An Inklings Bibliography (48)

Joe R. Christopher
Wayne G. Hammond
Mythcon 51: A VIRTUAL “HALFLING” MYTHCON
July 31 - August 1, 2021 (Saturday and Sunday)
http://www.mythsoc.org/mythcon/mythcon-51.htm

Mythcon 52: The Mythic, the Fantastic, and the Alien
Albuquerque, New Mexico, July 29 - August 1, 2022
http://www.mythsoc.org/mythcon/mythcon-52.htm

Abstract
Entries 42–59 in this series are written by Hammond (Tolkien material) and Christopher (Lewis and other material). See Hammond, Wayne G., for one later entry in this series.
Authors and readers are encouraged to send copies and bibliographic references on: J.R.R. Tolkien — Wayne G. Hammond, 30 Talcott Road, Williamstown, MA 01267; C.S. Lewis and Charles Williams — Dr. J.R. Christopher, English Department, Tarleton State University, Stephenville, TX 76402.


The mythology Tolkien invented was first to be "purely Anglo-Saxon and to extol the origins of the English inhabitants of Britain at the expense of their Celtic neighbours." But Tolkien was smitten by the essentially Irish vision of a fair immortal race and their Otherworld paradise in the West, and at last expanded the range of his inspiration (p. 8). Númenor evokes not only Atlantis but also Celtic myth: the sunken land of Lyonesse (cf. Westernes) and the deluge sent by God in the Breton legend of Is. The motif of the Land of Gift may have come from the myth of the goddess Eriu ceding Ireland to the mortal Milesians. The culture of Númenor shows little Celtic influence except the custom that the king should abdicate and surrender his life before senility (p. 8), and is "more akin to Athens or Luxor than to Uppsala or Tara" (p. 12). However, the division of the island as described in Unfinished Tales appears to be based on ancient Ireland and Wales.

The present article follows on the author's Celtic Influences on the History of the First Age, Mallorn 28 (1991): 2-6. [WGH]


Beare relates the barrow in which the hobbits were captured by a wight in The Fellowship of the Ring to Arthur's Stone, an ancient burial mound in Herefordshire. These are similar in structure, and each has a door facing east. Beare also describes parallels between Tolkien's episode and various vampire tales.

In another article in the same joint issue of Ravenhill/Chronicles of the Restoration, "It has been Melted," p. 10, Beare describes an Anglo-Saxon spell for removing "elfshot" or supernatural darts in connection with the healing of Frodo's Nazgûl-wound in The Fellowship of the Ring, Book2. [WGH]


A good review essay, discussing the failings of Wilson's C. S. Lewis: A Biography. Beaversluis uses six examples out of Lewis' life in which Wilson refuses to accept Lewis' explanations and explains them in psychological terms: "Wilson seldom justifies these oracular pronouncements [of Lewis' real motives]. But anyone who takes the trouble to recast them in argument form will realize that he is repeatedly guilty of the fallacy post hoc, ergo propter hoc" (186). "Confronted again and again with Lewis' own testimony, [Wilson] neither abandons nor modifies his claims; instead, he takes another plunge into Lewis' psyche and surfaces clutching some still deeper irrational cause. He in fact seems prepared to say anything, however ad hoc or implausible, rather than acknowledge that Lewis' reasons are genuine" (186). [Wilson's] book is a textbook example of what Robert Gittings [in The Nature of Biography] calls 'the biography of denigration'" (190). Beaversluis also points to examples of Wilson's double standards in judgements of Lewis' books (180), his lack of real research (183), his omission of any serious consideration of Lewis' essays rebutting psychological readings (184), but does give one paragraph to some virtues in Wilson's book (193). The present brief summary does not indicate adequately how Beaversluis works from specific examples to support his critique. [JRC]


Burns considers the possibility of a connection between the Icelandic Journals by Morris and Tolkien's Middle-earth tales, The Hobbit in particular. In the latter, "setting, character, and incident are at times remarkably close to situations and events Morris encountered on his 1871 Icelandic journey" (p. [367]). Morris, like Bilbo, travelled by pony and through an almost identical landscape; early on, he too met with wind and rain and had to make do with no fire; and his arrival in Waterdale parallels Bilbo's coming to Rivendell. Thereafter, the two journeys are less precisely matched, but their similarities are striking enough to suggest an influence on Tolkien. Burns especially notes "the barren, death-evoking lands, those sandy, ash-strewn sections of Iceland that have their Tolkienian counterparts in the Desolation of Smaug and in Mordor's sullen wastes" (p. 372). [WGH]

Chance's book begins with a chronology, a general introduction to Tolkien and his works, and an account of his critical reception. These first chapters are incidental to Chance's main text, however, and for the most part are written superficially and from a distinctly American point of view. Her argument proper begins with chapter four, in which she compares Tolkien's use of power and knowledge in *The Lord of the Rings* with the philosophy of Michel Foucault. In the remainder of her book she elaborates on this aspect of Tolkien's work, analyzing also the growth of "political abilities" in the hobbits and how language is used (by Tolkien and by his characters) to manipulate and to affect perception. Chance is interested too in the narrative patterns of Tolkien's book, which she summarizes in a final chapter.

Her analyses, interwoven throughout a book-by-book reading of *The Lord of the Rings*, unfortunately often seem to be random thoughts strung together, and her arguments are undercut by frequent errors: for example, her use of "The Birthday Party" rather than "A Long-expected Party" as the title of chapter 1 of Tolkien's book; her conclusion (p. 38), with no textual foundation, that Frodo's father drowned because he drank excessively; her claim, also unfounded, that Frodo was saved at the Ford of Rivendell "by Gandalf the wizard, whose possession of one of the Elven Rings is sufficient to fill the black horses with madness" (p. 44, giving Elrond no credit); her application (though the extension is not inappropriate) of the phrase "Durin's Bane" to a desire for wealth as well as to the Balrog of Moria; and her description of Lothlorien as "seasonally changeless, which contradicts Tolkien's text. Her bibliography also contains some minor errors, and is apparently a personal selection, omitting important works such as Kocher's *Master of Middle-earth* and Shippey's *Road to Middle-earth.*

---

**Day, David. Tolkien: The Illustrated Encyclopaedia.**

Day's new book is built on the foundation of his *Tolkien Bestiary* published in 1979. The text of the earlier work is here revised and rearranged within a more ambitious scheme. The *Encyclopaedia* is concerned not only with "beasts, monsters, races, deities and flora" but also with topography and biography. An account of the history of Arda precedes alphabetically arranged entries in four sections. The entries may be compared with those of Robert Foster in his *Complete Guide to Middle-earth* but are generally more extensive and do not individually have citations to Tolkien's works, which here are given in an index of sources. Day also provides several charts and maps. Some of the illustrations in *A Tolkien Bestiary* are repeated in the *Encyclopaedia* together with numerous new illustrations, in color and black and white.

---

**Fonstad, Karen Wynn. The Atlas of Middle-earth.**

A thorough revision of the essential Tolkien reference work published in 1981, now incorporating information published in "The History of Middle-earth." The earlier text has been enlarged, many of the maps have been altered, and new maps and diagrams have been added, e.g., a cutaway view of the inn at Bree and more detailed pictures of Minas Tirith. The added color image on p. [137] is mistakenly printed flopped left to right.

---

**Hammond, Wayne G., with the assistance of Douglas A. Anderson. J.R.R. Tolkien: A Descriptive Bibliography.**

The first bibliography of the works of Tolkien to describe first and subsequent editions descriptively, i.e., with transcriptions of title pages, details of printing and binding, and the history of the writing and publication of the works. The book is intended especially as a guide to works by (not about) Tolkien for collectors and librarians, but also serves the textual scholar and the student who wishes to determine the most accurate edition of a given work. The bibliography is hierarchically divided into seven sections, each with its own system of classification, determined by type of material: books entirely by Tolkien; books to which Tolkien contributed, or which he edited or translated; his contributions to periodicals, except letters; published letters and extracts from letters, in books, periodicals, and catalogues; Tolkien's art, in collections and on calendars, cards, posters, etc.; miscellaneous, including interviews and recordings; and translations of Tolkien's works. The last five of these sections are primarily checklists, though with numerous annotations.

Also included are many pages of notes detailing textual errors, corrections, and alterations in *The Hobbit, The Lord of the Rings,* and other works; pertinent letters by and to Tolkien, some previously not published; a foreword by Tolkien's former publisher, Rayner Unwin; a chronology; selected secondary bibliographies of general sources and of works about translations of Tolkien; an extensive index; and eight pages of illustrations.


---

**Hopkins, Lisa. "Endogamy and Exogamy in the Works of Tolkien."**

Tolkien went to considerable lengths to exclude the necessity for incest in his creation stories. His Elves, Men, and Valar are created in sufficient numbers to avoid the need of intermarriage amongst kin, unlike single-pair accounts of creation such as the story of Adam and Eve. Only in the story of Turin and his sister/wife Nienor, clearly influenced by the legend of Oedipus, does Tolkien introduce the subject, as the worst fate Morgoth can inflict upon the children of Hurin to punish their father for his defiance. That Tolkien omitted the possibility of incest from his creation myth by design is supported by the importance in his works of markedly exogamous (as opposed to endogamous) marriages: Thingol, an Elf, and Melian, a Maia;
the Elven women Lúthien, Idriel Celebrindal, and Arwen, and the mortal Men Beren, Tuor, and Aragorn; and the parents of Bilbo Baggins, a union of Baggins solitudy and Took eccentricity. "The exogamous marriage in Tolkien's works enjoys a special status, a power to bridge divides, and [to] generate love that can transcend death," and the children of such a marriage are "special, fated, and endowed with more than ordinary portions of beauty, courage and luck" (p. 16). [WGH]


The author, a Russian translator of Tolkien's works, gives a first-hand account of Tolkien fandom in the former Soviet Union. Before 1982 only The Hobbit and "Leaf by Niggle" were available in Russian, and these translations were shortened and changed to please the government censor. Well-worn copies of The Lord of the Rings were secretly passed from reader to reader. Through his books Tolkien became an apostle for Christianity in an officially atheistic society, and his writings were associated with the Orthodox Church. The Lord of the Rings was "proof of the power and the conclusive force of Christian grace, which changes all things.... It has shown us that Christianity is not just the sullen black robe of a monk, but creativity and freedom . . . ." (p. 35). The first (abridged and imperfect) Russian translation of The Fellowship of the Ring appeared in 1982 and became popular. The government forbade publication of the other two volumes, perhaps out of fear of "the growth of the sense of inner freedom in the hearts of the slaves of Mordor" (p. 36). Underground translations, seldom of good quality, circulated in typescript. Kamenkovich notes that additional materials for Tolkien studies were not available, which made it hard even for a great translator to make an adequate text. The lack of knowledge of Tolkien's life and views led to attacks on him as a Freemason, a disciple of Hindu teachers, etc. After perestroika there are now many free publishers who are attracted to Tolkien because of his popularity. This has led to numerous different translations in print or in process, in the end perhaps nearly ten of The Lord of the Rings, but produced quickly, without sufficient quality.

Kamenkovich movingly remarks also on the efforts of Moscow Tolkien fans to resist the coup in Moscow in August 1991. Tolkien "helped us to regain freedom and to return to the common sources of the human spirit. He helped us to overthrow the rule of Sharkey (though outside we could possibly find only ruins and desolated land)" (p. 38).


Hooper has taken the first edition of Lewis' Letters, compared the letters in it to the originals, and so corrected and often expanded what appeared in 1966; he has also added many letters, clarified the recipients to a large degree, added some footnotes and a few notes between letters, and added a very good index—in fact, two indices, but the first, of recipients of letters, is to be used with the second. Essentially, in his biographical notes between letters and his choice of letters to add, Hooper has created a stronger biographical framework to Lewis' life in this volume. This is an excellent job, and this edition is now the basic one. The only loss is the omission of the photographs which appeared in the original edition.

Hooper's introduction (9-19) gives, in addition to a statement of what he has done, a history of the writing and publishing of the original edition, complete with an account by Christopher Derrick of his editing of the original typescript.

Typical of the changes is the date of the first letter—"Undated: October 1915" said W. H. Lewis; Hooper gives it, in square brackets, the date of 7 March 1916. The date is important, for this letter recounts Lewis' first reading of Phantastes. (Of course, this letter, to Arthur Greeves, has appeared in full in They Stand Together, but for the reader of Lewis' Letters, it is very good to have accurate information.)

These are the added letters: (1) to Arthur Greeves, 12 October [1916]; (2) to his father, 27 August 1917; (3) to his father, 24 September 1917; (4) to his father, 3 October
and both can be justified on biographical grounds — this is a substantial enlargement. No letters in the first edition were dropped.

Besides the biographical orientation, no doubt many other things will be based on these new letters. For example, in the letter to W. H. Lewis on 5 October 1927 (247-248), Lewis mentions his project to do “an Encyclopedia Boxoniana.” Kathryn Lindskoog, in her newsletter *The Lewis Legacy*, has questioned the authenticity of that work, which appeared in Boxen; if the provenance of this letter is certain, then this tends to settle the matter. (It is not beyond all argument, however, for Lewis only has been re-reading the Boxen materials in this letter, planning to work on the encyclopedia during the following Christmas time.) [JRC]


A compilation of checklists originally published in *Beyond Bree*, with additional material. The work is divided into theses; pamphlets and other short works about Tolkien (with sub-lists of publications by the Dutch Tolkien society, Unquendor, and by the American Tolkien Society); calendars; posters and prints; commercial and private audio recordings and music books; games, including board games, role-playing games, and computer games; miniatures and figurines; and "mathoms," i.e. other Tolkien items such as mugs and badges. [WGH]


Miller argues that the medieval poem *Sir Gawain and the Green Knight*, with which Tolkien was especially interested, and his own *Lord of the Rings* have much in common technically and thematically. Both works concern a heroic
quest with many obstacles; both contain carefully con-
structed secondary worlds; both have a framework of
historicity and a thematic emphasis on youth. Bertilak
and Tom Bombadil are both symbolic representations of
the Force of Nature and are figures of moral ambiguity.

[WCH]


Eerdmans released a new edition of these three Charles Williams' novels in November 1991. The company's press release said that it was an attempt at more commercial packaging. The covers are mainly white, with simple color designs of about two inches (horizontal) by four inches (vertical) below the titles and author's name. That on War in Heaven shows a chalice with blue-green background and what seems to be gray lightning across the background; on The Place of the Lion is the head and front paws of a lion, with green grass and brown sky in the background; on All Hallows' Eve, in the foreground, is the tail of a plane with the plane angling down and, in the background, is London behind Westminster Bridge. Each cover has some small portion of the foreground extending beyond the background into the white area—to attract attention, no doubt. In general, the covers seem effective enough for their purpose on these trade paperbacks, although as art their designs are not great. The edition of All Hallows' Eve, by the way, includes T. S. Eliot's 1948 introduction. [JRC]


A sometimes flawed but interesting study of the Narnian books. Murrin sums up his thesis this way:

... this is what Lewis attempts through the intercon-
nections of worlds. First, by his doorways and pictures
[some of the means of moving to and from Narnia] he
draws attention to the nature of his art. Second, by the
juxtaposition of worlds, on either side of the door, he
creates a narrative equivalent of a Platonic dialectic.
(254)

(Murrin seems to be using dialectic to mean the investiga-
tion of eternal ideas, although there is an element of juxta-
position of ideas and concepts in his discussion also.) The
first major section is “Ways of Transit” (233-248), with
subdivisions on “The Door” (233-237), “The Picture” (237-
241), “The Railroad Station” (241-42), and “The Wood
between the Worlds” (242-48); the other major sections,
without subdivisions, are “The Dialectic” (248-251) and
“Why We Go Between” (251-55).

Most of the flaws are in “The Door.” For example,
Murrin says, [The wardrobe’s] wood comes from a tree in
London that was planted from a Narnian seed, so above
this tree [the one in London] is a magical one in another
world [the one in the western garden from which the apple
came]. Above that tree is still another, the tree with silver
apples which grows in the Narnian paradise [that is, in the
hortus conclusus of the end of The Last Battle]. In Platonic
terms the first two trees are diminishing replicas of this
original one... (234) In Platonic terms, this may be so; but
later Murrin decides “Narnia... exists at the same ontolo-
gical level” as England: “Juxtaposition replaces the Pla-
tonic vertical ascent” (239). Perhaps for rhetorical reasons,
Murrin deliberately set up the Platonic pattern and only
later modified it, but the material ends up sounding inconsist-
sent, since it has no reference forward.

More significantly, Murrin gets enamored of the idea of
“Aslan’s country” — that is, “a single high mountain” —
being the center of the Narnian universe, with, reading from
left to right, Narnia and then the garden, on one of the spurs
of the mountain (235-36; diagram, 236). First, as Murrin says
on p. 235, this is not how it appears in Narnia; second, the
diagram seems to be (for no clear reason) inverted in its
east-west order; third, the text of The Last Battle does not
support there being one mountain, central or not — it refers
to “a great chain of mountains which ringed round the whole
world” (New York: Collier Book [trade paperback edition],
1986; p. 171) and to “the great mountains of Aslan” (172, the
plural is in the original; both quotations are from Ch. 16).
Murrin is simply not reading the text.

Further, Murrin goes on to apply his misreading to the
original Narnia:

Wherever the children travel from Narnia, they event-
ually come to mountains, and so one would assume
that mountains circle it. The children are misled by
their perspective, for Narnia itself is a spoke in a wheel
which is a mountain system. (236)

Just as Murrin was wrong about the archetypal Narnia,
based on the text, so he is equally wrong about this. The
whole discussion is a good example of letting an idea
replace what the words say.

There are a few other trivial errors, but they do not
affect the points being made. It is hard to be certain of what
Murrin means, however, when he announces that Lewis’
“fairy tales are not symbolic” (254); they get their meaning
from a juxtaposition “which does not depend on symbol”
(255). Surely his own reading of the shallow pools in the
wood between the worlds as standing for Lewis’ art (e.g.,
248) is a symbolic reading. Presumably Lewis’ text allows
(or perhaps encourages) such a reading and thus is, in a
rather Coleridgean way, symbolic. But, since Murrin is the
author of two books on allegory, he may have something
more specific in mind.

Otherwise, as stated, Murrin’s essay is interesting. He
surveys the means of the children’s journeys to Narnia; he
sees the contrast between England and Narnia as, in Lewis’
life, the split in his childhood between his outer life —
school, etc. — and his inner, imaginative life (250). The
picture of the ship at the first of *The Voyage of the "Dawn Treader"* and the pools mentioned earlier are images of Lewis' fairy tale art: they appear shallow but they allow entrance to another world. Lewis' emphasis on morality "answers Socrates' critique of mythology" in *The Republic* (255). Murrin concludes, "Lewis differs from Plato in degree more than in kind. Plato uses myth to control dialectic but emphasizes the dialectic. Lewis stresses the myth but uses dialectic to preserve its value" (255). [JRC]


The catalogue of the Tolkien Centenary exhibition held at the Bodleian Library, 17 August-23 December 1992. The text by curator Judith Priestman, which describes and amplifies the books, manuscripts, art, and ephemera displayed, is an important contribution to Tolkien biography.

More than 100 illustrations are included, many never before reproduced. These include (in black and white unless noted as in color): p. [2], a dust-jacket design by Tolkien for *The Fellowship of the Ring*, which was modified for the published version with fewer elements and type rather than calligraphy; pp. [4] and [5], two drawings by Tolkien identified only by their Bodleian classification, notable for their abstract and Expressionist qualities; pp. [8] and 9, a Christmas card from Tolkien's maternal grandfather, John Suffield, from whose branch of the family Tolkien received a love of art and fine penmanship; p. 10, part of an autograph letter (partially transcribed) by Mabel Tolkien describing her infant son Ronald; p. 11, "Tolkien's first letter," dictated at age five to his nurse for posting to his father, who died soon after the writing; pp. 12-13, a spread from Tolkien's first sketchbook, showing drawings of seaweed and starfishes; p. 14, an early drawing by Tolkien of a domestic scene; p. 16, reproduced in color, a rebus by Tolkien dated 8 August 1904 and sent to Father Francis Morgan; p. 18, a page from Tolkien's manuscript "Book of the Foxrook," a notebook compiled in 1909 with a code-alphabet and commentary in a language based on Esperanto and Spanish; pp. 19, 1910 sketch of Whitby by Tolkien; p. 20, in color, an illustration by Tolkien for Father Christmas' letter of 1926, here shown in its entirety (in *The Father Christmas Letters*, pp. [10-11]), this painting is divided into two illustrations and lacks the lower portion giving the date and the checked border originally separating the two scenes); p. 25, a photograph of Tolkien with the Exeter College Rugby XV and Boat Club; p. 26, two illustrations by Tolkien for dinners, the Exeter College Smoker of 19 November 1913 (earlier reproduced in *The Tolkien Family Album*) and the "Chequers Clubbe Binge," June 1914; p. 27, an ownership inscription by Tolkien, 1913, in a copy of *The Pearl*; p. 29, in color (reproduced with more of a reddish cast than is in the original), an illustration by Tolkien for his unpublished story "Roverandum," 1927, stylistically a close precursor of his pictures for *The Hobbit* in the next decade; p. 32, in color, a trench map made by Tolkien in 1916; p. 37, two illustrations by Tolkien for the 1931 Father Christmas letter (the first is as reproduced in *The Father Christmas Letters* (p. [20]), the second was reproduced there divided into two parts, pp. [22-23], without the decorative border at the top and bottom of the second scene and lacking the manuscript portion at bottom, though the latter is transcribed in the text); p. 38, a sheet of sketches by Tolkien, "High Life at Gipsy Green"; p. 40, in color, an illustrated page by Tolkien for Father Christmas's letter of 1932, three parts of which were extracted for *The Father Christmas Letters* and there reproduced separated on pp. [7], [24], and [45]; p. 44, in color, drawings by Tolkien of two imaginary creatures, "Maddo" and "Owlamoo," both dated 1928 (the latter also reproduced in black and white on p. 83); p. 46, a manuscript page on which Tolkien practiced Anglo-Saxon insular bookhand; p. 48, a sketch by Tolkien for *The Hobbit*, *One Morning in the Quiet of the World* (earlier reproduced in the 1987 Marquette University Haggerty Museum catalogue, but here with slightly more definition), and a previously unpublished version of Thrór's Map, drawn by Tolkien in a vertical format for insertion with the text pages of *The Hobbit*; an autograph postcard by Tolkien to Katharine Farrer, December 1937, written using the *Hobbit* system of runes (cf. a later runic message, *Letters of J.R.R. Tolkien* no. 112); p. 52, a watercolor painted on black paper with a subtle background painted on black paper with a subtle background, for the crispness of its lettering, lost to a degree on the jacket, and for the pinkish red color of the sun on the upper cover); p. 56, part of the original manuscript opening of "Leaf by Niggle"; p. [57], an autograph letter signed by Tolkien to C.A. Furth of George Allen & Unwin, 4 February 1938 (partly transcribed in *Letters no. 22*); p. 58, in color, Tolkien's final watercolor painting, *Bilbo Comes to the Huts of the Raft-elves*, shown here with a portion of the sheet below the painting with Tolkien's manuscript direction to the printer and an additional JRRT monogram; p. 59, in color, another watercolor illustration by Tolkien for "Roverandum," *The Gardens of the Merking's Palace*, 1927, with a manuscript title; p. 60, a fragment of a manuscript draft for Appendix D of *The Lord of the Rings*, concerning the Kings' Reckoning; p. 61, a design by Tolkien for the dust-jacket of *The Return of the King* painted on black paper with a subtle background drawing (not visible in the catalogue reproduction), not used for the published jacket (but the drawing of the throne of Elendil was later reproduced on the binding of the 1969 one-volume deluxe edition of *The Lord of the*
Rings); p. 63, the first working map made by Tolkien for *The Lord of the Rings*; p. 67, part of Tolkien's manuscript first page of the *Silmarillion* "Sketch of the Mythology"; p. 71, the first manuscript page of the "Quenta Silmarillion"; p. 74, the heraldic device of Lúthien Tínuviel (the version reproduced on the original dust-jacket of the British hardcover *Silmarillion*), here shown on a full sheet with other marks by Tolkien (partly reproduced in color on p. 77); p. 77, in color, another device of Lúthien with two lines in tengwar (also reproduced in black and white, without the manuscript lines, on p. 85); and a sheet with the device of Eldir Celeborn and manuscript notes by Tolkien, dated 1960; p. 78, a manuscript chart by Tolkien showing the "Normal Development of A in [the] Vespasian Ps[alter] & Ancrene Wisse"; p. 80, in color, a previously unpublished illustrated page by Tolkien for Father Christmas's 1939 letter; p. 81, a manuscript page by Tolkien from his edition of the Old English *Exodus*; p. [82], a printed agenda for a meeting at Merton College, covered by Tolkien with doodles and tengwar characters; p. 84, a manuscript by Tolkien of his poem "Namrië", with annotations, preliminary to the manuscript version reproduced in *The Road Goes Ever On*; p. 86, a broadside poem by A.D. Godley, "Motor Bus," which inspired Tolkien to write his unpublished satire, "The Bovadium Fragments"; p. 87, a rejected design by Tolkien for the dust-jacket of *The Two Towers*; and p. 89, Tolkien's first *Silmarillion* map.

Also reproduced, p. 42, is a spread from a copy of Tolkien and Gordon's *Sir Gawain and the Green Knight* owned by C.S. Lewis, with his annotations and a drawing of armor, and p. 62, the holograph full text of the blurb written by Lewis for *The Lord of the Rings*.

The catalogue describes 250 items in nine sections: "Family and Early Life," "Schooldays and Oxford," "War," "Lexicography and Leeds," "Mr. Baggins," *The Lord of the Rings*, *The Silmarillion*, "Academic Life," and "Last Years." Also included are an introduction and afterward, and three indexes. The color illustration *Tanniquestil* by Tolkien is reproduced on the upper cover, as on the poster that also accompanied the exhibition, with exceptional faithfulness to the original. [WGH]


This large-format, spiral-bound booklet served as the "ticket" and supplemental guide for participants in the tour of Tolkien's Birmingham during the Tolkien Centenary Conference in August 1992. Chiefly illustrations, it includes photographs of houses in which Tolkien lived and of the churches he knew, and of Sarehole Mill; pertinent close-scale maps; drawings of trees and architectural details; and diagrams of 19th-century ploughing practices, housing construction, and urban planning. [WGH]


Includes a biographical essay; an article, "Tolkien en Nederland," concerning Tolkien's visit to Rotterdam in March 1958, with a photograph of Tolkien at the "Hobbit-Maaltijd" and remarks made there by Tolkien; and a catalogue of an exhibition of 393 items by and about Tolkien. Also illustrated are the menu and brochure of the "Hobbit Dinner"; the title page of a copy of *The Fellowship of the Ring* autographed by Tolkien and inscribed by him in tengwar; and a typed letter signed by Tolkien to S.E.O. Joukes, 28 August 1967, concerning names in *The Lord of the Rings* and giving the etymology of *Ioreth*. [WGH]


The catalogue of an exhibition held at the University of Liége, 16-22 May 1992. Listed, some with annotations, are 151 items divided into six categories: "Biographical Documents," "Tolkien's Philological Work," "Tolkien's Works of Fantasy," "Glimpses of Middle-Earth [sic]," "The Critics," and "Tolkien Societies." Many of the exhibits were from the collection of the editor, or from the S.R.T.O. d'Ardenne collection at Liége. A preface statement, p. [iii], describes d'Ardenne's friendship with Tolkien. [WGH]


An irreverent book about modern Oxford with several references to Inklings. *That Hideous Strength* by Lewis has "one of the most savagely satirical portrayals of a Governing Body at work," and the entmoots in *The Lord of the Rings* "are in fact woodland college meetings: they go on forever, everyone has to have their say and whenever an object is mentioned its full history has to be rehearsed" (p. 136). Snow also remarks on the "rootedness" of *The Lord of the Rings* in North Oxford, both in its characters and in its "anti-industrial ethos."

The hobbit heroes are clearly North Oxford children: they have the bodies of children but the minds of adults; they speak with all the distinctive spiy confidence of Dragon School pupils.... There is also a range of other peculiar races and creatures in the novel, odd little particularizations of the British class system; the orcs are miniaturized Cowley yobs and the wizards are of course superdons, with added magical powers (pp. 172-73).[WGH]


Spivack demonstrates that in Tolkien's mythology Evil is equivalent to nothingness, privative rather than substantial. Evil cannot create, but only pervert or distort; it cannot understand Good, as the part cannot understand the whole; it is innately self-destructive; it is the deprivation of being. [WGH]


An issue devoted to Inklings and Others, published in a double number with 3.4 (Spring 1991), German Medi-
evaluate. Its general aim, expressed by editor Jane Chance in her preface, is to show how medieval ideas and works provided a context for the Inklings and other writers to examine modern crises or problems (p. 232). Its principal contents are: Ian Boyd, Chesterton’s Medievalism; Kathrynn Kerby-Fulton, ‘Standing on Lewis’ Shoulders’: C.S. Lewis as Critic of Medieval Literature; Lionel Adley, Medievalism in the Space Trilogy of C.S. Lewis; Judith J. Kollmann, Charles Williams’s All Hallows Eve: A Modern Adaptation of Dante’s Commedia; Charles A. Hutter, Arms and the Man: The Place of Beatrice in Charles Williams’s Romantic Theology; Miriam Youngerman Miller, ‘Of sum mayn merualye, Yat he mygt trawe’: The Lord of the Rings and Sir Gawain and the Green Knight; Marjorie J. Burns, Echoes of William Morris’s Icelandic Journals in J.R.R. Tolkien; and Jane Chance and David D. Day, Medievalism in Tolkien: Two Decades of Criticism in Review. [WGH]


An audio cassette produced to commemorate the Tolkien centenary and the 1001st anniversary of the Battle of Maldon, distributed gratis by the publisher HarperCollins and the Tolkien Estate to delegates to the Tolkien Centenary Conference in Oxford. Like the version of The Homecoming of Beorhtnoth’s Son printed in Essays and Studies (1953) and elsewhere, the work is here divided into an introduction, Beorhtnoth’s Death, the verse drama proper, and an afterword, Ofermod. For the cassette, Christopher Tolkien has recorded the first and third parts, excluding all but one footnote and with a brief prefatory statement and a few minor changes to suit the medium. The central part was recorded by J.R.R. Tolkien privately, including ingenious sound effects, sometime after the drama was broadcast on radio in December 1954. Here as in his other recordings, he proves himself a born actor. [WGH]


A revised edition of a work originally published in 1979. The foreword is unchanged except that the fifth paragraph has been reset to include a note on the renumbering of picture no. 23 as no. 24. A preface to the new edition now follows the foreword. All notes to the illustrations have been reset except no. 24 (formerly 23), the complicated transcription of the Book of Mazarbul fragments. The notes to nos. 1, 4-7, 9, 14, 17, 21-30, 33, 35-37, and 39 have been revised, sometimes to omit references to later reproductions, sometimes to correct or amplify a note of 1979 based on Christopher Tolkien’s later research or contemplation.

In no. 1, the pencil drawing of Hobbiton has been replaced with the pen frontispiece to The Hobbit referred to in the note. No. 4, Rivendell Looking West, has been retitled Rivendell (I), with a note by Christopher Tolkien that the river, which flowed to the west, is shown flowing from the west, down out of the mountains. No. 5, Rivendell Looking East, here retitled Rivendell (II), is now thought by Christopher Tolkien not to date earlier than the watercolor view of Rivendell made for The Hobbit, but from the later period of the Lord of the Rings illustrations. No. 6, formerly Rivendell, is now entitled Rivendell (III). The color illustration of Moria Gate in no. 22 has a notably less blue-green cast than the same picture in the 1979 edition. Nos. 23 and 24, formerly the Book of Mazarbul pictures and Moria Gate (The Steps to the East Gate) respectively, are now reversed in order and the Moria Gate illustration is acknowledged by Christopher Tolkien to have been the lower part of no. 22. No. 26, Helm’s Deep and the Hornburg, now has a blue-grey cast not present in the 1979 reproduction. The color illustration in no. 27, Minas Tirith, on the other hand, is here without its former grey cast, and the color illustration in no. 30, Barad-dûr, is distinctly less blue than it was previously in Pictures. The black and white images in nos. 35 and 36, Gondolin and Tol Sirion, are here reproduced with greater definition than they were in the earlier edition. In no. 37, the black and white illustration, Mirkwood, is printed darker than before, and the color picture, Beleg Finds Gwainlor in Taur-nu-Fuin, now has a reddish cast. [WGH]


The first separate edition of Donald Swann’s setting of the poem Tolkien bequeathed to their mutual friend Joy Hill, originally published in the second edition (1978) of The Road Goes Ever On: A Song Cycle. The new edition is written out in calligraphy and includes a cover illustration by Alison Smith. Fifty copies of the impression were signed by the composer. [WGH]


The daughter of J.R.R. Tolkien here remembers the letters she and her brothers received from their father, written and illustrated as if by Father Christmas, between 1920 and 1943. Priscilla Tolkien notes especially her father’s artistic talent, techniques, and inspiration. [WGH]


Tolkien’s former publisher recalls the close relationship he had with the author, the contract Tolkien signed for The Lord of the Rings, some of the difficulties in the production of that book, and aspects of publicity and marketing. Unwin concludes with remarks on how the business of publishing has changed since he began his career.

Also recently published by Rayner Unwin is a booklet, The Making of The Lord of the Rings (Oxford: Willem A. Meeuws, 1992, 8 pp.), a revised separate edition of the
Where Did the Dwarves Come From?

(continued from page 48)

and travelled together to Hobbiton. Might it have been in the southern Ered Luin, between Eriador and the coastal realm of Harlindon? Perhaps; yet this seems to me unlikely, for the Ered Luin (though offset by the great fault that gave the Lune its passage to the ocean and formed the Gulf of Luin) certainly constituted a single range of mountains. If there was coal in the south of that range, then probably there would be coal also in the north. Even if coal seams cropped out only in the south, surely the dwarves mining them would have been close enough to their northern brothers to share in their relative prosperity and live equally comfortably?

Of the other hills surrounding the Shire, we may rule out the White Downs, clearly formed of chalk and impossible as a source of coal. The Tower Hills, then? Yes, perfectly feasible; we are told nothing of their geology. The tower of Elostirion, once the tallest of the White Towers and housing a *palantir*, had long since fallen into ruin and the hobbits had not yet settled the lands about. Yet we had no direct indication of mining there.

The Hills of Evendim, north of the Shire, can surely be excluded. They formed part of the Lost Realm of Amor and we are given no indication that dwarves ever inhabited that realm, before or after its fall.

Instead, let us look within the bounds of the Shire itself for the places where coal might be mined. Dwarves were familiar enough in the Shire; they were frequent travellers on “the Great West Road” which “ran though the Shire over the Brandywine Bridge” and which, from the maps, seems equally to have been called the East Road. (No doubt its name depended on the direction upon which one was travelling!) They came to the central Shire, then, certainly from eastward or westward and perhaps from northward, though not usually from southward. The arrival of “Strange dwarves of different kinds” from that direction occurred only as the shadow of Mordor grew.

Were there coal seams cropping out in the Far Downs that, lying between the White Downs and the Tower Hills, for so long marked the Shire’s western boundary? It seems possible, but we have no evidence either way, or indeed to show whether the Far Downs were inhabited.

Another, and perhaps likelier, possibility is that those coal mines were situated in the unnamed group of hills lying north of Scary, in the northern part of the East Farthing. The map of “A Part of Shire” in *Fellowship* shows a quarry there, which might have been for building-stone but might also have represented opencast mining for coal. The village name of Brokenborigs is also equivocal; where those boring hobbit-holes or might they have been mine adits?

Wherever they came from, it is clear that the dwarves gathering in Bilbo’s house arrived there from several different places — the places where they were living and working — and that some of them, at least (though not Thorin or fat Bombur) had been living, and working, hard; hard enough, maybe, to tempt them away on so desperate a quest. We may note, indeed, that most were pretty tough and agile. The exceptions were the dwarves who had come with Thorin from the comfortable halls in the Ered Luin: Bifur and Bofur, clumsy enough to tumble into Bilbo’s door on top of Thorin, and Bombur, whose general unfitness for the journey was to be so evident in Mirkwood.

Yet, after all, I am left still wondering; where did the dwarves come from?