



Mythopoeic Society

mythLORE

A Journal of J.R.R. Tolkien, C.S. Lewis,
Charles Williams, and Mythopoeic Literature

Volume 21
Number 1

Article 11

Summer 7-15-1995

Artist's Comment

Paula DiSante

Follow this and additional works at: <https://dc.swosu.edu/mythlore>



Part of the [Children's and Young Adult Literature Commons](#)

Recommended Citation

DiSante, Paula (1995) "Artist's Comment," *Mythlore: A Journal of J.R.R. Tolkien, C.S. Lewis, Charles Williams, and Mythopoeic Literature*: Vol. 21 : No. 1 , Article 11.

Available at: <https://dc.swosu.edu/mythlore/vol21/iss1/11>

This Note is brought to you for free and open access by the Mythopoeic Society at SWOSU Digital Commons. It has been accepted for inclusion in *Mythlore: A Journal of J.R.R. Tolkien, C.S. Lewis, Charles Williams, and Mythopoeic Literature* by an authorized editor of SWOSU Digital Commons. An ADA compliant document is available upon request. For more information, please contact phillip.fitzsimmons@swosu.edu.

To join the Mythopoeic Society go to:
<http://www.mythsoc.org/join.htm>

SWOSUTM

Online Winter Seminar

February 4-5, 2022 (Friday evening, Saturday all day)

<https://www.mythsoc.org/mythcon/ows-2022.htm>

Online Winter Seminar



Online Winter Seminar

The Inklings and Horror: Fantasy's Dark Corners

February 4-5, 2022 (Friday evening, Saturday all day)

Via Zoom and Discord

Mythcon 52: The Mythic, the Fantastic, and the Alien

Albuquerque, New Mexico; July 29 - August 1, 2022

<http://www.mythsoc.org/mythcon/mythcon-52.htm>

sung bzw. Verachtung ausdrückt, die zwischen Sprecher und Angesprochenen entweder schon besteht oder initiiert werden soll. Sie dagegen gilt als Ausdruck der Beziehung der Unbekanntheit oder Distanz oder besonderen Höflichkeit sowie Ehrerbietung und des Respekts. (85)

[The use of pronouns like *du* in the German language, with its bipartite paradigm of forms of address, is regarded as the use of a sign that expresses a relationship of acquaintance, familiarity, intimacy, or even of condescension or disdain, that either already exists between the speaker and the person addressed or is supposed to be initiated. *Sie*, on the other hand, is regarded as an expression of a relationship of unfamiliarity or distance or of especial politeness as well as respect. (my translation)]

It should also be noted that the use of *du* between husband and wife did not become widespread until the late eighteenth century, and children only came to address their parents with *du* during the course of the nineteenth century (Ljungerud 353-55). Much more has been written on this topic (see especially Brown and Gilman and, for German, Augst 18-23), but this will suffice for the purposes of this paper.

Departing from the modern standard language, we encounter yet another second person pronoun. As Lederer writes, the capitalized form of *Ihr* occurs in the singular as a polite form of address to show respect to people of higher rank in older texts and in works depicting older periods (193). The use of *Ihr* as a polite form of address has its origins in the use of the Latin second person plural *vos* as a "*pluralis reverentiae*" and was first used (in the form *ir*) during the Middle High German period by subjects addressing their lords. It spread there to use by members of the upper class in addressing both their superiors and their equals, a practice that was in place by 1300 (Augst 25-27; Ljungerud 363). This *du/ir* dichotomy lasted from roughly 1200 to 1550, after which time other pronouns of address (*Er*, *Sie* (sg.), *Sie* (pl.)) were introduced into the system, and *Ihr* came to be used in addressing servants, soldiers, farmers, and other members of the lower class (Augst 35-39; Ljungerud 363-64). Toward the end of the nineteenth century, according to Augst, *Er* and *Sie* (sg.) virtually disappeared, whereas *Ihr* enjoyed a resurgence in popularity due to 1) the rediscovery of the Middle Ages, 2) strong French influence (*tu/vous*), and 3) through recourse to the regional dialects, in which the *Er* and *Sie* forms had never taken hold (39). Nevertheless, by 1900 the plural *Sie* had become the sole polite second person pronoun in the standard language, though *Ihr* still survives — either as the sole polite form or as a form between *du* and *Sie* — in certain dialects, such as that of Bern in Switzerland (Augst 39; Ljungerud 365).

In her translation of *The Lord of the Rings*, Carroux makes use of three second person pronouns: familiar singular *du*, familiar plural *ihr*, and polite singular and plural *Ihr*. She presumably eschews *Sie* in order to give the story a more mediaeval flavor. If she uses *Ihr* where *Sie* is used in the modern standard language, we should expect to find *du* and *ihr* used in addressing the following: rela-

tives; spouses; (close) friends; equals in certain occupations (especially laborers, soldiers, athletes, and criminals); someone to whom respect is deliberately not being shown (i.e. as a sign of condescension or disdain); young people and children; the dead; deities and saints; animals; inanimate objects; abstract concepts. Assuming that this list is sufficiently complete for the purposes of translating Tolkien (which it is not, as we shall see below), we should expect *Ihr* in all other exchanges. Let us now see how closely Carroux adheres to these guidelines; for the sake of clarity and consistency, I will be referring to characters by the names given to them in the English original.

RELATIVES. Familiar forms of address are used among all hobbits who are related to one another, between Aragorn and his mother Gilraen (III: 354, 357) and between him and his kinsman Halbarad (III: 49-50), between Éomer and his sister Éowyn (III: 131, 160), by Théoden to his nephew Éomer (II: 138, 167, and elsewhere) and his niece Éowyn (II: 135; III: 73, 76), by Faramir to his (dead) brother Boromir and his father Denethor (II: 314-15; III: 93, and elsewhere) and by Denethor to both his sons (III: 24, 92-5), by the boy in Sams story to his dad (II: 370-71), by Ioreth to her kinswoman (III: 276), between Thrór and his son Thráin (At: 59-60), by Thráin to his son Thorin (At: 63), and by Dáin to Thráin, his first cousin once removed (At: 63). Relationship by marriage also seems to apply, since Celeborn and Galadriel address Aragorn with *Ihr* while he is in Iothlórien (It: 428, 452-53) but with *du* after



ARTIST'S COMMENT

Suddenly Frodo noticed that a strange-looking weather-beaten man, sitting in the shadows near the wall, was also listening intently to the hobbit-talk. He had a tall tankard in front of him, and was smoking a long-stemmed pipe curiously carved.

...As Frodo drew near he threw back his hood, showing a shaggy head of dark hair flecked with grey, and in a pale stern face a pair of keen grey eyes.

"I am called Strider," he said.

The Fellowship of the Ring

I love the way Tolkien reveals Aragorn, and the effort in this picture was to present Frodo's viewpoint of that moment: the strange, mysterious man peering down as the hobbit with a skeptical, cautious, evaluating state. Aragorn's wariness is appropriate, as he later tells the hobbits: "I had to study you first, and make sure of you. The Enemy has set traps for me before now."

This uncomplicated piece is really nothing more than a portrait. With drawing time severely limited these days, I didn't want to get into a more involved composition. Even so, this still took almost a year to complete. It sat for months and months before I could get around to the finishing touches.

— Paula DiSante