By "Significant" Compounding "We Pass Insensibly in the World of Epic"

J. S. Ryan

Follow this and additional works at: https://dc.swosu.edu/mythlore

Part of the Children's and Young Adult Literature Commons

Recommended Citation
Available at: https://dc.swosu.edu/mythlore/vol17/iss4/8

To join the Mythopoeic Society go to: http://www.mythsoc.org/join.htm
Abstract
Relates Tolkien's thoughts expressed in the essay “Prefatory Remarks on the Prose Translation of Beowulf” to the style of The Hobbit, particularly the use of compound words or kennings.

Additional Keywords

This article is available in Mythlore: A Journal of J.R.R. Tolkien, C.S. Lewis, Charles Williams, and Mythopoeic Literature: https://dc.swosu.edu/mythlore/vol17/iss4/8
The quote in the title of this essay contains in its second part an abridged reference from a highly significant essay, treating of J.R.R. Tolkien's The Hobbit (published in 1937), from C.S. Lewis. The latter contributed a paper to a collection of pieces issued as a memorial tribute to their deceased friend Charles Williams (ob. 1945) by a number of his Oxford and London colleagues and associates. The essay by Lewis was "On Stories," which was originally—perhaps as early as 1938—"read to a Merton College undergraduate literary society... in a slightly fuller form" with the title "The Kappe Element in Fiction." Towards the end of his speculative piece (which has many parallels to Tolkien's own "On Fairy Stories," first written in 1938 for the University of St. Andrews), Lewis pulls his argument together with insightful reference to Tolkien's recently published story:

The Hobbit escapes the danger of degenerating into mere plot and excitement by a very curious shift of tone. As the humour and homeliness of the early chapters, the sheer 'Hobbitry', dies away we pass insensibly into the world of the epic... we lose one theme but find another. We kill 'Hobbitry', dies away we pass insensibly into the world of the epic... we lose one theme but find another. We kill - but not the same fox. (p. 104)

Another unduly neglected text of that same period of formulative thought and writing is Tolkien's own essay entitled "Prefatory Remarks on Prose Translation of Beowulf," which he wrote in 1939 for the (1940 issued) completely revised edition of John R. Clark Hall's Beowulf and the Finnesburg Fragment, A Translation into Modern English Prose. These "Remarks" are described by the reviser, C.L. Wrenn (long his assistant, and in 1945, his successor to the Rawlinson and Bosworth Professorship of Anglo-Saxon at the University of Oxford), as both highly insightful and of abiding significance "for they must remain as the most permanently valuable part of the book" (page vi).

While Wrenn saw the quoted details, analysis and discussion of the verse style as the key to the modern's enjoyment of the translation and, ultimately, of the original text of Beowulf, we may be able to extract from the "remarks" some other notions not without relevance to the style of Tolkien's own creative writing of those pre-war years. Our concern will be largely with the first part, "On Translation and Words" (pp. ix-xxvii), and more briefly with the second, "On Metre" (pp. xxviii-xlxxiii).

The first section is concerned with the task of obtaining a dignified prose for the translation of the poem, one of "skilled and close-wrought metre" (p. ix), in order to give readers at the end "a drink dark and bitter: a solemn funeral-ale with the taste of death" (ibid.). Tolkien, who was consulted by his Oxford teaching associate, Wrenn, over many details of the following modified "competent" translation, then refers to aspects of the original that must be retained in an appropriate prose rendering: "heroic names now faded into oblivion" (p. x); "recurring words which give important 'hints'" (ibid.); "the need for words 'bearing echoes of ancient days beyond the shadowy borders of Northern history'" (p. xi); "some words at least normally to be deemed 'already archaic and rare'" (p. xii); "the use of 'descriptive compounds... generally foreign to our present literary and linguistic habits'" (p. xiii); and "compounds whose object was compression, the force of brevity, the packing of pictorial and emotional colour" (p. xiv).

Tolkien then went on to distinguish between the tones that might be required: (i) the colloquial or "snappy" (p. xvi); (ii) the literary and traditional, occasionally archaic but "elevated, recognized as old" (p. xvii), a serious language "freed from trivial associations, and filled with the memory of good and evil" (p. xviii); and (iii) an ethical tone suggestive of being "upon the threshold of Christian chivalry" (p. xxii). The remaining sections of the essay give much attention to the retention of compounds and kennings (particularly for nouns and adjectives), stressing how modern heroic prose should try by use of compounds and/or compressed phrases to "retain the colour" and not "weaken" the texture, since every such phrase "flashes a picture before us, often the more clear and bright for its brevity, instead of unrolling it in a simile" (p. xxv). His conclusion on the Old English heroic style in implicitly Christian epic contains his tribute to the verses' "unrecapturable magic," for "profound feeling, and poignant vision, filled with beauty and mortality, are aroused by brief phrases, light touches, short-words resounding like harp-strings sharply plucked" (p. xxvii).

When we turn to The Hobbit itself, a text finally edited only two years before the writing of this essay, we find Tolkien's notions of a grand style appropriate to the epic or heroic occasion to be very close indeed to his own fictional/story-telling practice. Let us consider first the colloquial or snappy. This style in The Hobbit has several functions, in that it is the private manner of the hobbits, sometimes remarkably modern sounding and colloquial.

Here we may list, seriatim,—"smoke-rings" (14, 23), "seed-cake" (18), "flummoxed" (21, 27), "confusticate" (21, 104, 164), "clarinets" (23), "walking-sticks" (23), "the
whistle of an engine coming out of a tunnel" (27), "the game of Golf" (28), "a pocket-handkerchief" (40, 225), "policemen" (43), "bashes" (50), "a pocket-knife" (53), "larder" (54), "picnics" (66), "football" (69, 168), "the nearest post-office" (72), "meat delivered by the butcher" (121), "matches" (121), "toast" (123), "a warm bath" (123), "jack-in-the-boxes" (133), "veranda" (140), "black as a top-hat" (153), "dart-throwing" (169), "slowcoach" (192), "toss-pot" (193), "waistcoat" (240), "hide-and-seek" (246), "looking-glass" (251), "mantelpiece" (213, 281), and "tobacco-jar" (315). As this fairly exhaustive list indicates, the domestic tone or "hobbitry" does indeed die away very quickly, once Bilbo and the dwarves are far from the Shire and the plot grows more heroic and the destiny of whole nations is at stake. As others have pointed out, the manner of a nursery tale has fallen away. As usual, Lewis said it well, when, in his lecture he continued, after his phrase "we pass insensibly into the epic,"

It is as if the battle of Toad Hall had become a serious heimsök and Badger had begun to talk like Njal. Thus we lose one theme but find another (loc. cit.).


As the text reveals, the second edition shows the goblins (of George MacDonald flavour) slowly becoming orcs, as in (a) the reference to Orcrist (Goblin-cleaver) (63), (b) the orc reference (at 99) to the mountain orcs, and (c) “orcs of the worst description” (149-150). Yet the goblins are malign enough, as this sequential catalogue reveals: “the goblins” (36), “goblin-wars” (63), “goblin-drivers” (73), “goblin-cleaver” (75), “goblin-hall” (76), “goblin-chaos” (77), “goblin feet” (78), “goblin-infested” (110), or the later phrasal units: “goblin-army,” “goblin blood,” “goblin swordsmen” (all on p. 293), or: “goblins’ mustering” (299). “Wargs” are not explained in this work; they first appear on p. 112 (twice), and then are associated with the “wolf-riders” (292).


The dwarves, a passing race, are not accorded many descriptive compounds, apart from: “dwarf-kings” (204), “dwarf-ridden” (235), “dwarf-linked” (242), “dwarf-lad” (268), “dwarffish” (275), “dwarf-messengers” (290), or “dwarf-lord” (292). More interesting, not least for the curiosity of older races about them, are the various phrasal units concerning hobbits, viz.: “burrahobbit” (46, 48), “hobbit-hole” (78, 166, 219, 220, 313), “hobbit-legs” (252), “hobbit-smell” (235), or a “hobbit’s holiday” (314).

"autumn-like" (146), "water-skin" (150), "forest-floor" (151), "woodland king" (165), "forest-day" (166), "spider-webs" (167), "torch-light" (180, 252), "low-spirited" (186), "river-door" (194), "cliff-like" (203), "river-tolls" (206), "raft-men" (208), "steep-walled" (218), "grassy-floored" (218), "rock-wall" (222), "dungeon-hall" (226), "red-golden" (226), "two-handed" (228), "mountain-palace" (228), "high-walled" (230), "snail-covered" (246), "pine-torch" (247), "silver-hafted" [axe] (251), "drinking-horns" (252), "timeless" (254), "south-pointing" (254), "arrow-storm" (259), "market-pool" (259), "town-baiting" (260), "swift-flying" (265), etc.

The Beowulfian proper names or synonym names, if they are not as grand as in the epic, show well the origins and thought involved in their creation. Thus it is that "Were-worms" (29), "Mirkwood" (30, etc.), "Goblinswars" (63), "Sea-elves" (178), "Front Gate" (252), "Dragonshooter" (262), etc. reveal their bases for us. The last honorific reminds us of the class of like descriptive names/designations, sometimes boastfully self-bestowed, as in the catalogue (234): "clue-finder," "web-cutter," "Ringwinner," "Luckwearer" and "Barrelrider."

The total corpus of these compounds, hyphenated or phrasal, numbering between 700 and 1000, can be categorized in more subtle ways than those already used. Thus there are also subsets of the following kinds:

- **Journeying Terms:** "map makers" (43), "mountain-paths" (73), "meeting-place" (115), "forest-path" (146), "landing-place" (212), "river-tolls" (206), "hill-path" (254), "narrow path" (285), "dreadful pathways" (303).

- **Tree Vocabulary:** "pine roots" (109), "oak-trunk" (129), "pine-woods" (141), "forest-root" (152), "tree-trunk" (173), "tree-top" (308).

- **Bird Compounds:** "thrush-language" (239), "bird-speech" (268), "carrion-birds" (269), "bat-cloud" (292), etc.

- **Seasonal Compounding:** "autumn-like" (146), "mid-winter" (304), "Yule-tide" (304), "May-time" (308).

- **Germanic Battle Descriptions:** "battle-ground" (118), "arrow-wound" (120), "sword-blade" (166), "bow-string" (260), "spearmen" (passim), "iron-bound" (285), "vanguard" (292).

Clearly these categories could be multiplied considerably.

---

While concordances would be needed to quantify the relative contextual frequency of compounds in *The Hobbit* as against the more diffuse and long-sentence romance style of *The Lord of the Rings*, there is no question that the earlier story achieves its surprisingly powerful effect from the compact and linguistically allusive phrases/units. Tolkien had spoken of the refreshing power of such phrasing in his 1938 "On Fairy Stories," and in the 1939 written "Prefatory Remarks" he had observed of the kenning that "the compound offers a partial and often imaginative or fanciful description of a thing" (loc. cit.). He continued:

I have called this the poetic class .... But compounds of this kind are not confined to verse .... We find "kennings" in ordinary language, though they have then become trite in the process of becoming familiar. They may no longer be analysed, even when their form has not actually been obscured by wear. (Ibid.)

He went on then to deplore the "emptying of significance" (p. xxvi) that time tended to effect, but then observed that the older (epic) verse contained kennings and "a host of similar devices" —

If not fresh in the sense of being struck out then and there where we first meet them, they are fresh and alive in preserving a significance and feeling as full, or nearly as full, as when they were first devised (p. xxvi).

It is thoughts like these which animate *The Hobbit*, a text completed when Tolkien had held the chair of Anglo-Saxon for some twelve years and had also for a like time been giving the Old Norse classes for the University of Oxford.23

This concern with Old Norse poetry, and scaldic verse in particular,26 explains the largely Germanic compounding style of *The Hobbit* in many ways. In his lectures of the period 1955-57,27 Tolkien referred to the Latin Christian mold of many (Cynewulfinda) verse kennings, agreeing with the thesis28 of James Walter Rankin to this effect. (This scholar's work, stressed by Napier in Tolkien's own student days, is published as "A Study of the Kennings in Anglo-Saxon Poetry" in *The Journal of English and Germanic Philology*, Vol. VIII (1909), pp. 357-422, and Vol. X (1910), pp. 49-84.) The central images of Old English verse — those of God as King, of heaven as a city, the devil as a monstrous beast, or the cross as a sign of victory — were inappropriate in the folk style of the legendary tale, whose tone is secular and concerned with adventure and quest. Thus it is that so much of the poetry's moral and religious compounding was unsuitable for the fairy-story. The scaldic verse, so battle focussed, or the early heroism of the Kings' sagas in the *Heimskringla* were much more appropriate places to search for compounds and to afford the thought associations suitable for the heroic nature of the latter parts of Bilbo's story.

In his 1939 essay, at several points, Tolkien is to be found lamenting the non-survival into *The Oxford English Dictionary* of meaningful old compounds like: "boat-guard," "neck-ring" or "hoard(ed)-wealth" (pp. xxiv-v), observing sadly that: "Our language has not lost, though it has much limited the compounding habit." Quite clearly he intended to retain — and extend — "the compounding habit." His own contributions to the Dictionary have been discussed in detail elsewhere,29 but Tolkien's prose-style had yielded to *The Oxford English Dictionary* by 1976 (in Vols. I and II), from A-N: "barrow-wight," "barrow-wightish," "bee-hunter," "beggar-bread," "bone-white," "dwarf-man," the ordinary "elf-compounds" given above,

One assumes therefore, that the readers for the Supplement and the editor R.W. Burchfield, were not particularly concerned to record all Tolkien's compounds by any means. Indeed, the A-N volumes' list given above only gives "elf-friend," "Elven King" and "hobbit" from The Hobbit, although it does contain, from before 1940 writings from Tolkien: "Blimp" (from "blist" + "lump") (1927); "eyrie" (The Hobbit, p. 115); and "half," or "half-line" (1939). Yet the full list given in Ipotesi (q.v.) shows a range of compounds that may be described as being concerned with: folkloristic concepts — as in "barrow-wight," "bee-hunter," etc.; the vocabulary of war — "knife-work," "night-eye"; Romantic Georgian poetic style, as in the diction of de la Mare and Bridges — "elf-" compounds, "elven-," "eyrie," etc.; use of northern terms (many still in dialect in the late 19th century), e.g. "hard-edge," "hill-brow," "long-shanks," "maybe" and coined new nonsense-like words, e.g. "halfling," "hobbit." Yet it is not just in The Lord of the Rings that Tolkien displays the habit of inveterate compounding. While most readers recall "herb-lore" or "mithril-mail," they seem to have missed, as did The Oxford English Dictionary readers, the enormous range of compounds already to be found in The Hobbit.

While there is no space here to list the subtle but differing characteristics of the prose of The Lord of the Rings — such as Biblical echoes, the (Spenserian) tendency to ornament the stately, or numerous impersonal constructions, and a syntax based on an accumulation of main clauses — The Hobbit is more austere, with deliberate (Germanic sourced) archaisms, distinctive compound elements/ epithets, and a vocabulary which is closest to Tolkien's contributions to Songs for the Philologists (1936). These last poems include pieces on elves, trolls, the springing of flowers in a new year, the activity of the carrion crow and the elegy "Ofre widdane Garsecg" ("Across the broad [and surrounding] Ocean").

Somewhere about the same time Tolkien had made his translation of Sir Gawain and the Green Knight, — noting approvingly that the author's "style, his vocabulary, were in many respects off the track of inevitable development, ... dialectical, ... including in its tradition a number of special ... words, never used in ordinary talk or prose ... courtly, wise, and well bred" (introduction, pp. 13-14). In 1929, he had referred, with much approval, to a medieval prose style used in the West Midlands as having traditions and some acquaintance with books and the pen ... [a] language at once self-consistent and markedly individual ... a form of English whose development from an antecedent Old English type was relatively undisturbed. (Essays and Studies, XIV, pp. 106-107)

As will be abundantly clear, The Hobbit was a product of Tolkien's more antiquarian period, having a physical setting with the emptiness of the Dark Ages, related in a manner close to oral literature, with a remarkable feel for continental Germanic landscape markers, such as hills, fords, hedges and passes. As well it has the topographic, almost map-making mode to be found in such Icelandic texts of harsh terrain traversal as Hrafnkels Saga Freysgotha.

While the stock epithet is to be found too often in the hobbits' poetry — due perhaps to hobbit innocence and simplicity — and The Lord of the Rings as open to charges of escapism, privatism and self-indulgence, Tolkien was always most successful with his evocation of barbaric times, gaunt landscapes and combats such as the Battle of the Five Armies. When he was re-creating and enfleshing Dark Age tales, rounding out gaps in its (surviving) folklore, he was the most confident, consistent and heroic in both tone and style. As Shippey would observe more recently, Tolkien was responding to the "charm of the archaic world of the North," and so he "wanted to tell a story about it simply, one feels, because there were hardly any complete ones left." Such was his aim, and inventive compounding of the Germanic sort was the manner best calculated to achieve this objective. Further, an analysis of the type attempted in this article makes it very clear that Tolkien's story came from pivotal words, enigmatic names, descriptions and an urge to fill complex omissions in the inherited texts. Quite simply, words were the inspiration, words were the vehicle, and words, compounded for preference, gave the qualities which C.S. Lewis was so quick to identify in the later parts of a seeming tale for children. The editors of The Oxford English Dictionary (K, p. 673), under "kenning" 5 and 6, had given two particular senses of the word:

5b. A recognizable portion; just enough to be perceived. [Scandinavian and northern dialect.]

6. One of the periphrastic expressions used instead of the simple name of the thing, characteristic of Old Teutonic, and especially Old Norse, poetry.

They then gave an English definition from 1889: "A characteristic ornament of Old English, as well as early Teutonic poetry, are the kennings." We might add that they are also the key stylistic device of Tolkien's most heroic prose.

Notes
1. It was entitled "On Stories" and first appeared in Essays Presented to Charles Williams. (Oxford U.P. 1947.)
2. Page vii of the Preface to Of Other Worlds: Essays and Short Stories by C.S. Lewis, edited by Walter Hooper. New York: Harcourt, Brace and
30. This adverb, ubiquitous in Tolkien, has nothing to do with American
28. Stated in Conclusion to his analysis,
27. Attended by the present writer. Tolkien was particularly excited by
26. Lectured regularly by Tolkien in the period 1926-1940 (according to
32. In
29. See J.S. Ryan, “Tolkien’s Language and Style,” in
25. Due to funding problems within the Faculties of English and of
24. I.e. “original” with the poet whose work we are reading.
23. See the later part of Chapter XII of J.S. Ryan,
22. This is very reminiscent of the anpaS in Beowulf.
21. This is often obscured in the case of Old English for the modern reader,
19. This is another of the Greek type pastoral phrases, reminiscent of
18. Tolkien is not consistent in his use of hyphens from one edition to
16. This word is descriptive of both Beom and the wargs (cp. wolf allies
15. Worm is the old Germanic word for ‘dragon,’ so called from p. 125.
14. It is not exhaustive.
13. This term and the descriptions of the people’s lifestyle suggest the
12. This is an exact translation of various terms in ancient Greek to denote
11. The most venerable associations of the name, Mirkwood, suggest that
10. The references are to the Icelandic Saga and heroic tragedy, The
8. While not in the translation of Beowulf, this strand is to be found in
7. These are, as was stated above, references to the pages of the second
6. This section contains: “spider-colony” (169); “spider-rope” (171); “spider-string” (172); “spider-poison” (172); and “spider-threads” (175). This is often obscured in the case of Old English for the modern reader, unfamiliar with the elements of compound names like: Orneaas; Wederar; or Wedermearc. This is very reminiscent of the anpaS in Beowulf. See the later part of Chapter XII of J.S. Ryan, Tolkien: Cult or Culture? Armondale, New South Wales, Australia: Univer. of New England, 1969. 24. I.e. “original” with the poet whose work we are reading. 25. Due to funding problems within the Faculties of English and of Modern Languages, Tolkien was the effective Professor of Old Norse for nearly 20 years. This work exposed him to even more texts filled with kennings. 26. Lectured regularly by Tolkien in the period 1926-1940 (according to lecture lists in the Oxford University Gazette). 27. Attended by the present writer. Tolkien was particularly excited by ancient Germanic pagan battle overtones which he discerned behind the text of the Old English Exodus. 28. Stated in Conclusion to his analysis, The Journal of English and Germanic Philology, Vol. X (1910), pp. 83-84. 29. See J.S. Ryan, “Tolkien’s Language and Style,” in Ipotesi (Genoa), December 1978. 30. This adverb, ubiquitous in Tolkien, has nothing to do with American usage, but comes from Northern England. (See Supplement to The Oxford English Dictionary II, p. 866.) 31. Published, posthumously, in 1975. 32. In Essays and Studies Presented to the English Association, Vol. XIV, p. 106.