
Fall 10-15-1984

Early Review of Books by J.R.R. Tolkien

George H. Thompson

Follow this and additional works at: <https://dc.swosu.edu/mythlore>



Part of the [Children's and Young Adult Literature Commons](#)

Recommended Citation

Thompson, George H. (1984) "Early Review of Books by J.R.R. Tolkien," *Mythlore: A Journal of J.R.R. Tolkien, C.S. Lewis, Charles Williams, and Mythopoeic Literature*: Vol. 11: No. 2, Article 8.
Available at: <https://dc.swosu.edu/mythlore/vol11/iss2/8>

This Article is brought to you for free and open access by the Mythopoeic Society at SWOSU Digital Commons. It has been accepted for inclusion in Mythlore: A Journal of J.R.R. Tolkien, C.S. Lewis, Charles Williams, and Mythopoeic Literature by an authorized editor of SWOSU Digital Commons. An ADA compliant document is available upon request. For more information, please contact phillip.fitzsimmons@swosu.edu.

To join the Mythopoeic Society go to:
<http://www.mythsoc.org/join.htm>



Online Summer Seminar 2023

August 5-6, 2023: Fantasy Goes to Hell: Depictions of Hell in Modern Fantasy Texts

<https://mythsoc.org/oms/oms-2023.htm>



Early Review of Books by J.R.R. Tolkien

Early Review of Books by J.R.R. Tolkien

Compiled by George H. Thompson

Introductory Note. The following annotated checklist of reviews was essentially completed by 1973. However, its thirty-one reviews of *The Hobbit* -- to use that book as an example -- are more than the nineteen which are listed eight years later in *Tolkien Criticism: An Annotated Checklist, Revised Edition*, compiled by Richard C. West (The Kent State University Press, 1981), p. 144. Fourteen of West's items are annotated in the second section of his volume; five are not. All of Professor Thomson's items receive brief annotations. West lists four items which Thomson does not, all later than 1972; Thomson (at the University of Ottawa) lists sixteen which West does not; they have fifteen items in common.

Something of the same relationship exists between Professor Thomson's work and the most recent bibliography, *En Tolkienbibliografi 1911-1980: Verk av och om J.R.R. Tolkien*, compiled by Åke Jönsson (Högskolan i Borås, 1983), pp. 83-84. The first two sections of reviews of *The Hobbit* contain twenty-one reviews, of which seventeen appear in Thomson's list. (The third section of *Hobbit*, fifteen in number, are too late for Thomson's work; and the seventeen Swedish reviews of the Sweden translation, *Bilbo*, p. 105, are not within Thomson's area.) Thomson has thirteen reviews which Jönsson does not; also Jönsson's are not annotated. As Jönsson notes in the English version of his "Preface" (p. xi), he has used various indices for his listings; thus he does not have authors for those found in the *Book Review Index* (G&A ed. is by Harry L. Binns; G&A., by Mary Stocks; G&A.m. by William Rose Benét; further, G&A.k. attributed to Mary Lambertson, is by May Lambertson Becker).

Obviously, each of these works has valuable additions to the others. For this reason, it seems appropriate to present Professor Thomson's work in place of temporarily discontinued "An Inklings Bibliography." His organization is this:

- I. The Hobbit
- II. Farmer Giles of Ham
- III. The Fellowship of the Ring
- IV. The Two Towers
- V. The Return of the King
- VI. The Lord of the Rings
- VII. The Adventures of Tom Bombadil
- VIII. Tree and Leaf
- IX. The Tolkien Reader
- X. The Road Goes Ever On
- XI. Smith of Wootton Major

"An Inklings Bibliography" should re-appear in about a year.

--Joe R. Christopher

The Hobbit

- | | |
|------|---|
| H'37 | London: AKU, Sept. 1937 |
| H'38 | Boston: HM, 1938 |
| H'51 | 2nd ed. London: AKU, 1951 |
| H'58 | 2nd ed. Boston: HM, 1958 |
| H'61 | Paper. Harmondsworth: Penguin Books, 1961 |
| H'65 | Paper. New York: BB, 16 Aug. 1965 |
| | Rev. ed., 1966 |

- | | |
|-------|-----------------------------------|
| H'66E | 3rd ed. London: AKU, 30 June 1966 |
| H'66P | Paper. London: AKU, 30 June 1966 |
| H'66A | 3rd ed. Boston: HM, 1966 |

Becker, May L. "Books for Young People." *New York Herald Tribune Books*, 20 Feb. 1938, p. 7. [A solid review, praising the book's richness of detail and texture, its sharply defined tribes of characters, and its true fairy-tale quality which enables children to feel safe and secure on the side of good.] + H '38

Benet, William Rose. "The Children's Bookshop." *Saturday Review of Literature* 17 (2 Apr. 1938), 28. [A very favorable mention.] + H '38

Binns, Harry L. "Juveniles, 1938." *Commonweal* 29 (2 Dec. 1938), 154-155. [H is included among 10 recommended books.] + H '38

The Booklist 34 (15 Apr. 1938), 304. [A brief recommendation. "The well-sustained plot maintains its interest in spite of its length. . ."] + H '38

"Children's Books of 1938." *New York Libraries* (Univ. of the State of New York, Albany) 16 (Aug. 1939), 246-251. [H is listed, with a brief description: "This is a refreshingly inventive, humorous and well-written fairy tale. . ." (p. 249)] + H '38

Crouch, Marcus S. "Another Don in Wonderland." *Junior Bookshelf* 14 (March 1950), 50-53. [Tolkien's fantasy is an interpretation of reality, not an escape. It is "profoundly imaginative and yet firmly based on truth." There are no digressions and the wholeshow great architectural skill. The book is a "Northern epic" in the form of a quest. It will be read in the twenty-first century.] + H '37

Eaton, Anne T. *Horn Book Magazine* 14 (March-April 1938), 94-96. [A very favorable review of moderate length, with a full-page illustration of "The Hill: Hobbiton across the Water." Tolkien's magical countries, like William Morris' are unmistakably a part of England and of Fairyland at the same time. . . the book has the rare quality of style. It is written with a quiet humor and the logical detail in which children take delight." Recommended for all ages.] + H '38

Eaton, Anne T. "The New Books for Younger Readers." *New York Times Book Review*, 13 March 1938, p. 12. [H was -- like "Alice" -- written for children that the author knew. And for children it is "a glorious account of a magnificent adventure, filled with suspense and seasoned with a quiet humor that is irresistible." Bilbo has an engaging and consistent personality, the different types of beings -- dwarves, goblins, etc. -- are clearly distinguished, the maps are admirable, the songs real poetry, and the illustrations by Tolkien a perfect accompaniment to the text.] + H '38

Glasgow Herald, 30 Nov. 1961, p. 3. [After 25 years H "looks better than ever." The reader is utterly gripped. The best thing in the whole book is the "meeting with Gollum, that beautifully sinister, grotesque, funny bad character." H is more alive than

LotR: "everything is lighter, swifter, crisper, more compact; and we never have the feeling . . . that, in Professor Tolkien's own phrase, 'it is like old gentlemen [even Professors of Philology] gone cracked and playing at being boys.'" Children and adults "meet on the common ground of fantasy, and both may equally enjoy themselves there." + H '61

H., R. The Scouter (Boy Scouts' Assoc., England), Aug. 1966, p. 231. [Brief and enthusiastic: "interesting in its own right, it lights up the grandeur and excitement that are to come." LotR is "one of the great works of creative imagination of our time."] + H '38

Hughes, Richard. "Books for Pre-Adults". New Statesmen and Nation 14 (4 Dec. 1937), 944, 946. [Tolkien is so saturated in Nordic mythology that, rather than serving it up second-hand, he contributes to it at first hand: "and thus his wholly original story of adventure among goblins, elves and dragons, instead of being a *tour-de-force*, a separate creation of his own, gives rather the impression of a well-informed glimpse into the life of a wide other-world. . ."] + H '37

Lucas, Mary R. "Recommended Children's Books". Library Journal 63 (1 May 1938), 385. [To the adult, the Hobbit is a smug middle-class individual who is thrust into adventure and forced to use his brain. To the child, he is an interesting small person. The adventures are too numerous. The book will be liked best by children whose imagination is alert. This fairly brief review offers qualified approval.] + H '38

Moore, Anne C. "The Three Owls' Notebook". Horn Book Magazine 14 (March-April 1938), 92. [Not actually a review, but a brief perceptive comment to the effect that H is rooted in Beowulf and Saxon lore, and is not like Alice.] + H '38

Moore, Anne C. "The Three Owls' Notebook". Horn Book Magazine 14 (May-June 1938), 174. [Another favorable comment on H which has "recently been awarded the prize at the Spring Festival of Children's Books."] + H '38

"A New Look at Old Books". Young Reader's Review 1 (Dec. 1964), 12. [A substantial review. Islandia, The Worm Ouroboros, The Lord of the Rings, and The Faerie Queene demand acceptance of a second reality or world at the adult level; Alice in Wonderland, the Narnia books and The Hobbit at the child's level. In H Tolkien has the deft touch essential to fantasy. He has an "uncanny ability" to describe and name people and places, his characters are complex and believable. In most episodes he achieves a "strange mixture of humor and brooding evil." This evil becomes full-blown in LotR.] + H '51

"Oin and Gloin and Hobbits and Habits". The Daily Mail (London), 30 June 1966, p. 10. ["This is a marvelous fantasy-adventure." Today it starts a new career in paperback, having gone through 16 impressions in 28 years as a hardback. Brief.] + H '66P

Owens, Olga. "Bookstall Gossip". Boston Evening Transcript, 28 May 1938, Part III, p. 2. [Not a review, but a brief expression of pleasure that H has won the Herald Tribune prize for 1938.] + H '38

P., A. "How 'the Ring' Began". Oxford Times, 8 July

1966, p. 29. [H is purely a children's book, a first-rate one, and a worthy forerunner of LotR. The reviewer hopes it is true that is has joined the immortals, Alice, etc.] + H '66P

Potter, Dennis. "A Dream that is True". New Society 7 (30 June 1966), 31. ["This is a very potent book... It is a labyrinth of dreams, wondrously evocative, menacingly twisted and mysteriously impregnable... The dream is so complete that it punctures the eyelids." But the source of all this? Religion, Oxford, political perversity, snobbery. A very lively review.] + H '66P

Scott-Clark, Joe. "Paperback Books". The Queen (London) 426 (22 June 1966), 15. [Bilbo "takes his place in the ranks of the immortals..." "The Hobbit is almost part of a morality cycle." Brief.] + H '66P

Shaw, Greg. "The Hobbit". Entmoot No. 2 (1965), [p. 2]. [Reviewing the Ballantine paperback, Shaw is concerned exclusively with cover, pagination, format: "an attractive and tastefully done book."] + H '65

"Shorter Notices". Catholic World 147 (July 1938), 507. [A brief laudatory description.] + H '38

Stocks, Mary. "Goblins and Others". Manchester Guardian, Supp., 3 Dec. 1937, p. x. [A brief and generally favorable indication of the nature of the story. The illustration of Bag-end is reproduced.] + H '37

Strong, L.A.G. "Children's Books / The Pick of the Bunch". Spectator No. 5710 (3 Dec. 1937), p. 1024. ["The Hobbit should become a classic." Very brief.] + H '37

"The Two Prize-Winning Books, Spring, 1938". New York Herald Tribune Books, 1 May 1938, p. 7-8. [May L. Becker's review of H from 20 Feb. 1938 is reprinted (p. 7). Under the heading "John R. Tunis and John R.R. Tolkien" there is a brief account of Tolkien, including the statement that his U.S. publishers do not have a photo (p. 8).] + H '38

West, Dorothy H. and Shor, Rachel, eds. Children's Catalog. 11th ed. New York: H.W. Wilson, 1966, p. 402. [H is listed. It is described in two brief quotations from reviews in Huntington's Children's Catalog (not located) and New York Libraries 16 (1939). The 10th ed. 1961, quoted Anne C. Moore, Horn Book Magazine 14 (1938)] o H '58

Whitney, Mary A. "The Indefatigable Baggins". Christian Science Monitor, 31 March 1938, p. 13. [A moderately brief, very favorable review.] + H '38

Wisconsin Library Bulletin 34 (May 1938), 114. [A brief notice.] + H '38

"A World for Children". Times Literary Supplement, 2 Oct. 1937, p. 714. [A very laudatory review. "Though all is marvelous, nothing is arbitrary ..." It is probably a classic.] + H '37

See also reviews of LotR '56 by Straight, of LotR '65 and '67 by Brady, Dolbier, Fuller, Hentoff, Hodgatt (2), Martin, Prinz, Ramacitti, Ready, Smith, Wimsatt, and of SWM by Head.

Farmer Giles of Ham

FGH '49 London: A&U, Sept. 1949
FGH '50 Boston: HM, 1950

Adams, Clara. Library Journal 75 (1 Dec. 1950), 2084. [A brief recommendation.] + FGH '50

"Also of Interest". Horn Book Magazine 42 (Feb. 1966), 77. [FGH is mentioned.] + FGH '50

The Booklist 47 (15 Jan. 1951), 192. [A brief descriptive comment.] + FGH '50

Brady, Charles A. "Mock Dragon's and Real Dragon's Tail". Library Bulletin (Western N.Y. Catholic Librarians Conference) 10 (Dec. 1950), 1, 4, 5, 9. [Most of this review is about books by C.S. Lewis and George MacDonald. FGH is seen in the tradition of the whimsical. "It has about it an assimilated saga pithiness and a folk raciness that make it an immensely fetching narrative indeed." (p. 5). He quotes a letter from Lewis about H and LotR (p. 9).] + FGH '50

Brady, Charles A. "Works of Playfully Serious Minds". Buffalo Evening News, 9 Dec. 1950, Magazine Section, p. 8. [The brief comments in this review are repeated with some elaboration in the review of FGH in Renascence (1951).] + FGH '50

Brady, Charles A. Renascence 3 (Spring 1951), 191-195. [Most of the review is about C.S. Lewis. FGH is seen in the tradition of the whimsical (193-194). He quotes a letter from Lewis about H and LotR. Much of this review is repeated from Library Bulletin (1950).] + FGH '50

"Books for Children". Christian World (London), 15 Dec. 1949, p. 7. [A very brief notice.] + FGH '49

"Children's Books". Irish Times (Dublin), 3 Dec. 1949, p. 8. [A brief review: "a highly original book" that will be enjoyed in both the nursery and the drawing room.] + FGH '49

Crouch, Marcus S. Junior Bookshelf 14 (Jan. 1950), 14-15. [This is a light-weight book. The urbane mannered style suggests...that the book is not intended primarily for children." "It is a delightful book, exquisitely written and full of charming touches of humour..." Fairly brief.] + FGH '49

D., M.G. "An Unusual Fairy Tale". Natal Witness, 29 June 1950, p. 7. [This book is written in the straightforward and dignified manner of a biography, with historical allusions and verifications from a time before history as we know it." It will be enjoyed by both grown-ups and children.] + FGH '49

Dunn, Mary. "Children's Bookshelf-IV". Sunday Times, 11 Dec. 1949, p. 3. [Very brief: "a fabulous tale...full of a scholar's wit...will be appreciated by discriminating children of all ages."] + FGH '49

Eaton, Anne T. "Folk Tale and Fantasy". Christian Science Monitor, 13 Nov. 1950, p. 11. [A brief recommendation.] + FGH '50

Etheldreda, Sister M. "Children's Books". Catholic Library World 37 (Feb. 1966), 380. [A very brief evaluation.] + FGH '50

"Folklore and Fantasy". Saturday Review of Literature

33 (11 Nov. 1950), 41. [Brief. "It is a joy to read."] + FGH '50

Freeman, Gwendolen. "Children's Books". Spectator No. 6334 (18 Nov. 1949), pp. 716, 718. [Brief. "It is a satire on the chivalric idea."] + FGH '49

Freeman, Gwendolen. "Books for Christmas". The Nursery World, 1 Dec. 1949, pp. 1639-1641. [An experiment which does not quite come off and which might be more enjoyed by grown-ups. The fun "is not quite sharp enough. You read on expecting a bang at the end, and there is no bang."] + FGH '49

"The Good Old Days, in Various Moods". New York Herald Tribune Book Review, 12 Nov. 1950, p. 14. [Tolkien's story is discussed as a spoof of old legends which may yet have something to say about the modern need for good sense and courage. "Merely as a bit of fun, his little tale is a minor masterpiece."] + FGH '50

H., B.E. "For the Very Young". British Weekly 127 (24 Nov. 1949), p. 4. [A brief account, describing the book as a "sustained enchantment." Those who remember Tolkien's lectures on philology will recognize his "very special wit."] + FGH '49

H., P.H. "Seven to Eleven". School Library Review and Educational Record (became School Librarian) 5 (15 July 1950), 137. ["The author may be forgiven his sly digs at pomp and circumstance meant for adult ears, because of the imaginative quality and rare humour of the story." Brief] + FGH '49

"High and Far Off Times". Times Literary Supplement: Children's Book Section, 21 Oct. 1949, p. iv. [The plot is summarized and the sly humor touched upon. "The digs at human and giant nature seem less satisfying than the plain fee-fi-fo-fum that pleased our natural ruthlessness at the age of six." The illustrations by Pauline Baynes are in the manner of the Luttrell Psalter.] + FGH '49

Jackson, Joseph H. San Francisco Chronicle, 4 Oct. 1950, p. 22. [Not seen.] FGH '50

Jordan, Alice M. "Summer Booklist". Horn Book Magazine 26 (July-Aug. 1950), 287, 289. [A brief favorable mention.] + FGH '50

K[nolauch], M[ary] B. "Before King Arthur". Chicago Sunday Tribune: Magazine of Books, 12 Nov. 1950, p. 17. [A brief, entertaining plot summary is followed by this judgment "Mock serious, written in brilliant style, this tale...is ideal for reading aloud."] + FGH '50

Lask, Thomas. "Repeat Performance". New York Times Book Review, 7 Nov. 1965, p. 60. [A brief mention among a lot of books.] + FGH '50

"Legends and Tales". The Friend (London) 107 (2 Dec. 1949), 983. [In a group of short comments, FGH receives a brief favorable mention.] + FGH '49

Lindsay, Stephen. "Fantasy". Time and Tide: Children's Christmas Number, 30 (3 Dec. 1949), p. iii. [A short review by a nine-year-old who likes the book.] + FGH '49

R., J.B. "Children's Books". The Northern Whig and Belfast Post, 17 Dec. 1949, p. 4. [A brief review praising the work as "full of imagination, vigour, and

humour."] +

FGH '49

S. S. "Children's Books." Christian Science Monitor, 14 Apr. 1966, p. ii. [A brief notice.] +
FGH '50

"Short Notices." Oxford Magazine 68 (26 Jan. 1950), 267. [A brief mention.] + FGH '49

Smith, Irene. "The People's Hero." New York Times Book Review, 26 Nov. 1950, p. 50. [A short friendly description of the book.] + FGH '50

"Something New in Fairy Stories." Birmingham Weekly Post (Eng.), 28 Oct. 1949, p. 16. [A fairy story of an unusual kind....] with an appeal not confined to children. Brief.] + FGH '49

W., V. "Farmer Giles." Illustrated Weekly of India, 5 Feb. 1950, p. 47. [A short review which neatly conveys the tone of the story and refers to it as the creation "of a lively and rare imagination and a gifted teller of tales."] + FGH '49

Ward, Fredk. R. "Fredk. R. Ward Reviews More New Books." Guernsey Star, 19 July 1950, p. 2. [Not seen.] FGH '49

Young, Eric. "So Easy to Believe in Dragons." Sheffield Telegraph, 29 Oct. 1949, p. 2. [This delightful book is intended for grown-ups as much as for children....] This brief and highly favorable review also praises the style.] + FGH '49

See also review of SWM by Slavin.

The Fellowship of the Ring

FR '54E London: AMU, 29 July 1954
FR '54A Boston: HM, 1954

Auden, W.H. "The Hero is a Hobbit." New York Times Book Review, 31 Oct. 1954, p. 37. [The Book is an Heroic Quest. Though imaginary "it nevertheless holds up the mirror to the only nature we know, our own...."] + FR '54A

Auden, W.H. "A World Imaginary, but Real." Encounter 3 (Nov. 1954), 59-60, 62. [A substantial and enthusiastic review praising the exciting quest and the brilliant naming of the characters. "In a heroic romance where the situations are those of elemental crisis" the characters are limited to a few archetypes. JRRT gives them "an uncommon depth and solidity" by providing them with a past that belongs to the group. The story "seems wholly relevant to the realities of our concrete historical existence" but it is dangerous to "draw too literal a parallel between it and our present historical situation."] + FR '54E

Blair, H.A. "Myth or Legend." Church Quarterly Review (London) 156 (Jan.-March 1955), 121-122. [The work appeals to unconscious archetypes, it tells poetic truth. "This is a religious book, pre-Christian, its theology....the original dualism of Zarathustra, in which the only true reality is in goodness and light. But there are Christian echoes and emphasis: baptism (p. 155), self-commitment (p. 178), exodus (p. 227), paradise (pp. 243, 303), absolution (p. 372), evil is not to be used for good ends....; false gnosis cannot save (p. 272 ff.), indeed it causes the fall (p. 255). The Ring is the desire to escape into fantasy and nothingness; in its power the Nothings are seen -- the things which are

not, because they are not in the Mind of God except as rejected possibilities."] + FR '54E

The Booklist 51 (1 Jan. 1955), 204. [Brief summary of the plot, noting the work is "expressly addressed to adults."] o FR '54A

Boucher, Anthony. "Recommended Reading: The Best Science-Fantasy Books of 1954." Fantasy and Science Fiction 8 (March 1955), 70-73. [Among fantasy novels FR is recommended.] + FR '54A

Boucher, Anthony. "Recommended Reading." Fantasy and Science Fiction 8 (Apr. 1955), 82. [A work of pure fantasy, in superb prose, replete with both adventure and humor. He thinks Eddison's characterization has more depth than Tolkien's, to judge by this first volume.] + FR '54A

Brady, Charles A. "At Quite Proper Time for Fantasy, Two Myth-Makers Fill Breach." Buffalo Evening News, 31 Dec. 1954, Section II, p. 6. [He speaks of "that Oxford Fellowship of the Ring," Williams, Lewis, and Tolkien, and quotes Lewis' letter of 1944 about LotR in MS. Tolkien has "an uncanny empathy with trolls and dwarves. His hobbits bear Saxon names. His elves -- who are of heroic stature like the riders of the Sidhe -- speak pure Celtic."] + FR '54A

"Brief Notes, Fiction." The New Yorker 30 (13 Nov. 1954), 202-203. [Brief. "This whimsical and sententious fairy story...."] - FR '54A

C., A.S. "A Swelling Chord." Irish Times (Dublin), 21 Aug. 1954, p. 6. [There is nothing on our bookshelves quite to match this work of boundless imagination....] The reader will find "delight and child-like wonder in an adventure so simple in appearance, so heroic in imagination." "When he has finished this trilogy, J.R.R. Tolkien perhaps will have written one of the great books of this century."] + FR '54E

Cherryman, A.E. "Myth-maker." Truth (London) 154 (6 Aug. 1954), 988. [After ridiculing the dust-jacket quote from C.S. Lewis, the reviewer goes on to marvel at Tolkien's having invented a whole new mythology: "...it seems almost as though he has added something, not only to the world's literature, but to its history." The book is not allegory but points simple morals of honor and courage and self-sacrifice. "It is written in a prose of majestic and delicate beauty...."] + FR '54E

Churchill, R.C. "New Novels." Birmingham Post (Eng.), 10 Aug. 1954, p. 3. [The reviewer closed "this Hobbitiad with a sigh of puzzled relief." "It is a strange affair, as must be a sort of epic in prose which invents its own mythology." Brief.] + FR '54E

Conklin, Groff. "Galaxy's 5 Star Shelf." Galaxy Science Fiction 10 (May 1955), 115. ["...rich, flavorsome, exhaustively detailed and almost too leisurely...."] Brief.] + FR '54A

D., H.M. "New World." The Western Mail (Cardiff), 25 Aug. 1954, p. 3. [A brief notice describing FR as a mythological epic. "Professor Tolkien has created an entirely new mythology. His world of Hobbits ... though possessing affinities with the world of men, is really unique, a superb gesture of a rich imagination."] + FR '54E

D., P. Punch 227 (8 Sept. 1954), 325. [An allegory on the grand scale but "not with Spenser's tiresome complexity." The bits about the hobbits are best. "...I can think of nothing in the book to account for the fact that I find the whole thing absolutely fascinating, despite some of the most infuriating fine writing." Brief.] + FR '54E

Daweddit, Glendy. "Three Novels of Distinction". Washington Post and Times Herald, 14 Nov. 1954, p. B6. [Brief. "A novel of merit but specialized appeal....it is unquestionably the definitive work on Hobbits." + FR '54A

de Camp, L. Sprague. "Book Reviews". Science Fiction Quarterly 3 (Aug. 1955), 36-40. [A kind of survey of major fantasy fiction, ending with FR (pp. 39-40). "This is a big, leisurely, colorful, poetical, sorrowful, adventuresome romance...." The hobbits are "a cross between an English white-collar worker and a rabbit." The characterization is too sweet for the reviewer's drier taste.] + FR '54A

Derrick, Christopher. "Talking of Dragons". Tablet (London) 204 (11 Sept. 1954), 250. [Science in science fiction has mainly been used as a disguise for the imaginary and improbably. But lately the mythical has been treated without disguise. LotR belongs here. It is heroic romance. Tolkien shows amazing fertility in creating his world and almost succeeds in devising an elevated diction. "...one of the most arresting and readable stories of our time." + FR '54E

Dolbier, Maurice. "The Ring of Power and the Shadow of Evil". Providence Sunday Journal, 28 Nov. 1954, Section 6, p. 8. [A sympathetic and descriptive review. "Brilliant in its telling as it is broad in scope, Mr. Tolkien's romance never slackens in pace nor weakens in style." The work is relevant because we "have come into possession of the Great Ring of Power." + FR '54A

"An Essay in Romance". Christian World (London), 7 Oct. 1954, p. 4. [Very brief. There is too much fantasy but the technique and writing are praise-worthy.] + FR '54E

"Fable for To-day". Church Times (London), 10 Oct. 1954, p. 4. [This very favorable review is mainly summary. The book is "heroic romance" for our own time. "A new world, rich and astonishingly coherent, unfolds with the story." "This is a deeply, though never overtly, Christian book...." It is the product of "an entirely Christian imagination." + FR '54E

"A Fairy Tale". The Times of India (Bombay), 27 Feb. 1955, p. 6. [A favorable summary of the book. "The magic ring...quite clearly represents nuclear power." "The reviewer can find no adequate way to praise this beautiful and grand book." + FR '54E

To Be Continued

Our Speaker Tonight

I fled into a looking glass
Because I could not stand my face,
And swam in molten silver there
And flashed like fire from place to place,
Until I met a girl of gold
Who smiled at me and ran away,
And now I tramp from place to place
And talk of her to you for pay,
— Gene Wolfe

Continued from page 55

room enough, of course, for both the Elvish and British peoples on the island. So inevitably Tol Eressea was removed to the distant West, while Britain remained near Europe.



Mythopoeic Fantasy Award 1985

The Council of Stewards would like to thank last year's selection committee, and to announce that members of the Society who would like to nominate books for the 1984 Mythopoeic Fantasy Award or who wish to serve on the committee please write to Christine Lowentroutrout, 115 5th St. #2, Seal Beach, CA 90740 by February 20, 1984. A member can nominate up to five books, and does not have to serve on the selection committee in order to make nominations. Committee members must be willing to read all five of the finalists.

Nominations received by February 20 will be compiled and returned to committee members by March 1. Committee members are then requested to select five books from the nomination list and return them to Christine by May 10th. The five books with the most votes will be the finalists, a winner from which will be returned to Christine by July 15. The four runners-up will be awarded Honorable Mentions, and the winner will be announced at Mythcon 16 in Chicago.

Volunteers for the selection committee who wish to have their names included on the list to be distributed to the committee must indicate willingness when they volunteer. Thank you!



Benefactors

Benefactors support the improvement and outreach of MYTHLORE by making donations beyond the price of subscription. For this much appreciated support they are listed for four issues. You are encouraged to become a Benefactor by writing the Editor, Glen GoodKnight (see page 2).

Carole Albright
Lloyd Alexander
Stanley & Angelee Anderson
Marion Zimmer Bradley
Paula DiSante
David Dougham
Grace E. Funk
Robert A. Hall, Jr.
John K. Jackomin III
Mark Leiterman
Alison S. Lewis
Edna Montemayor
Patricia Muller
Richard Nemesvari
Mark Olsen
Anne Osborn
Mary McDermott Shideler
Mary Stolzenback
Marion VanLoo
Wendell Wagner, Jr.

Littleton, CO
Drexel Hill, PA
Huntington Beach, CA
Berkeley, CA
Gross Point Woods, MI
Surrey, England
Lumby, B.C., Canada
Ithaca, NY
Nyack, NY
Morris, IL
Hayward, CA
Chicago, IL
Denver, CO
Kingston, Ont., Canada
Watham, MA
Riverside, CA
Boulder, CO
Vienna, VA
Horton, MI
Laurel, MD