



Mythopoeic Society

mythLORE

A Journal of J.R.R. Tolkien, C.S. Lewis,  
Charles Williams, and Mythopoeic Literature

---

Volume 22  
Number 1

Article 11

---

10-15-1997

## Annotated Checklists of Early Reviews of Books by J.R.R. Tolkien

George H. Thompson

Follow this and additional works at: <https://dc.swosu.edu/mythlore>

---

### Recommended Citation

Thompson, George H. (1997) "Annotated Checklists of Early Reviews of Books by J.R.R. Tolkien," *Mythlore: A Journal of J.R.R. Tolkien, C.S. Lewis, Charles Williams, and Mythopoeic Literature*: Vol. 22 : No. 1 , Article 11.

Available at: <https://dc.swosu.edu/mythlore/vol22/iss1/11>

This Article is brought to you for free and open access by the Mythopoeic Society at SWOSU Digital Commons. It has been accepted for inclusion in Mythlore: A Journal of J.R.R. Tolkien, C.S. Lewis, Charles Williams, and Mythopoeic Literature by an authorized editor of SWOSU Digital Commons. An ADA compliant document is available upon request. For more information, please contact [phillip.fitzsimmons@swosu.edu](mailto:phillip.fitzsimmons@swosu.edu).

To join the Mythopoeic Society go to:  
<http://www.mythsoc.org/join.htm>

SWOSU<sup>TM</sup>

---

## Mythcon 51: The Mythic, the Fantastic, and the Alien

Albuquerque, New Mexico • Postponed to: July 30 – August 2, 2021



### Abstract

Lists Thompson's earlier articles in *Mythlore* on reviews of and references to Tolkien's works, with errata.

### Additional Keywords

Tolkien, J.R.R.—Bibliography; Tolkien, J.R.R.—Critical reception

# ANNOTATED CHECKLISTS OF EARLY REVIEWS OF BOOKS BY J. R. R. TOLKIEN

COMPILED BY GEORGE H. THOMSON

**A note of acknowledgement** For their help in preparing the Checklists recorded below, I am especially grateful to the late Angus Cameron, his wife Wendy Cameron, and to Rachel Brown Giblin, all of whom searched the review files of Allen & Unwin; to my wife Dorothy Thomson who revised and typed; to Joe Christopher who arranged publication; and to helpful staff at Allen & Unwin, Houghton Mifflin, and Ballantine Books. As well, many reviewers generously contributed by sending me copies or information about their publications.

## "Early Reviews of Books by J. R. R. Tolkien:"

"[Part I:] *The Hobbit, Farmer Giles of Ham, The Fellowship of the Ring* [to be continued]." *Mythlore* 11, No. 2 (40: Autumn 1984), 56-60.

"Part II: *The Fellowship of the Ring* [continued], *The Two Towers*," *Mythlore* 11, No. 3 (41: Winter-Spring, 1985), 59-63.

"Part III: *The Return of the King*," *Mythlore* 12, No. 1 (43: Autumn 1985), 58-63.

"Part III [read Part IV]: *Smith of Wootton Major & "Smith of Wootton Major & Farmer Giles of Ham*," *Mythlore* 12, No. 3 (45: Spring 1986), 61-62.

"Part V: *The Lord of the Rings*, new editions," *Mythlore* 12, No. 4 (46: Summer 1986), 59-62.

"Part VI: *Tree and Leaf* / Part VII: *The Adventures of Tom Bombadil* / Part VIII: *The Road Goes Ever On & Poems and Songs of Middle-earth*," *Mythlore* 13, No. 1 (47: Autumn 1986), 54-59.

## Annotated Checklists of Early and Minor References to Tolkien and his Works

Compiled by George H. Thomson

"Early Articles, Comments, Etcetera about J. R. R. Tolkien," *Mythlore* 13, No. 3 (49: Spring 1987), 58-63.

"Minor, Early References to Tolkien and His Works," *Mythlore* 14, No. 1 (51: Autumn 1987), 41-42, 55.

## ERRATA

"Early Reviews of Books by J. R. R. Tolkien: [Part I:] *The Hobbit, Farmer Giles of Ham, The Fellowship of the Ring* [to be continued]." *Mythlore* 11, No. 2 (40: Autumn 1984), 56-60.

P.56 For Thompson read Thomson

P.57 H., R., line 6: For H '38 read H '66P

Hughes, line 2: For Statesmen read Statesman

P., A., line 4: For is has read it has

Bottom of page: See also reviews of *LotR* '56 by Straight, of *LotR* '65 and '67 in *Best Sellers* and by Brady ETC

P.59S., S., line 2: For p. ii read p. 11

Blair, line 8: For emphasis read emphases

Conklin, line 4: For + read + -

"Part II: *The Fellowship of the Ring* [continued], *The Two Towers*," *Mythlore* 11, No. 3 (41: Winter-Spring, 1985), 59-63.

P.59: Beginning: *The following entries were omitted:*

"The Fellowship of the Ring." *Adelphi* 31:1 (1954), 101-102. [He objects to the excessive praise on the jacket. Conclusion: "Mr. Tolkien rejects everything, tradition, history, symbolism and allegory. His admirers regard it as his strength, yet in fact it is his weakness, despite all the ingenuity and the brilliance of detail. There is a difference between a tour de force and a work of genius."] + -FR '54E

F[ausset], H. Y.A. "Epic Romance." *Manchester Guardian*, 20 Aug. 1954, p. 3. ["To have created so enthralling an epic-romance, with its own mythology, with . . . such imaginative largesse in invention and description, and such supernatural meaning underlying the wealth of incident, is a most remarkable feat." Brief.] +FR '54E

P.59: after Flood: *the following entries were omitted:*

Gerson, Villiers. "The Spectroscope." *Amazing Stories* 29 (Sept. 1955), 110. [A rather brief review. It is not the adventures which fascinate but "the wonderful characterization, the poetry, the interest which the author makes us feel in each of the protagonists which gives it a strange power."] +FR '54A

Green, Peter. "Outward Bound by Air to an Inappropriate Ending." *The Daily Telegraph & Morning Post*, 27 Aug. 1954, p. 8. [Green can find no reason for taking the book seriously. Tolkien has "written, with the interminable prosiness of a bazaar story-teller, an adventure yarn about magic rings and Black Riders which should prove immensely popular with those 10-year-olds who don't prefer space-fiction." It does not show imagination at all. "The style veers from pre-Raphaelite to Boy's Own Paper." Yet the work has an awesome fascination.] -Fr '54E

Hall, David. "Faint but Pursuing." *New Zealand Listener*, 14 Jan. 1955, pp. 13-14. ["This farrago of the imagination running amok, this saga-crooning over the rivalries or friendships of hobbits . . . elves, dwarves, and orcs, this homeric clashing of ignorant armies by night, is presented with unflagging and enviable zest." Brief.] +FR '54E

Halle, Louis J. "Flourishing Orcs." *Saturday Review* 38 (15 Jan. 1955), 17-18. [A playful review, greatly praising the book for being a history or mythology of "higher authenticity," for being immensely readable, and for making one feel that life is ennobled.] +Fr '54A

Hayes, E. Nelson. "New Fiction." *The Progressive* (Madison) 19 (Jan. 1955), 42-43. ["Tolkien has created a mythology complete, consistent, and convincing. He writes a prose of great dignity and power, compounded of strong rhythms, colorful

- diction, and brilliant metaphor, exactly suited to the subject at hand." Brief.] +FR '54A
- "Heroic Endeavour." *Times Literary Supplement*, 27 Aug. 1954, p. 541. [It is a near thing but Tolkien brings off the change of key between the earlier and later parts of this volume. "Yet the plot lacks balance." The only code of the good characters "is the warrior's code of courage, and the author never explains what it is they consider the Good."] +FR '54E
- "Hobbits and the Ring." *Newsweek* 44 (29 Nov. 1954), 106. ["In the northwest of the Old World' of literature, east of the inky sea of crisp reporting and useful biography, and far south of the icily sensitive psychological novel, live some folk called Hobbits and a remarkable new book about them." The rich Biblical style and the handling of the allegory are praised. "Summing up: Hobbits have something to say." A large cartoon illustration shows a ridiculous conception of orcs.] +FR '54A
- P.59Kiely, line 3: *For* enchanting *read* interesting  
Lehamann, line 1: *For* Lehamann *read* Lehmann
- P.60Mitchison, line 2: *For* Statesmen *read* Statesman  
Pearson, line 2: *For* No. 132 *read* No. 1232  
Sotemann, line 1: *For* Sotemann *read* Sötemann
- P.61Brady, line 1: *For* Wonderous *read* Wondrous  
de Camp, line 4: *For* passage *read* passages
- P.62Kepert, line 1: *For* Sidney *read* Sydney
- P.63Pearson, line 3: *For* legend. *read* legend,  
Street, line 5: *For* entralled *read* enthralled  
See also, line 2: *For* Sotemann *read* Sötemann
- "Part III: *The Return of the King*," *Mythlore* 12, No. 1 (43: Autumn 1985), 58-63.
- P.58 *Best Sellers*, line 1: *For* [The *read* ["The  
Churchill, line 3: *For* Fairy *read* Faerie
- P.59Forrest, line 2: *For* ii *read* II  
Gale, line 6: *For* enough. *read* enough."  
Hahn, line 17: *For* Fr *read* FR  
Halle, line 2: *For* [What *read* ["What
- P.60 McAlister, line 4: *For* dread, power. *read* dread power,
- P.61Muir, lines 3 & 4: *For* heros *read* heroes  
Nicholls, line 2: *For* AGE *read* Age  
"Recent Fiction," line 1: *For* 3 *read* 52
- P.62Roberts, line 1: *For* Adventures *read* Adventure  
"The Saga of Middle Earth," line 12: *For* Scudmore *read*  
Scudamore  
Scudmore, line 1: *For* Scudmore *read* Scudamore  
Smith, Kathe, line 1: *For* Kathe *read* Käthe  
Sotemann, line 1: *For* Sotemann *read* Sötemann  
line 15: *For* not as a *read* not a  
line 22: *For* is riding *read* riding  
Steele, line 4: *For* touched *read* touched with
- P.63Steele, line 5: *For* for, *read* for instance,  
Warton, line 1: *For* Hobbit *read* Hobbits  
Wickenden, line 5: *For* European *read* European
- "Part III [*read* Part IV]: *Smith of Wootton Major & "Smith of Wootton Major & Farmer Giles of Ham*," *Mythlore* 12, No. 3 (45: Spring 1986), 61-62.
- P.62Moss, line 3: *For* SMW is *read* SMW "is
- "Part V: *The Lord of the Rings*, new editions," *Mythlore* 12, No. 4 (46: Summer 1986), 59-62.
- P.59Brace, line 5: *For* Magnet-Bem *read* Magnet-Gem
- P.60Comans, line 2: *For* p. 7 *read* p. ?  
Dolbier, line 5: *For* LOTR '65 *read* H '65, LOTR '65  
Hanns, line 1: *For* Hanns *read* Hanna  
line 4: *For* Queen *read* Queene  
line 9: *For* LOTR '65 *read* LOTR '66
- P.61Jonas, lines 7-8: *Omit*: And see Henry, Judy.  
Lobdell, line 7: *For* LOTR '66 *read* LOTR '67
- P.62Ramacitti, line 3: *For* favorably *read* favorably  
Wimsatt, line 7: *For* LOTR '65, 67 *read* LOTR '65, '67,
- "Part VI: *Tree And Leaf* / Part VII: *The Adventures of Tom Bombadil* / Part VIII: *The Road Goes Ever On & Poems and Songs of Middle-earth*," *Mythlore* 13, No. 1 (47: Autumn 1986), 54-59.
- P.55"Fairy Tales, line 2: *For* told *read* "told  
Lawrence, line 1: *For* [English *read* *English*  
Schmidt, line 3: *For* LOTH *read* LOTR
- P.56Clark, line 4: *For* ATB '63 *read* ATB '62  
"Middle Earth Verse," line 1: *For* Literacy *read* Literary  
line 3: *For* di *read* do
- P.57Serraillier, line 2: *For* Devotes *read* Devotees  
Clemens, line 3: *For* ba::ads *read* ballads  
D., K., line 5: *For* have any *read* have
- P.58"Forecasts . . .," line 6: *For* varried *read* varied  
Mitchell, line 4: *For* esoterics *read* esoterica
- P.59Wildstrom, line 8: *For* While *read* "While  
Woods, line 7: *For* eminantly *read* eminently
- "Early Articles, Comments, Etcetera about J. R. R. Tolkien," *Mythlore* 13, No. 3 (49: Spring 1987), 58-63.
- P.58Adams, line 5: *For* treat *read* threat  
Boroff, lines 5-6: *For* kind of intellectual *read* kind of literary backlash is developing on the more intellectual  
Brace, line 18: *For* spoke *read* spoke to  
Brogan, line 6: *For* elements of attacks *read* elements of the Fantastic Tradition . . ."; the way Tolkien attacks
- P.59 Castell, line 13: *For* now *read* know  
Courtney, line 3: *For* there *read* There  
line 5: *For* this work *read* his work
- P.60"Hobbit Fans I Made N. H.," line 3: *For* American *read*  
America  
Hugh-Jones, line 6: *For* give *read* give a
- P.61Nichols, line 5: *Add*: B 413
- P.62Shaw, Greg, line 3: *For* Feanorian *read* Fëanorian  
Unwin, line 5: *For* nor *read* no
- P.63Walters, line 4: *For* with a *read* within a
- "Minor, Early References to Tolkien and His Works," *Mythlore* 14, No. 1 (51: Autumn 1987), 41-42, 55.
- P.41Elliot, line 1: *For* Elliot *read* Elliott
- P.42Meskys, line 7: *For* here *read* her