as part of a Song and Dance Company; in the latter, Barfield met his wife and the teachings of Rudolph Steiner.

Harwood, A. C. "A Toast to the Memory of C. S. Lewis: Proposed at Magdalen College, July 4th, 1975." *Mythlore*, 3:4/12 (June 1976), 3-5. [Illustrated by two photographs taken by Bonnie GoodKnight.]

Reprinted from *CSL: The Bulletin of the New York C. S. Lewis Society*, 6:11/71 (September 1975), 1-3, where it was accompanied by an early photograph of Owen Barfield, C. S. Lewis, and Cecil and Daphne Harwood. (GoodKnight's photographs with this reprint are of the occasion upon which the toast was given; A. C. [Cecil] Harwood appears in both.)

Helms, Marci. "The Grey Lady of Lorien." *Minas Tirith Evening-Star: Journal of the American Tolkien Society*, 5:3 (April 1976), 2-8. [Illustrated by Phil Helms, p. 3.]

An unrhymed poem with usually tetrameter lines and irregular rhythm; 258 lines; The story of the capture of Celebrián by orcs, her rescue by Elladan and Elrohir, and her passing over the sea; The treatment of Celebrián by the orcs is handled in a genteel manner; A typical passage (after the rescue) shows the inversions, a poor syllepsis, and general descriptions ("grave wounds")—the latter characteristic much like Tolkien's style:

Arrived at settlements they have now,
And horses borrowed here they mount,
As the burdened people of the houses,
Mourn and wring their hands and skirts,
At the thought of Lady Celebrián's grave wounds
And the many who lay dead in Redhorn pass.

(The commas are as in the original.)

Helms, Philip W. "The Lossoth." *Minas Tirith Evening-Star: Journal of the American Tolkien Society*, 5:3 (April 1976), 10-15. [Illustrated by the author, pp. 11, 13, 14, 15.]

A first-person narration by a yeoman (a hobbit) of Arnanth's flight to the north to escape the Witch-king (Houghton Mifflin ed., Appendix A [iii], pp. 321-22). For amateur fiction, some of the passages are striking:

The nights were times of beauty and terror. The sky was black, flat and dully absorbing all light. ... At times, sheets of multi-colored morgul flame twisted and warped across the sky, veiling the blackness in visions more terrible. At such time[s] we saw reflections, images of things far away, upside down in the sky...the towers and ships of the Havens, the ruins of Fornost...many of us wept, salt-tears freezing on our faces.

Hodgens, Richard. "Notes on Narrative Poems." *CSL: The*

Bulletin of the New York C. S. Lewis Society, 7:6/78 (April 1976), 1-14 [references to Williams, pp. 4, 13-14nn.].

In his untitled first section (pp. 1-4), Hodgens collects a number of Lewis's comments about narrative poetry, from a summary of a 1920 paper presented to the Martlet Society (reprinted in Walter Hooper's introduction to *Selected Literary Essays*) to statements in several of Lewis's books. Hodgens doubts that they provide an adequate defense of narrative poetry; nor does he find a satisfactory explanation of why, about 1930, Lewis abandoned the writing of narrative poems—although the change in critical taste, which exalted T. S. Eliot and depreciated John Masefield, may have had some part in his reaction.

The second section is titled "Dymer: Lewis's Pagan Epic" (pp. 4-8). Hodgens, after a summary of the action, indicates how many of Lewis's lost works of the time (through 1918 or 1919) involved conflicts between generations. "The finished Dymer...certainly does carry on the theme: it appears in the killing of the teacher, an act which destroys the whole, 'parental' state; in the 'matriarchal' hag's near-killing of Dymer; and in the magician's attempt. (Of course a magician is almost always a father-figure, and this one calls Dymer 'My little son...') At last, Dymer is killed by his own son." Hodgens ties this, autobiographically, to Lewis's own rebelliousness of the time. He concludes with praise of the poem's technique, whatever, very specifically, it means.

The final section is titled "'The Queen of Drum': Lewis's Faerie Queene" (pp. 8-13). Hodgens gives the history of Lewis's writing this poem; a summary of the content; a suggestion that *Drum* may derive from Dundrum, near Dublin, Ireland, where Lewis had relatives; and the faery background from the chapter on "The Longaevi" in *The Discarded Image*. He faults the conclusion and the treatment of the King and the Chancellor in the poem, after quoting Masefield's suggestions for improving the poem. Then, after raising some questions about the mixed verse-forms employed in "The Queen of Drum," Hodgens analyzes the appropriateness of the verse in a number of passages.

Overall, a good essay on Lewis's narrative poems. Also see Carol Ann Brown's "The Three Roads," which appeared in the same issue of *CSL*; a summary of the discussion at which this paper was read, which is not listed in this bibliography, appears on p. 15 of the issue of *CSL* in which these essays are published.

Hooper, Walter. "Reminiscences: Presented to Mythcon VI, Scripps College, August 16th, 1975." *Mythlore*, 3:4/12 (June 1976), 5-9. [Illustrated with a photograph of Fr. Hooper taken by Bonnie GoodKnight, p. 7.]

Hooper's reminiscences of Lewis appear on pp. 6-9; of Tolkien, p. 9. There are brief references to other Inklings: Barfield, p. 5; Coghill, p. 6; Havard, p. 7; and MacCallum, p. 6. Typically, Hooper does not give the dates of his period with Lewis; but the anecdotes are well done—the first meeting (p. 6), the joke about "As C. S. Lewis has said—" (p. 6), some details about the Kilns (pp. 6-7), Paxford the gardener (p. 7), Lewis's three weeks in a nursing home (p. 8), a male nurse in the Kilns (p. 8), a visit with Tolkien soon after Lewis's death (p. 9), Tolkien in a hospital (p. 9).

Horrocks, Elizabeth. "Eowyn." *Amon Hen: The Bulletin of the [British] Tolkien Society*, No. 20 (June 1976), 4-6. A character sketch, primarily retelling Eowyn's story. In her concluding analysis, Horrocks suggests (1) the story is anti-Women's Lib, for Eowyn at last rejects her masculine role to accept a traditionally feminine one, and (2) it presents the least black-and-white characterization in Tolkien's work, in that Eowyn does a great deed but at least begins her ride with the wrong motive—i.e., seeking death. Horrocks modifies this right deed/wrong motive by noting that Eowyn's following after, and protecting of, Théoden is an act of love, not a death wish *per se*.

Hulan, Dave. "I remember Mythopoeia [Part 3]," *Defrosted Architecture* [fanzine; actually *The High Aesthetic Line*, No. 12], n.d. [Summer 1976], pp. [12-17].

Of interest as an account of the cultural influence of the Inklings—more specifically, one person's view of the early years of the Mythopoeic Society. Of most interest in this installment is an account of the failure in production of a musical drama based on a cross between *The Voyage of the Dawn Treader* and *The Thief of Baghdad* (the lyrics by Paula

Marmor and music by Dale Ziegler were finally performed as a song cycle at Mythcon IV). (See also the letters commenting on earlier installments on pp. [19, 21-22].)

Johnston, George Burke. "The Poetry of J. R. R. Tolkien." *Appendix I* [monthly bulletin of the American Tolkien Society], June 1976; pagination from *The Tolkien Papers* (see below).

A reprint from *The Tolkien Papers*, ed. J. T. Hansen et. al. (Mankato, Minnesota: Mankato State College Studies, 2:1 [February 1976], 63-74; also listed as *Mankato Studies in English*, No. 2); listed in Richard C. West's *Tolkien Criticism: An Annotated Checklist* as B89.

Kilby, Clyde S. *Tolkien and "The Silmarillion"*. Wheaton, Illinois: Harold Shaw Publishers, 1976. 90 pp. Index. [References to Barfield, pp. 15, 69; to Cecil, p. 17; to Coghill, pp. 71, 79; to Fox, p. 69; to Hardie, p. 57; to Havard, pp. 9, 69; to C. S. Lewis, pp. 11, 12, 15, 17, 20, 24, 27, 32, 33, 48, 53-56, 67-77; to W. H. Lewis, pp. 33, 69, 72; to Christopher Tolkien, p. 6; to Williams, pp. 15, 67-74, 77.]

Chapter I, "First Meeting," is reprinted (with changes) from *Kodan*, 28:1 (November 1973), where it appeared as "Of Myth and Men: C. S. Kilby talks with J. R. R. Tolkien"; Chapter V, "Tolkien, Lewis and Williams," (with changes) from *Mythcon I Proceedings*, ed. Glen GoodKnight (Los Angeles: The Mythopoeic Society, 1971), pp. 3-4; and Chapter VI, "Postscript," (with slight changes) from *The Mythopoeic Society Special Bulletin*, n.d. (but circa 16 September 1973), p. 2, where it appeared as "From C. S. Kilby."

Probably the first two chapters, telling of Kilby's first meeting with Tolkien and subsequent summer spent trying to encourage him to finish *The Silmarillion* will be of most interest (and perhaps of most lasting interest) in this small book. These are character sketches in which much of Tolkien's personality comes through, including what Kilby calls his "contrasistency"—which indicates that Tolkien changed his mind on a number of things, and changed it so firmly he denied past positions. These chapters are filled with anecdotes, but they also have a biographical interpretation of "Leaf by Niggle" (pp. 34-35) and a longer, similar study of *Smith of Wootton Major* (pp. 36-39), in which Old Noakes is taken to stand for George MacDonald.

The third and fourth chapters are "Chronology of Composition and Geography of Middle-Earth" and "Tolkien as a Christian Writer." The first part of the third chapter establishes a twelve-step chronology of Tolkien's writing about Middle-earth (pp. 49-50); as Kilby observes, this probably shall be superceded by fuller studies in the future. The discussion of the geography of Middle-earth identifies it with Europe (and the Shire with England), which Kilby takes as necessarily implying an allegorical framework. The fourth chapter, primarily limited to material about the First Age in references in print by Tolkien, discusses the analogues between it and the Bible. (Some of these are limited to certain aspects, such as the longevity of Galadriel and Christ [p. 61] which does not consider her role as a rebel in the First Age.) Just as in the second chapter Kilby briefly described an unpublished work titled "The Bovadium Fragments" (p. 36), so here he mentions a "Job-like conversation on soul and body" (pp. 61-62) and indicates that Tolkien intended to end his Middle-earth history with a new Middle-earth, analogous to the new Heavens and new Earth in *Revelations* (pp. 64-65).

The fifth chapter, "Tolkien, Lewis and Williams," is not greatly changed from its first publication, but there is added some information about the Tolkien-Williams friendship, including a brief quotation from a poem which Tolkien wrote to Williams (p. 71), now among the Williams' papers in the Wade Collection. (The only other reference to unpublished Tolkien mss., not counting letters, are to "Mr. Bliss" [p. 15] and two sexual stories [p. 83, n. 6]—although the latter may be Tolkien's joke.)

Reviews: (1) Ian M. Slater, in the "Reviews" column, *Fantasiae: The Monthly Newsletter of The Fantasy Association*, 4:6/39 (June 1976), 6. "Kilby...makes available a very limited amount of additional information on the contents of *The Silmarillion*"; "I was much more favorably impressed by Kilby's prose style in this volume than in some of his other writing." (2) Terri Williams, *The Chronicle of the Portland C. S. Lewis Society*, 5:2 (April-June 1976) 7-8. "The Tolkien personality emerges a cohesive whole with the necessary sol-

idity and maturity for the author of a masterpiece such as *The Lord of the Rings* and yet with the broad streak of maverick intrinsic to the creation in such depth and variation of that awesome world, Middle Earth." (3) Nancy-Lou Patterson, "Tolkien & the Silmarillion," *Mythlore*, 4:1/13 (September 1976), 21.

Kirkpatrick, Hope. "An Approach to *The Personal Heresy*." *CSL: The Bulletin of the New York C. S. Lewis Society*, 7:8/80 (June 1976), 1-8. [Illustrated by a drawing of the Greek statue, "The Charioteer," by Mary Kirkpatrick.] Kirkpatrick gives the publishing history of the essays by Lewis and E. M. W. Tillyard collected in *The Personal Heresy* (1939), and then offers a fairly full summary of the first two essays and shorter, more selective summaries of the remaining essays (pp. 2-7). She suggests the difference between Tillyard and Lewis by discussing two of the exact points they argued (a poem by Herrick, a passage from Keats—the mention of "The Charioteer" is earlier, in the summaries); on the authority of Lafcadio Hearn, she suggests the goal of art is not the personal truth of the artist but the universal truth of human nature; she disagrees with Tillyard on the personal nature of style in poetry; she disagrees with both writers on T. S. Eliot; and she mentions unpublished correspondence (in England) which indicates that Tillyard believed Lewis had won the debate (pp. 7-8).

Lindskoog, Kathryn. "C. S. Lewis: Reactions from Women." *Mythlore*, 3:4/12 (June 1976), 18-20 [references to Barfield, p. 18; to Tolkien and Williams, p. 20]. [Illustrated by Bonnie GoodKnight, p. 18.]

Brief accounts of a number of women who knew Lewis: his mother, Florence Augusta Hamilton Lewis (p. 18); his cousin, Hope—Charlotte Hope Ewart Harding (p. 18); his "adopted" mother, Janie King Askins Moore (pp. 18-19); his wife, Helen Joy Davidman Gresham (pp. 19-20); Caroline Rakestraw, who supervised the recording of "The Four Loves" (p. 20); the poet, Kathleen Raine (p. 20); and an editor of Puffin Books, Kay Webb (p. 20).

Lindskoog, Kathryn. *Up from Eden*. Elgin, Illinois: David C. Cook Publishing Company, 1976. 140 pp. [References to Lewis, pp. 16, 25-26, 45, 70, 73, 105, 111-14; to Williams, p. 137.]

A study of Christian roles for women, with an especially acute chapter (No. 4, "Woman's Objection to Subjection") on the New Testament commands; the content is highly anecdotal. The first five references to Lewis are citations from his works, including "The Weight of Glory" and *The Four Loves* (Lewis as an authority); the last two are primarily biographical references (Lewis as an example). The one citation from Williams (as an authority) is actually a paraphrase by Lewis of Williams. The one reference to Lewis which modifies his position is of theological interest: "[Lewis writes,] 'Next to the Blessed Sacrament itself, your neighbor is the holiest object presented to your senses.' I assume that for a Protestant, the neighbor is even more holy than the Sacrament" (p. 45).

Miller, David M. "The Moral Universe of J. R. R. Tolkien." *Appendix H* [monthly bulletin of the American Tolkien Society], May 1976; pagination from *The Tolkien Papers* (see below).

A reprint from *The Tolkien Papers*, ed. J. T. Hansen, et. al. (Mankato, Minnesota: Mankato State College Studies, 2:1 [February 1967], 51-62; also listed as *Mankato Studies in English*, No. 2); listed in Richard C. West's *Tolkien Criticism: An Annotated Checklist* as B116.

Neuleib, Janice Witherspoon. "The Empty Face of Evil" (in "The Refiner's Fire" column). *Christianity Today: A Fortnightly Magazine of Evangelical Conviction*, 19:13 (28 March 1975), 14-16.

A good, compact survey of several themes in *Till We Have Faces*. The most original part of the essay is the conclusion, the last three paragraphs, which focus on the moral evil which Orual has found within herself: "...Lewis's final statement on evil [is that, essentially, it is the wrong kind of love. ... Evil is the face of blank, malicious selfishness. It turns in upon itself, again and again unable to look out to others. ... [The evil man] is evil not because he wills to be an evil man but because he can do nothing else but will his own narrow desires."

Noad, Charles, with Jessica Kembell-Cook. "A[nnu]al G[eneral] M[eeting] and Dinner: 21 Feb[ruary] 1976."

Amon Hen: *The Bulletin of the [British] Tolkien Society*, No. 19 (May 1976), 2-5.

A report of particular interest for an anecdote about Tolkien recounted by his daughter (p. 3) and a report by Humphrey Carpenter on his writing the official biography of Tolkien (pp. 4-5).

Owens, Virginia Stem. "How Do We Make Belief?" *Christianity Today: A Fortnightly Magazine of Evangelical Conviction*, 20:15 (23 April 1976), 14-19.

In a discussion (often satiric) of the emphasis *story* and *myth* have received from Christian writers recently, Owens mentions Tolkien briefly in her opening comments about her not wanting stories to end (p. 15), but she uses Lewis more fully as one of her three examples of writers who do know how story-making affects belief: specifically, Lewis's concept of Heaven as being more real than the Ghosts who visit it, in *The Great Divorce*, and his use of human myth as being factual but beyond what humans had seen in it, in *Perelandra* (pp. 17-18).

Roberts, Frank C. (ed.). *Obituaries from "The Times", 1961-1970*. Reading, Berkshire: Newspaper Archive Developments Ltd., 1975.

Reprints the obituary of C. S. Lewis from *The [London] Times* on pp. 477-478.

Rockow, Karen. "The Hnakra Was a Snark" (in "The Unicorn" column). *Unicorn: A Miscellaneous Journal*, 3:3/12 (Summer [July] 1976), 64.

Reprinted from *Orcrist: Special C. S. Lewis Issue*, No. 6 (Winter, 1971-72), 23-24, where it appeared under the title "The Hunting of the Hnakra."

Sugerman, Shirley. "A Conversation with Owen Barfield." In *Evolution of Consciousness: Studies in Polarity*, ed. Shirley Sugerman, pp. 3-28. Middletown, Connecticut: Wesleyan University Press, 1976. xvi + 240 pp. [References to Cecil, p. 10; Coghill, p. 10; Dyson, p. 10; Hayward, p. 10, C. S. Lewis, pp. 9-10, 22-23; W. H. Lewis, p. 10; Christopher Tolkien, p. 10; J. R. R. Tolkien, p. 10; Williams, pp. 9-10.]

An interview at Barfield's home, April 1974. The topics may be briefly suggested: Englishness (pp. 3-4); Barfield's early life, its religious vacuum (pp. 4-5); his early twenties, an interest in lyric poetry (pp. 6-7); Wadham College, Barfield's career in law beginning in his thirties (pp. 7-8); the Inklings (pp. 9-10); philology = religion (p. 10); the influence of Rudolph Steiner (pp. 11-13, 16-17); the "residue of unresolved positivism" defined (p. 13) and discussed in terms of Jung, Whitehead, Darwin, and Ronald Laing (pp. 13-16); Coleridge and Steiner compared (p. 17); polarity and idealism, polarity and the evolution of consciousness (p. 18); tension and fusion in polarity (pp. 19-20); the Trinity as polarity (p. 20); polarity in Barfield's life (pp. 21-22); the true meaning of *occult* (pp. 23-24); current cultural changes as part of the evolution of consciousness (pp. 24-25); the role of the imagination (pp. 25-26); the role of will (pp. 26-27); a description of the state of final participation (pp. 27-28).

Of special interest to this bibliography are Barfield's comments about C. S. Lewis and the Inklings: "Lewis and I became friends when we were both undergraduates, but we didn't develop a really close association until after our time as undergraduates had finished. We were both very keen after writing good poetry, if we could. That was our main connection. But we soon came to talk...about philosophical matters as well, which in any case are closely connected with what is good poetry and what is not" (p. 9). "Certainly during most of the time during which the Inklings were meeting, I was only really on the fringe of them because I could very rarely attend" (p. 10). (Barfield seems to be incorrect on p. 10 when he says that Williams had returned to London before he died.) The most interesting passage is on pp. 22-23 where Barfield speaks of the polarity between Lewis and himself, and distinguishes between the early Lewis—the subjective idealist—who tried to lose himself in the Absolute, and the Christian Lewis, who emphasized the dichotomy between men and their Creator.

Sugerman, Shirley (ed.). *Evolution of Consciousness: Studies in Polarity*. Middletown, Connecticut: Wesleyan University Press, 1976. xvi + 240 pp.

This volume is a *Festschrift* in honor of Owen Barfield (at least the sixth volume which has been presented to an Ink-

ling or, in two cases, his memory). Most of the essays have not been separately annotated; two which are biographical, and one which is by an Inklings have been. The "Editor's Note" (pp. ix-x) indicates the plans for this volume began in honor of Barfield's seventy-fifth birthday (in November 1973). The "Foreword" (pp. xi-xvi) is an editorial survey of the contents of the volume. The first section, titled "Owen Barfield," consists of one item, Sugerman's "A Conversation with Owen Barfield," which is annotated separately.

The second section, "To Owen Barfield," consists of three items, of which the first, Cecil Harwood's "Owen Barfield," is annotated separately. Norman O. Brown's "On Interpretation" (pp. 34-41 [dedication to Barfield, p. 34]) is a prose-poem reproduced in Brown's manuscript. Howard Nemerov's "Exceptions & Rules" (pp. 42-47 [dedication to Barfield, p. 42]) studies three meanings of "the exception proves the rule."

The third section, "Studies in Polarity," consists of thirteen essays. Colin Hardie's "Two Descents into the Underworld," which has little to do with Barfield, is separately annotated because its author was an Inklings. All the following essays at least refer to Barfield or another of the Inklings, and several study Barfield's works; they are here arranged alphabetically by author. (1) Lionel Adey, "Enjoyment, Contemplation, and Hierarchy in *Hamlet*" (pp. 149-167 [references to Barfield, pp. 149, 151, 161, 166n; to Lewis, pp. 150-151, 163, 167n]). An approach to the play with the use of the terms *enjoy* and *contemplate* from Samuel Alexander's *Space, Time and Deity*. The most interesting passage from the view of a student of the Inklings is a three-paragraph quotation from an unpublished work by Lewis, "Clivi Hamiltonis Summae Metaphysices Contra Anthroposophos" (p. 151). Four works by Lewis, two by Barfield, are cited in the discussion. (2) R. H. Barfield, "Darwinism" (pp. 69-82 [reference to Owen Barfield, p. 82]). An argument against Darwinian belief; R. H. Barfield is Owen Barfield's brother. (3) David Bohm, "Imagination, Fancy, Insight, and Reason in the Process of Thought" (pp. 51-68 [references to Barfield, pp. 51-52, 68n]). An application of Coleridgean terms to the gaining of scientific knowledge; next, a contrast of intelligence and thought. (4) Richard A. Hocks, "'Novelty' in Polarity to 'The Most Admitted Truths': Tradition and the Individual Talent in S. T. Coleridge and T. S. Eliot" (pp. 83-97 [references to Barfield, pp. 84-87, 91, 97n]). A study of the polarity implicit in Eliot's *Four Quartets*, deriving from his use of Heraclitus.

(5) Clyde S. Kilby, "The Ugly and the Evil" (pp. 202-210 [references to Tolkien, pp. 202, 210n]). A discussion of aesthetics, linked with morality. (6) R. K. Meiners, "On Modern Poetry, Poetic Consciousness, and the Madness of Poets" (pp. 106-120 [references to Barfield, pp. 106, 109n, 113, 113n, 114n, 116, 117n, 119-120]). A consideration of the consciousness in the works of Theodore Roethke, John Berryman, Robert Lowell, Randall Jarrell, and Delmore Schwartz; the fourth section tentatively recommends an investigation of Rudolf Steiner's ideas as a way of escaping "the sense of alienated and isolated consciousness." (7) Paul Piehler, "Milton's Iconoclasm" (pp. 121-135 [references to Barfield, pp. 120-121, 135; to Lewis, pp. 129, 133, 135n.]). Piehler shows that *Comus* and *Paradise Lost* have an increasing internalization of the powers earlier invoked in visionary allegories; he treats it as a step in the evolution of consciousness, in Barfield's sense. (8) Robert O. Preyer, "The Burden of Culture and the Dialectic of Literature" (pp. 98-105 [reference to Barfield, p. 104]). "This paper attempts to [depict] the dialectic of literature as it swings from mediated experience [in Tennyson] to direct confrontation of the actual [in Hardy] and then back again."

(9) R. J. Reilly, "A Note on Barfield, Romanticism, and Time" (pp. 183-90; to Lewis, p. 183, to Williams, pp. 183, 186-87]). An explanation of what Barfield means by saying that Romanticism never came to maturity in the nineteenth century (outside of Coleridge): it thought of time as an illusion. Shelley, Emerson, and Whitman are Eastern in their assumptions; Barfield, on the other hand, takes history seriously: he accepts an evolution of consciousness in a historic framework. For both Coleridge and Barfield, this acceptance of history grows out of Christian belief. (10) Mary Caroline Richards, "The Vessel and the Fire" (pp. 211-224 [dedication to Barfield, p. 211; references to Barfield, pp. 211, 219]). A more personal and more highly rhetorical essay than the others in this section; it concerns a coming to terms with one's inner drives. (11) Shirley Sugerman,

"An 'Essay' on Coleridge on Imagination" (pp. 191-201 [references to Barfield, pp. 191, 196, 201]). An elaboration on Coleridge's distinction between Imagination and Fancy. (12) G. B. Tennyson, "Etymology and Meaning" (pp. 168-182 [references to Barfield, pp. 175-81; to Lewis, pp. 179, 182n]). Tennyson starts with a history of the study of etymology and semantics, reaching Barfield's study of the changes in—the evolution of—human consciousness as reflected in language. The latter part of the essay is a summary of Barfield's position.

The final section of the book, titled "The Works of Owen Barfield," consists of one item, a Barfieldian bibliography compiled by G. B. Tennyson; it has been annotated separately.

Tennyson, G. B. (compiler). "A Bibliography of the Works of Owen Barfield," In *Evolution of Consciousness: Studies in Polarity*, ed. Shirley Sugarman, pp. 227-39. Middletown, Connecticut: Wesleyan University Press, 1976. xvi + 240 pp.

Sixty-seven items, arranged by year of publication, 1917-1974. This includes thirteen original books and pamphlets, nineteen poems, one short story, twenty-seven book reviews (one of Charles Williams' *Descent into Hell*), seven letters to editors (two to *G. K.'s Weekly*), and seven translations from the German. Two items are in collaboration with C. S. Lewis; four are on him.

Tolkien, J. R. R. "Riddles in the Dark." First part: *Children's Digest*, 24:235 (February 1974), 5-17. First part reprinted: *Children's Digest*, 24:235, No. 2 (Winter-Spring 1974), 5-17 [the issue is identical with the February issue]. Second part: *Children's Digest*, 24:236 (March 1974), 5-13. Illustrated by Lester Abrams.

A reprint of the revised version of Chapter V of *The Hobbit*. The main interest of this reprint lies in the illustrations by Lester Abrams—the cover on the February issue, with twelve interior drawings; seven interior drawings in the March issues (one repeated from the February issue). The drawings somewhat resemble the type which Ed Cartier did for *Unknown*, but with thinner line and crosshatching in the background instead of grease-pencil shading.

Tolkien, J. R. R. *The Father Christmas Letters*, ed. Baillie Tolkien. Boston: Houghton Mifflin Company, 1976. (Published in England by George Allen & Unwin Ltd.) 48 pp. [unnumbered].

A series of letters which Tolkien, in the persona of Father Christmas, wrote to his children over a period of approximately 20 years. The references to the children by name: 1920, addressed to John; 1925, mention of John, Michael and Christopher; 1932, mention of Michael's birthday; 1933, mention of Christopher's birthday (besides the page listing below, note the reproduction on p. [5]); 1937, envelope addressed to Christopher and Priscilla (reproduced, p. [40]). Contents: "Introduction" by Baillie Tolkien, pp. [5-7]; a reproduction of the 1920 letter to John p. [6]; the 1925 letter, pp. [8-9]; the 1926 letter, pp. [10-11]; the 1927 letter, pp. [12-13]; the 1928 letter, pp. [14-15]; the 1929 letter, pp. [16-17]; the 1930 letter, pp. [18-19]; the 1931 letter, pp. [20-23]; the 1932 letter, pp. [24-28]; the 1933 letter, pp. [29-31]; the 1934 letter, pp. [32-33]; the 1935 letter, pp. [34-35]; the 1936 letter, pp. [36-37]; the 1937 letter, including a note from Ilbereth, pp. [38-40]; the 1938 verses, from Father Christmas, Ilbereth, and (briefly) Karhu the North Polar Bear, pp. [41-43]; "Last Letter," pp. [44-45]; "Appendix," with a note from the editor, an alphabet invented by Karhu from Goblin marks, and a letter in it, pp. [46-47].

What the above listing does not indicate is that each letter typically consists of a note and a page drawing; many of the headings, stamps drawn for the envelopes, etc., are also reproduced. All items are reproduced in color, except the envelope on p. [12], if it was in color, and the materials in the appendix which presumably were just black and white. Bibliographically, the book is frustrating in several ways: (1) the letters of 1921-1924 are not described or published; judging from the reproduction of the 1920 letter, one may guess that they would be brief and not too interesting; (2) the "Last Letter" was presumably written in 1939, but that is not made certain; (3) the appendix casually informs the reader that Karhu the North Polar Bear occasionally wrote the children; these letters, except for a few inserts and that letter contained in the appendix, are not given.

The content of these letters need not be given here, since this primary work will be widely read. Perhaps it should be noted that Ilbereth writes one line in Elvish script, p. [40], which ties this book in a casual way to the mythology and writing developed for *The Hobbit* and *The Lord of the Rings*. Besides several linguistic details concerning the Arctic language—p. [46] and perhaps the bear names on p. [22]—Tolkien also invents an animal—the *drasil*, p. [26]—to explain prehistoric cave drawings.

Wain, John. "Poetry and Social Criticism: Should Poets try to change the world[?]" *Encounter*, 46:6 (June 1976), 25-33.

There is a constant temptation for poets to join one social cause or another writes Wain, a one-time Inkling, but to succumb to it is a destruction of art. "Poetry is about life, death, love, hate, heaven, hell, immortality, joy and pain" (p. 26)—these are general human concerns, not political programs. Of course, poems can deal with emotional reactions connected to politics, as Wordsworth's *Prelude* reflects his emotions over the French Revolution and John Crowe Ranson's "Captain Carpenter" reflects (more indirectly) his feelings about the South in the American Civil War. But straight propaganda is not art, for the latter is "the free exercise of the imagination, [and it] should be retained, for art is just about the only thing we have left, the only complete success our species can point to" (p. 22).

Walsh, Chad. "Afterword," In *A Grief Observed*, by C. S. Lewis, pp. 91-151. New York: Bantam Books, 1976. 154 pp.

Walsh writes a biography of Lewis, with emphasis on his marriage to Joy Davidman. It is not a brief work, being about the same wordage as Lewis's small book which it accompanies. All of the material in Lewis's early life will be familiar to most students of Lewis, but Walsh and his wife knew Joy Davidman and her husband, William Gresham, before Joy met Lewis; thus, his descriptions of the Greshams have freshness. Walsh traces the development of love between Lewis and Joy, and writes of her remission from cancer: "As her recovery progressed, we received...letters in which she bubbled over with happiness (if one can use such language of a person who had her austere side) and celebrated Lewis's prowess as a lover" (pp. 141-142). Walsh also traces the influence of Joy in Lewis's last books: *Till We Have Faces*, *The Four Loves*, and (of course) *A Grief Observed*. Of the first, he writes: "Orual is plain, as Joy was plain, but like Joy capable of intense Philia as well as Eros. Her life involves a religious quest that leads at last to the one God; here there is a clear parallel to Joy's progression from atheistic Communism to Christianity. These are only the most obvious resemblances. Anyone knowing Joy would recognize many of her traits in Orual" (pp. 143-44). The influence in the second book is shown in Lewis's turn from the legalisms of Eros which he had recorded in his earlier books, to a celebration and understanding of it. Walsh concludes about Davidman's influence on Lewis: "[He] was indeed surprised by Joy—into his own self-knowledge and deepest fulfillment" (p. 151). (Note: one minor objection may be made to the content to Walsh's well-written account—nowhere does he note that Davidman's first name was Helen, which explains why Lewis used "H." in *A Grief Observed*.)

Williams, Charles. "The Sabbath." In *The Magic Valley Travellers: Welsh Stories of Fantasy and Horror*, ed. and intro. Peter Haining, pp. 195-203. Foreword by Richard Hughes. New York: Taplinger Publishing Company, 1974. 256 pp.

Williams makes this collection, according to Haining's biographical paragraph on him (p. 195), because he had Welsh parents. No copyright notice is given on "The Sabbath," nor is its source listed, but it is the sixth chapter of *War in Heaven*, reprinted in full and called simply a "story" by Haining.

Zuber, Bernard A. "Tolkien on Film." *Fantasiae: The Monthly Newsletter of the Fantasy Association*, (June 1976), 5. Reprinted: *Appendix L* [monthly bulletin of the American Tolkien Society], September 1976, p. [3].

Zuber reports what details are available about the Rankin and Bass production of *The Hobbit* as a TV cartoon for the fall of 1977 and the Ralph Bakshi production of *The Lord of the Rings* as a series of three films which will combine animation and live action.