10-15-1997

Annotated Checklists of Early Reviews of Books by J.R.R. Tolkien

George H. Thompson

Follow this and additional works at: https://dc.swosu.edu/mythlore

Recommended Citation


This Article is brought to you for free and open access by SWOSU Digital Commons. It has been accepted for inclusion in Mythlore: A Journal of J.R.R. Tolkien, C.S. Lewis, Charles Williams, and Mythopoeic Literature by an authorized editor of SWOSU Digital Commons. An ADA compliant document is available upon request. For more information, please contact phillip.fitzsimmons@swosu.edu.
Annotated Checklists of Early Reviews of Books by J.R.R. Tolkien

Abstract
Lists Thompson's earlier articles in Mythlore on reviews of and references to Tolkien's works, with errata.

Additional Keywords
Tolkien, J.R.R.—Bibliography; Tolkien, J.R.R.—Critical reception
Annotated Checklists of Early Reviews of Books by J. R. R. Tolkien
Compiled by George H. Thomson

A note of acknowledgement For their help in preparing the Checklists recorded below, I am especially grateful to the late Angus Cameron, his wife Wendy Cameron, and to Rachel Brown Giblin, all of whom searched the review files of Allen & Unwin; to my wife Dorothy Thomson who revised and typed; to Joe Christopher who arranged publication; and to helpful staff at Allen & Unwin, Houghton Mifflin, and Ballantine Books. As well, many reviewers generously contributed by sending me copies or information about their publications.

“Early Reviews of Books by J. R. R. Tolkien:"

“[Part I:] The Hobbit, Farmer Giles of Ham, The Fellowship of the Ring [to be continued].” Mythlore 11, No. 2 (40: Autumn 1984), 56-60.

“Part II: The Fellowship of the Ring [continued], The Two Towers,” Mythlore 11, No. 3 (41: Winter-Spring, 1985), 59-63.


Annotated Checklists of Early and Minor References to Tolkien and his Works
Compiled by George H. Thomson


“Minor, Early References to Tolkien and His Works,” Mythlore 14, No. 1 (51: Autumn 1987), 41-42, 55.

ERRATA


P.56 For Thompson read Thomson

P.57 H., R., line 6: For H ’38 read H ’66P
Hughes, line 2: For Statesmen read Statesman
P. A., line 4: For is has read it has
Bottom of page: See also reviews of LotR ’56 by Straight, of LotR ’65 and ’67 in Best Sellers and by Brady ETC

P.59S., S., line 2: For p. ii read p. 11
Blair, line 8: For emphasis read emphases
Conklin, line 4: For + read + -

“Part II: The Fellowship of the Ring [continued], The Two Towers,” Mythlore 11, No. 3 (41: Winter-Spring, 1985), 59-63.

P.59: Beginning: The following entries were omitted:

“The Fellowship of the Ring.” Adelphi 31:1 (1954), 101-102. [He objects to the excessive praise on the jacket. Conclusion: “Mr. Tolkien rejects everything, tradition, history, symbolism and allegory. His admirers regard it as his strength, yet in fact it is his weakness, despite all the ingenuity and the brilliance of detail. There is a difference between a tour de force and a work of genius.”] + -FR ’54E

Fausset, H. I.’A. “Epic Romance.” Manchester Guardian, 20 Aug. 1954, p. 3. [“To have created so enthralling an epic-romance, with its own mythology, with . . . such imaginative largesse in invention and description, and such supernatural meaning underlying the wealth of incident, is a most remarkable feat.”] Brief. +FR ’54E

P.59: after Flood: the following entries were omitted:

Gerson, Villiers. “The Spectroscope.” Amazing Stories 29 (Sept. 1955), 110. [A rather brief review. It is not the adventures which fascinate but “the wonderful characterization, the poetry, the interest which the author makes us feel in each of the protagonists which gives it a strange power.”] +FR ’54A

Green, Peter. “Outward Bound by Air to an Inappropriate Ending.” The Daily Telegraph & Morning Post, 27 Aug. 1954, p. 8. [Green can find no reason for taking the book seriously. Tolkien has “written, with the interminable prose of a bazaar story-teller, an adventure yarn about magic rings and Black Riders which should prove immensely popular with those 10-year-olds who don’t prefer space-fiction.” It does not show imagination at all. “The style veers from pre-Raphaelite to Boy’s Own Paper.” Yet the work has an awesome fascination.] -Fr ’54E

Hall, David. “Faint but Pursuing.” New Zealand Listener, 14 Jan. 1955, pp. 13-14. [“This farrago of the imagination running amok, this saga-crooning over the rivalries or friendships of hobbits . . . elves, dwarves, and orcs, this homeric clashing of ignorant armies by night, is presented with unflagging and enviable zest.”] Brief. +FR ’54E

Halle, Louis J. “Flourishing Orcs.” Saturday Review 38 (15 Jan. 1955), 17-18. [A playful review, greatly praising the book for being a history or mythology of “higher authenticity,” for being immensely readable, and for making one feel that life is ennobled.] +Fr ’54A

Hayes, E. Nelson. “New Fiction.” The Progressive (Madison) 19 (Jan. 1955), 42-43. [“Tolkien has created a mythology complete, consistent, and convincing. He writes a prose of great dignity and power, compounded of strong rhythms, colorful...
diction, and brilliant metaphor, exactly suited to the subject at hand.” Brief.] +FR ’54A

“Heroic Endeavour.” Times Literary Supplement, 27 Aug. 1954, p. 541. [It is a near thing but Tolkien brings off the change of key between the earlier and later parts of this volume. “Yet the plot lacks balance.” The only code of the good characters “is the warrior’s code of courage, and the author never explains what it is they consider the Good.”] +FR ’54E

“Hobbits and the Ring,” Newsweek 44 (29 Nov. 1954), 106. [“In the northwest of the Old World” of literature, east of the inky sea of crisp reporting and useful biography, and far south of the icy sensitive psychological novel, live some folk called Hobbits and a remarkable new book about them.” The rich Biblical style and the handling of the allegory are praised. “Summing up: Hobbits have something to say.” A large cartoon illustration shows a ridiculous conception of orcs.] +FR ’54A

P.59Kiely, line 3: For enchanting read interesting
Lehamann, line 1: For Lehamann read Lehamann
P.60Mitchison, line 2: For Statesmen read Statesman
Pearson, line 2: For No. 132 read No. 1232
Sotemann, line 1: For Sotemann read Sötemann
P.61Brady, line 1: For Wondrous read Wondrous de Camp, line 4: For passage read passages
P.62Kepert, line 1: For Sydney read Sydney
P.63Pearson, line 3: For legend. read legend,
Street, line 5: For entralled read enthralled
See also, line 2: For Sotemann read Sötemann


P.58 Best Sellers, line 1: For [The read [“The Churchhill, line 3: For Fairy read Faerie
P.59Forrest, line 2: For ii read II
Gale, line 6: For enough. read enough.”
Hahn, line 17: For Fr read FR
Halle, line 2: For What read “What
P.60 McAlister, line 4: For dread, power. read dread power,
P.61Muir, lines 3 & 4: For heros read heroes
Nicholls, line 2: For AGE read Age
“Recent Fiction,” line 1: For 3 read 52
P.62Roberts, line 1: For Adventures read Adventure
“The Saga of Middle Earth,” line 12: For Scudmore read Scudamore
Scudmore, line 1: For Scudmore read Scudamore
Smith, Kathe, line 1: For Kathe read Kätte
Sotemann, line 1: For Sotemann read Sötemann
line 15: For not as a read not a
line 22: For is riding read riding
Steele, line 4: For touched read touched with
P.63Steele, line 5: For for, read for instance,
Warton, line 1: For Hobbit read Hobbits
Wickenden, line 5: For European read European


P.62Moss, line 3: For SMW is read SMW “is


P.59Brace, line 5: For Magnet-Bem read Magnet-Gem
P.60Comans, line 2: For p. 7 read p. ?
Dolbier, line 5: For LOTR ’65 read H ’65, LOTR ’65
Hanns, line 1: For Hanns read Hanna
line 4: For Queen read Queene
line 9: For LOTR ’65 read LOTR ’66
P.61Jonas, lines 7-8: Omit: And see Henry, Judy.
Lobdell, line 7: For LOTR ’66 read LOTR ’67
P.62Ramacitti, line 3: For favorably read favorably
Wimsatt, line 7: For LOTR ’65, 67 read LOTR ’65, ’67,


P.55 “Fairy Tales, line 2: For told read “told
Lawrence, line 1: For [English read English
Schmidt, line 3: For LOTH read LOTR
P.56Clark, line 4: For ATB ’63 read ATB ’62
“Middle Earth Verse,” line 1: For Literacy read Literary
line 3: For di read do
P.57Serraillier, line 2: For Devotes read Devotees
Clemens, line 3: For ba:ads read ballads
D., K., line 5: For have any read have
P.58 “Forecasts . . .,” line 6: For varried read varied
Mitchell, line 4: For esoterics read esoterica
P.59Wildstrom, line 8: For While read “While
Woods, line 7: For eminently read eminently


P.58 Adams, line 5: For treat read threat
Boroff, lines 5-6: For kind of intellectual read kind of literary backlash is developing on the more intellectual
Brace, line 18: For spoke read spoke to
Brogan, line 6: For elements of attacks read elements of the Fantastic Tradition . . .; the way Tolkien attacks
P.59 Castell, line 13: For now read know
Courtney, line 3: For there read There
line 5: For this work read his work
P.60 “Hobbit Fans 1 Made N. H.,” line 3: For American read America
Hugh-Jones, line 6: For give read give a
P.61Nichols, line 5: Add: B 413
P.62 Shaw, Greg, line 3: For Feanorian read Péanorain
Unwin, line 5: For nor read no
P.63 Walters, line 4: For with a read within a
“Minor, Early References to Tolkien and His Works,” Mythlore 14, No. 1 (51: Autumn 1987), 41-42, 55.

P.41 Elliott, line 1: For Elliot read Elliott
P.42Meskys, line 7: For here read her