Artist's Comment

Paula DiSante

Follow this and additional works at: https://dc.swosu.edu/mythlore

Part of the Children's and Young Adult Literature Commons

Recommended Citation
Available at: https://dc.swosu.edu/mythlore/vol21/iss1/11

To join the Mythopoeic Society go to: http://www.mythsoc.org/join.htm
Mythcon 51: The Mythic, the Fantastic, and the Alien
Albuquerque, New Mexico • Postponed to: July 30 – August 2, 2021

This note is available in Mythlore: A Journal of J.R.R. Tolkien, C.S. Lewis, Charles Williams, and Mythopoeic Literature:
https://dc.swosu.edu/mythlore/vol21/iss1/11
If she uses *Sie* — in certain dialects, such as that of Bern in Switzerland — as the sole polite form or as a form between *du* and *thou*, we should expect *ihr* to find its way into the regional dialects, in which the *tu* form virtually disappeared, whereas *Ihr* enjoyed a resurgence in the higher ranks of society (Augst 35-39; Ljungerud 363-64). Toward the end of the nineteenth century, according to Augst, *er* and *Ihr* were introduced into the system, and *Ihr* was first used in the forms *Ihr* and *lieber* in the Middle High German period by subjects addressing their lords. It spread thence to use by members of the upper class in addressing both their superiors and their equals, a practice that was in place by 1300 (Augst 25-27; Ljungerud 363). This *du*/*Ihr* dichotomy lasted from roughly 1200 to 1550, after which time other pronouns of address (*Er*, *Sie* (sg.), *Sie* (pl.)) were introduced into the system, and *Ihr* came to be used in addressing servants, soldiers, farmers, and other members of the lower class (Augst 35-39; Ljungerud 363-64). Toward the end of the nineteenth century, according to Augst, *Er* and *Sie* (sg.) virtually disappeared, whereas *Ihr* enjoyed a resurgence in popularity due to 1) the rediscovery of the Middle Ages, 2) strong French influence (*tu*/*vous*), and 3) through recourse to the regional dialects, in which the *Er* and *Sie* forms had never taken hold (39). Nevertheless, by 1900 the plural *Sie* had become the sole polite second person pronoun in the standard language, though *Ihr* still survives — either as the sole polite form or as a form between *du* and *Sie* — in certain dialects, such as that of Bern in Switzerland (Augst 39; Ljungerud 365).

In her translation of *The Lord of the Rings*, Carroux makes use of three second person pronouns: familiar singular *du*, familiar plural *ihr*, and polite singular and plural *Ihr*. She presumably eschews *Sie* in order to give the story a more mediaeval flavor. If she uses *Ihr* where *Sie* is used in the modern standard language, we should expect to find *du* and *ihr* used in addressing the following: relatives; spouses; (close) friends; equals in certain occupations (especially laborers, soldiers, athletes, and criminals); someone to whom respect is deliberately not being shown (i.e. as a sign of condescension or disdain); young people and children; the dead; deities and saints; animals; inanimate objects; abstract concepts. Assuming that this list is sufficiently complete for the purposes of translating Tolkien (which it is not, as we shall see below), we should expect *Ihr* in all other exchanges. Let us now see how closely Carroux adheres to these guidelines; for the sake of clarity and consistency, I will be referring to characters by the names given to them in the English original.

RELATIVES. Familiar forms of address are used among all hobbits who are related to one another, between Aragorn and his mother Gilraen (III: 354, 357) and between him and his kinsman Halbarad (III: 49-50), between Éomer and his sister Éowyn (III: 131, 160), by Théoden to his nephew Éomer (II: 138, 167, and elsewhere) and his niece Éowyn (III: 135; III: 73, 76), by Faramir to his (dead) brother Boromir and his father Denethor (II: 314-15; III: 93, and elsewhere) and by Denethor to both his sons (III: 24, 92-5), by the boy in Sams story to his dad (III: 370-71), by loreth to her kinswoman (III: 276), between Thror and his son Thráin (At: 59-60), by Thráin to his son Thorin (At: 63), and by Dáin to Thráin, his first cousin once removed (At: 63). Relationship by marriage also seems to apply, since Celeborm and Galadriel address Aragorn with *Ihr* while he is in Lothlórien (It: 428, 452-53) but with *du* after...