

Fall 10-15-1987

Minor, Early References to Tolkien and His Works

George H. Thompson

Follow this and additional works at: <https://dc.swosu.edu/mythlore>



Part of the [Children's and Young Adult Literature Commons](#)

Recommended Citation

Thompson, George H. (1987) "Minor, Early References to Tolkien and His Works," *Mythlore: A Journal of J.R.R. Tolkien, C.S. Lewis, Charles Williams, and Mythopoeic Literature*: Vol. 14: No. 1, Article 8. Available at: <https://dc.swosu.edu/mythlore/vol14/iss1/8>

This Article is brought to you for free and open access by the Mythopoeic Society at SWOSU Digital Commons. It has been accepted for inclusion in Mythlore: A Journal of J.R.R. Tolkien, C.S. Lewis, Charles Williams, and Mythopoeic Literature by an authorized editor of SWOSU Digital Commons. An ADA compliant document is available upon request. For more information, please contact phillip.fitzsimmons@swosu.edu.

To join the Mythopoeic Society go to:
<http://www.mythsoc.org/join.htm>



Online Summer Seminar 2023

August 5-6, 2023: Fantasy Goes to Hell: Depictions of Hell in Modern Fantasy Texts

<https://mythsoc.org/oms/oms-2023.htm>



Minor, Early References to Tolkien and His Works

Abstract

Completes the briefly annotated checklist of minor early secondary materials on Tolkien not represented in Judith A. Johnson's *Six Decades of Tolkien Criticism*.

Additional Keywords

Tolkien, J.R.R.—Bibliography; Tolkien, J.R.R.—Critical reception

Minor, Early References to Tolkien and His Works

Compiled by George H. Thompson

NOTE: This completes Professor Thomson's annotated checklist of early secondary materials on Tolkien, 1947-1971. None of these items appear in Judith A. Johnson's *J.R.R. Tolkien: Six Decades of Criticism* (1986). The items in this checklist are mainly trivial in themselves, and significant primarily as a record of popularity of Tolkien's works. *Mythlore* has been pleased to present over the last few years Professor Thomson's additions to the complete bibliography on Tolkien which will eventually be produced. With this installment, Professor Thomson hands the work on Tolkien over to other hands. JRC

I. Anonymous Items Arranged Alphabetically by Journal or Book Title

"Thuds". *Amra* Vol. II, No. 39, p. 3. [A brief editorial review of the Ace *LOTR* affair suggests that you write Ace if you object, but no boycott please.]

"Tolkien, J.R.R." *The Author's and Writer's Who's Who*. London: Burke's Peerage Ltd., 1963, p. 483. [Tolkien's address and publications are listed.]

Best Books for Children. 10th ed. New York: R.R. Bowker, 1968, p. 76. [There is a two-line description of *H*, also included in earlier editions.]

"This Hill Inhabited". *Bestsellers* (New York), July 1967, pp. 12-13. [This article on Tolkien's popularity is made up mainly of letters to Tolkien and his publisher, Ballantine Books. There are references to posters and other aspects of the cult.]

"National Book Sale". *The Bookseller*, 24 Feb. 1968, p. 1328. [In the National Book Sale opening Feb. 21 Allen & Unwin offered the first edition of the 3-vol. *LOTR* reduced from 75s. to 40s. Orders exceeded copies available 10 to 1. The new edition remains available at 75s.]

"Amon Lhaw" (Letter Column). *Entmoot* No. 2 (1965), [pp. 3-7]. [The question of what kinds of music are appropriate to the various peoples of Middle-earth and to the specific songs Tolkien has written is chewed over by a number of correspondents and by Greg Shaw as editor. The comments are distinguished for their subjective honesty.]

"Ballantine Books has Paperback Rights to Tolkien". *Publisher's Weekly* 188 (2 Aug. 1965), 44. [By arrangement with Houghton Mifflin Ballantine Books will bring out *H* on Aug. 5 at \$9.5 (Actual date, Aug. 16), and *LOTR*, 3 vols. in Oct. at \$9.5 each. Ace Books had the legal right to publish a paperback edition because of "a confusing clause in the copyright law."]

"1965 Paperback Best Sellers in the Bookstores". *Publisher's Weekly* 189 (17 Jan. 1966), 64-67. [*H* and *LOTR* are number 10 among "Mass Market Paperbacks." Ballantine has in print 268,000 copies of *H* and 405,000 of *LOTR*. The Ace edition is in addition to this. (p. 65)]

"1967 Paperback Best Sellers in the Bookstores". *Publisher's Weekly* 193 (29 Jan. 1968), 44. [Tolkien books are second among "Mass Market Paperbacks." Ballantine total printings since 1965: 3,881,000. For 1967:

TR--52,860; *H*--357,000; *FR*--320,000; *TT*--268,000; *FR*--273,000.]

"Tips". *Publisher's Weekly* 194 (11 Nov. 1968), 33. [Ballantine Books has sold 5,000,000 copies in all of *H*, *FR*, *TT*, *FR*, and *TR*. Weekly sales of the four Hobbit books have been averaging 12,500 copies apiece each week for the past three months.]

"The Publishing Scene: But Does It Sell Books?" *Saturday Review* 50 (18 Mar. 1967), 26. ["Frodo Lives" and other such buttons by Mark Sloane of Greenwich Village have started a trend. A large number have been sold.]

"New Magic in Animation". *Time* 92 (27 Dec. 1968), 42-47. [Heinz Edelman, who did the artistic creations for *Yellow Submarine* is said to be "thinking about animating J.R.R. Tolkien's *The Lord of the Rings* trilogy..." (p. 47).]

II. Items Arranged Alphabetically by Author

Boersma, Dave. Letter. *Tolkien Journal* III:4 (Nov. 1969), p. 23. [Lists words from *Beowulf*, *Widsith*, and *The Fight at Finnesburg* which appear as names, etc., in *LOTR*.]

"Tolkien Buys to Convene". *UWM Post* (University of Wisconsin-Milwaukee), 22 March 1968, p. 7. [A news item about the May 10 and 11 National Conference on the Secondary Universe.]

Boucher, Anthony. "Recommended Reading". *Fantasy and Science Fiction* 14 (May 1958), 112. [He reports that "the International Fantasy Award, presented at last year's World Science Fiction Convention in London, went to J.R.R. Tolkien's *The Lord of the Rings*." He quotes Allen & Unwin as disclosing that Tolkien is now "working as best he can on *The Silmarillion*, which might best be described as the source book for *The Lord of the Rings*. We cannot hold out any hope that it will be published this year."]

Carlsen, G. Robert. *Books and the Teen-Age Reader*. New York: Bantam Books, 1967, p. 93. [The bibliography to Chapter 6, "The Popular Adult Book," lists *LOTR* as "adult fantasy."]

Carter, David. "Where the Sun Sails and the Moon Walks". *Tucson Daily Citizen*, 12 Aug. 1967, pp. 12-13. [A popular article about the flourishing Tolkien Society in Tucson (35 members), and about Tolkien and his books.]

Damrosch, David. Letter. *Tolkien Journal* III:4 (Nov. 1969) 21. [In answer to the letter of John Biella, *Tolkien Journal* II:2 (1966), 13-14, he argues Tom Bombadil is Eldest, not Treebeard. The relevant passages are *LOTR* '65: *TT* pp. 89, 209; *FR* p. 182.]

Elliot, George P. "A Defense of Fiction". *Hudson Review* 16 (1963), 9-48. [Discussing pure fantasy as part of one form of fiction, he says: "Such fiction, though it is frequently looked at with condescension, is in no danger of disappearing. Tolkien's *Lord of the Rings* is four volumes of charming fantasy in the British manner" (p. 19).]

Evers, Earl. "Tolkien Con and Pro" (Letter). *Niekas* No. 14 (10 Dec. 1965), pp. 53-54. [A rather wild-eyed attack on Tolkien's values, his gods, his elves, and his ring. The letter is answered, pp. 54-55, by Nan Braude; also in a letter from George Scott, *Niekas* No. 16 (30 June 1966), p. 81.]

Fein, Adrienne. Letter. *Riverside Quarterly* (Regina) 3 (March 1969) 320-321. [A comment on Sandra Miesel's article, *Riverside Quarterly* 3 (Aug. 1968). Evidence from *Rings*, essentially pp. 64-65, and comments from *LOTR* suggest that there is prayer in *LOTR*.]

Foster, [Robert] Bob. "A Glossary of Middle Earth". *Niekas* Nos. 16-20. [See West, TB3, and add the following letters: Peristar Formello, No. 17, p. 67, who criticizes several translations; Patrick Strang, No. 20, p. 86, who doubts Orcs are immortal; and Jim Allen, No. 20, pp. 92-93 who comments on the definition of Middle-earth and some of the Elvish translation.]

Gaines, Renford. Letter: "On Middle-Earth". *Chicago Daily News*, Panorama, 9 Oct. 1965, p. 7. [He quotes the posted policy of Woolworth's Book Store (Chicago) who sell the Ace edition of *LOTR* but collect a \$.10 royalty with each sale and propose to send the proceeds to Tolkien. The letter relates to the article by Haas, 7 Aug. 1965.]

Gaughan, Jack. Letter. *Niekas* No. 13 (15 Sept. 1965), p. 38. [He briefly explains that "the error (flying horse instead of pterodactyl) on the Two Towers cover is mine alone." It was the result of hasty reading before doing the illustration.]

Glass, Bill. Letter. *Niekas* No. 13 (15 Sept. 1965), p. 39. [He explains that his review in *What Shall I Call It of The Fellowship of the Ring*, Books I and II, published by Penguin, was a hoax. The review is here reprinted. This may explain any rumors of such an edition.]

Hewitt, Harry. "A Tolkien Tapestry": Opus 352: A 45-minute work for solo piano based on *LOTR*. [Announced as completed Sept. 1958. Dedicated "To All Hobbit Lovers Everywhere."]

Hill, Joy. "Daily Life on Middle Earth". *Bookseller*, 3 Aug. 1968, pp. 374-375. [Miss Hill screens Tolkien's mail at Allen & Unwin. Here she gives a popular account of the many letters and parcels she confronts daily. With the 1-volume paperback of *LOTR* about to appear, she expects an increase, especially in inquiries about *The Silmarillion*. "Say it's a myth" said Tolkien. "But how can I when it is a fact" says Miss Hill.]

Loper, Mary Lou. "Fun is Hobbit-Forming at Tolkien Party". *Los Angeles Times*, 19 Sept. 1967, Part IV, pp. 1, 4. [A happy account of a hobbit party, with costumes, in honor of Bilbo's and Frodo's birthdays, sponsored in a public park by the Tolkien Society of Cal State, Los Angeles.]

Meras, Phyllis. "'Go, Go, Gandalf'". *New York Times*, Magazine 15 Jan. 1967, p. 102. [An inset-piece in connection with Philip Norman's article. It is mostly quotes from Richard Plotz about the Tolkien Society and its meetings. Some of the statements are tongue in cheek.]

[Mesky, Edmund R.] "Of Tolkienish Things". *Niekas* No. 12 (15 June 1965), pp. 77-78. [He discusses in some detail the way Ace Books has brought out the paperback

edition of *LOTR*, and the copyright situation.]

Mesky, Edmund R.] "Speaking of Tolkien". *Niekas* No. 16 (30 June 1966), p. 96. [He is going to publish in full Resnik's interview with Tolkien; Isaac and Zimbardo are preparing a volume and welcome MSS; and he and Marion Bradley are thinking of a collection of fanish articles, "to be edited and (if necessary) rewritten by here and published by me." This last project was never carried through.]

Moorcock, Mike. Letter *Eldritch Dream Quest* I:2 (May 1961), 54. [The Lord of the Rings might be an allegory, you know -- the tale of a War between Town and Country?...]]

P., O. "Behind the Lines". *The Bookseller*, 31 July 1954, p. 524. [Two paragraphs captioned "Swans and Geese" and "Sheeps and Goats" recount how the staff of Allen & Unwin looked scornfully at the half-million word MS. of *LOTR* -- and then one by one were won over when they read it. They became sheep rather than scornful goats.]

P., O. "Behind the Lines: Purely Coincidental". *The Bookseller*, 12 Nov. 1955, p. 1667. ["Incidentally, I am asked by Messrs. Allen & Unwin to let it be known that although Professor J.R.R. Tolkien is an Oxford man his Hobbit trilogy has no local significance. Mr. Basil Blackwell most definitely is not the Lord of the Rings." This little joke refers to Blackwell's plan to publish a list of booksellers who will take an oath not to participate in a second-hand book ring.]

Smith, Nancy. "Pleasures of the Hobbit Table". *Diplomat* (New York), Oct. 1966, pp. 42-43, 73-74. [An engaging interview of hobbit eating habits, interlarded with recipes in the English tradition. (The recipes are for real, but their excellence remains unverified. GHT)]

Spergel, Howard. "Heard About Hobbits?" *Augusta Chronicle*, 4 May 1962, p. 1B. [An article about wood sculptures by Susan Rawlings of Tolkien Figures -- now on display in Augusta-Rockwood County Public Library. "Miss Rawlings did the display because she found Tolkien's characters 'esthetically appealing.'"]

Vanderburg, Albert. "Lothlorien". *Tolkien Journal* II:2 (Astron 1966), 5-6. [A statement by the artist about his painting.]

Weir, Arthur R. "No Monroe in Lothlorien." *I Palantir* No. 3 (April 1964), pp. 17-19. Reprinted from *Triode* No. 17 (Jan. 1960). Later reprinted in Becker, *Tolkien Scrapbook*, 1978. [He speculates about filming *LOTR* and the difficulty of finding good geographical settings and appropriate actors. (Monroe in the title refers to the actress.) Tolkien commented on this article.] West (2nd II)-702. Jonsson FI-64. Johnson B1320. (West cites *Triode* and Becker; Jonsson cites Becker; Johnson does not mention Weir but cites Becker's fanish pieces generally. In West's citation of *Triode*, he adds No. 18 (May 1960), for the full article later reprinted together.)

Weir, [Arthur R.] Doc. "Addenda to No Monroe in Lothlorien". *I Palantir* No. 4 (Aug. 1966), p. 26. Reprinted from *Bastion*, No. 1 (1960). [In H. Decker, *Romanesque Art in Italy* (London), plates 74 and 75 of San Gimignano and 76 of Monteriggione suggest suitable film sites for Minas Tirith. To do cartoon work for *LOTR* the man really needed is Arthur Rackham who had a great influence on C.S. Lewis and I believe also on Tolkien.]

Continued on page 55

double of the Blackbury River; the fact that there are two Rosies in the story, and that Pierce manages to get them confused; etc.

The narrative is open-ended, so that a sequel is possible -- almost probable, since we have only gone through three of the twelve astrological houses that serve as the novel's symbolic framework. Whether it will stand on its own or be extended in the future, this many-faceted, delicately woven tale should fascinate anyone who is asking the ultimate questions about meaning and mythopoeia.



A TOLKIEN INDEX

A *Working Concordance*, the first volume of Dr. Paul Nolan Hyde's comprehensive index of the writings of J.R.R. Tolkien, was first made available at the 18th Mythopoeic Conference and is now being offered to the general membership of the Mythopoeic Society and other interested parties. It is a compilation of names, places, things, and language elements together with volume and page numbers of (almost) every occurrence. Volumes indexed include *The Hobbit*, *The Lord of the Rings*, *The Silmarillion*, *Unfinished Tales*, *The Book of Lost Tales* (I & II), *The Lays of Beleriand*, *The Shaping of Middle-earth*, *The Road Goes Ever On*, *The Letters of J.R.R. Tolkien*, *The Monsters and the Critics*, and Tolkien's "Guide to the Names in the Lord of the Rings" included in Jared Lobdell's *A Tolkien Compass*. The index also includes a complete listing of the Old and Middle English words used by J.R.R. Tolkien including the lengthy passages of Old English given in *The Shaping of Middle-earth*. It is soft-back, spiral bound, 163 pages, double column format.

Copies may be obtained by sending \$20.00/copy plus \$2.00 shipping and handling to Paul Nolan Hyde, 2661 E. Lee, Simi Valley, CA 93065.

Apologizes to Benjamin Urrutia. The review "Our Bodies, Our Elves", in *Mythlore* 50 was written by him.

From Under Mountains, from page 13

Haven and London: Yale U.P., 1980. 133-140.
The Holy Bible. Revised Standard Version. Cleveland and New York: World, 1962.

Jennings, Elizabeth. *Christian Poetry*. New York: Hawthorn Books, 1965.

Kocher, Paul H. *Master of Middle-earth*. Boston: Houghton Mifflin, 1972.

-----, *A Reader's Guide to the Silmarillion*. Boston: Houghton Mifflin, 1980.

Noel, Ruth S. *The Mythology of Middle-earth*. Boston: Houghton Mifflin, 1977.

Shippey, T.A. *The Road to Middle-earth*. Boston: Houghton Mifflin, 1983.

Tolkien, J.R.R. *The Fellowship of the Ring: Being the First Part of The Lord of the Rings*. Second edition. Boston: Houghton Mifflin, 1966.

-----, *The Hobbit*. Illus. J.R.R. Tolkien. Boston: Houghton Mifflin, 1966.

Williamson, Craig, trans. *A Feast of Creatures: Anglo-Saxon Riddle-Songs*. Philadelphia: U. of Pennsylvania P., 1982.

-----, ed. *The Old English Riddles of the Exeter Book*. Chapel Hill: U. of North Carolina P., 1977.

Moving?

When you move, please let us know, so your issues will arrive at your new address in timely manner. Send change of address information to: *Mythlore*, P.O. Box 6707, Altadena, CA 91001.

Courtly Love, from page 45

troop back to their master." (Ibid., p. 44.)

So the mad, gallant, foolhardy experiment is over. But Western civilization will never be the same. Woman will never again be seen as merely a piece of property or an object of barter. She is a human being -- a person -- whatever she may do or fail to do. And if she cares to stand on her dignity, she is a lady, with all a lady's prerogatives. As Lewis puts it,

To leap up on errands, to go through heat or cold, at the bidding of one's lady, or even of any lady, would seem but honorable and natural to a gentleman of the thirteenth or even of the seventeenth century; and most of us have gone shopping in the twentieth with ladies who show no sign of regarding the tradition as a dead letter." (Ibid., p. 7)

A lady, any lady, retains something of her ancient authority -- just how much no man can be quite sure. It is hers to have and to hold. She can forfeit her title to honor only by conduct unbecoming a lady, of which, to be sure, no wise woman would ever be guilty. Courtly love is Western man's heritage; it still flows in his bloodstream. "Neither the form nor the sentiment of this old poetry," says Lewis, "has passed away without leaving indelible traces on our minds." (Ibid., p. 1.)

NOTES

1. C.S. Lewis, *Poems* (London: Geoffrey Bles, Ltd., 1964), p. 133.
2. C.S. Lewis, *The Allegory of Love* (New York: Oxford University Press, 1936; Galaxy Books (paper), 1958), pp. 25-26.
3. Charles Williams, "The Figure of Arthur," in *Tales-in-sin through Logres* (Grand Rapids: Wm. B. Eerdmans Publishing Co. (paper), 1974), p. 240.

Minor, Early References, from page 42

West, Richard C. "The Tolkienians: Some Introductory Reflections on Alan Garner, Carol Kendall, and Lloyd Alexander." *Oricrist* No. 2 (1968), pp. 4-15. [These writers are regarded as Tolkienian primarily for the reason that each has followed Tolkien's example and invented his own mythology.]

Wood, Anthony. "Fireworks for the Author -- and B.B.C.2 Viewers." *Oxford Mail*, 9 Feb. 1968, p. 10. [Leslie Megahey is filming a program on Tolkien in color for the series "Release" on B.B.C.2. He describes Tolkien's reaction to a fireworks display filmed at his grandson's school, and his dislike of television technique. Much more film was shot (for the Archives) than was needed for the program.]

Yussupoff, Elina. "Do You Know about Hobbits". *Tinicum Township Bulletin* (Tinicum Civic Association, Pennsylvania), June 1968, p. ? [Brief enthusiastic description of *H and LOTR*, and news that the former is now in the local library.]