



Mythopoeic Society

mythLORE

A Journal of J.R.R. Tolkien, C.S. Lewis,
Charles Williams, and Mythopoeic Literature

Volume 20
Number 4

Article 11

Winter 1-15-1995

An Inklings Bibliography (54)

Joe R. Christopher

Wayne G. Hammond

Follow this and additional works at: <https://dc.swosu.edu/mythlore>



Part of the [Children's and Young Adult Literature Commons](#)

Recommended Citation

Christopher, Joe R. and Hammond, Wayne G. (1995) "An Inklings Bibliography (54)," *Mythlore: A Journal of J.R.R. Tolkien, C.S. Lewis, Charles Williams, and Mythopoeic Literature*: Vol. 20: No. 4, Article 11.
Available at: <https://dc.swosu.edu/mythlore/vol20/iss4/11>

This Article is brought to you for free and open access by the Mythopoeic Society at SWOSU Digital Commons. It has been accepted for inclusion in Mythlore: A Journal of J.R.R. Tolkien, C.S. Lewis, Charles Williams, and Mythopoeic Literature by an authorized editor of SWOSU Digital Commons. An ADA compliant document is available upon request. For more information, please contact phillip.fitzsimmons@swosu.edu.

To join the Mythopoeic Society go to:
<http://www.mythsoc.org/join.htm>

SWOSUTM

Online MidSummer Seminar 2025

More Perilous and Fair: Women and Gender in Mythopoeic Fantasy

August 2-5, 2024

Via Zoom and Discord

<https://www.mythsoc.org/oms/oms-04.htm>



An Inklings Bibliography (54)

Abstract

Entries 42–59 in this series are written by Hammond (Tolkien material) and Christopher (Lewis and other material). See Hammond, Wayne G., for one later entry in this series.

Creative Commons License



This work is licensed under a [Creative Commons Attribution-NonCommercial-No Derivative Works 4.0 International License](https://creativecommons.org/licenses/by-nc-nd/4.0/).

IN INKLINGS Bibliography (54)

Compiled by Joe R. Christopher and Wayne G. Hammond

Authors and readers are encouraged to send copies and bibliographic references on: **J.R.R. Tolkien** — Wayne G. Hammond, 30 Talcott Road, Williamstown, MA 01267; **C.S. Lewis** and **Charles Williams** — Dr. J.R. Christopher, English Department, Tarleton State University, Stephenville, TX 76402.

Anderson, Stevens W., ed. *The Great American Bathroom Book, Vol. II.* Salt Lake City: Compact Classics, 1993. ix + 626 pp. [Tolkien 87-88; Lewis 85-86, 153-54]

This volume of "single-sitting summaries of all-time great books" includes a summary of *The Hobbit* which omits a few elements (Beorn, Bilbo's betrayal of the dwarves, the Arkenstone), misspells *Gandalf* as *Gandolf*, and describes Gollum simply as "a small lake dweller" and Bard mistakenly as "Lake Town's mayor." A brief commentary following the summary describes *The Hobbit* as a coming-of-age book in which Tolkien wished to depict, in part, "the class divisions so prevalent in his time, symbolized by the new, hostile, warring races of creatures that he imagined" (p. 88).

The volume also includes summaries of C.S. Lewis's *The Lion, the Witch, and the Wardrobe* ("a poignant and beautiful allegory, one that is as meaningful as it is obvious," p. 86) and *The Screwtape Letters*. [WGH]

Battarbee, K.J., ed. *Scholarship & Fantasy*. Turku: University of Turku, 1993. [iv] + 240 pp. [Tolkien]

The proceedings of "The Tolkien Phenomenon," an international literary conference held in Turku, Finland, in May 1992. The volume contains fifteen substantive essays:

- "The Magic of Words: J.R.R. Tolkien and Finland" by Luigi de Anna, pp. [7]-19;
- "Familiarity and Distance: Quenya's Relation to Finnish" by Helena Rautala, pp. [21]-31;
- "The Influence of Archaeology and History on Tolkien's World" by Christina Scull, pp. [33]-51;
- "Some Notes on Giants in Tolkien's Writings" by Anders Stenström (Beregond), pp. [53]-71;
- "Tolkien, the Monsters, and the Critics: Back to *Beowulf*" by Andy Orchard, pp. [73]-84;
- "The Green Man, the Green Knight, and Treebeard: Scholarship and Invention in Tolkien's Fiction" by Verlyn Flieger, pp. [85]-98;
- "Tolkien and Old Icelandic Literature" by Fredrik J. Henemann, pp. [99]-109;
- "Sæge se e Cúe: J.R.R. Tolkien as Anglo-Saxonist" by Paul Bibire, pp. [111]-31;

"Sub-creation and Tolkien's Theology of Story" by Colin Duriez, pp. [133]-50;

"Tolkien and the Unfinished" by Clive Tolley, pp. [151]-64;

"Technology and Sub-creation: Tolkien's Alternative to the Dominant Worldview" by David Llewellyn Dodds, pp. [165]-86;

"Speculative Fiction and Ideology" by K.J. Battarbee, pp. [187]-92;

"Violence and Fantasy" by Vappu Viemerö, pp. [193]-201;

"By Stock or by Stone: Recurrent Imagery and Narrative Pattern in *The Hobbit*" by Paul Bibire, pp. [203]-15;

"Tolkien as a Post-War Writer" by T.A. Shippey, pp. [217]-36.

Six papers presented at the conference were not published in the proceedings. [WGH]

Bratman, David. "A Corrigenda to *The Lord of the Rings*." *The Tolkien Collector* 6 (1994): 17-25.

Bratman lists "misreadings and omissions of wording occurring during the course of successive draftings," "ghosts" of earlier versions of the story which were overlooked during revisions made to bring previously-written chapters up to the current conception, and readings in the *Eärendillinwë*, accidentally published from an earlier text, which do not accord with the intended final version (p. 18). With these, he gives corrections he feels Tolkien probably would have made if the errors had been adequately brought to his attention. The list, keyed to the 1987 revised Houghton Mifflin edition, was compiled primarily from the 1993 descriptive bibliography of Tolkien, from the supplements to that work in *The Tolkien Collector*, and from notes by Christopher Tolkien in *The History of Middle-earth*. A few other errors were noticed by Bratman. The author describes his list as "an approach to the apparatus necessary to construct" a fully corrected text according to Tolkien's final intentions, as far as they can be determined. [WGH]

Dale, Alzina Stone. "Introduction: A Jury of Her Peers" and "A Brief Biography of Dorothy L. Sayers." *Dorothy L. Sayers: The Centenary Celebration*. Ed. Alzina Stone Dale. New York: Walker and Company, 1993. xi-xiii and 151-152. [Lewis xi, 151.]

Dale, in two of her three contributions to this volume, alludes to Lewis. In the "Introduction," she writes, "Many of [Sayers'] fans reread her books, the sure sign, according to her friend C. S. Lewis, of a classic" (xi). This is an overstatement; Lewis actually wrote in *An Experiment in Criticism* of "good literature"—not of classics, which pre-

sumably would be the best of the good—"as that which permits, invites, or even compels good reading"; and he described as one sign of that good reading the re-reading of material. (The allusion to Susan Glaspell in the title of the introduction seems non-functional, although Glaspell's story was a mystery.) In "A Brief Biography of Dorothy L. Sayers," Dale writes, "C. S. Lewis jokingly wrote [Sayers] that if her letter were ever published she might find that her true fame rested upon them, not her published books" (151). This is an accurate paraphrase of his letter to her on 10 December 1945. These references are minor aspects of minor parts of Dale's book. [JRC]

Hunnell, Gary. *Tolkien Fannish and Scholarly Activities and Publications: Year End Review 1992*. Arnold, Mo.: New England Tolkien Society, 1993. 63 pp.

A checklist of Tolkien fan organizations, activities, and publications existing, occurring, or published in 1992. The arrangement is first by country, followed by organizations, independent conferences and conventions, exhibits, and publications. Addresses, costs of subscription/membership, and other information are included. Tolkien-oriented characters, places, and things that appear in published artwork are also listed. The Mythopoeic Society is covered on pp. 57-61, encompassing *Mythlore* 18.2-4, *Mythprint* 29.1-12, discussion groups, and their publications. The Tolkien Centenary Conference, a joint venture of The Mythopoeic Society and The Tolkien Society, is listed for convenience as a separate organization.

This *Review* was issued in both hard copy and computer diskette form, and is being loaded at an Internet archive site. [WGH]

Gaiman, Neil, et al. *Brief Lives: Sandman (The)*. New York: D C Comics, 1994. (Originally published as issues of *The Sandman*, Nos. 41-49.) [Allusions to Lewis, Ch. 6, p. 16, Ch. 9, p. 17; allusion to Tolkien, Ch. 9, p. 17.]

During episodes in the Library of Dreams in this sequence of *The Sandman* comics, a book spine is shown with *The Emperor over the Sea*, by C. S. Lewis (Ch. 6, p. 16), and a partial spine with *arnia* [sic] on it (Ch. 9, p. 17); also in the latter episode occurs a half spine with what seems to be *Hobbiton* on it. [JRC]

Gilbert, Michael. "A Personal Memoir: Dorothy L. Sayers." *Dorothy L. Sayers: The Centenary Celebration*. Ed. Alzina Stone Dale. New York: Walker and Company, 1993. 15-21. [Lewis 20.]

Gilbert, at the conclusion of his essay, describes Sayers' funeral service, mentioning, "The panegyric was written by Professor C. S. Lewis and read by Bishop Bell of Chichester" (20). The other details of the service are slightly fuller. (Lewis's "A Panegyric for Dorothy L. Sayers" is collected in *Of This and Other Worlds* [British title] or "On Stories" and *Other Essays on Literature* [American title], 1982.) [JRC]

Heilbrun, Carolyn G. (aka Amanda Cross). "Dorothy L. Sayers: Biography between the Lines." *Dorothy L. Sayers: The Centenary Celebration*. Ed. Alzina Stone Dale. New York: Walker and Company, 1993. 1-13. [Lewis 1, 12.] Rpt. from *The American Scholar* 51:4 (Autumn 1982).

Heilbrun frames her essay with citations of a Lewis letter in which he says to Sayers that she seems to confuse the desire to write a particular work with the moral obligation to write a certain work. Interestingly, Heilbrun uses the second citation to draw a feminist moral only analogous to the Christian work Lewis and Sayers were discussing:

Similarly, today, women who find the courage to pursue their 'proper job'—in academia or in the professions or businesses newly opened to women by the efforts of feminists—eschew any support of other women with the excuse that their proper job is being a lawyer, or whatever it might be; thus they avoid their part in the hard and painful task of changing society's restrictions on women. (12)

Perhaps it should be added that Heilbrun's essay is an interesting discussion of the things James Brabazon in his authorized biography of Sayers did not fully understand; a few points (e.g., about Sayers' reason for refusing a Lambeth Degree) have been complicated by further information since Heilbrun wrote. [JRC]

McDaniel, Stan. *The Philosophical Etymology of Hobbit*. Rohnert Park, Calif.: Stan McDaniel, 1991. [ii] + 13 pp. [Tolkien]

The word *hobbit*, says McDaniel, grew out of the "leaf-mould" of Tolkien's mind composed "largely of linguistic matter" (p. 1). Tolkien would not use a name in a story unless the name had sufficient philological interest. McDaniel attempts to show that *hobbit* belongs to an "eidophonic" group of words, i.e. related by sound and idea, that includes as well Latin *caput*, Old High German *houbit*, Anglo-Saxon *hobbit*, and Modern English *head*. The cognate terms can be traced back to Sanskrit *gupa*, "hole in the ground"; hence, both components of the opening words of Tolkien's book, "In a hole in the ground there lived a Hobbit," share a common linguistic ancestor. McDaniel argues that Tolkien was aware of this connection, even amused by it, and inserted a related anecdote in *The Hobbit* in which a wooden club is used to knock the head of a goblin-king like a golf ball into a hole. McDaniel traces *goblin*, *golf*, Sanskrit *guda* "ball," and Old Norse *kuf* "wooden club" to earlier forms all cognate with *gupa*. *Kuduk*, the word Tolkien later chose as the "original" name for which *hobbit* is a "translation," is shown to be related to *hobbit* in a phonetic chain which also connects Sanskrit and Indo-European words and roots for "guard" and "curve." From these, McDaniel develops an "archetypal idea" he calls the "sheltering curve": "A hobbit-hole, dug into a hillside with arched ceilings, round doors, and round windows, protecting the hobbit or 'head' within, is

a paradigm instance of this archetype" (p. 7). And from the idea of a curve, MacDonald leads to the Baggins/Took polarity within Bilbo in *The Hobbit*.

As intriguing as MacDonald's approach is, it is stretched a long way (ultimately into Jungian territory) and posits a philological pattern behind *The Hobbit* surely more elaborate than any Tolkien actually devised for it (if any: in his *Letters*, p. 21, he denied applying his professional knowledge in *The Hobbit* to any great extent). The complexity of MacDonald's argument works against it. Would Tolkien have chosen to have Bilbo, in a Tookish mood, wish to "wear a sword instead of a walking-stick" because *tuck* (cf. Took) can mean "rapier," *stick* is cognate with *tuck* (both from Sanskrit *stij-* or *tij-* "be sharp"), and Middle High German *Stachel*, itself cognate with *tuck* and *stick*, means "sting"? Could it not be, rather, that wearing a sword is simply more adventurous and less *bourgeois* than carrying a stick? [WGH]

MacDonald, George. *An Expression of Character: The Letters of George MacDonald*. Ed. Glenn Edward Sadler. Grand Rapids, Michigan: William B. Eerdmans [sic] Publishing Company, 1994. [Barfield xi; Lewis ix-xi, xiii, 376; Tolkien xiii.]

This volume is of interest both for its minor references to the Inklings and as an associational work, since MacDonald influenced both Lewis and Tolkien. The references to the Inklings are these: (1) In G. B. Tennyson's "Foreword" (ix-xii), he begins with Lewis's purchase of *Phantasies* ("God was arranging simultaneously for the conversion of C. S. Lewis and the literary rehabilitation of George MacDonald") and develops the influence on Lewis on MacDonald's post-World War II reputation; Tennyson overstates Lewis's concern with only "one" MacDonald, the fantasist, for Lewis's *George MacDonald: An Anthology*, is certainly concerned with the Christian writer, the author of *Unspoken Sermons*; Tennyson uses Barfield's writing on "five C. S. Lewises" to develop the idea of the multiple aspects of George MacDonald (ix-xi). (2) In Sadler's "Preface" (xiii-xv), he mentions, as "impressive admirers" of MacDonald, G. K. Chesterton, "C. S. Lewis, J. R. R. Tolkien, and Maurice Sendak" (xiii). In Sadler's "Recommended Reading" (376-77), he begins with a mention of Lewis's *George MacDonald: An Anthology* (376).

This collection of letters is a very useful supplement to a biography of MacDonald. Sadler has divided it into six sections, chronologically, with a brief biographical introduction and list of dates for each. The letters capture something of MacDonald's religious struggles, that were not apparent to Lewis in his introduction to his *Anthology*; a typical comment is this from 1847:

To the perfectly holy mind, everything is religion. It seems to glorify everything—(Yet how cold is my heart while I write). (18)

The biographical could be extensively illustrated, but that will stand for many things. Unfortunately, MacDonald

ald seldom wrote about his own writing, so that side of his life does not appear; here, for example, is his most notable statement about *Lilith*, in a letter of 1897:

I daresay I could help you a little, I mean only as to my intent about this or that in *Lilith*, if I were to see you; but it seems to me that there is nothing very obscure in it that is worth finding out; though I hope there are some things in it not therefore shallow. (366-67).

Another area that will be disappointing to some readers is that—although Sadler lists MacDonald's first meeting with Lewis Carroll, in 1862 (48), and the trial reading by the MacDonalds of the first version of *Alice's Adventures in Wonderland*, in 1863 (141)—no letters appear to Carroll/Dodgson. (Twelve of the photographs of the MacDonald family between pp. 172-73 are by Dodgson, including several this bibliographer had not seen before; Dodgson also appears in a photograph with Louisa MacDonald and four of her children.)

In addition to the material appearing in the book listed above, Christopher MacDonald contributes "A Personal Note" (vii-viii); Freda Troup Levenson, "George MacDonald's Family Tree" (xviii-xix); Naomi Lewis, "Afterword" (371-72); and Sadler, "Principal Works of George MacDonald" (a list, 373-75) and "Register of Letters" (sources of the 352 letters, 378-384). There are two indices, by people and places and by subjects. Any objections to these materials are trivial (for example, it would have been nice to include Philip MacDonald's dates in the family tree—1899-1981, probably—for that grandson of MacDonald seems to have been the only other writer the family produced); as a biographical work, this is an excellent volume. [JRC]

McInerney, Ralph. "Unsoothing Sayers." *Dorothy L. Sayers: The Centenary Celebration*. Ed. Alzina Stone Dale. New York: Walker and Company, 1993. 123-128. [Lewis 124, 125, 128 (the latter two citations not in the index).]

McInerney "reflect[s]... on our tendency to rank mystery fiction rather low on any literary scale." In doing this, he cites Lewis's *An Experiment in Criticism* as defining literature as "whatever we would read again" (124). "Books we read again and again—Lewis's definition of literature—have more than plot or suspense" (125). "We reread the Whimsey stories and to that degree they are literature, if Lewis is right" (128). This is only one theme in McInerney's essay—he is also raising the question of free will, for instance—but the argument about the literary value of mysteries does run throughout, and he uses Lewis (who did not care for mysteries) to support his position. [JRC]

Obertino, James. "Moria and Hades: Underworld Journeys in Tolkien and Virgil." *Comparative Literature Studies* 30.2 (1993): [153]-69.

Obertino analyzes, compares, and contrasts Frodo's adventures underground in *The Lord of the Rings*, chiefly in Moria and in Mt. Doom, and the journey of Aeneas

through Hades in Virgil's *Aeneid*. Frodo and Aeneas are described as "heroes whose need to come to terms with the Terrible Mother defines key events in their quests" (p. [153]). Obertino's approach is Jungian, and his essay will be comprehensible only to those who know Jungian terminology. His aim seems to be to use the quests of Frodo and Aeneas to illustrate Jungian philosophy rather than to use Jung to illuminate Tolkien's and Virgil's texts.

Statements such as "For Frodo, both locating the gate to the underworld [the Doors of Durin] and getting in are hard, because the password for entering is 'friend,' a word that does not come easily to one whose immature ego cannot confidently face a re-immersion in the depths of the unconscious" (p. 160) and "The energies he [Frodo] has failed to integrate can be gained only by a sea journey to the Grey Havens, where he will be made whole through the restorative power of Galadriel, who represents here the healing power of the Great Mother" (p. 166) betray a less than thorough acquaintance with Tolkien's book.

[WGH]

Maio, Kathi. "In the Shadowland of the Hollywood Biopic" (the "Films" column). *The Magazine of Fantasy and Science Fiction* 87:4-5/521-522 (Oct.-Nov. 1994): 77-83.

Framed with citations of *The Screwtape Letters* in the first and last paragraphs, Maio's review of *Shadowlands* is knowledgeable and interesting. She objects to the film, but not entirely on the factual basis of most objections. She believes that the Hollywood version is not as good as the 1985 version for BBC Wales (the television version): it substitutes scenery for the earlier dialogue. Also, she mentions the omission of the Tolkien-Lewis friendship and the estrangement as Davidman appeared, and the lack of significant Christian emphasis ("What matters is that religion is a crucial part of who C. S. Lewis is"); but mainly she objects as a feminist to the downplaying of Davidman:

Viewers of *Shadowlands* get little sense of Joy Davidman as an intellectual. . . . Oh, she's nice, but she is not the intellectual equal of Jack Lewis. In "real life," she was.

Maio calls this "Richard Attenborough's best film," but she denies that biopics can be judged simply in film terms: they also have to be honest about the people whose biographies are being told. [JRC]

Reynolds, Barbara. *Dorothy L. Sayers: Her Life and Soul*. New York: St. Martin's Press, 1993. [Cecil 309; Inklings 97; Lewis 193, 358-59, 363; Williams 81-82 (the index mistakenly says "182"), 242, 273-76, 295, 340, 353-56, 384n.]

When this volume is combined with Reynolds' earlier biographical study —*The Passionate Intellect: Dorothy L. Sayers' Encounter with Dante* (1989)—the result is the best biography available of Sayers. The main surprise in connection with any of the Inklings is an early awareness by Williams of Sayers' writings: when her second book of poems was published—*Catholic Tales and Christian Songs*,

1917—she and her friend Muriel Jaeger turned a negative review by Theodore Maynard into a controversy, with Jaeger writing two letters under pseudonyms—one agreeing with Maynard and one opposing him; at this point several others were drawn in, one of whom referred to Maynard's earlier negative review of Williams' poetry; then Williams wrote, revealing in his letter that he had read Sayers' book twice. Reynolds suggests, since this book included a playlet, "The Mocking of Christ," it may have been the reason Williams later suggested, in 1936, that Sayers be asked to write a play for Canterbury Cathedral (81-82).

The other materials on Williams are more familiar: his letter to Victor Gollancz praising *The Nine Tailors*, which may have been the start of the friendship of Sayers and Williams (242, 274); Williams' background involvement in Sayers' writing of *The Zeal of Thy House* (273-76); Sayers' reference in *Strong Meat* to Williams' *He Came Down from Heaven* (295); the influence of Williams' *The Figure of Beatrice* to Sayers' Dantean interests (340, 353-54, 356); and Sayers' denial, in a letter after Williams' death, of being part of any group—possibly a reference to *The Company of the Coinherence* (384n). Reynolds' earlier book covers most of this material more thoroughly.

The references to Lewis contain a new letter—or passage from a letter—by him (13 July 1948), asking Sayers' support against a movement to ordain women priests in the Church of England; Sayers agrees it would be a pity to set up a barrier to understanding with "Catholic Christianity" but she denies Lewis's theological reasoning against such ordination (358-59). Two of the other references to Lewis are comparisons: a description by Sayers of "the literature of power" in an early lecture intended probably for students when she was teaching in 1921 or earlier—this compared to a passage in Lewis's *An Experiment in Criticism* (193); a comparison of Sayers' "The Pantheon Papers" (which Reynolds does not note is a collaborative work) with Lewis's *The Screwtape Letters*—this comparison is accompanied by a passage from an imitation *Screwtape Letter* (as by a demon named Sluckdrib) which Sayers sent to Lewis (363).

Two minor references complete this Inklings survey. In 1941 Sayers wrote a letter to Lord David Cecil about the series of books she, Muriel St. Clare Byrne, and Helen Simpson were editing—the Bridgeheads series, of which only three books appeared in the series proper; the part that Reynolds quotes from Sayers' letter clarifies the purposes of the series and of the book she wrote for it, but does not indicate why she was writing to Cecil (309). The Mutual Admiration Society—begun by Sayers and her friends at Oxford and continued in friendship, without that name, afterwards—is compared by Reynolds to the Inklings (97). [JRC]

Reynolds, Trevor, ed. *þe Lyfe ant þe Auncestrye 1* (1994). 8 pp. [Tolkien]

The first number of the journal of the biography special interest group of The Tolkien Society. Its title ("The Life and the Ancestry") is deliberately archaic in its spelling and typography. Most of this very brief issue is a prospectus for the journal, promising more substantive material to come. The remainder of the first number prints a note, "The T.C.B.S. at War," by Ian Collier; another note, by Trevor Reynolds, about a 19th-century clock and watchmaker and a 19th-century music seller and publisher, both named Tolkien; and an invitation by Pat Reynolds to join others interested in visiting places in Britain Tolkien visited. [WGH]

Ryan, J.S. "King Alfred's Developing Concept of Wisdom and Its Relevance to Tolkien's Moral Philosophy." *Minas Tirith Evening-Star* 22.4 (1993): 3-7; 23.1 (1994): 3-5.

"It is the purpose of this note to show how this great theme [wisdom], particularly treated in Old English by King Alfred's vernacular prose, is one which was a part of Tolkien's early studies and teaching, and how it may assist our perception of their creator's development of his two most significant human characters, Frodo and Aragorn, as well as being at the heart of Tolkien's metaphysical" (22.4, p. 3). Ryan traces pertinent references to wisdom in Alfred's English prose writings, then cites eight passages in *The Lord of the Rings* which, he says, "serve to establish wisdom as a characteristic kingly quality in Gandalf, Galadriel, Aragorn, Faramir and others, but to indicate flawed character in such figures as Saruman, Boromir and those like them" (23.1, p. 4). The essay, however, is too brief to wholly fulfill such a large purpose and to adequately link Tolkien to Alfred's writings. [WGH]

Stearns, Michael, ed. *A Wizard's Dozen: Stories of the Fantastic*. San Diego: Harcourt, Brace, 1993. xiv + 186 pp. [Tolkien 122, 123, 124, 127, 170, 173-74, 181; Lewis 180, 181]

In Jane Yolen's "Harlyn's Fairy" (pp. 119-30) a girl hisses like Gollum and is about to read *The Hobbit* for the fourth time. Her aunt thinks that such fantasy stories are "trashy, even dangerous" (p. 123), but in Yolen's story fairies are not just "empty make-believe."

BENEFACTORS

Benefactors support the improvement and outreach of *Mythlore* by making donations of \$25 or more beyond the cost of membership/subscription. For this much-appreciated support they are listed for four issues. You are encouraged to become a Benefactor and show your support.

BONNIE CALLAHAN
PATRICK OLYNNE
ROBERT HALL, JR.
FINE OSBORN
DEAN PICTON
MARY McDERMOTT SHIDLER

PASADENA, CA
FOSTON, MD
ITHACA, NY
RIVERSIDE, CA
HOLLYWOOD, FL
BOULDER, CO

In Sherwood Smith's "Faith" (pp. 167-82) a girl, Faith "Fay" Reed tells tall tales, such as that her dog Aslan can talk, or that she found a radio station that tuned in to Middle-earth, from which she brought her friends news "about the doings of the Fourth Age Gondorians and Hobbits and Riders of Rohan" (p. 170). The story tenderly explores the difference between lies and belief in magic. [WGH]

Sweetman, David. *Mary Renault: A Biography*. London: Chatto & Windus, 1993. xiv + 322 pp. [Tolkien 22-3, 29-30, 264, 291; Lewis 30]

To supplement his salary from the *Oxford English Dictionary* in the years following World War I, J.R.R. Tolkien tutored at St. Hugh's, a women's college of Oxford University. Among his pupils was the future novelist Mary Renault. Tolkien was a "conscientious lecturer" who was "notably sympathetic to women undergraduates" (pp. 29-30). To Mary and her fellow student Kasia Abbott he was not an author of fiction—at the time, none of his famous fantasy works had been published—but a brilliant scholar who made "the somewhat dry study of philology come alive as literature" (p. 30). The opposition of Tolkien and C.S. Lewis to modern literature changed the English curriculum at Oxford, which affected undergraduates like Mary Renault in their personal choice of largely non-experimental literature. Renault's letters to Kasia at the time of her *The Persian Boy* (published 1972) make frequent reference to Tolkien and make clear that Mary empathized with the "hermetic" universe Tolkien created. "His books seemed to transcend fiction by becoming the historical record of a perfect alternative reality" (p. 264). [WGH]

Tolkien, J.R.R. "Research v. Literature." *Sunday Times* (London), 14 April 1946, p. 3.

The existence of this previously unrecorded article was announced by A.S.G. Edwards of the University of Victoria, British Columbia, with commentary, in *The Book Collector* (Spring 1994, p. 142). It is a review of *English Literature at the Close of the Middle Ages* by E.K. Chambers, Volume 2, Part 2 of *The Oxford History of English Literature*. Tolkien is polite toward Chambers yet is severely critical of his book. Despite its title, "much that belongs to the close of the Middle Ages is omitted . . . and much that does not belong there is included." The work is "little more than a compendium of research" with little literary perception or criticism. The scholar will find in it the "fruit of research dried in the packing." It is hard reading "little seasoned with wit." The three essays in the book are "about literature . . . but hardly in themselves literary works." [WGH]

